

XAVIER BECERRA
Attorney General

State of California
DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE



600 WEST BROADWAY, SUITE 1800
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101
P.O. BOX 85266
SAN DIEGO, CA 92186-5266

Public: (619) 738-9000
Telephone: (619) 738-9345
Facsimile: (619) 645-2271
E-Mail: Dennis.Ragen@doj.ca.gov

February 28, 2019

Barbara Snider
Senior Counsel, Hinman & Carmichael LLP
260 California Street, Suite 700,
San Francisco, CA 94111

RE: Proposition 65 Notices re Web Sales of Alcohol.

Dear Ms. Snider:

We have reviewed the 60-day notices of violation that John Devlin served on a number of businesses over the past few weeks pursuant to Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq.) These notices are identified in the attached table (Table A). The notices allege that the businesses listed in Table A failed to provide clear and reasonable warnings to customers who purchased alcoholic beverages from the businesses' websites.

We currently are involved in discussions with Mr. Devlin and his lawyers concerning potential deficiencies with the notices, as well as the supporting information submitted to our office with the notices which we are required to maintain in confidence. (Health & Saf. Code, § 25249.7, subd. (i).) Unless you hear otherwise from Mr. Devlin's lawyers or from our office, however, the notices continue to be in effect and you should treat them as such. We expect to conclude those discussions within the next two weeks.

Meanwhile, regardless of the outcome of our discussions with Mr. Devlin, we note that, in order to take advantage of the applicable safe harbor warning regulation, web-sellers, including web sellers of alcohol, must provide website warnings so that the purchaser receives them "prior to completing the purchase." Cal. Code. Regs. title 27, section 25602, subd. (b). Please review section 27602(b) itself for additional requirements.

This letter addresses compliance with Proposition 65. It is the responsibility of the businesses to ensure that they are in compliance with any other laws or regulations applicable to the sales of alcoholic beverages.

Barbara Snider, Esq.
February 28, 2019
Page 2

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

/s/ Dennis A. Ragen

DENNIS A. RAGEN
Deputy Attorney General

For XAVIER BECERRA
Attorney General

cc: Harrison Pollak
Supervising Deputy Attorney General

Table A		
Notice No.	Date	Recipient
170	1/29/19	Tavour, Inc.
186	1/30/19	Wine Chateau, Inc.
187	1/30/19	B & V Enterprises, Inc. dba Super King Markets
188	1/30/19	Pernod Ricard USA, LLC
194	1/31/19	Plonk Wine Merchants, LLC
195	1/31/19	Retail Services & Systems, Inc. dba Total Wine & More
196	1/31/19	San Sebastian Winery
197	1/31/19	SendGifts, LLC
198	1/31/19	BBCK Enterprises, Inc. dba K&L Wine Merchants
199	1/31/19	L18 Holdings, Inc.
200	1/31/19	Liquor Barn Inc.
201	1/31/19	Monticello Vineyards & Winery, Inc.
202	1/31/19	Liquorama, Inc.
216	2/1/19	Best Damn Beer Shop
217	2/1/19	Clubs of America, Inc.
218	2/1/19	Crafshack, Inc.
219	2/1/19	Drizly, Inc.
220	2/1/19	GourmetGiftBaskets.com, Inc.
245	2/4/19	AWS Hopkins, dba Ace Spirits
269	2/6/19	1800Flowers.com, Inc.
270	2/6/19	The Accidental Wine Company
271	2/6/19	Benchmark Wine Group, Inc.
272	2/6/19	Bouchaine Vinyards, Inc.
273	2/6/19	Cristie Kerr Wines LLC
274	2/7/19	Givens and Halpern, Inc.
275	2/7/19	Jean-Claude Boisset Wines USA, Inc.
276	2/7/19	Mission Liquor & Tobacco, Inc.
277	2/7/19	Oldsmar Fine Wine, Inc. dba Laiken Liquors
278	2/7/19	Premier Wine & Liquor Inc.
289	2/8/19	Raymond Vineyard & Cellar, Inc.
290	2/8/19	Remedy Wholesale LLC dba Remedy Liquor
291	2/8/19	Schindler Weissman Co. LLC dba Wine Monger
292	2/8/19	The Wine Enthusiast, Inc.
293	2/8/19	Winc, Inc.
313	2/12/19	Boeger Winery, Inc.
314	2/12/19	Crown Liquors of Broward, Inc. dba Crown Fine Wine and Spirits
315	2/12/19	DoorDash, Inc.
316	2/12/19	Go To Gifts, Inc., dba The Bro Basket
317	2/12/19	LLJ, Inc. dba Minibar Delivery
318	2/12/19	Servall Market, Inc. dba Craft City Online Store
319	2/12/19	US Beverage Advertising Corp.

Table A		
Notice No.	Date	Recipient
320	2/12/19	Wheeler Farms Partners, LLC
321	2/12/19	Wine.com, Inc
322	2/12/19	BestWinesOnline.com dba Wine Exchange
327	2/13/19	A to Z Wineworks, LLC
328	2/13/19	CellarBrowser, Inc.
329	2/13/19	G&G Trading Company dba Adventure Wines
331	2/13/19	GCW AcquisitionCo, dba In Vino
332	2/13/19	Savage Wine, LLC
333	2/13/19	The Wine Spies, LLC
335	2/13/19	Hillside Wines & Spirits, LLC dba Wine Street
381	3/22/19	Liquor Management, LLC dba Crown Fine Wine and Spirits