12th Meeting of the Racial and Identity Profiling Advisory (RIPA) Board

December 10, 2018, 9:00 a.m.

Video/Teleconference Locations: California Department of Justice Offices:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sacramento</th>
<th>Oakland</th>
<th>Los Angeles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4949 Broadway</td>
<td>1515 Clay Street</td>
<td>300 S. Spring Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacramento, CA</td>
<td>20th Floor, Ste. 2000</td>
<td>1st Floor Reception</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95820</td>
<td>Oakland, CA 94612</td>
<td>Los Angeles, CA 90013</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Other Video/Teleconference Locations:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kings County Sheriff's Office</th>
<th>Morgan Hill PD</th>
<th>Alliance San Diego</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1444 W. Lacey Blvd, Administration Building, Hanford, CA, 93230</td>
<td>16200 Vineyard Blvd.</td>
<td>4443 30th Street, 1st Floor San Diego, CA 92112</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The twelfth meeting of the California Racial and Identity Profiling Advisory (RIPA) Board was held on Monday, December 10, 2019 at 9:00 A.M.

Members Present: Judge Alice Lytle, Brian Marvel, Reverend Ben McBride, Doug Oden, Sheriff Dave Robinson, Angela Sierra, Commissioner Warren Stanley, and Chief David Swing.


California Department of Justice Staff Present: Nancy A. Beninati, Supervising Deputy Attorney General, Civil Rights Enforcement Section (CRES); Kelsey Geiser, CRES, Dominique Alcaraz Deputy Attorney General CRES; Audra Opdyke, Assistant Bureau Chief, Bureau of Criminal Identification and Investigative Services, California Justice Information Services Division (CJIS); Erin Choi, Manager, Client Services Program, Randie Chance, Director of Research, Research Center, Bureau of Criminal Identification and Investigation Services, CJIS; Kevin Walker, CJIS, Jannie Smith, CJIS, Evelyn Reynoso, CJIS.

1. Call to Order and Welcoming Remarks

The meeting was called to order at 9:14 A.M. by Co-Chair Robinson.

2. Update from the California Department of Justice
Ms. Geiser and Ms. Beninati provided an update on the edits made to draft 2019 report in response to the requests and conversations had at the November 27, 2019 Board meeting in Riverside.

Ms. Geiser stated that comments on the content of the 2018 RIPA Board report are welcome, and stated that the report would be finalized in the following week to be able to meet the January 1, 2019 posting deadline. Ms. Beninati informed the Board that the report will be disseminated to all stakeholders that were discussed in the November meeting.

3. Overview of Report Progress

Ms. Beninati opened up the conversation to the board members for comments and feedback on the complete draft report.

➢ Board Member Comments
  o Member Stanley and Member Marvel both commented that they had some typographical changes to suggest. Ms. Geiser suggested that any members with editing comments or changes should send them to her via e-mail or in a track-changed Word document.
  o Co-Chair Robinson commented that the report was missing information on the amount of time officers devote to collecting each data record. Co-Chair Robinson also commented that the report could add additional information on the funding impact for data collection, which could be informed by data on the amount of time it takes to collect each record. Co-Chair Robinson suggested that this information be captured in future reports to give the Board a better sense of the impact the data collection may have on the officers and on agency funding.
  o Member Sierra commented positively on the balance of topics and suggested focusing more on recommendations in the 2020 report.
  o Member McBride commented that the report should include a hyperlink to the 2018 report and the accompanying video.

4. Public Comment

A representative from the San Diego Sheriff’s Department commented that the agency’s name was misspelled in the Stop Data section of the report.

Kati Mathews from Disability Rights California encouraged the Board and the DOJ to make the report ADA complaint online. Ms. Geiser noted that it would be.

Michele Wittig from the Santa Monica Coalition for Police Reform commented that the Officer ID number should be included in the data made available to the public.

Melanie Ochoa from the ACLU of Southern California commented that the report should include additional information about auditing of the data. Ms. Choi commented that many agencies are
planning to audit this data, and auditing and some of the corresponding concerns are reflected and addressed throughout the data integrity section of the report.

5. Final Discussion and Approval of RIPA Board Report

No Board member made additional comments or suggestions on the report draft.

Ms. Beninati stated that DOJ staff will work with the Board Co-Chairs on the dissemination of the report including a press release. Ms. Beninati encouraged the Board members to share the report widely with their networks.

Ms. Geiser requested that all additional comments or edits be submitted to her by the end of the week.

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Member Oden to approve the 2019 annual RIPA report pending copyediting changes to be made by the DOJ. The motion was seconded by Member Lytle. No objections were raised.

**APPROVAL:** The report was unanimously approved with all members in attendance voting “Yes”, no “No” votes, and no abstentions.

9. Closing Remarks and Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned by Co-Chair Robinson at 10:10 a.m.