

Proposition 65 Settlement Executive Summary 2016

All Settlements Reported

Plaintiff	No. of Settlements	Total Settlement Payments	Non-Contingent Civil Penalty*	% of Total	Attorney's Fee and Costs	% of Total	Payment In-Lieu of Penalty (PILP)	% of Total	% of PILP to (Civil Penalty + PILP)
As You Sow	8	\$425,000	\$92,000	22%	\$238,000	56%	\$95,000	22%	51%
Center for Environmental Health (CEH)	93	\$4,082,282	\$430,602	11%	\$3,000,601	74%	\$651,079	16%	60%
Council for Education & Research on Toxics	1	\$0	\$0	0%	\$0	0%	\$0	0%	0%
Chanler Group, The (combined)	242	\$7,471,461	\$1,244,450	17%	\$6,227,011	83%	\$0	0%	0%
Brimer, Russell	16	\$486,700	\$65,500	13%	\$421,200	87%	\$0	0%	0%
Brimer, Russell; Englander, Peter	1	\$20,000	\$4,000	20%	\$16,000	80%	\$0	0%	0%
Englander, Peter	20	\$716,011	\$152,250	21%	\$563,761	79%	\$0	0%	0%
Held, Anthony, Ph.D., P.E.	47	\$1,297,300	\$219,900	17%	\$1,077,400	83%	\$0	0%	0%
Held, Anthony, Ph.D., P.E.; Moore, John	5	\$155,500	\$24,500	16%	\$131,000	84%	\$0	0%	0%
Held, Anthony, Ph.D., P.E.; Moorberg, Mark	1	\$29,500	\$2,000	7%	\$27,500	93%	\$0	0%	0%
Leeman, Whitney R., Ph.D.	47	\$1,467,700	\$216,600	15%	\$1,251,100	85%	\$0	0%	0%
Moorberg, Mark	29	\$948,100	\$172,250	18%	\$775,850	82%	\$0	0%	0%
Moore, John	30	\$974,150	\$180,200	18%	\$793,950	82%	\$0	0%	0%
Vinocur, Laurence	28	\$789,000	\$103,750	13%	\$685,250	87%	\$0	0%	0%
Wozniak, Paul	18	\$587,500	\$103,500	18%	\$484,000	82%	\$0	0%	0%
Chemical Toxin Working Group, Inc.	2	\$315,499	\$220,565	70%	\$94,934	30%	\$0	0%	0%
Center for Advanced Public Awareness, Inc.	2	\$60,000	\$10,000	17%	\$50,000	83%	\$0	0%	0%
Cheng, Kingpun	17	\$297,625	\$19,525	7%	\$278,100	93%	\$0	0%	0%
Clean Water Fund	1	\$183,470	\$80,000	44%	\$103,470	56%	\$0	0%	0%
Consumer Advocacy Group	71	\$4,377,000	\$463,750	11%	\$3,287,750	75%	\$625,500	14%	57%
Custodio & Dubey Plaintiffs (combined)	75	\$1,115,750	\$109,750	10%	\$1,006,000	90%	\$0	0%	0%
Ecological Alliance, LLC	74	\$1,105,750	\$108,750	10%	\$997,000	90%	\$0	0%	0%
Jesse Garrett	1	\$10,000	\$1,000	10%	\$9,000	90%	\$0	0%	0%
Davia, Susan	14	\$564,100	\$117,100	21%	\$447,000	79%	\$0	0%	0%
DiPirro, Michael	6	\$340,500	\$29,000	9%	\$311,500	91%	\$0	0%	0%
Ecological Rights Foundation	1	\$117,500	\$52,500	45%	\$40,000	34%	\$25,000	21%	32%
Environmental Research Center	55	\$4,960,600	\$1,787,408	36%	\$1,650,211	33%	\$1,522,981	31%	46%
Hall, Mary	1	\$500,000	\$0	0%	\$500,000	100%	\$0	0%	0%
Hammond, Sara	6	\$140,000	\$11,000	8%	\$129,000	92%	\$0	0%	0%
Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation	4	\$305,000	\$37,000	12%	\$260,000	85%	\$8,000	3%	0%
McCartney, Erika	10	\$577,500	\$139,000	24%	\$438,500	76%	\$0	0%	0%
Lukas T. Novak Plaintiffs (combined)	12	\$264,000	\$44,500	17%	\$219,500	83%	\$0	0%	0%
APS&EE, LLC	4	\$84,500	\$12,500	15%	\$72,000	85%	\$0	0%	0%
Roskopf, Elise	1	\$11,000	\$2,000	18%	\$9,000	82%	\$0	0%	0%
Ruggeri, Isabel	6	\$153,500	\$27,500	18%	\$126,000	82%	\$0	0%	0%
Sprankle, Scott	1	\$15,000	\$2,500	17%	\$12,500	83%	\$0	0%	0%
Shefa LMV, LLC	31	\$1,011,350	\$236,950	23%	\$774,400	77%	\$0	0%	0%
Brodsky & Smith Plaintiffs (combined)	99	\$2,469,474	\$250,300	10%	\$2,219,174	90%	\$0	0%	0%
Balaboo, Precila	2	\$44,000	\$3,500	8%	\$40,500	92%	\$0	0%	0%
Bell, Ema	23	\$626,250	\$65,800	11%	\$560,450	89%	\$0	0%	0%
Bell, Ema; Espinosa, Gabriel	1	\$25,000	\$3,000	12%	\$22,000	88%	\$0	0%	0%

Proposition 65 Settlement Executive Summary 2016

All Settlements Reported

Plaintiff	No. of Settlements	Total Settlement Payments	Non-Contingent Civil Penalty*	% of Total	Attorney's Fee and Costs	% of Total	Payment In-Lieu of Penalty (PILP)	% of Total	% of PILP to (Civil Penalty + PILP)
Calacin, Karen	3	\$44,000	\$3,400	8%	\$40,600	92%	\$0	0%	0%
Espinosa, Gabriell	13	\$267,500	\$23,900	9%	\$243,600	91%	\$0	0%	0%
Ferriero, Anthony	50	\$1,290,224	\$136,700	11%	\$1,153,524	89%	\$0	0%	0%
Ferriero, Anthony; Espinosa, Gabrie	1	\$35,000	\$3,500	10%	\$31,500	90%	\$0	0%	0%
Velarde, Hector	3	\$50,000	\$4,000	8%	\$46,000	92%	\$0	0%	0%
Velarde, Martha, Estate of	3	\$87,500	\$6,500	7%	\$81,000	93%	\$0	0%	0%
Steinman, David	1	\$374,000	\$56,100	15%	\$102,462	27%	\$215,438	58%	79%
Wimberley, Evelyn	6	\$136,000	\$6,500	5%	\$129,500	95%	\$0	0%	0%
Zargarbashi, Ali	1	\$12,000	\$3,000	25%	\$9,000	75%	\$0	0%	0%
Zivkovic, Arthur	1	\$50,000	\$5,000	10%	\$45,000	90%	\$0	0%	0%
GRAND TOTAL	760	\$30,150,111	\$5,446,000	18%	\$21,561,113	72%	\$3,142,998	10%	

* A non-contingent penalty is the civil penalty that must be paid pursuant to the settlement, regardless of future events or actions of the defendant. If a settlement includes a contingent penalty, the plaintiff should report the additional penalty amount when it becomes due.

Settlements often contain injunctive relief and monetary payments that cannot be presented in summary form and that require reference to the actual settlement documents to accurately assess. Copies of Proposition 65 settlements are available on the Attorney General's website, at <http://oag.ca.gov/prop65>. This report should not be used by itself to evaluate Proposition 65 settlements.