

CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

ASSEMBLY BILL 953 STOP DATA REGULATIONS

PUBLIC HEARING

THURSDAY, JANUARY 26, 2017

2:30 P.M. - 4:30 P.M.

TRANSCRIPTION OF PROCEEDINGS

FRESNO AREA HISPANIC FOUNDATION

1444 Fulton Street
Fresno, California 93721

REPORTED BY MIRANDA K. ANTHONY, CSR NO. 13453

CAROL BIRKENFELD & ASSOCIATES

Certified Shorthand Reporters

53 West Shore Road, Belvedere, California 94920

Phone (415) 435-9765 Fax (415) 435-1825

Email: info@birkenfeldreporting.com

STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC

PAGE

| | | |
|----|---------------------|----|
| 1 | | |
| 2 | | |
| 3 | | |
| 4 | AARON PRATT | 11 |
| 5 | VICTORIA CASTILLO | 14 |
| 6 | IRENE ARMENDARIZ | 17 |
| 7 | DENISE FRIDAY-HALL | 17 |
| 8 | MARIA LOPEZ | 20 |
| 9 | NICOLE REMBLE | 21 |
| 10 | GENEA NICHOLSON | 22 |
| 11 | ANDREA DONADO | 23 |
| 12 | ROSA AQEEL | 25 |
| 13 | ALFREDO AGUERO | 27 |
| 14 | TERRANCE STEWART | 29 |
| 15 | BRANDON STURDIVANT | 31 |
| 16 | KENA CADOR | 34 |
| 17 | CRISANTEMA GALLARDO | 36 |
| 18 | BOBBI BUTTS | 38 |
| 19 | GREG JONES | 39 |
| 20 | NEYOU BERHE | 42 |
| 21 | SUKAINA HUSSAIN | 43 |
| 22 | TAYMAH JAHSI | 46 |
| 23 | JULIA DUDLEY | 47 |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |

APPEARANCES

From the Office of the Attorney General, Civil Rights
Enforcement Section (CRES):

SHANNON HOVIS, Chairperson
NANCY BENINATI, Supervising Deputy Attorney General
CATHERINE YSRAEL, Deputy Attorney General

From the California Justice Information Services
Division (CJIS):

AUDRA OPDYKE
RANDIE CHANCE

PROCEEDINGS

MS. HOVIS: Good afternoon, everyone. So thank
you all for attending both today's board meeting earlier
and also the public hearing right now. We very much
believe that public participation in the rule-making
process is really important, and we thank you for taking
the time out of your day to be here. Really, very, very
genuinely thank you for spending the day with us.

My name is Shannon Hovis, and I'm Senior Policy
Advisor with the Attorney General's Office. And with me
today are representatives in our Civil Rights
Enforcement Section and our California Justice
Information Services Division. And these are the two bodies
that are responsible for implementing AB 953, the Racial
Identity and Profiling Act at the Department of Justice.

So, specifically, to my right is Nancy Beninati,
who is our Supervising Deputy Attorney General in the
Civil Rights Enforcement Section. And we have Audra
Opdyke and Randie Chance, who are both with the
California Justice Information Services down here.

It's approximately 2:58 p.m. on Thursday,
January 26th, and we are gathered here today at the
Downtown Business Hub in Fresno to receive public
comments on the proposed Stop Data Regulations recently

1 posted by the California Department of Justice.
2 The proposed regulations that we are concerned
3 with today pertain to the collection of information
4 regarding stops made by law enforcement agencies and are
5 required by California's Racial and Identity
6 Profiling Act AB 953.
7 To be clear, this is not a meeting of the board.
8 You were just there, so you know that. This is a public
9 hearing during which you may provide comment to our
10 office, the Department of Justice, on the proposed
11 stop-data regulations since it is our office that is
12 responsible for drafting those.
13 The board functions in an advisory
14 capacity to us. So earlier they're weighing in,
15 they're discussing all these different elements they
16 want us to include, don't want us to include. That is
17 advice they give to us. And ultimately the
18 decision-making power for what these regulations look
19 like resides with the Department.
20 On December 9th, 2016, the California Department
21 of Justice posted the proposed text of the regulations
22 and the notice of proposed action, initial statement of
23 reasons, and fiscal impact analysis on our website at
24 "oag.ca.gov/AB953/regulations."
25 You should have received one page earlier, for

1 those of you who have been here for the duration of the
2 day, that basically tells you how you can participate
3 in the public comment process and also says specifically
4 where the regulations are posted on our website. If you
5 search on our website, if you go to "oag.ca.gov," you
6 can always just search for "AB 953" and also find that
7 information.
8 On December 9th, we also sent a notice to
9 interested stakeholders to let them know that the
10 proposed regulations had been posted. This notice also
11 outlined the ability of members of the public to submit
12 comments regarding the proposed regulations in writing
13 or orally at today's hearing. This is the last of three
14 public hearings. We had one in Oakland last week and
15 one in Los Angeles the week before.
16 The full rulemaking file, including the
17 rulemaking documents, the documents we relied upon to
18 draft the proposed regulations and also the comments
19 we've received to date, are available at one of our
20 offices, the DOJ in Oakland or in Los Angeles. And
21 you can email us if you'd like to see that full file.
22 The email is also on that piece of paper we gave you
23 earlier. But it's "AB953@doj.ca.gov." We just repeat
24 "AB 953" as often as possible so that you remember what
25 we're talking about.

1 At the front of the room, when you came in, I
2 think you all saw there are copies of the proposed
3 regulations. Hopefully, you received those. There are
4 also some copies of the statute, and I have a couple
5 more if anybody wants those.
6 The format of today's hearing will be as
7 follows: This is an opportunity for you to provide
8 comment to us on the proposed stop data regulations. Each
9 person will have three minutes to provide their comment.
10 And we'll have the time card similar to how we did this
11 morning, if you were here, showing the time you have
12 remaining.
13 We ask that you provide comments that are
14 relevant to the stop data regulations since the purpose
15 of this hearing is to discuss those.
16 And this is not a question-and-answer period.
17 So we won't actually go back and forth to say, "This is
18 our rationale for this and this," you know. Most of
19 you were here for the morning so you also heard some of
20 the back and forth about how we came to some of the
21 decisions on our -- on our regulations.
22 So this is our opportunity to listen to you,
23 which we are excited to do. And all the hearing will be
24 recorded and a transcript of the hearing and all the
25 information presented to us during the hearing will be

1 made part of the rulemaking record. So it will be
2 considered by our office as we revisit the regulations
3 to revise them. Any comments that you make here will be
4 taken into account. Okay?
5 If you wish to submit written comments after you
6 leave today, you may submit them through the Attorney
7 General's website at that same address I gave before.
8 You may also send them to us by email at
9 AB953@doj.ca.gov. The deadline for submitting
10 comments is tomorrow at 5:00 p.m. So if you know
11 anybody who wants to submit comments on the regulations,
12 you think would be interested in knowing what's going
13 on, make sure to let them know that tomorrow is our
14 deadline for receiving comments.
15 So as you entered the room, you received a
16 speaker card, and we've taken those. If you do want to
17 provide a comment anonymously, that is also an option.
18 So if you give us a speaker card, and you're like,
19 actually, I'd rather you not record my name or
20 whatever, just let us know. You don't have to present
21 it with your name. But for the rulemaking file, just in
22 our records, it's easier if we have that information.
23 Let's see. We also have a sign-in sheet. We
24 had one this morning. If you had not yet signed in, if
25 you'd like to stay apprised of different activities of

1 our office and implementing AB 953 and the activities of
 2 the board, you can sign up. You'll become part of our
 3 distribution list and receive notifications about what
 4 we're up to.
 5 Unless you specify otherwise, any correspondence
 6 you receive by us, you will receive by email. You can
 7 request by snail mail, if that is your preference, but
 8 you will have to let us know that.
 9 So we will now begin.
 10 Do you want to call?
 11 MS. BENINATI: I'll call people.
 12 MS. HOVIS: Okay. So Nancy will just go ahead
 13 and call folks' names.
 14 THE PUBLIC: We have our own order.
 15 MS. HOVIS: Okay. So just come up and state
 16 your name.
 17 MS. YSRAEL: Shannon, Nancy, I don't think --
 18 MS. BENINATI: Just to kind of clarify on
 19 Shannon's point, because we are transcribing this
 20 hearing, we ask that you please be considerate of the
 21 speaker and allow that person to speak. Because if more
 22 than one voice is heard at the same time, the Court
 23 Reporter can't get that down and that person's comment
 24 might be lost or garbled. So just keep that in mind.
 25 I do have -- we do have a public comment from

1 the co-chair of the Racial Identity Profiling Board,
 2 Mr. Ed Medrano, who would like to read the board's
 3 recommendations.
 4 MR. MEDRANO: Thank you. My name is Ed Medrano,
 5 and I'm one of the co-chairs for the RIPA board which
 6 just met earlier.
 7 The board did make some recommendations for the
 8 Department of Justice to consider. Prior to making
 9 those recommendations, the board considered formal
 10 comments that were submitted by other board members,
 11 considered comments made by the public prior to the
 12 board meeting, as well as public comment that was
 13 delivered today. Many of you were here today.
 14 Just a quick synopsis of what was voted on and
 15 what was recommended to the Department of Justice.
 16 First off, in terms of the regulations, there was a
 17 recommendation and motion that passed for a narrative
 18 box to be included for "reason of the stop" and the
 19 "basis for the stop" and anywhere else there is an
 20 "other" box to allow the officers to fill in a
 21 narrative. That was the first recommendation.
 22 In addition to that, a couple different items
 23 were added relative to information about the person
 24 that was stopped. The first item is to add a box that
 25 can allow officers to check LGBT in terms of

1 gender, so that will make six gender options available.
 2 Two, to add learning disability in the school
 3 setting. ADAH was one, hyperactivity, and others to
 4 allow officers to add additional information relative to
 5 school setting disabilities.
 6 The third was to allow officers to check
 7 religion if known, and another box, if unknown.
 8 And, lastly, to eliminate -- there was a
 9 recommendation in the regulations to have limited
 10 English or accent. And to delete the accent only,
 11 just to check limited English proficiency.
 12 The board unanimously voted that we forward all
 13 of those recommendations to the Department of Justice
 14 for their consideration and any potential modifications
 15 to the regulations.
 16 That is our report.
 17 MS. BENINATI: Thank you.
 18 So will the next member of the public please
 19 come up. And when you do, can you please spell your
 20 name for the Court Reporter.
 21 -oOo-
 22 STATEMENT OF PASTOR AARON PRATT
 23
 24 MR. PRATT: Good evening. Or should I say
 25 "afternoon"? My name is Pastor Aaron D. Pratt. I want

1 to say thank you to the Department of Justice for your
 2 diligence in, you know, facilitating this, AB 953. It
 3 has been a diligent and very arduous road, and we're
 4 still going uphill.
 5 So what -- I want to say a few things, but I need
 6 to frame it up right so you can know a little bit about
 7 me so when I give you these things that I feel I still
 8 want to work on you will understand where I come from.
 9 So who am I? I am a pastor. I am a college
 10 graduate. Two universities, Syracuse, chemical
 11 engineering cum laude; and Cal Berkeley, human services
 12 degree.
 13 Why did I chose pastory? Well, as a Navy SEAL,
 14 SEAL Team 5, graduate of Class 189, I found out that
 15 science was real. And in order to do some of the
 16 processes, running the actions on the USS Enterprise, or
 17 the Kittyhawk, riding in humvees, extracting prisoners,
 18 extracting hostages, I found that documentation was
 19 absolutely necessary. I found out that chemistry --
 20 without me being able to measure variables, I couldn't
 21 come up with a solution.
 22 So I'm still perplexed as to why we meet and we
 23 pondering trying to figure a way of -- you know, the new
 24 word, new vernacular, is "alternative facts."
 25 I want to know why we are still having a problem

1 about -- of explaining. I did a lot of writing. A lot of
 2 that writing that I did in Iran was on the roof while 32
 3 of my men, under fire, some of them died. But I had to
 4 make a report in this handheld recorder when I was
 5 calling for help.
 6 I don't understand why the Rules of Engagement
 7 that I had to follow on foreign soil, our public
 8 servants have a problem with right here. I don't
 9 understand anything about my beautiful country, America.
 10 I have problems. PTSD, anxiety. I have issues.
 11 And I come home only to find out that my war has just
 12 begun.
 13 So I want to know why we have the issue of
 14 explaining. Why does the officer have a problem hitting
 15 his camera? Why does the officer or technology, mind
 16 you -- why can't they do what we did in humvees, make
 17 the report and come back and file it? What is this
 18 issue about time? Isn't life precious? Don't we as a
 19 whole in society matter?
 20 I never -- I promise you -- I promise you, when
 21 I jumped out those helicopters, I didn't care what color
 22 those people were. I didn't care what they stood for.
 23 I had one mission, and that was to serve this country.
 24 How about my country serve me?
 25 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.

Page 13

1 MS. BENINATI: The next speaker, please.
 2 -oOo-
 3 STATEMENT OF VICTORIA CASTILLO
 4
 5 MS. CASTILLO: Good afternoon, members of the
 6 DOJ and others. My name is Victoria Castillo,
 7 V-I-C-T-O-R-I-A, C-A-S-T-I-L-L-O. I am from Merced
 8 County.
 9 I am going to again read some excerpts from
 10 citizens. And why I'm doing this is because I really
 11 took into consideration some of the back-and-forth that
 12 was going on between the board earlier as far as unique
 13 identifiers for officers. And I feel, personally, that
 14 this is important in order to review and establish a
 15 pattern of prejudice and/or abuse. It's not something
 16 I -- I, myself, do public records requests often, and I
 17 never come across any personal information from
 18 officers, other than if they were involved in a specific
 19 situation with an individual. And I never got anything
 20 like identifying officers' homes or any other personal
 21 information that could put that individual in danger.
 22 Part of these citizen complaints are from
 23 different individual and specific officers from Merced
 24 Police Department. Part of this says, "At one point,
 25 Penner walked to his vehicle and pressed something. We

Page 14

1 believe he may have disabled his dash camera. With this
 2 and the fact that officers' weapons -- two officers --
 3 were unbuttoned, both my friends and I had reasonable
 4 fear of being killed or seriously injured.
 5 "The officers did tell these individuals that
 6 they could not record. And after that, they
 7 subsequently went to the vehicle and the light that was
 8 on was shut off, after he pressed the button."
 9 The response to our request to this individual
 10 was: "The information provided is not specific enough
 11 to our search. Could you please provide more
 12 information, such as time and day and location of the
 13 incident to produce the dispatcher logs of the
 14 incident."
 15 Now, with our local departments, they have
 16 sophisticated software, so that's the first and last
 17 name and date of birth of an individual or even a
 18 license plate number can give us this information. But
 19 yet that information was not entered in the database.
 20 So as far as myself and -- just for background,
 21 both of the individuals that were in this citizen
 22 complaint that were together, they are relatives, and
 23 they're both Mexican; they both have beautiful brown
 24 skin.
 25 Another citizen complaint, from a different

Page 15

1 individual: "During the encounter I felt I was treated
 2 like human trash, and I was in physical pain. I had to
 3 call into my place of work and explain what took place
 4 because after the experience, I was not the right state
 5 of mind to work and had pressure and a swollen hand.
 6 The incident has left me traumatized, and I feel no
 7 matter how I attempt to better my life, Merced police
 8 will continue to find ways to assault, harass or even
 9 kill me. I feel I live with this fear every single day.
 10 This is not acceptable for people in my community to be
 11 treated so disrespectfully and without regard for their
 12 rights. I'm not on probation or parole, even if I were,
 13 the way I've been treated repeatedly dehumanizes, to say
 14 the least."
 15 And during this actual incident, I was called
 16 by the people that were being stopped in his car. And
 17 both of these citizen complaints did not result in
 18 arrest, but in both incidents the people in the car
 19 were both brown-skinned. And I went onto the scene, and
 20 these both happened in October of 2016. And I was on
 21 foot filming the law enforcement officers and the
 22 situation at a reasonable distance and was given a
 23 misdemeanor citation for reckless driving but I was not
 24 in my vehicle. So now I'm facing a trial for that I'm
 25 going to be facing.

Page 16

1 So I just wanted to put that out there, that
 2 data is crucial and unique identifiers are important.
 3 Thank you.
 4 MS. BENINATI: Thank you very much.
 5 -oOo-
 6 STATEMENT OF IRENE ARMENDARIZ
 7
 8 MS. ARMENDARIZ: Hello. My name is Irene
 9 Armendariz, I-R-E-N-E, A-R-M-E-D-A-R-I-Z. I'm from
 10 Merced, California, and I support the unique identifier.
 11 Like I said earlier, I have a brother who has
 12 been diagnosed with schizophrenic tendency through the
 13 harassment of the Merced Police Department, and he is
 14 now looking at several years of prison. It's been a
 15 burden on our family to come up with the money that we
 16 don't have to get a lawyer so he can get help for his
 17 mental condition. And I just believe the information on
 18 officers is needed to see if there's any specific
 19 patterns of prejudices or abuse. Thank you.
 20 MS. BENINATI: Thank you.
 21 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.
 22 -oOo-
 23 STATEMENT BY DENISE FRIDAY-HALL
 24
 25 MS. FRIDAY-HALL: Good afternoon. My name is

1 Denise Friday, D-E-N-I-S-E, Friday, as in the day of the
 2 week, Hall. And I'm here because of the identity and
 3 the protocol of racial profiling, because my son was
 4 assassinated by Officer David Wells because of the color
 5 of his skin. So what I'm trying to say is that I feel
 6 like, in a police-involved shooting, are the police
 7 above the law? When they go to the -- the Article of
 8 Police, the Bill of Rights, I want to know all the laws
 9 were written in an era where things were different.
 10 Now, things are different now. How come the law can't
 11 be revised where a police officer involved in a police
 12 shooting is not tested for drugs or alcohol after
 13 involved shooting? And what is the actual protocol
 14 when they are in an involved shooting? When the
 15 commanding officer steps on the scene, is the commanding
 16 officer -- is he surrendering his weapon to him?
 17 And then, on the other hand, I want to know
 18 that, are they taken immediately to go get tested?
 19 Okay. And then once they get to the office and they
 20 begin their report, if they're not verbally able to
 21 speak their report, are they able to -- I mean, write it
 22 out in a report? Do they get an opportunity to verbally
 23 say their report in a panel or something like that?
 24 So I would like to know, what is that protocol
 25 when a police officer shoots someone in the community

1 and something like that.
 2 And the other thing is that, when bus drivers
 3 have an accident on the street, they're tested for drugs
 4 or alcohol. So what makes the men in blue above the law
 5 where they can't be tested for drugs or alcohol?
 6 Because that Article in that Bill of Rights for them --
 7 that needs to be changed, because that law is outdated.
 8 And then, the other thing is that, when they
 9 have chance -- when they have their body camera, I feel
 10 like once the body camera is activated, then it should
 11 not be deactivated. And if it is, it should be
 12 automatically reset to turn back on, because this is to
 13 protect the officer as well as the citizen that is being
 14 engaged with the law enforcement officer.
 15 So I feel like they should not have control of
 16 activating or deactivating the body cam when they're
 17 involved in a situation where the whole truth could be
 18 really seen and told if they not cutting their video
 19 cameras off and on.
 20 And the third thing is that, when they approach
 21 people, they should de-escalate; they should -- okay.
 22 They should be able to have training to de-escalate
 23 situations instead of escalating them. Because, like we
 24 say, we have a lot of people out there with a lot of
 25 issues. And if they just took the time to analyze the

1 situation, maybe they wouldn't have to shoot to kill.
 2 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.
 3 -oOo-
 4 STATEMENT BY MARIA LOPEZ
 5
 6 MS. LOPEZ: Maria Lopez from Long Beach. Maria,
 7 M-A-R-I-A, and Lopez, L-O-P-E-Z.
 8 I'm very glad to see that everyone on this table
 9 appears to be -- may not identify but appears to be a
 10 woman. I also stand here as a woman, a brown Latin
 11 woman, a queer, gender nonconforming one, an
 12 undocumented, documented woman, a woman in poverty, a
 13 first generation woman, a (words spoken in Spanish.)
 14 I do not choose which one to be a day. I'm all
 15 of them every single day. All of this cannot fill in
 16 blocks but can be described in a small narrative if you
 17 took the time to see the importance in all that makes me
 18 who I am.
 19 When I hear people say they want to be a police
 20 officer because they want to make a difference, I say,
 21 "You have a chance with AB 953 to make a difference."
 22 I commend the RIPA board on their
 23 recommendations that will impact the lives of the most
 24 vulnerable in our communities. Today is a day that will
 25 go down in our people's history as a day we took a step

1 towards justice. Thank you.
 2 MS. BENINATI: Do you do poetry? You're very
 3 poetic.
 4 MS. LOPEZ: No, I don't.
 5 -oOo-
 6 STATEMENT OF NICOLE REMBLE
 7
 8 MS. REMBLE: Hello, Board. My name is Nicole
 9 Remble, N-I-C-O-L-E, R-E-M-B-L-E.
 10 I'll just start off with this. I've seen racial
 11 profiling. They told me to go to school. "No one will
 12 harass you." I'm gay. I don't look like a fem all the
 13 time. There's been times where cops looked at me and
 14 thought I was a man. It could have went another way,
 15 sometimes my partner say, when we're pulled over in the
 16 car 'cause I like to speed sometime. Sometimes I'm
 17 scared of the police. We shouldn't be scared at all.
 18 All we ask for is accountability. That's it.
 19 Write down what happened; tell us why. And we'll trust
 20 you more; you can trust us more, and we'll be in peace.
 21 I'm all about peace, love, and happiness. That's all
 22 you need; right? This is the first step. That's it.
 23 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.
 24
 25

Page 21

1 -oOo-
 2 STATEMENT OF GENEVA NICHOLSON
 3
 4 MS. NICHOLSON: My name's Geneva Nicholson. It's
 5 G-E-N-E-A; last name Nicholson, N-I-C-H-O-L-S-O-N.
 6 And I usually don't tell my story. But today,
 7 hearing everyone's story, made me think about the times
 8 I had felt discriminated against and how I was profiled.
 9 And growing up, I grew up in an abusive home,
 10 and there were times when my dad would beat the shit out
 11 of us, but we were too afraid to call the police
 12 because we didn't want anything to happen to him because
 13 we loved him. So as you hear your mom screaming and
 14 begging for help, there was nothing I can do to save
 15 her. I couldn't save her, because I was risking him.
 16 And to live with the trauma of that, knowing
 17 that even though he's abusing all of us, and he does
 18 deserve some type of punishment, to have him killed I
 19 knew wasn't the punishment.
 20 So instead we endeavored years of abuse from
 21 him, because we were too afraid to call the police. And
 22 so often, whenever we would try to reach out for help,
 23 the community would tell us that we couldn't.
 24 And I don't ever want anybody to have to grow up
 25 like that. You have no idea what it does to you, to

Page 22

1 constantly have to be perfect in order to fit in a
 2 system that's never going to respect, never going to
 3 love you. And no matter how much you change yourself,
 4 it still isn't enough.
 5 So I would like the board to take into account
 6 all the stories you've heard today, all the things you
 7 heard, because the community is crying for help and no
 8 one is listening to us. Thank you.
 9 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.
 10 -oOo-
 11 STATEMENT OF ANDREA DONADO
 12
 13 MS. DONADO: Andrea Donado. A-N-D-E -- D-R-E-A,
 14 and Donado is D-O-N-A-D-O.
 15 I'm with the Greater Long Beach Interfaith
 16 Community Organization, and we also are here
 17 representing ICO organization, which is made up 60
 18 organizations. And we applaud the recommendations from
 19 the RIPA board. And we ask you to consider them and
 20 actually take them.
 21 In Long Beach, actually some time ago, we had a
 22 case in which a white police officer was stopping an
 23 undocumented woman and impounded their cars, because he
 24 knew that most likely they won't have any papers.
 25 So this woman that come normally from very

Page 23

1 poor communities were facing all the economic
 2 challenges that comes when a car is impounded for them.
 3 A lot of them, they couldn't even take the car back.
 4 They couldn't fight anything because they were
 5 undocumented and they were in fear of the police.
 6 And this was just happening to very brown,
 7 Mexican-looking woman. I myself can drive there,
 8 because I have lighter skin and wouldn't stop me.
 9 We need also a narrative, because there's a
 10 lot of times in which (unintelligible); how can we
 11 include "other" when there's so many rights of options.
 12 So we are in favor of the narrative, instead of the
 13 other part.
 14 And also we need to know what is the race of
 15 the police that's stopping these people. Because we
 16 need to know whether or not it's Latinos going against
 17 Latinos, or is whites going for anybody else -- or
 18 blacks. Or how is the interaction going? And it can be
 19 that there's also black/brown police officers that
 20 are racially bias, but we need a for-sure confirmation.
 21 So to prevent all these situations to happen,
 22 the police situations, we ask you to please take into
 23 consideration. Thank you.
 24 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.
 25

Page 24

1 haven and seeking a way to provide a better opportunity
2 for their families.
3 So I know that the role of law enforcement is to
4 provide that peace, to serve and protect. And if we're
5 continuing to militarize, we're not serving that
6 purpose. So I hope the investment in this regulation
7 really provide them education and training into making
8 our community safer instead of more militarized.
9 I also wanted to speak to the piece around
10 religion. I know there was some discussion with the
11 board on what the identifier looks like. I do agree
12 it's important to be able to collect data to name their
13 specific religion, backgrounds and ethnicities.
14 Nationalities are being targeted.
15 However, it may be visible what religion I am
16 but may not be for another person of color. So I think
17 in order to make sure we're not falling into the trap of
18 continually stereotyping and going down this rabbit hole
19 of stereotyping by filling the box, but there should
20 even still be a narrative space for why the officer
21 chose to identify the person of that religion. Was it a
22 cross or symbol or something specific they were wearing
23 that caused them to feel they were of religious
24 background. And maybe use that to identify if there are
25 wrongful assumptions being made, if there are

1 stereotypes that are being mislabeled. And put those
2 learnings into trainings on how we're miscategorizing
3 individually or how we're correctly or incorrectly
4 identifying backgrounds to have more accurate
5 information and learning ahead. Thank you.
6 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.
7 -oOo-
8 STATEMENT OF TAYMAH JAHSI
9
10 MS. JAHSI: Hello. My name is Taymah Jahsi,
11 spelled T-A-Y-M-A-H, last name, J-A-H-S-I. I'm with
12 PICO, specifically Faith in the Valley here in Fresno.
13 We represent over 120 congregations here in the Valley.
14 Many of them went with us to the Capitol to make sure
15 AB 953 passed.
16 And we went there with the expectation with
17 racial profiling not ending tomorrow but sometime in
18 the future. Maybe our grandchildren wouldn't have to
19 face some of the pain we face.
20 So when I hear officers say it's too
21 time-consuming, I view that as an excuse. Because
22 what's more time-consuming is burying your child. I've
23 done that before. We heard from Mrs. Friday who's done
24 that.
25 And if we have the opportunity to collect

1 sufficient descriptive data in order to compile it and
2 interpret in a way that can identify how these officers
3 may be profiling folks, then that extra five or ten
4 minutes that it's costing them right now could save an
5 extra 500 lives in a couple years, and it will all be
6 worth it then.
7 So I'm asking you all, when you hear that
8 argument about time consumption that you let it bounce
9 off your ears because we're looking towards the future.
10 And in doing that, we have to spend the necessary time
11 focusing on those variables that are causing so many of
12 our people to suffer here.
13 I appreciate you all for hearing us out today.
14 I ask that you keep in mind the stories you heard and
15 the pain you heard when you're making those decisions
16 and finalizing the regulations.
17 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.
18 -oOo-
19 STATEMENT OF JULIA DUDLEY
20
21 MS. DUDLEY: Afternoon, to you. I definitely
22 wasn't slated to speak but I felt compelled to do so.
23 My name is Julia, J-U-L-I-A, D-U-D-L-E-Y.
24 And I have been a long time resident of Fresno,
25 but my roots are actually in San Jose. And I think

1 today is so important because my family has continually
2 had to go through racial profiling, even in front of my
3 house where we lived in a very affluent neighborhood
4 and we might have been one or two black families.
5 I watched my brother get beat up by nine or ten
6 cops because they didn't believe that was his house.
7 And I had to testify and watch these cops lie in court,
8 and it was traumatizing. Because he was in a car with
9 another non-black person, so they pulled him over and
10 assumed it wasn't his car. So that was my first
11 unfortunate incident with the police. And then it
12 continued, where I was always pulled over because of who
13 I was, because of being black and driving in a car down
14 a street where they felt I didn't belong.
15 Now we fast-forward here to Fresno, California,
16 where I live now. I'm a business owner. I'm an
17 entrepreneur. I'm also part of the African American
18 media. So I came here today, and we wanted to make sure
19 to have a story.
20 But I think it's also important I share my
21 story. And just last year, at the end of the year, we
22 were pulled over coming from my shop. We were
23 terrified. Me and my husband were very terrified. We
24 were in our car, which was a Mustang. The officer asked
25 what were we doing in a Mustang, why were we there,

1 where were we coming from. I was asked these -- this
 2 myriad of questions as if I didn't even belong being a
 3 business owner or even in my car.
 4 So that is not just happening to me but a whole
 5 bunch of people that look like me, a whole bunch of
 6 other black and brown folks that look like me. And I
 7 was shaking and I was terrified. And I shared it on
 8 Facebook. I couldn't get over it for weeks. And every
 9 time I saw an officer, all I could do was be fearful and
 10 look forward. And even when I was pulled over, I didn't
 11 know if we were going to be shot. No one was around.
 12 I'm looking around to see where I could -- who's
 13 watching and what I can do.
 14 No one should feel that terrified when they're
 15 pulled over by an officer. And loudly I remember
 16 speaking to the officer, letting him know, "Officer, I
 17 can't -- my license. It's in the back in my purse." And
 18 I was very scared to reach back. I'd already watched the
 19 Sandra Bland. Myself being a part of the media, it was
 20 a very terrifying experience for me.
 21 I've been stopped, my son's been stopped, my
 22 husband has been stopped, everyone's been stopped in my
 23 family. For what?
 24 And also being 15 years as an educator, as a
 25 state-mandated reporter, it was very important for me to

Page 49

1 write out paperwork. And when something happens in the
 2 classroom, you had to write it out. Time is nothing.
 3 Time is of the essence. And it's very important for us
 4 to take our time when we must write that report. When
 5 we must be a part of the solution versus the problem.
 6 If I didn't write about things that happened to
 7 my students, and they would tell me about stuff going on
 8 at home, should I be that teacher that says, heck, I
 9 don't have time to write that out? Should I have done
 10 that?
 11 So that's why it's so important for us to look
 12 at time as not an issue but part of it, to take the time
 13 to write that information down so we can see where the
 14 problem is and look forward to solutions.
 15 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.
 16 So since the public hearing is slated to go
 17 until 4:30, we sit and stay here until 4:30. That's how
 18 it works. So we will be here.
 19 Thank you for being here everybody who came,
 20 honestly. I'm just really pleased to see that -- the
 21 energy and commitment to ensure that AB 953 is
 22 effectively implemented because it's certainly
 23 consuming our lives. And it's just really great to have
 24 members of the public so participatory. So thank you so
 25 much.

Page 50

1 And if you want to speak and haven't done so, we
 2 have an open mic.
 3 (Whereupon the meeting concluded at
 4 4:30 p.m.)
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
 10
 11
 12
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

Page 51

1 STATE OF CALIFORNIA)
) ss.
 2 COUNTY OF FRESNO)
 3
 4 I, MIRANDA K. ANTHONY, Certified Shorthand
 5 Reporter, in and for the State of California, do hereby
 6 certify:
 7 That the foregoing proceedings were taken before
 8 me at the time and place herein set forth; that any
 9 witness in the foregoing proceedings, prior to
 10 testifying, were duly sworn; that a record of the
 11 proceedings was made by me using machine shorthand which
 12 was thereafter transcribed under my direction; that the
 13 foregoing is a true record of the testimony given.
 14 I further certify that I am neither financially
 15 interested in the action, nor a relative or employee of
 16 any attorney or party to this action.
 17 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have this date subscribed my
 18 name.
 19
 20 Dated: ___/___/___
 21
 22
 23 _____
 24 MIRANDA K. ANTHONY, CSR NO. 13453
 25

Page 52

Blank