1 2 3 4	WILLIAM VERICK, SBN 140972 Klamath Environmental Law Center FREDRIC EVENSON, SBN 198059 424 First Street Eureka, CA 95501 Telephone: (707) 268-8900 Facsimile: (707) 268-8901	ENDORSED FILED Superior Court of California County of San Francisco SEP 0 7 2010 CLERK OF THE COURT
5	DAVID WILLIAMS, SBN 144479	BY: WESLEY RAMIREZ
6	BRIAN ACREE, SBN 202505 370 Grand Avenue, Suite 5	Sopuly Cloth
7	Oakland, CA 94610 Telephone: (510) 271-0826 Facsimile: (510) 271-0829	
8	Attorneys for Plaintiff,	
9		
10	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
11	COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO	
12		
13	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL	CASE NO. CGC-09-486680
14		CASE NO. COC-07-480080
15	Plaintiff,	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTIVE RELIEF
16	V.	AND CIVIL PENALTIES
17 18	SAFEWAY, INC.; and BEN MYERSON CANDY CO., INC.,	TOXIC TORT/ENVIRONMENTAL
19	Defendants.	,
20		
21	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION alleges as follows:	
22		
23		
24		
25		
26	and use, and drink beverages stored or contained in leaded crystal glassware such as leaded	
27		
28	as "leaded crystal"), that handling and use of	of and drinking from, or eating food served from,
	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTION	1

1

1 leaded crystal causes those residents to be exposed to lead and lead compounds, lead acetate, lead 2 phosphate, and lead subacetate (hereinafter, collectively, "lead"). The types of products to which 3 this Complaint pertains are those types listed in the Product List appended to the Proposition 65 4 Notice of Violation Letter that is attached to and incorporated by reference into this Complaint. 5 Lead is known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and male and female reproductive toxicity. Defendants distribute, and/or market leaded crystal. These products cause 6 7 exposures to lead and lead compounds, which are chemicals known to the State of California to 8 cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

9 2. Defendants market, and/or distribute leaded crystal. Defendants intend that 10 residents of California handle, use and drink beverages stored or contained in, or served from, 11 the leaded crystal that Defendants market, and/or distribute. When these products are handled and used in their normally intended manner and when people drink beverages that has been 12 13 stored in or contained in leaded crystal the leaded crystal exposes people to lead. In spite of 14 knowing that residents of California were and are being exposed to this toxic heavy metal when 15 they handle, use and drink beverages contained or stored in, or served from, leaded crystal, 16 Defendants did not and do not provide clear and reasonable warnings that these products cause exposure to chemicals known to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm. 17

3. 18 Plaintiff seeks injunctive relief pursuant to Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7 to compel Defendants to bring their business practices into compliance with section 25249.5 et 19 20seq. by providing a clear and reasonable warning to each individual who has been and who in the future may be exposed to the above mentioned toxic chemicals from the use of Defendants' 21 22 products. Plaintiff seeks an order that defendant identify and locate each individual person who 23 in the past has purchased leaded crystal and to provide to each such purchaser a clear and 24 reasonable warning that the leaded crystal will cause exposures to chemicals known to cause 25 birth defects.

4. In addition to injunctive relief, plaintiff seeks civil penalties to remedy the failure
of Defendants to provide clear and reasonable warnings regarding exposure to chemicals known
to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

## PARTIES

2 5. Plaintiff MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION ("Mateel") 3 is a non-profit organization dedicated to, among other causes, the protection of the environment, 4 promotion of human health, environmental education, and consumer rights. Mateel is based in 5 Eureka, California, and is incorporated under the laws of the State of California. Mateel is a 6 "person" pursuant to Health & Safety Code Section 25118. Mateel brings this enforcement 7 action in the public interest pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d). Residents of 8 California are regularly exposed to lead and lead compounds from leaded crystal marketed by 9 Defendants and are so exposed without a clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning.

Defendants are persons doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety
 Code Section 25249.11. Defendants are businesses that distribute, and/or market leaded crystal in
 California, including the City and County of San Francisco. Distribution and/or marketing of
 these products in the City and County of San Francisco and/or to people who live in San
 Francisco, causes people to be exposed to lead and lead compounds while they are physically
 present in the City and County of San Francisco.

16 7. Plaintiff brings this enforcement action against Defendants pursuant to Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d). Attached hereto and incorporated by reference is a copy of a 17 60-day Notice letter, dated December 18, 2008, and a copy of a 60-day Notice letter, dated June 18 19 24, 2010, which Mateel sent to California's Attorney General. Substantively identical letters were 20 sent to every District Attorney in the state, and to the City Attorneys of every California city with 21 a population greater than 750,000. Further a copy of the December 18, 2008 letter was sent to 22 defendant SAFEWAY, INC., and a copy of the June 24, 2010 letter was sent to defendant BEN 23 MYERSON CANDY CO., INC. Attached to the 60-Day Notice Letter sent to each defendant 24 was a summary of Proposition 65 that was prepared by California's Office of Environmental 25 Health Hazard Assessment. In addition, each 60-Day Notice Letter plaintiff sent was 26 accompanied by a Certificate of Service attesting to the service of the 60-Day Notice Letter on 27 each entity which received it. Pursuant to California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), a 28 Certificate of Merit attesting to the reasonable and meritorious basis for the action was also sent

3

with each 60-Day Notice Letter. Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the Certificate of Merit was enclosed with the 60-Day Notice letter Mateel sent to the Attorney General.

8. Each defendant employs more than ten people.

ł

# JURISDICTION

9. The Court has jurisdiction over this action pursuant to California Health & Safety
Code Section 25249.7. California Constitution Article VI, Section 10 grants the Superior Court
"original jurisdiction in all causes except those given by statute to other trial courts." Chapter 6.6
of the Health & Safety Code, which contains the statutes under which this action is brought, does
not grant jurisdiction to any other trial court.

1 10. This Court also has jurisdiction over Defendants because they are businesses that
 2 have sufficient minimum contacts in California and within the City and County of San Francisco.
 3 Defendants intentionally availed themselves of the California and San Francisco County markets
 4 for leaded crystal. It is thus consistent with traditional notions of fair play and substantial justice
 5 for the San Francisco Superior Court to exercise jurisdiction over Defendants.

11. Venue is proper in this Court because Defendants market theirs products in and
around San Francisco and thus cause people to be exposed to lead and lead compounds while
those people are physically present in San Francisco. Liability for Plaintiff's causes of action, or
some parts thereof, has accordingly arisen in San Francisco during the times relevant to this
Complaint and Plaintiff seeks civil penalties imposed by statute.

# FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION (Claim for Injunctive Relief)

12. Plaintiff realleges and incorporates by reference into this First Cause of Action, as if specifically set forth herein, paragraphs 1 through 11, inclusive.

13. The People of the State of California have declared by referendum under
Proposition 65 (California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 <u>et seq.</u>) their right "[t]o be informed
about exposures to chemicals that cause cancer, birth defects, and reproductive harm."

14. To effectuate this goal, Section 25249.6 of the Health and Safety Code mandates

that businesses that knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer or birth defects must first provide a clear and reasonable warning to such individual prior to the exposure.

Since at least December 23, 2005, Defendant SAFEWAY INC., and since at least
June 24, 2007, Defendant BEN MYERSON CANDY CO., INC., have been engaged in conduct
that violates Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6 et seq. This conduct includes knowingly
and intentionally exposing to the above mentioned toxic chemicals, those California residents
who handle, use or drink beverages stored or contained in, or served from, leaded crystal. The
normally intended use of leaded crystal causes exposure to lead and lead compounds, which are
chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive
harm. Defendants have not provided clear and reasonable warnings, within the meaning of
Health & Safety Code Sections 25249.6 and 25249.11.

16. At all times relevant to this action, Defendants knew that the leaded crystal they distributed or marketed were causing exposures to lead and lead compounds. Defendants intended that residents of California handle, use and drink beverages stored or contained in leaded crystal in such ways as would lead to significant exposures to these chemicals.

17. By the above described acts, Defendants have violated Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 and are therefore subject to an injunction ordering them to stop violating Proposition 65, to provide warnings to all present and future customers and to provide warnings to their past customers who purchased Defendants' products without receiving a clear and reasonable warning.

# SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION (Claim for Civil Penalties)

18. Plaintiff realleges and incorporates by reference into this Second Cause of Action, as if specifically set forth herein, paragraphs 1 through 17, inclusive.

19. By the above described acts, Defendants are liable and should be liable pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), for a civil penalty of \$2,500.00 per day for each individual exposed without proper warning to lead and lead compounds from the handling, use

5

1

2

,	
1	of, or the drinking of beverages stored or contained in, or served from, Defendants' leaded
2	crystal.
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18 19	
20	
20	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTION AND CIVIL PENALTIES 6

٢.

.

.

# PRAYER FOR RELIEF

Wherefore, plaintiff prays for judgment against DEFENDANTS, as follows:

1. Pursuant to the First Cause of Action, that Defendants be enjoined, restrained, and ordered to comply with the provisions of Section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code;

2. Pursuant to the Second Cause of Action, that Defendants be assessed a civil
penalty in an amount equal to \$2,500.00 per day per individual exposed, in violation of Section
25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, to lead and lead compounds as the result of
Defendant's distributing or marketing of leaded crystal;

3. That Defendant be ordered to identify and locate each individual who purchased
 leaded crystal and provide a warning to each such person that the leaded crystal the person
 purchased will expose that person to chemicals known to cause birth defects.

4. That, pursuant to Civil Procedure Code § 1021.5, Defendant be ordered to pay to
Plaintiff the attorneys fees and costs it incurred in bringing this enforcement action.

For such other relief as this court deems just and proper.

Dated: September 7, 2010

5.

David Williams Attorney for Plaintiff Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation



December 18, 2008

EDWARD G. WEIL DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL P.O. BOX 70550 OAKLAND CA 94612-0550

Greetings:

This office and the Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation ("Mateel") hereby give you notice that the private businesses listed on the attached service list are, have been, will be and threaten to be in violation of Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.6. This office and Mateel are both private enforcers of Proposition 65, both organizations may be reached at the below-listed address and telephone number, I may be considered a "responsible individual" at both organizations, and I may be contacted at the same address and telephone number. The above referenced violations occur when the listed companies market leaded crystal vessels such as decanters, tumblers, wine glasses, champagne flutes, and cocktail glasses (as for martinis) (collectively hereinafter "leaded crystal vessels"). Though a specific model or SKU or product number is given as an example, this notice pertains to all models, and all variations, of the specific type of product of which the named model on the Product List is an example. Handling of, contact with, drinking from, and cleaning up broken glass from leaded crystal vessels exposes people to lead and lead compounds, lead phosphate, lead acetate, and lead subacetate (hereinafter, collectively, "lead"). Lead leaches from the vessel into the food or beverage stored in, or served from, the vessel. The food or beverage is then consumed and the accompanying lead ingested. These exposures (and resulting violations) occur occupationally, environmentally, and as the result of the sale of consumer products and/or services. In occupational settings, the type of work that is done during which the abovereferenced exposures occur is handling the leaded crystal vessels, cleaning up broken glass from them, and drinking from them, such as at wine tastings and office parties. These exposures occur via the dermal absorption, inhalation, ingestion, and subcutaneous routes. These violations have occurred every day since at least December 18, 2005, and will continue every day until reasonable warnings are given to those people exposed or until the listed companies, stop selling leaded crystal. The above-referenced violations are alleged for occupational exposures as well as for consumer and environmental exposures. We do not, however, allege occupational exposure violations as to any leaded stained glass lamps made outside of California, except as to workplaces the listed companies themselves maintain in California. Exposures constituting Proposition 65 environmental exposure violations occur both on and off the listed private businesses' properties and in each of California's 58 counties.

William Verick

EDWARD G. WEIL DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL P.O. BOX 70350 OAKLAND CA 94612-0530

٠.

2

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF OAKLAND SOS 14TH ST 12TH FLOOR OAKLAND, CA 94612

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO CITY HALL ROOM 205 400 VAN NESS SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SACRAMENTO PO BOX 1948 SACRAMENTO, CA 95812-1948

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN JOSE 200 EAST SANTA CLARA STREET SAN JOSE, CA 93113

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF LOS ANGELES 200 N. MAIN ST. LOS ANGELES, CA 90012

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN DEGO CONSUMER & ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 1200 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 700 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ALAMEDA 1225 FALLON STREET ROOM 900 OAKLAND, CA 94612

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ALFINE P.O. BOX 248 MARKLEEVILLE, CA 96120

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF AMADOR 705 COURT STREET IACKSON, CA 95642

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT AT TORNEY COUNTY OF BUTTE 25 COUNTY CENTER DR. OROVILLE, CA 95965

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF CALAVERAS GOVERNMENT CENTER 391 MOUNTAIN RANCH ROAD SAN ANDREAS, CA95249

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF COLUSA 547 MARKET STREET COLUSA, CA 95932

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF CONTRA COSTA P.O. BOX 670 MARTINEZ, CA 94553

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF DEL NORTE 450 H ST 4171 CRESCENT CITY, CA 95531

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF EL DORADO SIS MADY ST. PLACERVILLE, CA 95667

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF FRESNO 2220 TULARE ST #1000 FRESNO, CA 93721 OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF GLENN P.O. BOX 430 WILLOWS, CA 93988

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT ' 125 STH ST. EUREKA, CA 95501

COUNTY OF IMPERIAL COURTHOUSE, FLOOR 2 939 W. MADN ST EL CENTRO, CA 92243

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF INYO F.O. DRAWER D INDEPENDENCE CA 93526

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF KERN 1215 TRUXTUN AVE. FLOOR 4 BAKERSFIELD, CA 93101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF KINGS 1400 W. LACEY BLVD. HANFORD, CA 93230

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LAKE 255 N. FORBES ST # 424 LAKEPORT, CA 95453

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LASSEN 220 SOUTH LASSEN ST. STE 8 SUSANVILLE, CA 94110

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES 18000 CRIMINAL COURTS BUILDING 210 W. TEMPLE ST. LOS ANGELES, CA 90012

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MADERA 209 W. YOSEMITE AVE. MADERA, CA 93637

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MARIN HALL OF JUSTICE #183 SAN RAFAEL, CA 94903

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MARIPOSA P.O. BOX 730 MARIPOSA, CA 95338

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MENDOCINO PO BOX 1000 UXIAH, CA 95482

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MERCED 2222 M ST. MERCED, CA 95340

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MODOC 204 SOUTH COURT STREET ALTURAS, CA 96101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MONO P.O. BOX 617 BRIDGEPORT, CA 93517 OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MONTEREY 240 CHURCH STREET P.O. BOX 1131 SALINAS, CA 93902

COUNTY OF NAPA 931 PARKWAY MALL P.O. BOX 720 NAPA, CA 94559-0720

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF NEVADA COURTHOUSE ANNEX NEVADA CITY, CA 95959

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ORANGE 401 CIVIC CENTER DR WEST SANTA ANA, CA 92701

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF PLACER 11562 B AVE AUBURN, CA 95603-2687

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF PLUMAS 520 MAIN STREET #404 QUINCY, CA 93971

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE 4075 MAIN ST. RIVERSIDE, CA 92501

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT AT TORNEY COUNTY OF SACRAMENTO 901 G STREET SACRAMENTO, CA 91814

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN BENITO 419 4TH ST HOLLISTER, CA 95023

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN BERNARDINO 316 MT. VIEW AVE SAN BERNARDINO, CA 92415-0004

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO 130 W. BROADWAY SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO USO BRYANT ST #322 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94103

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNT Y OF SAN JOAQUIN 222 E. WEBER AVE #202 STOCKTON, CA 95202

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNT Y GOVERNMENT CENTER #450 SAN LUIS OBISPO, CA 93408

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN MATEO HALL OF JUSTICE AND RECORDS REDWOOD CITY, CA 94063

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA BARDARA 1112 SANTA BARBARA ST. SANTA BARBARA, CA 93101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA 70 W, HEDDING ST. SAN JOSE, CA 95110

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA CRUZ 701 OCEAN ST. #200 SANTA CRUZ, CA 95060

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SHASTA 1925 COURT ST. REDDING, CA 96001

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SIERRA P.O. BOX 457 DOWNIEVILLE, CA 95936 OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT A TIORNEY COUNTY OF SISKIYOU P.O. BOX 966 YREKA, CA 96097

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SOLANO 600 UNION AVE FAIRFIELD, CA 94533

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SONOMA 600 ADMINISTRATION DR. #212J SANTA ROSA, CA 95403

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF STANISLAUS 1100 I ST. #200 MODESTO, CA 93354

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SUTTER 1160 CIVIC CENTER BLVD. #A YUBA CITY, CA 95993

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TEHAMA P.O. BOX 319 REDBILIFF, CA 96060

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TRINITY P.O. BOX 110 WEAVERVILLE, CA 96093

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNT Y OF TULARE COURTHOUSE #224 VISALIA, CA 93291

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TUOLUMNE 2 S. GREEN ST. SONORA, CA 95370

VENTURA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 500 SOUTH VICTORIA AVE VENTURA, CA 93009

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNT Y OF YOLO JOJ SECOND STREET WOODLAND, CA 95695-

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF YUBA 213 5TH ST. MARYSVILLE, CA 95901

PRESIDENT OR CEO CRYSTAL CLEAR INDUSTRIES, INC. 2 BERGEN TURNPIKE RIDGEFIELD PARK, NI 07660

PRESIDENT OR CEO CRYSTAL CLEAR INDUSTRIES, INC. '300 INDUSTRIAL AVE RIDGEFIELD PARK, NJ 07660-1346

R LAWRENCE MONTGOMERY, CEO KOHL'S DEPARTMENT STORES, INC. 6360 N. LAKE DRIVE WHITEPISH BAY, WI 53217

R LAWRENCE MONTGOMERY, CEO KOHL'S DEPARTMENT STORES, D/C. N56 W 17000 RLDGEWOOD DR MENOMONEE FALLS, WI 53031

STEVEN A BURD, CEO SAFEWAY, INC. 5918 STONERIDGE MALL RD PLEASANTON, CA 94588-3229

### PRODUCT LIST

## **CRYSTAL CLEAR INDUSTRIES INC**

NORMAN 60Z MOUTHWASH DECANTER 24% LEAD CRYSTAL UPC CODE: 044117 230301 This product description pertains not only to the specific model of the product listed, but also for all units of all models of leaded crystal vessels

### KOHL'S DEPARTMENT STORES, INC.

SHANNON CRYSTAL BY GODINGER DUBLIN SET OF 4 100Z. CRYSTAL HIGHBALLS 24% LEAD CRYSTAL UPC CODE: 028199 258842; SHANNON CRYSTAL BY GODINGER DUBLIN SET OF 4 90Z CRYSTAL GOBLETS 24% LEAD CRYSTAL STYLE# 25904 UPC CODE: 028199 259047; LONGCHAMP CRISTAL D'ARQUES 4 53/40Z GLASSES UPC CODE: 026102 673119 These product descriptions pertain not only to the specific models of the products listed, but also for all units of all models of leaded crystal vessels

## SAFEWAY, INC.

RIEDEL VINUM CRYSTAL CHAMPAGNE #6416/8 UPC CODE: 632868 016086; RIEDEL VINUM CHABLIS UPC CODE: 632868 716054 These product descriptions pertain not only to the specific models of the products listed, but also for all units of all models of leaded crystal vessels

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

I, William Verick, hereby declare: This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings. I am the attorney for the noticing party. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the person(s) consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: December 18, 2008

Verick

This notice alleges the violation of Proposition 65 with respect to occupational exposures governed by the California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health. The State Plan incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California. The approval also provides that an employer may use the means of compliances in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement is subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the Attorney General.

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Nicole Frank, declare:

If called, I could and would testify as follows: I am over eighteen. My business address is 424 First Street, Eureka, California, 95501. On December 18, 2008, I caused the attached 60-DAY NOTICE LETTER, or a letter identical in substance, to be served by U.S. Mail on those public enforcement agencies listed on the attached SERVICE LIST; in addition on the same date and by U.S. Mail I caused the attached 60-DAY NOTICE LETTER and PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY to be sent by Certified U.S. Mail to the private business entities also listed on the attached SERVICE LIST. I deposited copies of these documents in envelopes, postage pre-paid, with the U.S. Postal Service on the day on which the mail is collected. I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on December 18, 2008, at Eureka, California.

licole Frank



June 24, 2010

PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCEMENT REPORTING ATTENTION: PROP 65 COORDINATOR 1515 CLAY STREET, SUITE 2000 P.O. BOX 70550 OAKLAND CA 94612-0550

#### Greetings:

This office and the Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation ("Mateel") hereby give you notice that Ben Myerson Candy Co., Inc. (hereinafter "Ben Myerson"), is, has been, will be and threatens to be in violation of Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.6. This office and Mateel are both private enforcers of Proposition 65, both organizations may be reached at the below-listed address and telephone number, I may be considered a "responsible individual" at both organizations, and I may be contacted at the same address and telephone number. The above referenced violations occur when Ben Myerson markets leaded crystal vessels such as decanters, tumblers, wine glasses, champagne flutes, and cocktail glasses (as for martinis) (collectively hereinafter "leaded crystal vessels"). Some specific examples include: RIEDEL VINUM CHABLIS UPC CODE: 632868 716054; and RIEDEL VINUM CRYSTAL CHAMPAGNE #6416/8 UPC CODE: 632868 016086. While specific names and UPC #'s are listed, this notice pertains to all similar types of leaded crystal vessels. Handling of, contact with, drinking from, and cleaning up broken glass from leaded crystal vessels exposes people to lead and lead compounds, lead phosphate, lead acetate, and lead subacetate (hereinafter, collectively, "lead"). Lead leaches from the vessel into the food or beverage stored in, or served from, the vessel. The food or beverage is then consumed and the accompanying lead ingested. These exposures (and resulting violations) occur occupationally, environmentally, and as the result of the sale of consumer products and/or services. In occupational settings, the type of work that is done during which the above-referenced exposures occur is handling the leaded crystal vessels, cleaning up broken glass from them, and drinking from them, such as at wine tastings and office parties. These exposures occur via the dermal absorption, inhalation, ingestion, and subcutaneous routes. Ben Myerson did not and does not provide people with clear and reasonable warnings before it exposes them to the above-referenced chemicals. The above referenced violations have occurred every day since at least June 24, 2007 and will continue every day until the warnings are given. These violations are alleged for occupational exposures as well as for consumer and environmental exposures. We do not, however, allege occupational exposure violations as to any of these products manufactured outside of California, except as to workplaces Ben Myerson itself maintains in California. Exposures constituting Proposition 65 environmental exposure violations occur both on and off Ben Myerson's private business properties and in each of California's 58 counties.

Cordially. William Verick

#### SERVICE LIST

PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCEMENT REPORTING ATTENTION: PROP 65 COORDINATOR 1515 CLAY STREET, SUITE 2000 POST OFFICE BOX 70550 OAKLAND, CA 94612-0550

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF OAKLAND 505 14TH ST 12TH FLOOR OAKLAND, CA 94612

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO CITY HALL ROOM 206 400 VAN NESS SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SACRAMENTO PO BOX 1948 SACRAMENTO, CA 95812-1948

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN JOSE 200 EAST SANTA CLARA STREET SAN JOSE, CA 95113

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF LOS ANGELES 200 N. MAIN ST. LOS ANGELES, CA 90012

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN DIEGO CONSUMER & ENVIRONNIENTAL PROTECTION 1200 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 700 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ALAMEDA 1225 FALLON STREET ROOM 900 OAKLAND, CA 94612

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ALPINE P O. BOX 248 MARKLEEVILLE, CA 96120

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF AMADOR 703 COURT STREET JACKSON, CA 95642

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF BUTTE 25 COUNTY CENTER DR. OROVILLE. CA 95965

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF CALAVERAS GOVERNMENT CENTER \$91 MOUNTAIN RANCH ROAD SAN ANDREAS. CA95249

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF COLUSA SIT MARKET STREET COLUSA, CA 93932

UFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF CONTRA COSTA P O BOX 670 MARTINEZ, CA 94553

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF DEL NORTE 450 H ST #171 CRESCENT CITY, CA 95531

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF EL DORADO SIS MAIN ST PLACERVILLE, CA 95667

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF FRESNO 22:0 TULARE ST #1000 FRESNO, CA 93721

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF GLENN P.O. BOX 430 WILLOWS, CA 95988

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT 825 STH ST. EUREKA, CA 95501 COUNTY OF IMPERIAL COURTHOUSE, FLOOR 2 939 W. MAIN ST EL CENTRO, CA 92243

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF INYO P.O. DRAWER D INDEPENDENCE, CA 93526

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF KERN 1215 TRUXTUN AVE. FLOOR 4 BAKERSFIELD, CA 93301

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF KINGS 1400 W. LACEY BLVD. HANFORD, CA 93230

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LAKE 235 N. FORBES ST # 424 LAKEPORT, CA 95453

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LASSEN 220 SOUTH LASSEN ST. STE 8 SUSANVILLE, CA 96130

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES 18000 CRIMINAL COURTS BUILDING 210 W. TEMPLE ST LOS ANGELES, CA 90012

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MADERA 209 W. YOSEMITE AVE MADERA, CA 93637

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MARIN HALL OF JUSTICE #183 SAN RAFAEL, CA 54503

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MARIPOSA P O. BOX 730 MARIPOSA. CA 95338

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MENDOCINO PO BOX 1000 UKIAIL CA 95492

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MERCED 2222 M ST. MERCED, CA 95340

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MODOC 204 SOUTH COURT STREET ALTURAS, CA 96101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MONO P.O. BOX 617 BRIDGEPORT, CA 93517

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MONTEREY 240 CHURCH STREET P O BOX 1131 SALINAS, CA 93902

COUNTY OF NAPA 931 PARKWAY MALL P.O. BOX 720 NAPA, CA 94559-0720

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF NEVADA 110 UNION STREET OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ORANGE 401 CIVIC CENTER DR WEST SANTA ANA, CA 92701

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF PLACER 10810 JUSTICE CENTER DR., STE 240 ROSEVILLE, CA 93678

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF PLUMAS 520 MAIN STREET #404 QUINCY, CA 95971

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE 4075 MAIN ST. RIVERSIDE, CA 92501

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SACRAMENTO 901 G STREET SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN BENITO 419 4TH ST HOLLISTER, CA 95023

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN BERNARDINO 316 MT. VIEW AVE. SAN BERNARDINO, CA 92415-0004

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO 330 W. BROADWAY, SUITE 1 100 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO 850 BRYANT ST #322 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94103

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN JOAQUIN 222 E. WEBER AVE #202 STOCKTON, CA 95202

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY GOVERNMENT CENTER #450 SAN LUIS OBISPO, CA 93408

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN MATEO HALL OF JUSTICE AND RECORDS REDWOOD CITY, CA 94063

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA DARBARA 1112 SANTA BARBARA ST. SANTA BARBARA, CA 93101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA 70 W. HEDDING ST SAN JOSE, CA 95110

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA CRUZ 701 OCEAN ST. #200 SANTA CRUZ, CA 95060

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SHASTA 1525 COURT ST. REDDING, CA 96001

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SIERRA P.O BOX 457 DOWNIEVILLE, CA 95936

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SISKI YOU P O BOX 986 YREKA, CA 96097

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SOLANO 600 UNION AVE FAIRFIELD, CA 94533

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SONOMA 600 ADMINISTRATION DR. #212J SANTA ROSA, CA 95403 OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF STANISLAUS 11001 ST. #200 MODESTO, CA 95354

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SUTTER 1160 CIVIC CENTER ULVD #A YUBA CITY, CA 95993

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TEHAMA P O. BOX 519 REDBLUFF, CA 96080

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TRINITY P.O. BOX 310 WEAVERVILLE, CA 96093

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TULARE COURTHOUSE #224 VISALIA, CA 93291

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TUOLUMNE 2 S. GREEN ST SONORA, CA 95370

VENTURA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 800 SOUTH VICTORIA AVE VENTURA, CA 93009

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF YOLO 301 SECOND STREET WOODLAND, CA 95695

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF YUBA 215 STH ST. MARYSVILLE, CA 95901

ROBERT MYERSON, CEO BEN MYERSON CANDY CO, INC 6550 E. WASHINGTON BLVD COMMERCE, CA 90040

٦,

·.

### CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

1

1, William Verick, hereby declare: This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings. I am the attorney for the noticing party. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will b e able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the person(s) consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: June 24, 2010

This notice alleges the violation of Proposition 65 with respect to occupational exposures governed by the California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health. The State Plan incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California. The approval also provides that an employer may use the means of compliances in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement is subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the Attorney General.

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

1, Nicole Frank, declare:

If called, I could and would testify as follows: I am over eighteen. My business address is 424 First Street, Eureka, California, 95501. On June 24, 2010, I caused the attached 60-DAY NOTICE LETTER, or a letter identical in substance, to be served by U.S. Mail on those public enforcement agencies listed on the attached SERVICE LIST; in addition on the same date and by U.S. Mail I caused the attached 60-DAY NOTICE LETTER and PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY to be sent by Certified U.S. Mail to the private business entities also listed on the attached SERVICE LIST. I deposited copies of these documents in envelopes, postage pre-paid, with the U.S. Postal Service on the day on which the mail is collected. I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on June 24, 2010, at Eureka, California.

Nicole Fran