

CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

ASSEMBLY BILL 953 STOP DATA REGULATIONS  
PUBLIC HEARING

---

Wednesday, January 18, 2017  
6:00-8:00 P.M.

---

TRANSCRIPTION OF RECORDED PROCEEDINGS

Chabot Elementary School  
Auditorium/Multi-Purpose Room  
6686 Chabot Road  
Oakland, California 94618

CAROL BIRKENFELD & ASSOCIATES  
Certified Shorthand Reporters  
53 West Shore Road, Belvedere, CA 94920  
Phone (415) 435-9765 Fax (415) 435-1825  
Email: info@birkenfeldreporting.com

STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC

PAGE

1		
2		
3	MICHAEL CHASE	10
4	SAMEENA USMAN	15
5	ALEXANDRA SANTA ANA	19
6	MATT NUSSBAUM	20
7	-o0o-	
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

APPEARANCES

From the Attorney General's Office, Civil Rights  
Enforcement Section (CRES):

SHANNON HOVIS, Chairperson  
NANCY BENIATI  
KATHLEEN V. RADEZ

From the California Justice Information Services  
Division (CJIS):

DOLORES HASTE  
ERIN CHOI

PROCEEDINGS

---

MS. HOVIS: So, hi. Good evening.  
Wow. I don't know if that sounds loud to  
you. It sounds loud to me.

Thank you for being here tonight. It's  
raining. It was raining during our hearing last  
week in L.A., too, which I thought would discourage  
everybody from coming, but we actually had a decent  
number of people in L.A. last week.

We really do appreciate your showing  
today. And, you know, public participation in the  
regulatory process is so important. So thank you  
for your presence.

My name is Shannon Hovis, and I'm a senior  
policy adviser here in the Attorney General's  
Office. With me are representatives of our Civil  
Rights Enforcement Section and our California  
Justice Information Services division, which are  
the two branches responsible for implementing The  
Racial and Identity Profiling Act.

So specifically we have Nancy Beniati, who  
is our supervising deputy attorney general in the  
Civil Rights Enforcement Section, Kathy Radez, who  
is an attorney in our Civil Rights Enforcement

1 Section, and Erin Choi and Dolores Haste, who are  
2 from CJIS, the California Justice Information  
3 Services division. Which is a mouthful, so we call  
4 them "CJIS." And we call them "CRES." So CRES and  
5 CJIS.  
6 It's approximately 6:11 p.m. on Wednesday,  
7 January 18th, 2017, and we're gathered here today  
8 at Chabot Elementary School in Oakland to receive  
9 public comments on the proposed stop data  
10 regulations recently posted by the California  
11 Department of Justice.  
12 The proposed regulations that we are  
13 concerned with today pertain to the collection of  
14 information regarding stops made by law enforcement  
15 agencies and are required by California's Racial  
16 and Identity Profiling Act of 2015, AB 953.  
17 To be clear, this is not a meeting of the  
18 Racial and Identity Profiling Advisory Board. So  
19 if you are coming for that meeting, we're sorry,  
20 we're not part of that board. Though Oscar Bobrow,  
21 who's over here, actually is part of that board.  
22 This is a public hearing during which you  
23 may provide comment on the proposed stop data  
24 regulations. If you are interested in the next  
25 RIPA board, Racial and Identity Profiling Advisory

Page 5

1 Board, hearing or meeting, the next meeting of that  
2 board is next Thursday, January 26th, at 10 a.m. in  
3 Fresno. And you can join us in Fresno.  
4 On December 9, 2016, the California  
5 Department of Justice posted the proposed text of  
6 the regulations, the Notice of Proposed Action,  
7 Initial Statement of Reasons and Fiscal Impact on  
8 our website at "oag.ca.gov/ab953/regulations."  
9 On December 9th, we also sent the  
10 notice to interested stakeholders to let them know  
11 that the proposed regulations had been posted.  
12 This notice also outlined the ability of members of  
13 the public to submit comments regarding the  
14 proposed regulations in writing or orally at  
15 today's hearing.  
16 We are holding one more public hearing  
17 next week, which will follow the RIPA board meeting  
18 in Fresno, if you would like to tell friends,  
19 colleagues, et cetera, about that. And last week  
20 we held a public hearing in Los Angeles.  
21 The full rulemaking file, including all of  
22 the rulemaking documents, documents relied upon to  
23 develop the proposed regulations and comments  
24 received to date are available in paper form at our  
25 DOJ offices in Oakland and in Los Angeles. And if

Page 6

1 you'd like to see the entire rulemaking file and  
2 information -- I'm sorry. If you'd like to see the  
3 entire rulemaking file, you may send an email to  
4 "ab953@doj.ca.gov."  
5 And all of these links that I've mentioned  
6 and email addresses are also listed in a one-pager  
7 that was in the back, that you should have received  
8 when you walked in. So I hopefully won't have to  
9 repeat those links and addresses multiple times.  
10 At the back of the room, for your  
11 reference, there are also copies of the proposed  
12 regulations.  
13 The format of today's hearing will be as  
14 follows: This is an opportunity for you to provide  
15 comments on the proposed stop data regulations.  
16 Each person will have four minutes to provide a  
17 statement about the regulations. For example, one  
18 statement may express your support or critique of  
19 certain data elements that we have proposed to  
20 collect in the regulations.  
21 We ask that you provide comments that are  
22 relevant to the stop data regulations, since the  
23 purpose of this hearing is to specifically provide  
24 comment on them. And this is not a question-and-  
25 answer period. It is our job in this hearing to

Page 7

1 hear you, to hear your input and your feedback.  
2 That means that we will be doing a lot of listening  
3 rather than talking.  
4 This entire hearing will also be recorded.  
5 And a transcript of the hearing and information  
6 presented to us during the hearing will be made  
7 part of the rulemaking record.  
8 If you've brought written comments with  
9 you today to submit to us, please give them to  
10 Kathy. If you wish to submit written comments or  
11 know of anybody else who may like to in the future,  
12 comments may be submitted to our office on our  
13 website, again, at "oag.ca.gov/ab953/regulations."  
14 And the deadline for submitting comments is next  
15 Friday, January 27th, at 5:00 p.m.  
16 We will consider all written and oral  
17 comments. They will all be addressed in our  
18 rulemaking documents. We will not respond  
19 individually to comments that are made.  
20 As you entered the room, you should have  
21 seen speaker cards at the back, on which you may  
22 write your name and the organization you represent,  
23 if you are here representing an organization. And  
24 when you come to the microphone to speak, please  
25 first just place the speaker card there, and then

Page 8

1 tell us your name and the organization you're with,  
2 if any. If you want to provide a comment  
3 anonymously, you may do that too. You do not have  
4 to say your name or fill out a speaker card.  
5 As you entered the room, you also should  
6 have seen a sign-in sheet. The sign-in sheet is  
7 voluntary. It's if you would like to receive  
8 notifications about AB 953, the regulations or the  
9 activities of the RIPA board. If you're already  
10 receiving them from us, you may sign in, or you  
11 don't have to. And unless you specify otherwise,  
12 if you request notifications from us, you will  
13 receive them by email and not by snail mail.  
14 So we'll now begin to take oral comments.  
15 When you would like to provide a comment, please  
16 line up behind the microphone.  
17 Like I said, every person will be allotted  
18 four minutes to keep with just general fairness.  
19 That's what we did in last week's hearing too.  
20 We'll continue that today, even though we'll  
21 probably have some dead time and space.  
22 We'll be here until 8 p.m. If you also  
23 are just planning to sort of monitor the hearing,  
24 you can hang out with us until 8 p.m. And we'll  
25 see who else -- if others trickle in.

1 And at this point, the microphone is  
2 essentially open to anybody who would like to kick  
3 us off. Thanks.  
4 STATEMENT BY MICHAEL CHASE  
5 MR. CHASE: Hello. I guess I'll take the  
6 plunge first.  
7 I didn't hear all -- everything you said,  
8 but I'll introduce myself. My name is Michael  
9 Chase, C-h-a-s-e. I'm a resident of Fremont.  
10 MS. BENIATI: Thank you for coming.  
11 MR. CHASE: Thank you.  
12 It took a little while to find it through  
13 all the streets, but I got here. So thanks for  
14 having me.  
15 I would like to say that I believe that  
16 effective implementation of AB 953 is essential to  
17 address racial and other biased policing that  
18 occurs in California. And I want to focus on  
19 "effective."  
20 I think that the proposed regulations have  
21 a lot going for them, which I appreciate. And if  
22 time permits, I'll get to those. But I would like  
23 to say that they must require data collection that  
24 will capture actual law enforcement practices. And  
25 that would include narrative or open fields where

1 officers provide factual detail and context for  
2 their stops. This is in contrast to a check-the-  
3 box-type approach, which I believe is the current  
4 approach.  
5 Narrative or open fields are especially  
6 important in two areas: One is reason for stop,  
7 and the second is basis for search.  
8 I would also like to make it a point that  
9 having police track what they do does not distract  
10 them from public safety; it's part of public  
11 safety. Making sure that the police are acting  
12 fairly and lawfully and that the burdens of being  
13 stopped and searched are not falling on some racial  
14 groups more than others is crucial, and it is part  
15 of the job of policing.  
16 I don't think that the full promise of  
17 AB 953 can be realized unless we have comprehensive  
18 and accurate data that can be analyzed by academics  
19 or other experts so that we can find real  
20 solutions, and those can be identified and  
21 implemented.  
22 I don't see a timer, so stop me when I run  
23 out.  
24 But I would like to also say that I think  
25 there are some things I liked about it. I like the

1 fact that -- I understand the officers include  
2 those who are in schools. I understand that there  
3 are some particular types of data asked for which  
4 are specific to schools, for example, referred to  
5 the school for discipline. I like the fact that  
6 consensual searches are included and that so-called  
7 frisks or pat downs are included as a search. I  
8 like that off-duty police officers are included. I  
9 understand that if they are working as peace  
10 officers for someone else, they will also be  
11 included. I like the fact that trans is included  
12 in the gender category.  
13 Okay. Thank you. You do have a timer. I  
14 appreciate that.  
15 And that there's a mention of mental  
16 health as well. So that's pretty much it.  
17 I think, um, I'll just be a little more  
18 specific about why I think "check the boxes" is  
19 problematic. I think that if you have a check-the-  
20 boxes approach in which every box is a legitimate  
21 reason, it reeks of kind of a leading question.  
22 I'm not an attorney. But the idea is: Which of  
23 these valid reasons did you have for a stop or a  
24 search?  
25 And I think if we allow them to say in

1 their own words why they did, we have a more -- a  
2 better opportunity to get at what is really  
3 happening with policing. And I think that's the  
4 key, is to get at what's really happening in  
5 policing. I guess --  
6 Okay. Time's up. Thank you very much for  
7 your time. I appreciate it.  
8 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
9 MS. BENIATI: Thank you.  
10 MS. HOVIS: Yeah. I forgot to say, we do  
11 have cards. It's like a stoplight.  
12 I suppose that for anybody that came here  
13 not knowing whether they have a comment or not yet,  
14 we have ample time to read over the regulations and  
15 see what they want to comment on. So if you're not  
16 positive.  
17 How did you hear about the hearing?  
18 MR. CHASE: About the hearing?  
19 MS. HOVIS: Mm-hmm.  
20 MR. CHASE: I heard about it through an  
21 organization that I'm involved in.  
22 THE REPORTER: I didn't hear the last  
23 part. An organization you're involved in?  
24 MR. CHASE: Yeah.  
25 THE REPORTER: Okay.

1 MS. HOVIS: Yeah. I only ask because I'm  
2 interested in how -- you know, how we're getting  
3 the word out, in addition to the email blasts that  
4 I'm sending -- that we're sending.  
5 MR. CHASE: I mean, I already knew about  
6 it. But I think out of the newspapers, local media  
7 outlets put it on sort of a calendar, what's going  
8 on. You probably already know that.  
9 Or like the local radio stations,  
10 sometimes they'll do like a local calendar, and  
11 they'll say something like this is what's happening  
12 this week. And sometimes they collect it.  
13 MS. BENIATI: Did we make that cut?  
14 MR. CHASE: Did we what?  
15 MS. BENIATI: Did we make that cut, where  
16 this was the happening thing on Wednesday night?  
17 MR. CHASE: No, I don't know. I don't  
18 know. I mean, they probably put it in the city  
19 council --  
20 MS. HOVIS: It was in the Capitol Alert --  
21 MS. BENIATI: Capitol Alert.  
22 MS. BENIATI: -- and the Sacramento Bee  
23 today.  
24 MR. CHASE: Oh, that's great.  
25 MS. HOVIS: So for the gentleman who's

1 just joining us, we have an open mic. It's four-  
2 minute comments. And the proposed regulations are  
3 in the back as well as other documents, if you'd  
4 like to grab anything.  
5 (Pause.)  
6 MS. HOVIS: I should add, too, that just  
7 because you provide oral comment does not mean you  
8 cannot also provide written comment. In fact, we  
9 encourage folks to do both. So please do.  
10 Even, you know, for Michael, who just  
11 testified, please feel free to submit in writing.  
12 (Pause.)  
13 MS. HOVIS: You have four minutes. I'll  
14 give you a one-minute warning.  
15 STATEMENT BY SAMEENA USMAN  
16 MS. USMAN: Hi. Well, I'm glad to know  
17 that I'm not late. I drove through about -- close  
18 to two hours' worth of traffic from the south bay  
19 to get here. So ...  
20 But as I was mentioning earlier, that our  
21 organization, we ended up going all the way to  
22 Sacramento to advocate for this bill. So two hours  
23 coming over here is nothing in comparison.  
24 So my name is Sameena Usman. I'm the  
25 government relations coordinator for the Council on

1 American-Islamic Relations. We're a nonprofit  
2 civil rights advocacy group that focuses on  
3 discrimination and hate crimes. And if there are  
4 any, you know, acts of harassment, school bullying,  
5 those are the types of things that we work on.  
6 Now, we advocated on AB 953 by sending  
7 folks from all over California to Sacramento to  
8 advocate for this bill. And it's interesting. I  
9 was just mentioning that we were told, when we were  
10 standing outside of the Governor's office, that it  
11 would take a miracle for him to sign this bill.  
12 And, lo and behold, the miracle happened, because  
13 he did sign the bill. And we were -- we were truly  
14 thrilled that the actions that were taken by all of  
15 these different coalition groups, these clergy  
16 members, these organizations, all and -- and just  
17 regular old citizens coming together to advocate on  
18 this bill. We were able to change the hearts and  
19 minds of both the elected officials and also the --  
20 the Governor as well.  
21 Now, the reason why this bill is so  
22 important to me and members of my organization and  
23 members of my community is that, you know, we have  
24 been seeing time and time again cases of either  
25 police misconduct or people who have been killed,











1 our office and implementing AB 953 and the activities of  
 2 the board, you can sign up. You'll become part of our  
 3 distribution list and receive notifications about what  
 4 we're up to.  
 5 Unless you specify otherwise, any correspondence  
 6 you receive by us, you will receive by email. You can  
 7 request by snail mail, if that is your preference, but  
 8 you will have to let us know that.  
 9 So we will now begin.  
 10 Do you want to call?  
 11 MS. BENINATI: Ill call people.  
 12 MS. HOVIS: Okay. So Nancy will just go ahead  
 13 and call folks' names.  
 14 THE PUBLIC: We have our own order.  
 15 MS. HOVIS: Okay. So just come up and state  
 16 your name.  
 17 MS. YSRAEL: Shannon, Nancy, I don't think --  
 18 MS. BENINATI: Just to kind of clarify on  
 19 Shannon's point, because we are transcribing this  
 20 hearing, we ask that you please be considerate of the  
 21 speaker and allow that person to speak. Because if more  
 22 than one voice is heard at the same time, the Court  
 23 Reporter can't get that down and that person's comment  
 24 might be lost or garbled. So just keep that in mind.  
 25 I do have -- we do have a public comment from

1 gender, so that will make six gender options available.  
 2 Two, to add learning disability in the school  
 3 setting. ADAH was one, hyperactivity, and others to  
 4 allow officers to add additional information relative to  
 5 school setting disabilities.  
 6 The third was to allow officers to check  
 7 religion if known, and another box, if unknown.  
 8 And, lastly, to eliminate -- there was a  
 9 recommendation in the regulations to have limited  
 10 English or accent. And to delete the accent only,  
 11 just to check limited English proficiency.  
 12 The board unanimously voted that we forward all  
 13 of those recommendations to the Department of Justice  
 14 for their consideration and any potential modifications  
 15 to the regulations.  
 16 That is our report.  
 17 MS. BENINATI: Thank you.  
 18 So will the next member of the public please  
 19 come up. And when you do, can you please spell your  
 20 name for the Court Reporter.  
 21 -oOo-  
 22 STATEMENT OF PASTOR AARON PRATT  
 23  
 24 MR. PRATT: Good evening. Or should I say  
 25 "afternoon"? My name is Pastor Aaron D. Pratt. I want

1 the co-chair of the Racial Identity Profiling Board,  
 2 Mr. Ed Medrano, who would like to read the board's  
 3 recommendations.  
 4 MR. MEDRANO: Thank you. My name is Ed Medrano,  
 5 and I'm one of the co-chairs for the RIPA board which  
 6 just met earlier.  
 7 The board did make some recommendations for the  
 8 Department of Justice to consider. Prior to making  
 9 those recommendations, the board considered formal  
 10 comments that were submitted by other board members,  
 11 considered comments made by the public prior to the  
 12 board meeting, as well as public comment that was  
 13 delivered today. Many of you were here today.  
 14 Just a quick synopsis of what was voted on and  
 15 what was recommended to the Department of Justice.  
 16 First off, in terms of the regulations, there was a  
 17 recommendation and motion that passed for a narrative  
 18 box to be included for "reason of the stop" and the  
 19 "basis for the stop" and anywhere else there is an  
 20 "other" box to allow the officers to fill in a  
 21 narrative. That was the first recommendation.  
 22 In addition to that, a couple different items  
 23 were added relative to information about the person  
 24 that was stopped. The first item is to add a box that  
 25 can allow officers to check LGBT in terms of

1 to say thank you to the Department of Justice for your  
 2 diligence in, you know, facilitating this, AB 953. It  
 3 has been a diligent and very arduous road, and we're  
 4 still going uphill.  
 5 So what -- I want to say a few things, but I need  
 6 to frame it up right so you can know a little bit about  
 7 me so when I give you these things that I feel I still  
 8 want to work on you will understand where I come from.  
 9 So who am I? I am a pastor. I am a college  
 10 graduate. Two universities, Syracuse, chemical  
 11 engineering cum laude; and Cal Berkeley, human services  
 12 degree.  
 13 Why did I chose pastory? Well, as a Navy SEAL,  
 14 SEAL Team 5, graduate of Class 189, I found out that  
 15 science was real. And in order to do some of the  
 16 processes, running the actions on the USS Enterprise, or  
 17 the Kittyhawk, riding in humvees, extracting prisoners,  
 18 extracting hostages, I found that documentation was  
 19 absolutely necessary. I found out that chemistry --  
 20 without me being able to measure variables, I couldn't  
 21 come up with a solution.  
 22 So I'm still perplexed as to why we meet and we  
 23 pondering trying to figure a way of -- you know, the new  
 24 word, new vernacular, is "alternative facts."  
 25 I want to know why we are still having a problem

1 about -- of explaining. I did a lot of writing. A lot of  
 2 that writing that I did in Iran was on the roof while 32  
 3 of my men, under fire, some of them died. But I had to  
 4 make a report in this handheld recorder when I was  
 5 calling for help.  
 6 I don't understand why the Rules of Engagement  
 7 that I had to follow on foreign soil, our public  
 8 servants have a problem with right here. I don't  
 9 understand anything about my beautiful country, America.  
 10 I have problems. PTSD, anxiety. I have issues.  
 11 And I come home only to find out that my war has just  
 12 begun.  
 13 So I want to know why we have the issue of  
 14 explaining. Why does the officer have a problem hitting  
 15 his camera? Why does the officer or technology, mind  
 16 you -- why can't they do what we did in humvees, make  
 17 the report and come back and file it? What is this  
 18 issue about time? Isn't life precious? Don't we as a  
 19 whole in society matter?  
 20 I never -- I promise you -- I promise you, when  
 21 I jumped out those helicopters, I didn't care what color  
 22 those people were. I didn't care what they stood for.  
 23 I had one mission, and that was to serve this country.  
 24 How about my country serve me?  
 25 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.

Page 13

1 MS. BENINATI: The next speaker, please.  
 2 -oOo-  
 3 STATEMENT OF VICTORIA CASTILLO  
 4  
 5 MS. CASTILLO: Good afternoon, members of the  
 6 DOJ and others. My name is Victoria Castillo,  
 7 V-I-C-T-O-R-I-A, C-A-S-T-I-L-L-O. I am from Merced  
 8 County.  
 9 I am going to again read some excerpts from  
 10 citizens. And why I'm doing this is because I really  
 11 took into consideration some of the back-and-forth that  
 12 was going on between the board earlier as far as unique  
 13 identifiers for officers. And I feel, personally, that  
 14 this is important in order to review and establish a  
 15 pattern of prejudice and/or abuse. It's not something  
 16 I -- I, myself, do public records requests often, and I  
 17 never come across any personal information from  
 18 officers, other than if they were involved in a specific  
 19 situation with an individual. And I never got anything  
 20 like identifying officers' homes or any other personal  
 21 information that could put that individual in danger.  
 22 Part of these citizen complaints are from  
 23 different individual and specific officers from Merced  
 24 Police Department. Part of this says, "At one point,  
 25 Penner walked to his vehicle and pressed something. We

Page 14

1 believe he may have disabled his dash camera. With this  
 2 and the fact that officers' weapons -- two officers --  
 3 were unbuttoned, both my friends and I had reasonable  
 4 fear of being killed or seriously injured.  
 5 "The officers did tell these individuals that  
 6 they could not record. And after that, they  
 7 subsequently went to the vehicle and the light that was  
 8 on was shut off, after he pressed the button."  
 9 The response to our request to this individual  
 10 was: "The information provided is not specific enough  
 11 to our search. Could you please provide more  
 12 information, such as time and day and location of the  
 13 incident to produce the dispatcher logs of the  
 14 incident."  
 15 Now, with our local departments, they have  
 16 sophisticated software, so that's the first and last  
 17 name and date of birth of an individual or even a  
 18 license plate number can give us this information. But  
 19 yet that information was not entered in the database.  
 20 So as far as myself and -- just for background,  
 21 both of the individuals that were in this citizen  
 22 complaint that were together, they are relatives, and  
 23 they're both Mexican; they both have beautiful brown  
 24 skin.  
 25 Another citizen complaint, from a different

Page 15

1 individual: "During the encounter I felt I was treated  
 2 like human trash, and I was in physical pain. I had to  
 3 call into my place of work and explain what took place  
 4 because after the experience, I was not the right state  
 5 of mind to work and had pressure and a swollen hand.  
 6 The incident has left me traumatized, and I feel no  
 7 matter how I attempt to better my life, Merced police  
 8 will continue to find ways to assault, harass or even  
 9 kill me. I feel I live with this fear every single day.  
 10 This is not acceptable for people in my community to be  
 11 treated so disrespectfully and without regard for their  
 12 rights. I'm not on probation or parole, even if I were,  
 13 the way I've been treated repeatedly dehumanizes, to say  
 14 the least."  
 15 And during this actual incident, I was called  
 16 by the people that were being stopped in his car. And  
 17 both of these citizen complaints did not result in  
 18 arrest, but in both incidents the people in the car  
 19 were both brown-skinned. And I went onto the scene, and  
 20 these both happened in October of 2016. And I was on  
 21 foot filming the law enforcement officers and the  
 22 situation at a reasonable distance and was given a  
 23 misdemeanor citation for reckless driving but I was not  
 24 in my vehicle. So now I'm facing a trial for that I'm  
 25 going to be facing.

Page 16

1 So I just wanted to put that out there, that  
 2 data is crucial and unique identifiers are important.  
 3 Thank you.  
 4 MS. BENINATI: Thank you very much.  
 5 -oOo-  
 6 STATEMENT OF IRENE ARMENDARIZ  
 7  
 8 MS. ARMENDARIZ: Hello. My name is Irene  
 9 Armendariz, I-R-E-N-E, A-R-M-E-D-A-R-I-Z. I'm from  
 10 Merced, California, and I support the unique identifier.  
 11 Like I said earlier, I have a brother who has  
 12 been diagnosed with schizophrenic tendency through the  
 13 harassment of the Merced Police Department, and he is  
 14 now looking at several years of prison. It's been a  
 15 burden on our family to come up with the money that we  
 16 don't have to get a lawyer so he can get help for his  
 17 mental condition. And I just believe the information on  
 18 officers is needed to see if there's any specific  
 19 patterns of prejudices or abuse. Thank you.  
 20 MS. BENINATI: Thank you.  
 21 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
 22 -oOo-  
 23 STATEMENT BY DENISE FRIDAY-HALL  
 24  
 25 MS. FRIDAY-HALL: Good afternoon. My name is

1 Denise Friday, D-E-N-I-S-E, Friday, as in the day of the  
 2 week, Hall. And I'm here because of the identity and  
 3 the protocol of racial profiling, because my son was  
 4 assassinated by Officer David Wells because of the color  
 5 of his skin. So what I'm trying to say is that I feel  
 6 like, in a police-involved shooting, are the police  
 7 above the law? When they go to the -- the Article of  
 8 Police, the Bill of Rights, I want to know all the laws  
 9 were written in an era where things were different.  
 10 Now, things are different now. How come the law can't  
 11 be revised where a police officer involved in a police  
 12 shooting is not tested for drugs or alcohol after  
 13 involved shooting? And what is the actual protocol  
 14 when they are in an involved shooting? When the  
 15 commanding officer steps on the scene, is the commanding  
 16 officer -- is he surrendering his weapon to him?  
 17 And then, on the other hand, I want to know  
 18 that, are they taken immediately to go get tested?  
 19 Okay. And then once they get to the office and they  
 20 begin their report, if they're not verbally able to  
 21 speak their report, are they able to -- I mean, write it  
 22 out in a report? Do they get an opportunity to verbally  
 23 say their report in a panel or something like that?  
 24 So I would like to know, what is that protocol  
 25 when a police officer shoots someone in the community

1 and something like that.  
 2 And the other thing is that, when bus drivers  
 3 have an accident on the street, they're tested for drugs  
 4 or alcohol. So what makes the men in blue above the law  
 5 where they can't be tested for drugs or alcohol?  
 6 Because that Article in that Bill of Rights for them --  
 7 that needs to be changed, because that law is outdated.  
 8 And then, the other thing is that, when they  
 9 have chance -- when they have their body camera, I feel  
 10 like once the body camera is activated, then it should  
 11 not be deactivated. And if it is, it should be  
 12 automatically reset to turn back on, because this is to  
 13 protect the officer as well as the citizen that is being  
 14 engaged with the law enforcement officer.  
 15 So I feel like they should not have control of  
 16 activating or deactivating the body cam when they're  
 17 involved in a situation where the whole truth could be  
 18 really seen and told if they not cutting their video  
 19 cameras off and on.  
 20 And the third thing is that, when they approach  
 21 people, they should de-escalate; they should -- okay.  
 22 They should be able to have training to de-escalate  
 23 situations instead of escalating them. Because, like we  
 24 say, we have a lot of people out there with a lot of  
 25 issues. And if they just took the time to analyze the

1 situation, maybe they wouldn't have to shoot to kill.  
 2 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
 3 -oOo-  
 4 STATEMENT BY MARIA LOPEZ  
 5  
 6 MS. LOPEZ: Maria Lopez from Long Beach. Maria,  
 7 M-A-R-I-A, and Lopez, L-O-P-E-Z.  
 8 I'm very glad to see that everyone on this table  
 9 appears to be -- may not identify but appears to be a  
 10 woman. I also stand here as a woman, a brown Latin  
 11 woman, a queer, gender nonconforming one, an  
 12 undocumented, documented woman, a woman in poverty, a  
 13 first generation woman, a (words spoken in Spanish.)  
 14 I do not choose which one to be a day. I'm all  
 15 of them every single day. All of this cannot fill in  
 16 blocks but can be described in a small narrative if you  
 17 took the time to see the importance in all that makes me  
 18 who I am.  
 19 When I hear people say they want to be a police  
 20 officer because they want to make a difference, I say,  
 21 "You have a chance with AB 953 to make a difference."  
 22 I commend the RIPA board on their  
 23 recommendations that will impact the lives of the most  
 24 vulnerable in our communities. Today is a day that will  
 25 go down in our people's history as a day we took a step

1 towards justice. Thank you.  
2 MS. BENINATI: Do you do poetry? You're very  
3 poetic.  
4 MS. LOPEZ: No, I don't.  
5 -oOo-  
6 STATEMENT OF NICOLE REMBLE  
7  
8 MS. REMBLE: Hello, Board. My name is Nicole  
9 Remble, N-I-C-O-L-E, R-E-M-B-L-E.  
10 I'll just start off with this. I've seen racial  
11 profiling. They told me to go to school. "No one will  
12 harass you." I'm gay. I don't look like a fem all the  
13 time. There's been times where cops looked at me and  
14 thought I was a man. It could have went another way,  
15 sometimes my partner say, when we're pulled over in the  
16 car 'cause I like to speed sometime. Sometimes I'm  
17 scared of the police. We shouldn't be scared at all.  
18 All we ask for is accountability. That's it.  
19 Write down what happened; tell us why. And we'll trust  
20 you more; you can trust us more, and we'll be in peace.  
21 I'm all about peace, love, and happiness. That's all  
22 you need; right? This is the first step. That's it.  
23 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
24  
25

1 -oOo-  
2 STATEMENT OF GENEVA NICHOLSON  
3  
4 MS. NICHOLSON: My name's Geneva Nicholson. It's  
5 G-E-N-E-A; last name Nicholson, N-I-C-H-O-L-S-O-N.  
6 And I usually don't tell my story. But today,  
7 hearing everyone's story, made me think about the times  
8 I had felt discriminated against and how I was profiled.  
9 And growing up, I grew up in an abusive home,  
10 and there were times when my dad would beat the shit out  
11 of us, but we were too afraid to call the police  
12 because we didn't want anything to happen to him because  
13 we loved him. So as you hear your mom screaming and  
14 begging for help, there was nothing I can do to save  
15 her. I couldn't save her, because I was risking him.  
16 And to live with the trauma of that, knowing  
17 that even though he's abusing all of us, and he does  
18 deserve some type of punishment, to have him killed I  
19 knew wasn't the punishment.  
20 So instead we endeavored years of abuse from  
21 him, because we were too afraid to call the police. And  
22 so often, whenever we would try to reach out for help,  
23 the community would tell us that we couldn't.  
24 And I don't ever want anybody to have to grow up  
25 like that. You have no idea what it does to you, to

1 constantly have to be perfect in order to fit in a  
2 system that's never going to respect, never going to  
3 love you. And no matter how much you change yourself,  
4 it still isn't enough.  
5 So I would like the board to take into account  
6 all the stories you've heard today, all the things you  
7 heard, because the community is crying for help and no  
8 one is listening to us. Thank you.  
9 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
10 -oOo-  
11 STATEMENT OF ANDREA DONADO  
12  
13 MS. DONADO: Andrea Donado. A-N-D-E -- D-R-E-A,  
14 and Donado is D-O-N-A-D-O.  
15 I'm with the Greater Long Beach Interfaith  
16 Community Organization, and we also are here  
17 representing ICO organization, which is made up 60  
18 organizations. And we applaud the recommendations from  
19 the RIPA board. And we ask you to consider them and  
20 actually take them.  
21 In Long Beach, actually some time ago, we had a  
22 case in which a white police officer was stopping an  
23 undocumented woman and impounded their cars, because he  
24 knew that most likely they won't have any papers.  
25 So this woman that come normally from very

1 poor communities were facing all the economic  
2 challenges that comes when a car is impounded for them.  
3 A lot of them, they couldn't even take the car back.  
4 They couldn't fight anything because they were  
5 undocumented and they were in fear of the police.  
6 And this was just happening to very brown,  
7 Mexican-looking woman. I myself can drive there,  
8 because I have lighter skin and wouldn't stop me.  
9 We need also a narrative, because there's a  
10 lot of times in which (unintelligible); how can we  
11 include "other" when there's so many rights of options.  
12 So we are in favor of the narrative, instead of the  
13 other part.  
14 And also we need to know what is the race of  
15 the police that's stopping these people. Because we  
16 need to know whether or not it's Latinos going against  
17 Latinos, or is whites going for anybody else -- or  
18 blacks. Or how is the interaction going? And it can be  
19 that there's also black/brown police officers that  
20 are racially bias, but we need a for-sure confirmation.  
21 So to prevent all these situations to happen,  
22 the police situations, we ask you to please take into  
23 consideration. Thank you.  
24 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
25

1 -oOo  
 2 STATEMENT OF ROSA AQUEEL  
 3  
 4 MS. AQUEEL: Hi, again. Rosa Aqueel, first name  
 5 R-O-S-A; last name A-Q-E-E-L, with Policy Link.  
 6 Again, just want to thank all of you for your  
 7 incredible work today. I want to say that I really  
 8 appreciate that the previous public comment hearings  
 9 were held in the evening. It's something I know PL has  
 10 raised repeatedly. So we really appreciate that you  
 11 accommodate that. That was very, very meaningful.  
 12 In terms of the regulations, I just want to  
 13 bring your attention to the letter that you had received  
 14 that was signed by the ACLU, Policy Link, and others,  
 15 that does -- definitely encompasses all of the concerns  
 16 that we have.  
 17 And I just wanted to draw your attention, in  
 18 particular, to Page 4 that focuses on the duration of  
 19 stats. It was mentioned briefly in the board meeting,  
 20 but I just wanted to make the case for why we think it's  
 21 really important that we include more accurate, specific  
 22 information. Where there is a stop that is 60 minutes  
 23 or longer, for example, the regulations currently  
 24 would only capture that it was over 60 minutes. But we  
 25 think there is a big difference between someone who is

Page 25

1 stopped for 60 minutes and three hours or four hours.  
 2 Right.  
 3 I had a conversation with a young woman who was  
 4 stopped for two hours, face down on the concrete. She  
 5 was a young girl. She was coming home from school, being  
 6 harassed by the police, terrified, 12 years old, for  
 7 two hours.  
 8 And so those kinds of data points I think are  
 9 really important to making sure that we're really  
 10 understanding the full meaning of the data being  
 11 collected.  
 12 Finally, I would just say again that I think  
 13 all of the stories that have been shared, while not  
 14 directly about a specific regulation, they're all about  
 15 the regulations; right? And that I think having the  
 16 stories and the actual testimonies of folks helps  
 17 build humanity into regulations that can at times seem  
 18 dry.  
 19 And so really just appreciate the work you have  
 20 in front of you and just really want to thank you for  
 21 that.  
 22 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
 23 MS. BENINATI: Thank you.  
 24  
 25

Page 26

1 -oOo  
 2 STATEMENT OF ALFREDO AGUERO  
 3  
 4 MR. AGUERO: My name is Alfredo Aguero. And I  
 5 want to start with something I read this morning.  
 6 "There's a reason why we change. One, either because we  
 7 learn a lot and we decide change or we been hurt so  
 8 much that we have to change."  
 9 I like to say thanks, though, for taking in  
 10 consideration for recommendation you made for Prop  
 11 AB 953.  
 12 But I'd like to say that -- like I mentioned  
 13 before, we need help in a special location because our  
 14 kids, the kids with the special needs, a lot of times  
 15 they don't even talk. They get home with scratches,  
 16 bruises, and the schools, they don't know why. Nobody  
 17 say anything.  
 18 And sometimes people said, you know what, they  
 19 was scared and in crisis and the officers come and try  
 20 to restrain them. They can't say anything.  
 21 So really we have to do something. Like I  
 22 said, if we train our officers how to deal with these  
 23 issues, that's going to help a lot. We don't got to see  
 24 these kids get in all these kinds of situations because  
 25 depression, anxiety, mental illness is one of the

Page 27

1 strongest parts in special ed kids.  
 2 I have one. My son is -- he got special needs.  
 3 And we know how it feels to see your kid getting home  
 4 and can't tell you what happened because they been  
 5 bullied. All this kind of stuff happen to them on the  
 6 schools.  
 7 We supposed to get our schools (sic) to the schools  
 8 to be protected, from the teachers who teach them. And  
 9 sometimes they get the bullying even from them, from the  
 10 same people, from the same school, from the same  
 11 teachers.  
 12 So if we don't do something for them, our  
 13 society is crooked. Everybody is crooked. If I don't  
 14 offer them and I know what happened there, I'm doing  
 15 something wrong. Because we are the voice. Our  
 16 community is tired. We have to start working. And the  
 17 only way we can do this is the officers have to be  
 18 more response -- responsible for what they doing if  
 19 they doing something wrong and get a congratulations if  
 20 they do something right.  
 21 But we, as a community, I think we deserve  
 22 respect. Because we like to trust the officers. But if  
 23 they don't help us, impossible. It's all I want to  
 24 say. Thank you.  
 25 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.

Page 28

1 MS. BENINATI: Thank you.  
2 -oOo-  
3 STATEMENT OF TERRANCE STEWART  
4  
5 MR. STEWART: Hello. My name is Terrance  
6 Stewart. T-E-R-R-A-N-C-E, S-T-E-W-A-R-T.  
7 I kind of highlighted this earlier. There's two  
8 things I really want to highlight. The first is that I  
9 was racial profiled a lot as a youth. And every time  
10 it happened -- I was racially profiled a lot to the  
11 point where, like I said, I could tell the different  
12 shifts, like what police worked on what shift. I knew  
13 the whole police force because every time they pulled me  
14 over, there's police in the car, and slowly you get to  
15 knowing everybody.  
16 I watched rookies become lieutenants over the  
17 course of time, you know. And every time I was stopped  
18 by the police, I was -- put a gun on one. But the other  
19 thing was I was touched in a way in which I didn't find  
20 appropriate. You know, they touched my genitals. They  
21 touched, like, my buttocks area because they were  
22 looking for something on me. So they'd bring me to the  
23 point where I was stopped a whole lot of times but I  
24 only went to jail a few times.  
25 So I hear the argument of "wasting time" and

Page 29

1 "too much time" to go to fill out a piece of paper. But  
2 it was a whole lot of time that they wasted pulling me  
3 over when they only arrested me like once or twice.  
4 And they pulled me over many of times, you know.  
5 And so I think if they stop racially profiling,  
6 they'll have more time. You know, that's one thing.  
7 And then the other thing is -- is that I work with  
8 Alfredo, and we do work with special education, you  
9 know. And it's a growing -- everybody knows it. Mental  
10 health is that -- a lot of people being arrested and  
11 profiled and type of stuff, they do have mental  
12 illnesses.  
13 So I'd like to highlight the part that you all  
14 said before, about putting a box there about the mental  
15 illnesses, because I believe that has a lot to do -- and  
16 now the jail is starting to become the biggest mental  
17 health provider for people with mental illnesses. And I  
18 believe that it should be some type of mechanism that we  
19 can help people that are mentally ill before they go to  
20 jail.  
21 And I say -- that's all I have to say. But every  
22 life has a value, you know. And like it's happening  
23 real fast. The first -- what is it? -- three minutes,  
24 two minutes is where people are being killed.  
25 And if it's people being racially profiled and

Page 30

1 people are mentally ill are the people that are catching  
2 the end -- the excessive force or the violence, then  
3 it's something we have to try to do to put a stop to it.  
4 I don't honestly believe that AB 953 will be the  
5 complete answer, but I do believe it will be a step in  
6 the right way. Thank you.  
7 -oOo-  
8 STATEMENT OF BRANDON STURDIVANT  
9  
10 MR. STURDIVANT: It's Brandon Sturdivant,  
11 B-R-A-N-D-O-N, S-T-U-R-D-I-V-A-N-T, working with People  
12 of California, also part of Hope for Community  
13 Organizations.  
14 So first, I hope folks really appreciate the  
15 level of trauma that the people in this audience are  
16 doing right now, to recount stories that seriously  
17 impacted us in our development and in our lives.  
18 Imagine having to interact with a person who abused you  
19 consistently. That is what we have to do. And even  
20 being in the space with law enforcement officers who are  
21 saying it's too much to collect data, to me it's an  
22 abuser telling me I'm not gonna stop and I don't  
23 actually want to take negativisms (sic) to stop, I'm  
24 fine with what I'm doing.  
25 So a lot of trauma in this room. That's the

Page 31

1 first thing.  
2 Second thing is, there's a duel line here. And  
3 I don't want to misstate AB 953, about what the board  
4 issue brought up. But the thing is, folks in this room  
5 and so many folks outside mobilized, over a thousand  
6 people, and sat on the lawn outside the Capitol to make  
7 sure that this thing is passed, right, to bring our  
8 work to fruition, to make sure we have the opportunity  
9 to collect this data. So the folks here are directly  
10 responsible for this legislation, for this effort. And  
11 we're proud to see what happened with the  
12 recommendations today. We want to see that continue  
13 forward implementation.  
14 I was not a part of AB 953. I actually sat out.  
15 The reason why I sat out was because my uncle was beaten  
16 to death by the Oakland police. Not shot, not tased.  
17 Like billy clubs. Nine officers beat him until he  
18 expired.  
19 My cousin was shot in the back, killed by the  
20 Oakland police. I got something on it, but it was just  
21 weak narrative, weak-ass narrative, that didn't explain  
22 exactly what happened.  
23 So for me, and knowing other folks who  
24 experienced police brutality, I thought what the hell  
25 are we doing. But the folks in this audience inspired

Page 32

1 me to step off the sidelines over the last year and  
2 work. I've been throwing myself into it actually and  
3 confront something that has caused trauma to my entire  
4 family.  
5 So we want to see the recommendations move  
6 forward as we saw fit. We want to see over this next  
7 period that you're not going to (unintelligible). We want  
8 to see more data, as much as possible, especially --  
9 especially around -- the data around the minutes that  
10 folks are being held. We don't want to see checkboxes.  
11 If you hold somebody for 60 minutes, put 60. If you  
12 hold them for five hours, put five hours. We need to  
13 know down to a "T".  
14 Last thing, I'm really, really concerned about  
15 the implementation of this. So what happens when law  
16 enforcement doesn't do it? What happens when we get  
17 back crappy data? We've done public records requests  
18 for the Sheriff's Department in Alameda County and  
19 gotten back crap, like receipts for coffee, stuff like  
20 that, just paper. So I'm really concerned, and I'm  
21 wondering, how do we make sure these regulations move  
22 forward and hit the ground.  
23 And the last thing is, for me, this is about an  
24 ark. This moment is about public safety transformation.  
25 We can't get it without the data. But this is the

1 beginning. So we have to start off on a good foot and  
2 push back on the law enforcement officers who are  
3 consistently sending a message that they want to do as  
4 little as possible. Thank you.  
5 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
6 -oOo-  
7 STATEMENT OF KENA CADOR  
8  
9 MS. CADOR: Hello. My name is Kena Cador,  
10 K-E-N-A, C-A-D-O-R. I'm here on behalf of the ACLU of  
11 Northern California, Fresno office.  
12 I want to start by saying that I think the  
13 stories today demonstrate the undeniable human element  
14 involved in police interactions. It also highlights the  
15 need for effective data.  
16 The ACLU commends DOJ and AOG for their  
17 consideration and adoption of recommendations made by  
18 advocacy organizations over the past several months.  
19 The proposed regulations reflect recommendations  
20 related to perceived identities and any stops of youth,  
21 particularly of youth on and around school grounds or in  
22 the school setting. However, the ACLU and many other  
23 advocacy organizations are very concerned in certain  
24 aspects of proposed recommendations and have submitted  
25 written comments to the DOJ and AOG as part of the

1 rule-making process. I also have copies if anybody needs  
2 it.  
3 In particular, we support the RIPA board  
4 recommendations to require use of open text fields with  
5 respect to data elements of reason for stop, basis for  
6 search, and any data value that refers to "other." The  
7 proposed regulations must require data collection that  
8 captures actual law enforcement practices by including  
9 these open field texts where officers provide factual  
10 detail and context for their stops.  
11 We also believe that the regulation should  
12 require officers to provide a description of the actual  
13 location of the stop, such as sidewalk, public  
14 transportation, public housing or building, to provide  
15 context about where these stops are taking place and  
16 what that might mean. Moreover, there are several data  
17 elements that we believe the data value is offered use  
18 time periods that do not allow for sufficient detail to  
19 echo the duration of the stop that others have  
20 mentioned, the perceived age of person stopped and  
21 officers' years of experience.  
22 Finally, we think there needs to be multiple  
23 data values added in response to data element for  
24 actions taken by officer during stop. The -- we  
25 might -- we suggest additional values such as other

1 agency called to the scene or unit, unbuttoning the  
2 holster or grabbing the weapon.  
3 I think that the importance of AB 953 cannot be  
4 overstated, especially as evidenced by the public  
5 participation here today, making sure police are acting  
6 fairly and lawfully and that burdens of being stopped  
7 and searched are not falling on some racial groups more  
8 than others is crucial and is part of the job. Thank  
9 you.  
10 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
11 -oOo-  
12 STATEMENT OF CRISANTEMA GALLARDO  
13  
14 MS. GALLARDO: Hi, everyone. My name is  
15 Crisantema Gallardo, C-R-I-S-A-N-T-E-M-A,  
16 G-A-L-L-A-R-D-O.  
17 As I spoke earlier, I'm from Merced, and I  
18 really want to lift up the importance of ensuring that  
19 we have individual and personal identifications for  
20 peace officers.  
21 You can go into any (speaking in Spanish) --  
22 any hood, and people in the community, well, they know  
23 what streets, what police officers are stopping our  
24 community members.  
25 In my community, on Winway near a church,

1 there's a white police officer that will park his  
2 vehicle there and stop brown and dark-skinned people for  
3 no reason. I think it's really important for us to be  
4 able to identify which law enforcement officers are the  
5 ones doing this.  
6 Again, I'm really happy to be here today,  
7 because we were there in 2015 pushing AB 953, because we  
8 know it's the beginning to any (unintelligible) in our  
9 community. And I say "beginning" because it's not going  
10 to end all the injustice that we're living as people of  
11 color in this state, but it is going to ensure that we  
12 hold law enforcement officers, individual folks,  
13 accountable so that they can do the job they're supposed  
14 to be doing, so they can really build trust with our  
15 communities.  
16 Again, I also think it's really important for  
17 our community groups to have access to the data. And  
18 not just community groups, but myself as an individual  
19 who has a brother that is in and out of prison and dad  
20 who was formerly incarcerated, I want to have access to  
21 all the data. So we need to create, like, a clear plan  
22 of how we as community members can know no who -- which  
23 officers are stopping who in our community and what  
24 ethnicities are being stopped the most. Thank you.  
25 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.

1 -oOo-  
2 STATEMENT OF BOBBI BUTTS  
3  
4 MS. BUTTS: First of all, I'd like to give our  
5 praises to God. He's the love of my life.  
6 My name is Bobbi Butts, B-O-B-B-I, B-U-T-T-S.  
7 I'm with a lot of different organizations. I was at the  
8 legislators office making sure the Transparency Bill  
9 came through.  
10 I just know that being as dark skinned as I am,  
11 I have witnessed and been the part of a lot of racial  
12 profiling, especially living in Tennessee and out here  
13 in California as well.  
14 I'm raising a son who wants to be a  
15 cardiologist and he plays instruments. But I know  
16 he'll grow up and be a big, black guy. So I know if I  
17 don't put my feet to the ground today and tomorrow, I'm  
18 probably not giving my son the chance that he deserves.  
19 So I just want to thank you all in the  
20 Department of Justice for just having our back and  
21 continuing to work with us with regards to this system  
22 that is so injustice to people of color. Thank you.  
23 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
24 THE PUBLIC: One people, one fight. One people.  
25 One fight.

1 -oOo-  
2 STATEMENT OF GREG JONES  
3  
4 MR. JONES: Good afternoon. I'm going to take  
5 this thing off. I'm sorry. My name is Greg Jones. I'm  
6 within the Congregation out for Change. And there are a  
7 couple things that really -- that really resonated with  
8 me.  
9 One of them is, you know, how can a group of  
10 individuals who don't want there to be transparency  
11 decide how transparency is going to be implemented. I  
12 cannot get past that in my mind to understand how a  
13 group of -- a group of individuals who we're trying to  
14 hold accountable, as a society, as taxpayers, as  
15 citizens, sometimes it's victims, how we want to correct  
16 the system that has been flawed since its inception.  
17 We all know that police officers were founded on  
18 the slave patrol. They would capture runaway slaves  
19 and, to tell the truth, they pretty much operate the  
20 same way today.  
21 When slavery ended -- before slavery ended,  
22 excuse me, the prison system was 95 percent white.  
23 Afterwards, it was 97 percent black. That's no mistake.  
24 The prison system was put in and perpetrated on  
25 African Americans in order to keep free labor going.

1 And today it operates the same exact way. Please, if  
2 you don't believe me, do your research.  
3 The problem is that I myself don't consider  
4 myself a free man because I have to do things that I  
5 don't want to do. I don't any adult that has to do  
6 things they don't want to do.  
7 But the problem is, when you have a system  
8 that's breathing over you and it has individuals who are  
9 equal to you, equal to you, equal to you, are telling  
10 you -- are making you feel that the system no longer  
11 applies to them, the rules no longer apply to them, and  
12 all they have to do is claim to feel fear and they can  
13 take your life, take your life with zero accountability.  
14 And we sit here and act as if that's the norm. We sit  
15 here and act as if that's necessary in order for America  
16 to be great again. Like that's what it has to be like.  
17 My children tremble in fear. They've seen me  
18 become a victim of police brutality. They still talk  
19 about it to this day, every time it comes up. It  
20 doesn't come up in conversations with family. It comes  
21 up in society. It's one of those things we talk about.  
22 It's one of those things that we live. It's normal.  
23 Just like the space landing or the comet -- whatever is  
24 the norm.  
25 Police brutality is the norm. And for people



1 who have the privilege to not be personally affected by  
2 it or not have a family member affected by it and  
3 someone that looks like them to not be affected by it,  
4 it's asinine to me to understand how you can say their  
5 experiences are less valued than yours just because you  
6 were put in the position to make that decision amongst  
7 those who don't know how to get to where you're at, who  
8 don't think that you belong where you belong, who may  
9 not have the resource that you have to get to where  
10 you're at.  
11 So what I'm asking is that you all take a  
12 look outside of yourselves, take a look outside of your  
13 experiences, outside your responsibilities as you see  
14 them and take a look at the society that you live in.  
15 THE PUBLIC: My God.  
16 MR. JONES: It's a wasteland. We're in a  
17 disgusting movie. This is a movie from the '80s that  
18 we're living in today, with this -- with this -- I don't  
19 even know what kind of -- this Commander-In-Chief, this  
20 CEO -- I don't know.  
21 I don't know what we're going to do. But it's  
22 up to you guys to make something happen in California  
23 that's not happening anywhere else in America. We're  
24 way behind so many other countries. It's going to take  
25 at least 40, 50 years to make America great again. And

Page 41

1 by the way we're going now, it's not going to happen.  
2 So we're asking you all to take the  
3 responsibility, take the accountability, and to ensure  
4 that the things that have happened in the past, the  
5 injustices that have happened in the past, never happen  
6 again to another person. Thank you.  
7 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
8 -oOo-  
9 STATEMENT BY NEBYOU BERHE  
10  
11 MR. BERHE: Hello. My name is Nebyou Berhe,  
12 N-E-B-Y-O-U, B-E-R-H-E.  
13 So just a couple things real quick. These  
14 narrative boxes -- and I find it amusing that there was  
15 so much pushback on them. Every time we see an  
16 officer-involved shooting video or anything related to  
17 police misconduct, we're always told -- the public is  
18 told to suspend your judgment because we don't know  
19 what happened before or after. We don't know what the  
20 context was; right? We don't know what the narrative  
21 was. We don't know all these factors.  
22 And that leads to the unique identifiers.  
23 Right. And what is this? It's this accountability so  
24 we can say, hey, man, these type of officers are the  
25 ones -- should be held responsible for these type of

Page 42

1 actions. Maybe we can change hiring practices as we go  
2 forward.  
3 And just to note on a local level, I live here  
4 in Fresno, our chief of police actually ordered an  
5 internal study review of his department, and what came  
6 back was that two-thirds of the officers didn't trust  
7 the chief and a third of officers complained about  
8 officers that falsified evidence or falsified police  
9 reports. And what we're talking about is years on  
10 someone's life; right? When you falsify --  
11 We have a brother right now that we're trying  
12 to help out who went to rescue his brothers from a  
13 shooting at a party, and he's -- now he's facing jail  
14 time because he was resisting arrest. Even though he  
15 showed up way after the cops did and he was drug  
16 through the mud physically, literally, and now he's  
17 facing jail time. And he's young. He's a young man.  
18 And so -- again, thank you guys for being here.  
19 We just want to continue to hold up these -- these  
20 stories and these experiences.  
21 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
22 -oOo-  
23 STATEMENT BY SUKAINA HUSSAIN  
24  
25 MS. HUSSAIN: Good afternoon. My name is

Page 43

1 Sukaina Hussain, S-U-K-A-I-N-A, H-U-S-S-A-I-N.  
2 I shared some comments with the board this  
3 morning, but I wanted to reiterate to you all. Thank  
4 you again for the time to hear us out. I know  
5 some people had to take off but they're with us in  
6 spirit. They're from all over California. They're  
7 making their way back.  
8 I wanted to highlight what was brought up  
9 before, the significance of the stories that my black  
10 and brown brothers and sisters have shared and how much  
11 of themselves they're putting out there so that all of  
12 us can live in a better community.  
13 And I'm speaking on behalf of immigrant families  
14 who are communities of color who have come from  
15 militarized states, who have come from environments  
16 where they're being targeted for the way they look, who  
17 are daily met with tanks in the street with automatic  
18 weapons in their face, whose children have to walk by  
19 army and militants just on the way to school or to the  
20 grocery store.  
21 And they came here. My family is from an  
22 immigrant background (unintelligible). And  
23 unfortunately we know it's going to be difficult for  
24 families coming from other countries in the future. But  
25 for those who are here, came here seeking that safe

Page 44

1 haven and seeking a way to provide a better opportunity  
2 for their families.  
3 So I know that the role of law enforcement is to  
4 provide that peace, to serve and protect. And if we're  
5 continuing to militarize, we're not serving that  
6 purpose. So I hope the investment in this regulation  
7 really provide them education and training into making  
8 our community safer instead of more militarized.  
9 I also wanted to speak to the piece around  
10 religion. I know there was some discussion with the  
11 board on what the identifier looks like. I do agree  
12 it's important to be able to collect data to name their  
13 specific religion, backgrounds and ethnicities.  
14 Nationalities are being targeted.  
15 However, it may be visible what religion I am  
16 but may not be for another person of color. So I think  
17 in order to make sure we're not falling into the trap of  
18 continually stereotyping and going down this rabbit hole  
19 of stereotyping by filling the box, but there should  
20 even still be a narrative space for why the officer  
21 chose to identify the person of that religion. Was it a  
22 cross or symbol or something specific they were wearing  
23 that caused them to feel they were of religious  
24 background. And maybe use that to identify if there are  
25 wrongful assumptions being made, if there are

1 stereotypes that are being mislabeled. And put those  
2 learnings into trainings on how we're miscategorizing  
3 individually or how we're correctly or incorrectly  
4 identifying backgrounds to have more accurate  
5 information and learning ahead. Thank you.  
6 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
7 -oOo-  
8 STATEMENT OF TAYMAH JAHSI  
9  
10 MS. JAHSI: Hello. My name is Taymah Jahsi,  
11 spelled T-A-Y-M-A-H, last name, J-A-H-S-I. I'm with  
12 PICO, specifically Faith in the Valley here in Fresno.  
13 We represent over 120 congregations here in the Valley.  
14 Many of them went with us to the Capitol to make sure  
15 AB 953 passed.  
16 And we went there with the expectation with  
17 racial profiling not ending tomorrow but sometime in  
18 the future. Maybe our grandchildren wouldn't have to  
19 face some of the pain we face.  
20 So when I hear officers say it's too  
21 time-consuming, I view that as an excuse. Because  
22 what's more time-consuming is burying your child. I've  
23 done that before. We heard from Mrs. Friday who's done  
24 that.  
25 And if we have the opportunity to collect

1 sufficient descriptive data in order to compile it and  
2 interpret in a way that can identify how these officers  
3 may be profiling folks, then that extra five or ten  
4 minutes that it's costing them right now could save an  
5 extra 500 lives in a couple years, and it will all be  
6 worth it then.  
7 So I'm asking you all, when you hear that  
8 argument about time consumption that you let it bounce  
9 off your ears because we're looking towards the future.  
10 And in doing that, we have to spend the necessary time  
11 focusing on those variables that are causing so many of  
12 our people to suffer here.  
13 I appreciate you all for hearing us out today.  
14 I ask that you keep in mind the stories you heard and  
15 the pain you heard when you're making those decisions  
16 and finalizing the regulations.  
17 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
18 -oOo-  
19 STATEMENT OF JULIA DUDLEY  
20  
21 MS. DUDLEY: Afternoon, to you. I definitely  
22 wasn't slated to speak but I felt compelled to do so.  
23 My name is Julia, J-U-L-I-A, D-U-D-L-E-Y.  
24 And I have been a long time resident of Fresno,  
25 but my roots are actually in San Jose. And I think

1 today is so important because my family has continually  
2 had to go through racial profiling, even in front of my  
3 house where we lived in a very affluent neighborhood  
4 and we might have been one or two black families.  
5 I watched my brother get beat up by nine or ten  
6 cops because they didn't believe that was his house.  
7 And I had to testify and watch these cops lie in court,  
8 and it was traumatizing. Because he was in a car with  
9 another non-black person, so they pulled him over and  
10 assumed it wasn't his car. So that was my first  
11 unfortunate incident with the police. And then it  
12 continued, where I was always pulled over because of who  
13 I was, because of being black and driving in a car down  
14 a street where they felt I didn't belong.  
15 Now we fast-forward here to Fresno, California,  
16 where I live now. I'm a business owner. I'm an  
17 entrepreneur. I'm also part of the African American  
18 media. So I came here today, and we wanted to make sure  
19 to have a story.  
20 But I think it's also important I share my  
21 story. And just last year, at the end of the year, we  
22 were pulled over coming from my shop. We were  
23 terrified. Me and my husband were very terrified. We  
24 were in our car, which was a Mustang. The officer asked  
25 what were we doing in a Mustang, why were we there,

1 where were we coming from. I was asked these -- this  
 2 myriad of questions as if I didn't even belong being a  
 3 business owner or even in my car.  
 4 So that is not just happening to me but a whole  
 5 bunch of people that look like me, a whole bunch of  
 6 other black and brown folks that look like me. And I  
 7 was shaking and I was terrified. And I shared it on  
 8 Facebook. I couldn't get over it for weeks. And every  
 9 time I saw an officer, all I could do was be fearful and  
 10 look forward. And even when I was pulled over, I didn't  
 11 know if we were going to be shot. No one was around.  
 12 I'm looking around to see where I could -- who's  
 13 watching and what I can do.  
 14 No one should feel that terrified when they're  
 15 pulled over by an officer. And loudly I remember  
 16 speaking to the officer, letting him know, "Officer, I  
 17 can't -- my license. It's in the back in my purse." And  
 18 I was very scared to reach back. I'd already watched the  
 19 Sandra Bland. Myself being a part of the media, it was  
 20 a very terrifying experience for me.  
 21 I've been stopped, my son's been stopped, my  
 22 husband has been stopped, everyone's been stopped in my  
 23 family. For what?  
 24 And also being 15 years as an educator, as a  
 25 state-mandated reporter, it was very important for me to

Page 49

1 write out paperwork. And when something happens in the  
 2 classroom, you had to write it out. Time is nothing.  
 3 Time is of the essence. And it's very important for us  
 4 to take our time when we must write that report. When  
 5 we must be a part of the solution versus the problem.  
 6 If I didn't write about things that happened to  
 7 my students, and they would tell me about stuff going on  
 8 at home, should I be that teacher that says, heck, I  
 9 don't have time to write that out? Should I have done  
 10 that?  
 11 So that's why it's so important for us to look  
 12 at time as not an issue but part of it, to take the time  
 13 to write that information down so we can see where the  
 14 problem is and look forward to solutions.  
 15 MS. HOVIS: Thank you.  
 16 So since the public hearing is slated to go  
 17 until 4:30, we sit and stay here until 4:30. That's how  
 18 it works. So we will be here.  
 19 Thank you for being here everybody who came,  
 20 honestly. I'm just really pleased to see that -- the  
 21 energy and commitment to ensure that AB 953 is  
 22 effectively implemented because it's certainly  
 23 consuming our lives. And it's just really great to have  
 24 members of the public so participatory. So thank you so  
 25 much.

Page 50

1 And if you want to speak and haven't done so, we  
 2 have an open mic.  
 3 (Whereupon the meeting concluded at  
 4 4:30 p.m.)  
 5  
 6  
 7  
 8  
 9  
 10  
 11  
 12  
 13  
 14  
 15  
 16  
 17  
 18  
 19  
 20  
 21  
 22  
 23  
 24  
 25

Page 51

1 STATE OF CALIFORNIA )  
 ) ss.  
 2 COUNTY OF FRESNO )  
 3  
 4 I, MIRANDA K. ANTHONY, Certified Shorthand  
 5 Reporter, in and for the State of California, do hereby  
 6 certify:  
 7 That the foregoing proceedings were taken before  
 8 me at the time and place herein set forth; that any  
 9 witness in the foregoing proceedings, prior to  
 10 testifying, were duly sworn; that a record of the  
 11 proceedings was made by me using machine shorthand which  
 12 was thereafter transcribed under my direction; that the  
 13 foregoing is a true record of the testimony given.  
 14 I further certify that I am neither financially  
 15 interested in the action, nor a relative or employee of  
 16 any attorney or party to this action.  
 17 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have this date subscribed my  
 18 name.  
 19  
 20 Dated: \_\_\_/\_\_\_/\_\_\_  
 21  
 22  
 23 \_\_\_\_\_  
 24 MIRANDA K. ANTHONY, CSR NO. 13453  
 25

Page 52

**Blank**