LEXINGTON LAW GROUP Eric S. Somers, State Bar No. 139050 ENDORSED Howard Hirsch, State Bar No. 213209 FILED Lisa Burger, State Bar No. 239676 ALAMEDA COUNTY 1627 Irving Street 3 JAN 1 9 2010 San Francisco, CA 94122 4 Telephone: (415) 759-4111 CLERKOFTHESUPERIORCOURT Facsimile: (415) 759-4112 5 By Tasha Perry, Deputy Attorneys for Plaintiff CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA 8 9 COUNTY OF ALAMEDA 10 710494517 11 CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH,) a non-profit corporation, 12 Plaintiff, COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTIVE RELIEF AND CIVIL PENALTIES 13 14 Health & Safety Code §25249.6, et seq. BAG BAZAAR, LTD.; A-LIST, INC.; 15 ACCESSORY EXCHANGE LLC; ADIDAS AMERICA, INC.; ADIDAS PROMOTIONAL (Other) RETAIL OPERATIONS, INC.; AE RETAIL 16 WEST LLC; AMAZON.COM, INC. AMERICAN EAGLE OUTFITTERS, INC.; 17 AMERICAN PROCUREMENT CO., INC.; 18 AMICI ACCESSORIES, LTD.; AMITY/ROLFS, INC.; AUDIGIER BRAND 19 MANAGEMENT GROUP, LLC; BAEKGAARD LIMITED OF INDIANA; BEBE STORES, INC.; BENETTON USA 20 CORPORATION DBA UNITED COLORS OF 21 BENETTON; BILLABONG RETAIL, INC.; BILLABONG USA HOLDINGS PTY LTD.; **BILLABONG USA INVESTMENTS PTY** 22 LTD.; BLOOMINGDALE'S, INC.; BROWN SHOE COMPANY, INC.; BURLEIGH POINT, 23 LTD.; CALIFORNIA ONAX; CALVIN KLEIN, 24 INC.; CBI DISTRIBUTING CORP.; CHARLOTTE RUSSE, INC.; CHARLOTTE 25 RUSSE HOLDING, INC.; CHARMING SHOPPES, INC.; CHENSON INDUSTRIAL CO. LTD., INC.; CHRISTIAN AUDIGIER, INC.; CLAIRE'S BOUTIQUES, INC.; 26 27 CLAIRE'S STORES, INC.; COLDWATER CREEK, INC.; COLDWATER CREEK U.S. INC.; COMECO, INC.; COMECO, LLC; CVS 28

```
CAREMARK CORPORATION; CVS
   PHARMACY, INC.; DIESEL U.S.A., INC.;
   DISTEX, INC.; THE DRESS BARN, INC.;
   EASTBAY, INC.; EBAGS, INC.; ECKO
   DIRECT, LLC; EFASHION SOLUTIONS,
   LLC; ELEMENT SKATEBOARDS, INC.;
   EXPRESS, LLC; FASHION BUG OF
   CALIFORNIA, INC.; FASHION BUG RETAIL
   COMPANIES, INC., FASHION SHOE
   LICENSING LLC; FOOT LOCKER, INC.;
   FOREIGN EXCHANGE, INC.; FOX HEAD,
   INC.; FRENCH CONNECTION GROUP, INC.;
   FRENCH CONNECTION GROUP PLC;
   FURMIR, LLC; GLOBAL BRAND
   HOLDINGS, LLC; GUESS?, INC.; GUESS?
   RETAIL, INC.; HARDY LIFE, LLC; HOT
    TOPIC, INC.; HOT TOPIC
    MERCHANDISING, INC.; HSN, INC.;
   ICONIX BRAND GROUP, INC.:
10
    INDONESIAN IMPORTS, INC.; JILL
11
    STUART, INC.; JILL STUART
   INTERNATIONAL, LLC; KEMISTRE 8, LLC;
   KMART CORPORATION; LANE BRYANT,
12
   INC.; LIMITED STORES, LLC; LODIS
    ACCESSORIES, INC.; LOEHMANN'S, INC.;
13
   LONG RAP INC.; MANGO NY, INC.; MARC
   ECKO ENTERPRISES ACCESSORIES, LLC;
14
    MARC JACOBS INTERNATIONAL, L.L.C.;
15
    MAXX ACCESSORIES, INC.; MELIE
    BIANCO ACCESSORIES, INC.;
    METROPARK USA, INC.; MIAS FASHION
16
    MANUFACTURING COMPANY, INC.;
   MICHAEL KORS (USA), INC.; MICHAEL
17
    KORS STORES (CALIFORNIA), INC.; MODE
    PLUS; MONDANI HANDBAGS &
18
    ACCESSORIES, INC.; NAKAJIMA USA,
19
    INC.; NORDSTROM, INC.;
    OVERSTOCK.COM, INC.; PACIFIC
    SUNWEAR OF CALIFORNIA, INC.; PACIFIC
20
    SUNWEAR STORES CORP.; PACIFIC
21
    WORLDWIDE, INC.; PAYLESS
    SHOESOURCE, INC.; PERLINA
22
    HANDBAGS, INC.; PHAT FASHIONS, INC.;
    PHAT FASHIONS, LLC; PHILLIPS-VAN
23
    HEUSEN CORPORATION; RAY
    ENTERPRISES OF CHESAPEAKE WALK,
24
    INC. DBA HOBO INTERNATIONAL;
    ROBERT TALBOTT, INC.; ROC APPAREL
    GROUP LLC; RUE21, INC.; RUN
25
    ATHLETICS INTERNATIONAL, LLC; THE
    SAK; SAKS & COMPANY; SAKS
26
    INCORPORATED; SANRIO, INC.; SHARIF
27
    DESIGNS, LTD.; SHARIF VISION, INC.;
    SIGNATURE STYLES, LLC; SILHOUETTE
28
    CLOTHING, INC.; SOUTH CONE, INC.;
```

1	SPIEGEL CATALOG HOLDINGS)
2	CORPORATION; SUPER TRADER, INC.;) = TANDY BRANDS ACCESSORIES, INC.;)
	TANDY BRANDS HANDBAGS)
3	ACCESSORIES, INC.; TED BAKER) LIMITED; TED BAKER NEW YORK, INC.;)
4	T.J. MAXX OF CA, LLC; THE TJX
5	COMPANIES, INC.; TORY BURCH LLC;) TUMI, INC.; TUMI STORES, INC.; VANS,)
	INC.; VF OUTDOOR, INC.; V.F.
6	CORPORATION; VIĆTORÍA'S SECRET) DIRECT BRAND MANAGEMENT, LLC;)
7	VICTORIA'S SECRET STORES, LLC;
8	VIEWMARK USA, INC.; VOLCOM, INC.;) VOLCOM RETAIL, INC.; WESTPORT)
	CORPORATION; THE WET SEAL, INC.; THE)
9	WET SEAL RETAIL, INC.; WILSONS) LEATHER DIRECT, INC.; WILSONS)
10	LEATHER HOLDINGS INC.; WITH YOU,)
11	INC.; WORLDWIDE DREAMS LLC;) WORLDWIDE DYNASTY, INC.; Y & S)
12	HANDBAGS, INC.; ZAPPOS.COM, INC.;) ZUMIEZ, INC.; and Defendant DOES 1 through)
	500, inclusive,
13	D-f1
	Defendants.
14	Defendants.)
14 15	Defendants.)
15	Defendants.)
15 16	Defendants.
15	Defendants.
15 16	Defendants.
15 16 17	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19 20	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19 20	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	Defendants.
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	Defendants.

Plaintiff Center for Environmental Health, in the public interest, based on information and belief and investigation of counsel, except for information based on knowledge, hereby makes the following allegations:

INTRODUCTION

- 1. This complaint seeks to remedy Defendants' continuing failure to warn individuals in California that they are being exposed to lead and lead compounds (collectively, "Lead"), chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects and other reproductive harm. Such exposures have occurred, and continue to occur, through the manufacture, distribution, sale and/or use of Defendants' wallets, handbags, purses and clutches made with leather, vinyl or imitation leather materials (the "Products"). Consumers, including pregnant women, are exposed to Lead when they use, touch or handle the Products.
- 2. Under California's Proposition 65, Health and Safety Code §25249.5, et seq., it is unlawful for businesses to knowingly and intentionally expose individuals in California to chemicals known to the State to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm without providing clear and reasonable warnings to individuals prior to their exposure. Defendants introduce Products contaminated with significant quantities of Lead into the California marketplace, exposing consumers of their Products, many of whom are pregnant women, to Lead.
- 3. Despite the fact that Defendants expose pregnant women, children and other people who come into contact with the Products to Lead, Defendants provide no warnings whatsoever about the carcinogenic or reproductive hazards associated with these Lead exposures. Defendants' conduct thus violates the warning provision of Proposition 65. Health & Safety Code §25249.6.

PARTIES

4. Plaintiff CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH ("CEH") is a non-profit corporation dedicated to protecting the public from environmental health hazards and toxic exposures. CEH is based in Oakland, California and incorporated under the laws of the State of California. CEH is a "person" within the meaning of Health & Safety Code

§25249.11(a) and brings this enforcement action in the public interest pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d). CEH is a nationally recognized non-profit environmental advocacy group that has prosecuted a large number of Proposition 65 cases in the public interest. These cases have resulted in significant public benefit, including the reformulation of thousands of products to remove toxic chemicals to make them safer. CEH also provides information to Californians about the health risks associated with exposure to hazardous substances, where manufacturers and other responsible parties fail to do so.

- 5. Defendant A-LIST, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. A-List, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 6. Defendant ACCESSORY EXCHANGE LLC is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Accessory Exchange LLC manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 7. Defendant ADIDAS AMERICA, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Adidas America, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 8. Defendant ADIDAS PROMOTIONAL RETAIL OPERATIONS, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Adidas Promotional Retail Operations, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 9. Defendant AE RETAIL WEST LLC is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. AE Retail West LLC manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 10. Defendant AMAZON.COM, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Amazon.com, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 11. Defendant AMERICAN EAGLE OUTFITTERS, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. American

manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.

doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Coldwater Creek, Inc.

45.

and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.

within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Eastbay, Inc. manufactures, distributes

Defendant EASTBAY, INC. is a person in the course of doing business

- 46. Defendant EBAGS, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. eBags, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 47. Defendant ECKO DIRECT, LLC is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Ecko Direct, LLC manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 48. Defendant EFASHION SOLUTIONS, LLC is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. eFashion Solutions, LLC manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 49. Defendant ELEMENT SKATEBOARDS, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Element Skateboards, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 50. Defendant EXPRESS, LLC is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Express, LLC manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 51. Defendant FASHION BUG OF CALIFORNIA, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Fashion Bug of California, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 52. Defendant FASHION BUG RETAIL COMPANIES, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Fashion Bug Retail Companies, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 53. Defendant FASHION SHOE LICENSING LLC is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Fashion Shoe Licensing LLC manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 54. Defendant FOOT LOCKER, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Foot Locker, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.

within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Hardy Life, LLC manufactures,

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Defendant KMART CORPORATION is a person in the course of doing

distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.

72.

business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Kmart Corporation manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.

- Defendant LANE BRYANT, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Lane Bryant, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- Defendant LIMITED STORES, LLC is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Limited Stores, LLC manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- Defendant LODIS ACCESSORIES, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Lodis Accessories, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- Defendant LOEHMANN'S, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Loehmann's, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- Defendant LONG RAP INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Long Rap Inc. manufactures. distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- Defendant MANGO NY, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Mango NY, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- Defendant MARC ECKO ENTERPRISES ACCESSORIES, LLC is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Marc Ecko Enterprises Accessories, LLC manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for
- Defendant MARC JACOBS INTERNATIONAL, L.L.C. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Marc Jacobs International, L.L.C. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in

Defendant NAKAJIMA USA, INC. is a person in the course of doing

89.

106.

Defendant SAKS & COMPANY is a person in the course of doing

115.

Defendant SUPER TRADER, INC. is a person in the course of doing

business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Super Trader, Inc.

- 133. Defendant WESTPORT CORPORATION is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Westport Corporation manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 134. Defendant THE WET SEAL, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. The Wet Seal, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 135. Defendant THE WET SEAL RETAIL, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. The Wet Seal Retail, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 136. Defendant WILSONS LEATHER DIRECT, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Wilsons Leather Direct, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 137. Defendant WILSONS LEATHER HOLDINGS INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Wilsons Leather Holdings Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 138. Defendant WITH YOU, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. With You, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 139. Defendant WORLDWIDE DREAMS LLC is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Worldwide Dreams LLC manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 140. Defendant WORLDWIDE DYNASTY, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Worldwide Dynasty, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.
- 141. Defendant Y & S HANDBAGS, INC. is a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code §25249.11. Y & S Handbags, Inc. manufactures, distributes and/or sells the Products for sale or use in California.

BACKGROUND FACTS

The People of the State of California have declared by initiative under

27

28

150.

Proposition 65 their right "[t]o be informed about exposures to chemicals that cause cancer, birth defects, or other reproductive harm." Proposition 65, §1(b).

151. To effectuate this goal, Proposition 65 prohibits exposing people to chemicals listed by the State of California as known to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm without a "clear and reasonable warning" unless the business responsible for the exposure can prove that it fits within a statutory exemption. Health & Safety Code §25249.6 states, in pertinent part:

No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual. . .

- chemical known to cause reproductive toxicity. Lead is specifically identified as a reproductive toxicant under three subcategories: "developmental reproductive toxicity," which means harm to the developing fetus, "female reproductive toxicity," which means harm to the female reproductive system, and "male reproductive toxicity," which means harm to the male reproductive system. 27 California Code of Regulations ("C.C.R.") §27001(c). On February 27, 1988, one year after it was listed as a chemical known to cause reproductive toxicity, lead became subject to the clear and reasonable warning requirement regarding reproductive toxicants under Proposition 65. 27 C.C.R. §27001(c); Health & Safety Code §25249.10(b).
- 153. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer. On October 1, 1993, one year after they were listed as chemicals known to cause cancer, lead and lead compounds became subject to the clear and reasonable warning requirement regarding carcinogens under Proposition 65. 27 C.C.R. §27001(c); Health & Safety Code §25249.10(b).
- 154. Some of the Products are designed for and marketed to children. Young children are also exposed to Lead from the Products when they touch or play with Products that are owned or used by their parents or caretakers. In addition, young children are exposed to Lead from the Products when they eat food that is stored or carried in the Products or touch or play

with non-food items that are stored or carried in the Products. Additional childhood exposures to Lead occur when children touch their hands to their mouths after their hands have touched the Products or items stored or carried in the Products.

Children show a greater sensitivity to Lead's effects than do adults. Adverse health impacts from Lead exposure generally occur in children at lower blood Lead levels than in adults. Children absorb and retain more Lead in proportion to their weight than do adults. Young children also show a greater prevalence of iron deficiency, a condition that can increase gastrointestinal absorption of Lead. The body accumulates Lead over a lifetime and releases it slowly, so even small doses received in childhood, over time, can cause adverse health impacts, including but not limited to reproductive toxicity, later in life. For example, in times of physiological stress, such as pregnancy, the body can mobilize accumulated stores of Lead in tissue and bone, thereby increasing the level of Lead in the blood and increasing the risk of harm to the fetus.

Lead exposure have been shown to permanently reduce mental capacity. Davis, J.M., Svendgaard, D.J., "Lead and Child Development," *Nature* 329:297-300, 1987. One study on the effect of childhood Lead exposure declared that even the smallest detectable amount of blood Lead levels in children can mean the difference between an A or B grade in school. Lanphear, B.P., Dietrich, K., Auinger, P., Cox, C., "Subclinical Lead Toxicity in U.S. Children and Adolescents," *Neurodevelopmental Disabilities II Platform*, 2000. Another study followed children into adulthood and found a sevenfold increase in the risk for developing a reading disability among children exposed to sufficient levels of Lead as toddlers. Needleman, H.L., Schell, A., Bellinger, D., Leviton, A., Allred, E.N., "The Long-Term Effects of Exposure to Low Doses of Lead in Childhood: An 11-Year Follow-up Report," *New England Journal of Medicine* 322:83-88, 1990.

157. Lead exposures for pregnant women are also of particular concern in light of evidence that even short term Lead exposures *in utero* may have long-term harmful effects.

Hu, H., et al., "Fetal Lead Exposure at Each State of Pregnancy as a Predictor of Infant Mental."

Development," Environmental Health Perspectives 114:11, 2006; Schnaas, L., et al., "Reduced Intellectual Development in Children with Prenatal Lead Exposure," Environmental Health Perspectives 114:5, 2006.

- Products are made. Lead is found in the Products as a stabilizer in the vinyl or imitation leather materials, as a chemical ingredient in some of the dies, paints and other coloring agents used in the Products and in the chemicals used in the leather tanning process. Lead is also found in the metallic components such as zippers and zipper pulls used on some of the Products.
- 159. Defendants' Products contain sufficient quantities of Lead such that consumers, including pregnant women and children, who use, touch and/or handle the Products are exposed to Lead through the average use of the Products. The route of exposure for the violations is direct ingestion when consumers place the Products or items that have been stored in the Products in their mouths; ingestion via hand-to-mouth contact after consumers use, touch and/or handle the Products or items that have been stored in the Products; and dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch and/or handle the Products or items that have been stored in the Products or items that
- 160. Any person acting in the public interest has standing to enforce violations of Proposition 65 provided that such person has supplied the requisite public enforcers with a valid 60-Day Notice of Violation and such public enforcers are not diligently prosecuting the action within such time. Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d).
- 161. More than sixty days prior to naming each Defendant in this lawsuit, CEH provided a 60-Day "Notice of Violation of Proposition 65" to the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every county in California, the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000 and to each of the named Defendants. In compliance with Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) and 27 C.C.R. §25903(b), each Notice included the following information: (1) the name and address of each violator; (2) the statute violated; (3) the time period during which violations occurred; (4) specific descriptions of the violations, including (a) the routes of exposure to Lead from the Products, and (b) the specific type of products sold and

- Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every county in California, the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000 and to the named Defendants. In compliance with Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) and 11 C.C.R. §3101, each of the Certificates certified that CEH's counsel: (1) has consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the exposures to Lead alleged in each of the Notices; and (2) based on the information obtained through such consultations, believes that there is a reasonable and meritorious case for a citizen enforcement action based on the facts alleged in each of the Notices. In compliance with Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) and 11 C.C.R. §3102, each of the Certificates served on the Attorney General included factual information provided on a confidential basis sufficient to establish the basis for the Certificate, including the identity of the person(s) consulted by CEH's counsel and the facts, studies or other data reviewed by such persons.
- 163. None of the public prosecutors with the authority to prosecute violations of Proposition 65 has commenced and/or is diligently prosecuting a cause of action against Defendants under Health & Safety Code §25249.5, *et seq.*, based on the claims asserted in the Notice.
- 164. Defendants both know and intend that individuals, including pregnant women and children, will use, touch and/or handle the Products, thus exposing them to Lead.
- 165. Under Proposition 65, an exposure is "knowing" where the party responsible for such exposure has:

knowledge of the fact that a[n]... exposure to a chemical listed pursuant to [Health and Safety Code §25249.8(a)] is occurring. No knowledge that the ... exposure is unlawful is required.

27 C.C.R. §25102(n). This knowledge may be either actual or constructive. *See, e.g.,* Final Statement of Reasons Revised (November 4, 1988) (pursuant to former 22 C.C.R. Division 2,

- 28

CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH