

1 ROB BONTA
 Attorney General of California
 2 R. MATTHEW WISE
 Supervising Deputy Attorney General
 3 ROBERT L. MEYERHOFF
 KEVIN J. KELLY
 4 Deputy Attorneys General
 JOHN D. ECHEVERRIA
 5 Deputy Attorney General
 State Bar No. 268843
 6 455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000
 San Francisco, CA 94102-7004
 7 Telephone: (415) 510-3479
 Fax: (415) 703-1234
 8 Email: John.Echeverria@doj.ca.gov
Attorneys for Defendant Rob Bonta,
 9 *in his official capacity as Attorney General*
of the State of California

10 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 11 FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

15 **VIRGINIA DUNCAN, et al.,**
 16 Plaintiffs,
 17 v.
 18 **ROB BONTA, in his official capacity**
 19 **as Attorney General of the State of**
 20 **California,**
 21 Defendant.

Case No. 3:17-cv-1017-BEN-JLB

NOTICE OF APPEAL

Courtroom: 5A
 Judge: Hon. Roger T. Benitez
 Action Filed: May 17, 2017

1 **PLEASE TAKE NOTICE** that Defendant-Appellant Rob Bonta, in his
2 official capacity as Attorney General of the State of California, hereby appeals to
3 the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit from this Court’s Decision
4 and permanent injunction, entered on September 22, 2023 (Dkt. 149).¹

5 Dated: September 22, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

6 ROB BONTA
7 Attorney General of California
8 R. MATTHEW WISE
9 Supervising Deputy Attorney General
10 ROBERT L. MEYERHOFF
11 KEVIN J. KELLY
12 Deputy Attorneys General

s/ John D. Echeverria

13 JOHN D. ECHEVERRIA
14 Deputy Attorney General
15 Attorneys for Defendant Rob Bonta,
16 in his official capacity as Attorney
17 General of the State of California

18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27 ¹ This is a new appeal taken following a remand from the United States
28 Supreme Court and then the en banc court. *See* Ninth Circuit General Order 3.6;
 Duncan v. Bonta, No. 21-1194 (June 30, 2022); *Duncan v. Bonta*, 49 F.4th 1228
 (9th Cir. 2022) (en banc).

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Case Name: *Duncan, et al. v. Bonta* Case No. **3:17-cv-01017-BEN-JLB**

I hereby certify that on September 22, 2023, I electronically filed the following document with the Clerk of the Court by using the CM/ECF system:

NOTICE OF APPEAL

I certify that **all** participants in the case are registered CM/ECF users and that service will be electronically accomplished by the CM/ECF system.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California and the United States of America the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on September 22, 2023, at San Francisco, California.

s/ John D. Echeverria

JOHN D. ECHEVERRIA
Deputy Attorney General