

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
FORT WORTH DIVISION**

TEXAS, WISCONSIN, ALABAMA,  
ARKANSAS, ARIZONA, FLORIDA,  
GEORGIA, INDIANA, KANSAS,  
LOUISIANA, PAUL LePAGE, Governor of  
Maine, Governor Phil Bryant of the State of  
MISSISSIPPI, MISSOURI, NEBRASKA,  
NORTH DAKOTA, SOUTH CAROLINA,  
SOUTH DAKOTA, TENNESSEE, UTAH,  
WEST VIRGINIA, NEILL HURLEY, and  
JOHN NANTZ,

Plaintiffs,

Civil Action No. 4:18-cv-  
00167-O

v.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, UNITED  
STATES DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND  
HUMAN SERVICES, ALEX AZAR, in his  
Official Capacity as SECRETARY OF  
HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES,  
UNITED STATES INTERNAL REVENUE  
SERVICE, and CHARLES P. RETTIG,  
COMMISSIONER OF INTERNAL  
REVENUE SERVICE,

Defendants.

CALIFORNIA, CONNECTICUT, DISTRICT  
OF COLUMBIA, DELAWARE, HAWAII,  
ILLINOIS, KENTUCKY,  
MASSACHUSETTS, MINNESOTA by and  
through its Department of Commerce, NEW  
JERSEY, NEW YORK, NORTH CAROLINA,  
OREGON, RHODE ISLAND, VERMONT,  
VIRGINIA, and WASHINGTON,

Intervenor-Defendants.

**INTERVENOR-DEFENDANTS' NOTICE OF APPEAL**

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that the Intervenor-Defendants hereby appeal to the United States Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit from this Court's December 30, 2018 Order, ECF No. 221, entering a Final Judgment on Count I of Plaintiff's Amended Complaint. Previously and on December 14, 2018, the Court entered an Order granting partial summary judgment on Count I of the Amended Complaint. ECF No. 211. On December 30, 2018, the Court granted the Intervenor-Defendants' request for entry of partial final judgment on Count I of the Amended Complaint, and also granted the Intervenor Defendants' request for a stay of that judgment. ECF No. 220. Accordingly, and pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 54(b), the Court entered partial final judgment on Count I of the Amended Complaint, ECF No. 221. The Intervenor-Defendants hereby appeal from the partial final judgment entered by the Court, ECF No. 221, as well as the orders underlying that partial final judgment, including but not limited to the order granting partial summary judgment (ECF No. 211).

Dated: January 3, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

XAVIER BECERRA  
Attorney General of California  
JULIE WENG-GUTIERREZ  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
KATHLEEN BOERGERS  
Supervising Deputy Attorney General

**/s/ Neli N. Palma**

NELI N. PALMA  
NIMROD P. ELIAS  
Deputy Attorneys General  
California State Bar No. 203374  
California State Bar No. 251634  
1300 I Street, Suite 125  
Sacramento, CA 94244-2550  
Telephone: (916) 210-7522  
Fax: (916) 322-8288  
E-mail: [Neli.Palma@doj.ca.gov](mailto:Neli.Palma@doj.ca.gov)  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendants*

GEORGE JEPSEN  
Attorney General of Connecticut  
JOSEPH RUBIN  
Associate Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of Connecticut*

KATHLEEN JENNINGS  
Attorney General of Delaware  
ILONA KIRSHON  
Deputy State Solicitor  
JESSICA M. WILLEY  
DAVID J. LYONS  
Deputy Attorneys General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of Delaware*

RUSSELL A. SUZUKI  
Attorney General of Hawaii  
ANDRÉA A. SUZUKI  
Deputy Attorney General  
ROBERT T. NAKATSUJI  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of Hawaii*

LISA MADIGAN  
Attorney General of Illinois  
DAVID F. BUYSSE  
Deputy Chief, Public Interest Division  
ANNA P. CRANE  
Public Interest Counsel  
MATTHEW V. CHIMIANTI  
Assistant Attorney General, Special  
Litigation Bureau  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of Illinois*

ANDY BESHEAR  
Attorney General of Kentucky  
LA TASHA BUCKNER  
Assistant Deputy Attorney General  
S. TRAVIS MAYO  
Executive Director, Office of Civil and  
Environmental Law  
TAYLOR PAYNE  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant  
the Commonwealth of Kentucky*

MAURA HEALEY  
Attorney General of Massachusetts  
STEPHEN B. VOGEL  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
Commonwealth of Massachusetts*

OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY  
GENERAL  
State of Minnesota  
SCOTT IKEDA  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of Minnesota by and through its  
Department of Commerce*  
GURBIR S. GREWAL  
Attorney General of New Jersey  
JEREMY M. FEIGENBAUM  
Assistant Attorney General  
ANGELA JUNEAU BEZER  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of New Jersey*

LETITIA JAMES  
Attorney General of New York  
BARBARA D. UNDERWOOD  
Solicitor General  
STEVEN C. WU  
Deputy Solicitor General  
LISA LANDAU  
Bureau Chief, Health Care Bureau  
ELIZABETH CHESLER  
Assistant Attorney General, Health Care  
Bureau  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of New York*

JOSHUA H. STEIN  
Attorney General of North Carolina  
SRIPRIYA NARASIMHAN  
Deputy General Counsel  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of North Carolina*

ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM  
Attorney General of Oregon  
HENRY KANTOR  
Special Counsel to the Attorney General  
SCOTT KAPLAN  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of Oregon*

PETER F. NERONHA  
Attorney General of Rhode Island  
MICHAEL W. FIELD  
Assistant Attorney General  
MARIA R. LENZ  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of Rhode Island*

THOMAS J. DONOVAN, JR.  
Attorney General of Vermont  
BENJAMIN D. BATTLES  
Solicitor General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of Vermont*

MARK R. HERRING  
Attorney General of Virginia  
TOBY J. HEYTENS  
Solicitor General  
MATTHEW R. MCGUIRE  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
Commonwealth of Virginia*

ROBERT W. FERGUSON  
Attorney General of Washington  
JEFFREY G. RUPERT  
Chief, Complex Litigation Division  
JEFFREY T. SPRUNG  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
State of Washington*

KARL A. RACINE  
Attorney General for the District of  
Columbia  
ROBYN R. BENDER  
Deputy Attorney General  
VALÉRIE M. NANNERY  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant the  
District of Columbia*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

On January 3, 2019, I electronically submitted the foregoing document with the clerk of court for the U.S. District Court, Northern District of Texas, using the electronic case filing system of the court. I hereby certify that I have served all counsel and/or pro se parties of record electronically or by another manner authorized by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5 (b)(2).

          /s/ Ashley Harrison