I				
	* 2 **	ENDORSED FILED San Francisco County Superior Court		
1	WILLIAM VERICK, CSB #140972	JUL 2 6 2007		
2	Klamath Environmental Law Center FREDRIC EVENSON, CSB #198059	GORDON PARK-LI, Cleri BY:JUN P. PANELO		
3	424 First Street Eureka, CA 95501	Deputy Clerk		
4	Telephone: (707) 268-8900 Facsimile: (707) 268-8901 email: wverick@igc.org	CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE SET		
5	ecorights@earthlink.net			
6	DAVID H. WILLIAMS, CSB #144479 BRIAN ACREE, CSB #202505	DEC 2 8 2007 -9∞AM		
7 8	370 Grand Avenue, Suite 5 Oakland, CA 94610 Telephone: (510) 271-0826	DEPARTMENT 212		
9	Facsimile: (510) 271-0829 email: davidhwilliams@earthlink.net brianacree@earthlink.net			
10	Attorneys for Plaintiff,			
11	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION			
12	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA			
13	COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO			
14	(Unlimited Jurisdiction)			
15				
16 17	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION,	CASE NO. CGC-07-465490		
	Plaintiff,			
18	v.	COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTIVE RELIEF AND CIVIL PENALTIES		
19 20	COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION; HOME DEPOT U.S.A., INC.; SUR LA TABLE,			
21	INC.	TOXIC TORT/ENVIRONMENTAL		
22	Defendants.			
23	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
24	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION alleges as follows:			
25	INTRODUCTION			
26	1. This Complaint seeks civil penalties and an injunction to remedy the continuing			
27	failure of defendants COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION; HOME DEPOT U.S.A., INC.;			
.28	COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTION AND CIVIL PENALTIES 1			

SUR LA TABLE, INC., (hereinafter "Defendants"), to give clear and reasonable warnings to
 those residents of California, who handle and use cookware with leaded brass handles (Brass
 Handled Cookware Products). The handles of these Brass Handled Cookware Products are made
 from leaded brass, which contains lead and lead compounds ("lead"), which are chemicals
 known to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm. California residents are
 exposed to lead when they handle these Brass Handled Cookware Products.

7 2. Defendants are businesses that manufacture, market, and/or distribute Brass 8 Handled Cookware Products . Defendants intend that residents of California handle and use 9 Brass Handled Cookware Products that Defendants manufacture, market, and/or distribute. 10 When these products are handled and used in their normally intended manner, they expose 11 people to lead. In spite of knowing that residents of California were and are being exposed to 12 these chemicals when they handle and use Brass Handled Cookware Products, Defendants did 13 not and do not provide clear and reasonable warnings that these products cause exposure to 14 chemicals known to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

3. 15 Plaintiff seeks injunctive relief pursuant to Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7 16 to compel Defendants to bring their business practices into compliance with section 25249.5 et 17 seq. by providing a clear and reasonable warning to each individual who has been, and who in 18 the future ma, be exposed to the lead from the use of Defendants' products. Plaintiff seeks an 19 order that defendants identify and locate each individual person who in the past has purchased 20 Brass Handled Cookware Products and to provide to each such purchaser a clear and reasonable 21 warning that the Brass Handled Cookware Products will cause exposures to chemicals known to cause birth defects. 22

4. In addition to injunctive relief, plaintiff seeks civil penalties to remedy the failure
of Defendants to provide clear and reasonable warnings regarding exposure to chemicals known
to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

28 COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTION AND CIVIL PENALTIES

26

27

PARTIES

5. Plaintiff MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION ("Mateel") is a non-profit organization dedicated to, among other causes, the protection of the environment, promotion of human health, environmental education, and consumer rights. Mateel is based in Eureka, California, and is incorporated under the laws of the State of California. Mateel is a "person" pursuant to Health & Safety Code Section 25118. Mateel brings this enforcement action in the public interest pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d). Residents of California are regularly exposed to lead and lead compounds from Brass Handled Cookware Products manufactured, distributed or marketed by Defendant and are so exposed without a clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning.

6. Defendants are each a person doing business within the meaning of Health &
 Safety Code Section 25249.11. Defendants are businesses that manufacture, distribute, and/or
 market Brass Handled Cookware Products in California, including the City and County of San
 Francisco. Manufacture, distribution and/or marketing of these products in the City and County
 of San Francisco and/or to people who live in San Francisco, causes people to be exposed to lead
 and lead compounds while they are physically present in the City and County of San Francisco.

17 7. Plaintiff brings this enforcement action against Defendants pursuant to Health & 18 Safety Code Section 25249.7(d). Attached hereto and incorporated by reference is a copy of a 19 60-day Notice letter, dated May 10, 2007, which Mateel sent to California's Attorney General. 20 Substantially identical letters were sent to every District Attorney in the state, and to the City 21 Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000. On May 10, 2007, 22 Mateel sent to each Defendant a letter substantively identical to the Notice letter it sent on that 23 date to the Attorney General. Attached to the 60-Day Notice Letters sent to each defendant was 24 a summary of Proposition 65 that was prepared by California's Office of Environmental Health 25 Hazard Assessment. In addition, each 60-Day Notice Letter plaintiff sent was accompanied by a 26 Certificate of Service attesting to the service of the 60-Day Notice Letter on each entity which

28 COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTION AND CIVIL PENALTIES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

27

received it. Pursuant to California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), a Certificate of 2 Merit attesting to the reasonable and meritorious basis for the action was also sent with each 3 60-Day Notice Letter. Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the Certificate of 4 Merit was enclosed with the 60-Day Notice letters Mateel sent to the Attorney General on the two dates.

6

8.

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

1

Defendants are all businesses that employ more than ten people.

JURISDICTION

9. The Court has jurisdiction over this action pursuant to California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7. California Constitution Article VI, Section 10 grants the Superior Court "original jurisdiction in all causes except those given by statute to other trial courts." Chapter 6.6 of the Health & Safety Code, which contains the statutes under which this action is brought, does not grant jurisdiction to any other trial court.

10. 14 This Court also has jurisdiction over Defendants because they are businesses that 15 have sufficient minimum contacts in California and within the City and County of San Francisco. 16 Defendants intentionally availed themselves of the California and San Francisco County markets 17 for Brass Handled Cookware Products. It is thus consistent with traditional notions of fair play 18 and substantial justice for the San Francisco Superior Court to exercise jurisdiction over it.

19 11. Venue is proper in this Court because Defendants market their products in and 20 around San Francisco and thus cause people to be exposed to lead and lead compounds while 21 those people are physically present in San Francisco. Liability for Plaintiff's causes of action, or 22 some parts thereof, has accordingly arisen in San Francisco during the times relevant to this 23 Complaint and Plaintiff seeks civil penalties and forfeitures imposed by statutes.

4

25 26 27

24

COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTION 28 AND CIVIL PENALTIES

FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION (Claim for Injunctive Relief)

12. Plaintiff realleges and incorporates by reference into this First Cause of Action, as if specifically set forth herein, paragraphs 1 through 11, inclusive.

13. The People of the State of California have declared by referendum under Proposition 65 (California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.) their right "[t]o be informed about exposures to chemicals that cause cancer, birth defects, and reproductive harm."

14. To effectuate this goal, Section 25249.6 of the Health and Safety Code mandates that persons who, in the course of doing business, knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer or birth defects must first provide a clear and reasonable warning to such individual prior to the exposure.

15. Since at least 3 years prior to the filing of this complaint Defendants have engaged in conduct that violates Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6 et seq. This conduct includes knowingly and intentionally exposing to the above mentioned toxic chemicals, those California residents who handle and use Brass Handled Cookware Products. The normally intended use of Brass Handled Cookware Products causes exposure to lead and lead compounds, which are chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm. Defendants have not provided clear and reasonable warnings, within the meaning of Health & Safety Code Sections 25249.6 and 25249.11.

16. At all times relevant to this action, Defendants knew that the Brass Handled Cookware Products they manufactured, distributed or marketed were causing exposures to lead and lead compounds. Defendants intended that residents of California handle and use Brass Handled Cookware Products in such ways as would lead to significant exposures to these chemicals.

17. By the above described acts, Defendants have violated Cal. Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 and are therefore subject to an injunction ordering them to stop violating Proposition 65, to provide warnings to all present and future customers, and to provide warnings COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTION

28 AND CIVIL PENALTIES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

to their past customers who purchased defendants' products without receiving a clear and reasonable warning.

SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION (Claim for Civil Penalties)

18. Plaintiff realleges and incorporates by reference into this Second Cause of Action,as if specifically set forth herein, paragraphs 1 through 18, inclusive.

19. By the above described acts, Defendants are liable and should be liable pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), for a civil penalty of \$2,500.00 per day for each individual exposed without proper warning to lead and lead compounds from the handling or use of Defendants' Brass Handled Cookware Products.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

Wherefore, plaintiff prays for judgment against DEFENDANTS, as follows:

Pursuant to the First Cause of Action, that Defendants be enjoined, restrained,
 and ordered to comply with the provisions of Section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety
 Code;

Pursuant to the Second Cause of Action, that Defendants be assessed a civil
 penalty in an amount equal to \$2,500.00 per day per individual exposed, in violation of Section
 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, to lead and lead compounds as the result of
 Defendants' manufacturing, distributing or marketing of Brass Handled Cookware Products;

3. Pursuant to the First Cause of Action, that Defendants be ordered to identify and
 locate each individual who purchased Brass Handled Cookware Products and provide a warning
 to each such person that the Brass Handled Cookware Products the person purchased will expose
 that person to chemicals known to cause birth defects.

26

·27

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

28 COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTION AND CIVIL PENALTIES

· ·		,	
	1	4. Pursuant to Civil Procedure Code § 1021.5, that Defendants be ordered to pay to	
•	2	2 Plaintiff the attorneys fees and costs it incurred in bringing this enforcement action.	
,*	3	5. For such other relief	as this court deems just and proper.
	4		
	5		
	. 6	Dated: July 23, 2007	KLAMATH ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CENTER
	7		
	8		A Mighan 1000 in 1
	9		By William Verick
	10		Attorney for Plaintiff Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation
	11		
	12		
·	13		
	14		
	15		
	16	1	
	. 17		
	18		
	19		
	20		
	21		
	22		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	23		
	24		
	25		
	26		
	27	COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTION	
	28	AND CIVIL PENALTIES	7



May 10, 2007

EDWARD G. WEIL DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL P.O. BOX 70550 OAKLAND CA 94612-0550

Greetings:

This office and the Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation ("Mateel") give you notice that the private businesses on the attached service list have been, are, will be and threaten to be in violation of Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6. Both this office and Mateel are private enforcers of Proposition 65, both may be contacted at the below listed address and telephone number, and I am a responsible individual at both Mateel and this office. The above referenced violations occur when California residents come into contact with the brass handles on cookware these businesses market. A list of specific examples of the specific types of products at issue is attached. The handles on these frying pans, pots and pans (hereinafter "brass handled cookware") are made from leaded brass, which contains lead and lead compounds ("lead"), which are chemicals known to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm. California residents are exposed to lead whenever they handle brass handled cookware, such as when buying it, stocking shelves with it, while cooking with it, and while putting it away after washing it. Lead is transferred from the brass handles to peoples' hands and to other parts of their skin. This lead is then absorbed through the skin, taken into cuts and abrasions, absorbed through mucous membranes, and transferred from the skin to the mouth via oral contact either directly with the lead-contaminated skin, and when lead is transferred from contaminated skin to cigarettes and food and the contaminated cigarettes and food are smoked and/or eaten. These lead exposures thus occur via the dermal absorption, subcutaneous, mucus membrane, ingestion and inhalation routes. The listed businesses did not and do not provide people with clear and reasonable warnings before they expose them to lead. These violations have occurred every day since at least May 10, 2004, and will continue every day until the lead is removed from the brass handles, or until clear and reasonable warnings are given. The abovereferenced violations are alleged for occupational exposures as well as for consumer and environmental exposures. We do not, however, allege occupational exposure violations as to any brass handled cookware made outside of California, except as to workplaces these companies themselves maintain in California. Exposures constituting Proposition 65 environmental exposure violations occur both on and off the companies' properties and in each of California's 58 counties.

Cordially, WNEN William Verick

424 First Street, Eureka, CA 95501 • 707.268.8900 (phone) 707.268.8901 (fax)

EDWARD G. WEIL DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL P.O. BOX 70550 OAKLAND CA 94612-0550

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF OAKLAND 505 14TH ST 12TH FLOOR OAKLAND, CA 94612

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO CITY HALL ROOM 206 400 VAN NESS SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SACRAMENTO 980 9TH STREET, 10TH FLOOR SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN JOSE 151 W. MISSION ST. SAN JOSE, CA 95110

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF LOS ANGELES 200 N. MAIN ST. LOS ANGELES, CA 90012

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN DIEGO CONSUMER & ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 1200 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 700 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ALAMEDA 1225 FALLON STREET ROOM 900 OAKLAND, CA 94612

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ALPINE P.O. BOX 248 MARKLEEVILLE, CA 96120

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF AMADOR 708 COURT STREET JACKSON, CA 95642

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF BUTTE 25 COUNTY CENTER DR. OROVILLE, CA 95965

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF CALAVERAS GOVERNMENT CENTER 891 MOUNTAIN RANCH ROAD SAN ANDREAS, CA95249

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF COLUSA 547 MARKET STREET COLUSA, CA 95932

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF CONTRA COSTA P.O. BOX 670 MARTINEZ, CA 94553

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF DEL NORTE 450 H ST #171 CRESCENT CITY, CA 95531

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF EL DORADO 515 MAIN ST. PLACERVILLE, CA 95667

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF FRESNO 2220 TULARE ST #1000 FRESNO, CA 93721 OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF GLENN P.O. BOX 430 WILLOWS, CA 95988

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT 825 5TH ST. EUREKA, CA 95501

COUNTY OF IMPERIAL COURTHOUSE, FLOOR 2 939 W. MAIN ST EL CENTRO, CA 92243

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF INYO P.O. DRAWER D INDEPENDENCE, CA 93526

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF KERN 1215 TRUXTUN AVE. FLOOR 4 BAKERSFIELD, CA 93301

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF KINGS 1400 W. LACEY BLVD. HANFORD, CA 93230

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LAKE 255 N. FORBES ST # 424

LAKEPORT, CA 95453

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LASSEN 220 SOUTH LASSEN ST. STE 8 SUSANVILLE, CA 96130

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES 18000 CRIMINAL COURTS BUILDING 210 W. TEMPLE ST. LOS ANGELES, CA 90012

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MADERA 209 W. YOSEMITE AVE.

MADERA, CA 93637 OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MARIN HALL OF JUSTICE #183 SAN RAFAEL, CA 94903

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MARIPOSA P.O. BOX 730 MARIPOSA, CA 95338

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MENDOCINO PO BOX 1000 UKIAH, CA 95482

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MERCED 2222 M ST. MERCED, CA 95340

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MODOC 204 SOUTH COURT STREET ALTURAS, CA 96101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MONO P.O. BOX 617 BRIDGEPORT, CA 93517 OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MONTEREY 240 CHURCH STREET P.O. BOX 1131 SALINAS, CA 93902

COUNTY OF NAPA 931 PARKWAY MALL P.O. BOX 720 NAPA, CA 94559-0720

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF NEVADA COURTHOUSE ANNEX NEVADA CITY, CA 95959

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ORANGE 401 CIVIC CENTER DR WEST SANTA ANA, CA 92701

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF PLACER 11562 B AVE AUBURN. CA 95603-2687

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF PLUMAS 520 MAIN STREET #404 QUINCY, CA 95971

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE 4075 MAIN ST. RIVERSIDE, CA 92501

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SACRAMENTO 901 G STREET SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN BENITO 419 4TH ST HOLLISTER, CA 95023

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN BERNARDINO 316 MT. VIEW AVE. SAN BERNARDINO, CA 92415-0004

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO 330 W. BROADWAY SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO 850 BRYANT ST #322 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94103

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN JOAQUIN 222 E. WEBER AVE #202 STOCKTON, CA 95202

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY GOVERNMENT CENTER #450 SAN LUIS OBISPO, CA 93408

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN MATEO HALL OF JUSTICE AND RECORDS REDWOOD CITY, CA 94063

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA 1112 SANTA BARBARA ST. SANTA BARBARA, CA 93101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA 70 W. HEDDING ST. SAN JOSE, CA 95110

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA CRUZ 701 OCEAN ST. #200 SANTA CRUZ, CA 95060

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SHASTA 1525 COURT ST. REDDING, CA 96001

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SIERRA P.O. BOX 457 DOWNIEVILLE, CA 95936 OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SISKIYOU P.O. BOX 986 YREKA, CA 96097

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SOLANO 600 UNION AVE FAIRFIELD, CA 94533

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SONOMA 600 ADMINISTRATION DR. #212J SANTA ROSA, CA 95403

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF STANISLAUS 1100 I ST. #200 MODESTO, CA 95354

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SUTTER 1160 CIVIC CENTER BLVD. #A YUBA CITY, CA 95993

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TEHAMA P.O. BOX 519 REDBLUFF, CA 96080

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TRINITY P.O. BOX 310 WEAVERVILLE, CA 96093

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TULARE COURTHOUSE #224 VISALIA, CA 93291

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TUOLUMNE 2 S. GREEN ST. SONORA, CA 95370

VENTURA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 800 SOUTH VICTORIA AVE VENTURA, CA 93009

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF YOLO 301 SECOND STREET WOODLAND, CA 95695

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF YUBA 215 STH ST. MARYSVILLE, CA 95901

JAMES D. SINEGAL, CEO COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION 999 LAKE DR ISSAQUAH, WA 98027

FRANCIS S. BLAKE, CEO ROBERT L. NARDELLI, CEO HOME DEPOT U.S.A., INC. 2455 PACES FERRY ROAD NW ATLANTA, GA 30339

KATHY TIERNEY, CEO SUR LA TABLE, INC. 5701 SIXTH AVE SOUTH #486 SEATTLE, WA 98108

BOB ULRICH, CEO TARGET CORPORATION 1000 NICOLLET MALL TPN-0945 MINNEAPOLIS, MN 55403

EDWARD A MUELLER, CEO WILLIAMS-SONOMA, INC. 3250 VAN NESS AVE SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109

SERVICE LIST

PRODUCT LIST

HOME DEPOT U.S.A., INC.

RUFFONI SAUCEPAN WITH FLAT LID 6.25"; RUFFONI SAUCEPAN WITH FLAT LID 8" This product description pertains not only to the specific model of the product listed, but also for all units of all models of similar types of Saucepans.

COSTCO WHOLESALE

RUFFONI COPPER OPERA 2.75 QT 7" SAUCEPAN, STYLE #1104-18; RUFFONI COPPER OPERA 2 QT 6.25" SAUCEPAN STYLE #1104-16 These product descriptions pertain not only to the specific models of the products listed, but also for all units of all models of similar types of Saucepans.

SUR LA TABLE, INC.

RUFFONI 10" COPPER CASSEROLE This product description pertains not only to the specific model of the product listed, but also for all units of all models of similar types of Casseroles.

TARGET CORPORATION

RUFFONI COPPER OPERA FRY PAN 10"; RUFFONI COPPER OPERA 8.75" 5 QT CASSEROLE STYLE #1103-22; RUFFONI COPPER OPERA 8.75" SAUTE PAN STYLE #1114-22; RUFFONI COPPER OPERA 8.75" FRYING PAN STYLE # 1106-22 These product descriptions pertain not only to the specific models of the products listed, but also for all units of all models of similar types of Saucepans or Casserole Pans.

WILLIAMS-SONOMA, INC.

RUFFONI POLENTA POT; RUFFONI HAMMERED COPPER FONDUEPOT; RUFFONI 4.75" COPPER STOCK POT #6231856; RUFFONI 4.75" COPPER STOCK POT #6231864 These product descriptions pertain not only to the specific models of the products listed, but also for all units of all models of similar types of Saucepans or Casserole Pans.

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

I, William Verick, hereby declare: This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings. I am the attorney for the noticing party. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the person(s) consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: May 10, 2007

lliam

This notice alleges the violation of Proposition 65 with respect to occupational exposures governed by the California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health. The State Plan incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California. The approval also provides that an employer may use the means of compliances in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement is subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the Attorney General.

<u>CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE</u>

I, Nicole Frank, declare:

If called, I could and would testify as follows: I am over eighteen. My business address is 424 First Street, Eureka, California, 95501. On May 10, 2007, I caused the attached 60-DAY NOTICE LETTER, or a letter identical in substance, to be served by U.S. Mail on those public enforcement agencies listed on the attached SERVICE LIST; in addition on the same date and by U.S. Mail I caused the attached 60-DAY NOTICE LETTER and PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY to be sent by Certified U.S. Mail to the private business entities also listed on the attached SERVICE LIST. I deposited copies of these documents in envelopes, postage pre-paid, with the U.S. Postal Service on the day on which the mail is collected. I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on May 10, 2007, at Eureka, California.

Nicole Frank