

SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT

WILLIAM VERICK, SBN 140972 Klamath Environmental Law Center 2 FREDRIC EVENSON, SBN 198059 424 First Street Eureka, CA 95501 Telephone: (707) 268-8900 4 Facsimile: (707) 268-8901 wverick@igc.org 5 ecorights@earthlink.net

**DAVID ROE SBN 62552** Law Offices of David Roe 1061 Walker Avenue Oakland, CA 94610 Telephone: (510) 465-5860 davidroe@mail.com

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

Attorneys for Plaintiff. MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION

#### SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT (Unlimited Jurisdiction)

MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION.

CASE NO DR110874

Plaintiff,

v.

COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTIVE RELIEF AND CIVIL PENALTIES

TOXIC TORT/ENVIRONMENTAL

AKER BIOMARINE; AURORA ALGAE, INC.; AUSTRAL GROUP S.A.A.; AZANTIS, INC.; BARLEAN'S ORGANIC OILS, LLC; BASÉ CORPORATION; BIODROGA, INC. BIORIGINAL FOOD AND SCIENCE CORP.;

BIZEN CHEMICAL CO., LTD;

21 BORREGAARD WD LTD; COPEINCA

22 S.A.C.; CRODA INTERNATIONAL; DSM NUTRÍTIONAL PRODUCTS; EPAX AS; GC

RIEBER OILS AS GOLDEN OMEGA S.A.; 23 JR CARLSON LABORATORIES; K.D.

PHARMA BEXBACH GMBH; MARINE NUTRICEUTICAL CORP; MARUHA

NICHIRO FOODS, INC.; NORDIC

NATURALS, INC.; OCEAN NUTRITION CANADA LÍMITED; OMEGA NATURAL

SCIENCE, INC. (ORIGINATES, INC.); PHARMA MARINE AS: PHARMLINE,

28

26

27

ļ	
1	INC.; SOLUCIONES EXTRACTIVAS ALIMENTARIAS, SL; TECHNOLOGICA de
2	ALIMENTOS S.A.; and TISHCON CORP. (WILEY ORGANICS);
3	Defendants.
4	
5	
6	
7	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION allege as follows:
8	<u>INTRODUCTION</u>
9	1. This Complaint seeks civil penalties and an injunction to remedy the continuing
10	failure of defendants AKER BIOMARINE; AURORA ALGAE, INC.; AUSTRAL GROUP
11	S.A.A.; AZANTIS, INC.; BARLEAN'S ORGANIC OILS, LLC; BASF CORPORATION;
12	BIODROGA, INC.; BIORIGINAL FOOD AND SCIENCE CORP.; BIZEN CHEMICAL CO.,
13	LTD; BORREGAARD WD LTD; COPEINCA S.A.C.; CRODA INTERNATIONAL; DSM
14	NUTRITIONAL PRODUCTS; EPAX AS; GC RIEBER OILS AS GOLDEN OMEGA S.A.; JR
15	CARLSON LABORATORIES; K.D. PHARMA BEXBACH GMBH; MARINE
16	NUTRICEUTICAL CORP; MARUHA NICHIRO FOODS, INC.; NORDIC NATURALS, INC.;
17	OCEAN NUTRITION CANADA LIMITED; OMEGA NATURAL SCIENCE, INC.
18	(ORIGINATES, INC.); PHARMA MARINE AS; PHARMLINE, INC.; SOLUCIONES
19	EXTRACTIVAS ALIMENTARIAS, SL; TECHNOLOGICA de ALIMENTOS S.A.; and
20	TISHCON CORP. (WILEY ORGANICS), (hereinafter "Defendants"), to give clear and
21	reasonable warnings to those residents of California who are exposed to polychlorinated
22	biphenyls, polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins, polychlorinated dibenzofurans and 2,3,7,8
23	tetrachlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxin (hereinafter, collectively, "PCBs and dioxins"), when they
24	handle, ingest and use dietary supplements or supplemented foods or beverages containing
25	containing eicosapentanoica acid (EPA) and docosahexaenoic acid (DHA) including those that
26	are, or that are made from, fish oils, fish liver oils, shark or squid oils, and/or shark liver oils
27	(collectively, hereinafter, "fish oil supplements"). PCBs and dioxins are known to the State of
28	California to cause cancer and birth defects. Defendants manufacture, distribute, and/or market
	fish oil

supplements. Defendants' products cause exposures to PCBs and dioxins, which are chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

- 2. Defendants are businesses that manufacture, market, and/or distribute fish oil supplements. Defendants intend that residents of California ingest fish oil supplements that Defendants manufacture, market, and/or distribute. When these products are ingested in their normally intended manner, they expose people to PCBs and dioxins. In spite of knowing that residents of California were and are being exposed to PCBs and dioxins when they ingest Defendants' fish oil supplements, Defendants did not and do not provide clear and reasonable warnings that these products cause exposure to chemicals known to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.
- 3. Plaintiff seeks injunctive relief pursuant to Health & Saf. Code § 25249.7 to compel Defendants to bring their business practices into compliance with section Health & Saf. Code § 25249.5 et seq. by providing a clear and reasonable warning to each individual who has been and who in the future may be exposed to the above mentioned toxic chemicals from the reasonably anticipated and intended use of Defendants' products.
- 4. In addition to injunctive relief, plaintiff seeks civil penalties to remedy the failure of Defendants to provide clear and reasonable warnings regarding exposure to chemicals known to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

#### **PARTIES**

5. Plaintiff MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION ("Mateel") is a non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, the protection of the environment, promotion of human health, environmental education, and consumer rights. Mateel is based in Eureka, California, and is incorporated under the laws of the State of California. Mateel is a "person" within the meaning of Health & Saf, Code §§ 25118 and 25249.11(a). Mateel brings this enforcement action in the public interest pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d).

- 6. Each Defendant is a person doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code Section 25249.11(a). Each defendant is a business that manufactures, distributes, and/or markets fish oil supplements in California. Marketing of these products in Humboldt County, and/or to people who live in Humboldt County, causes people to be intentionally exposed to PCBs while they are physically present in Humboldt County.
- 7. Mateel brings this enforcement action against Defendants pursuant to Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d). Attached hereto and incorporated by reference is a copy of the Notice of Violation letter dated April 15, 2011, which Mateel sent to California's Attorney General. Notice of Violation letters identical in substance were sent to every District Attorney in the state, and to the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000. On the same date, Mateel sent the same Notice of Violation letter to Defendants. Attached to the 60-Day Notice Letter sent to the Defendants was a summary of Proposition 65 that was prepared by California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment. In addition, the 60-Day Notice Letter Plaintiffs sent was accompanied by a Certificate of Service attesting to the service of the 60-Day Notice Letter on each entity which received it. Pursuant to California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), a Certificate of Merit attesting to the reasonable and meritorious basis for the action was also sent with the 60-Day Notice Letter. Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the Certificate of Merit was enclosed with the 60-Day Notice letter Plaintiffs sent to the Attorney General.
  - 8. Each Defendant is a business that employs more than ten people.

#### <u>JURISDICTION</u>

- 9. The Court has jurisdiction over this action pursuant to California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7. California Constitution Article VI, Section 10 grants the Superior Court "original jurisdiction in all causes except those given by statute to other trial courts." Chapter 6.6 of the Health & Safety Code, which contains the statutes under which this action is brought, does not grant jurisdiction to any other trial court.
- 10. This Court also has jurisdiction over Defendants because they are businesses that have sufficient minimum contacts in California and within the Humboldt County. Defendants intentionally availed themselves of the California and Humboldt County markets for fish oil

supplements. It is thus consistent with traditional notions of fair play and substantial justice for the Humboldt Superior Court to exercise jurisdiction over them.

11. Venue is proper in this Court because Defendants market their products in and around Humboldt County and thus intentionally cause people to ingest PCBs while those people are physically present in Humboldt County. Liability for Plaintiffs' causes of action, or some parts thereof, has accordingly arisen in Humboldt County during the times relevant to this Complaint and Plaintiffs accordingly seek civil penalties and forfeitures imposed by statutes.

# FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION (Claim for Injunctive Relief)

- 12. Plaintiff's reallege and incorporate by reference into this First Cause of Action, as if specifically set forth herein, paragraphs 1 through 11, inclusive.
- 13. The People of the State of California have declared by referendum under Proposition 65 (California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.) their right "[t]o be informed about exposures to chemicals that cause cancer, birth defects, and reproductive harm."
- 14. To effectuate this goal, Section 25249.6 of the Health and Safety Code mandates that persons who, in the course of doing business, knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer or birth defects, must first provide a clear and reasonable warning to such individual prior to the exposure.
- 15. Since at least April 15, 2008, Defendants have engaged in conduct that violates Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6 et *seq*. This conduct includes knowingly and intentionally exposing those California residents who ingest fish oil supplements to PCBs and dioxins. The normally intended use of fish oil supplements causes people to ingest PCBs and dioxins, which are chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm. Defendants have not provided clear and reasonable warnings within the meaning of Health & Safety Code Sections 25249.6 and 25249.11.
- 16. At all times relevant to this action, Defendants knew that the fish oil supplements they marketed were causing exposures to PCBs and dioxins. Defendants intended that residents of California ingest fish oil supplements thereby causing significant exposures to these chemicals.

17. By the above described acts, Defendants have violated Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 and are therefore subject to an injunction ordering them to stop violating Proposition 65, to provide warnings to all present and future customers, and to provide warnings to their past customers who purchased Defendants' products without receiving a clear and reasonable warning.

# SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION (Claim for Civil Penalties)

- 18. Plaintiff realleges and incorporates by reference into this Second Cause of Action, as if specifically set forth herein, paragraphs 1 through 17, inclusive.
- 19. By the above described acts, Defendants and each of them are liable, pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), for a civil penalty of up to \$2,500.00 per day for each exposure of an individual to PCBs without proper warning from the use of Defendants' fish oil supplements.

## PRAYER FOR RELIEF

Wherefore, plaintiff prays for judgment against DEFENDANTS, as follows:

- Pursuant to the First Cause of Action, that Defendants be enjoined, restrained, and ordered to comply with the provisions of Section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code;
- 2. Pursuant to the Second Cause of Action, that Defendants be assessed a civil penalty in an amount equal to \$2,500.00 per individual knowingly and intentionally exposed per day, in violation of Section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, to PCBs and dioxins as the result of Defendants' manufacturing, distributing or marketing of fish oil supplements;
- 3. That, pursuant to Civil Procedure Code § 1021.5, Defendants be ordered to pay to Plaintiffs the attorneys fees and costs it incurred in bringing this enforcement action.
  - 4. For such other relief as this court deems just and proper.

Dated: November 16, 2011

KLAMATH ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CENTER

William Verick Attorney for Plaintiff



April 14, 2011

PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCEMENT REPORTING ATTENTION: PROP 65 COORDINATOR 1515 CLAY STREET, SUITE 2000 P.O. BOX 70550 OAKLAND CA 94612-0550

Cordially

Re: Notice of Violation of Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 (PCB Exposure)

Greetings:

The Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation ("Mateel"), Chris Manthey and Benson Chiles give you notice that the private businesses listed on the attached Service List have been, are, will be and threaten to be in violation of Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.6. Mateel, Mr. Manthey and Mr. Chiles are private enforcers of Proposition 65, all may be contacted at the below listed address and telephone number. I am a responsible individual at Mateel. The Noticing Parties are also represented by David Roe. Mr. Roe may be reached at: Law Offices of David Roe, 1061 Walker Ave, Oakland, CA 94610, (510) 465-5860. The above referenced violations occur and have occurred when people ingest dietary supplements these companies market that are made from fish oil, fish liver oils, shark oils and/or shark liver oils, as well as other oils containing eicosapentanoica acid (EPA) and docosahexaenoic acid (DHA), (collectively EPA and DHA Omega-3s or, "products"). These products expose the people who take them to polychlorinated biphenyls ("PCBs"), polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins, polychlorinated dibenzofurans and 2,3,7, 8 tetrachlorodibenzo-para-dioxin via the ingestion, dermal absorption and absorption through mucous membrane routes. The listed companies did not and do not provide people with clear and reasonable warnings before they expose them to these chemicals. The above referenced violations have occurred every day since at least April 14, 2008 and will continue every day until these chemicals are taken out of these products or until warnings are given.

#### Each of the below-listed businesses is being served with this notice by mailing a copy of the notice to: Robert Falk, Morrison & Foerster LLP, 425 Market Street, San Francisco, CA 94105-2482, their authorized agent for service of this notice.

AKER BIOMARINE FJORDALLEEN 16 OSLO, NORWAY -0115

AURORA ALGAE, INC. 3325 INVESTMENT BLVD. HAYWARD, CA 94545

AUSTRAL GROUP S.A.A.
AV. VICTOR ANDRES BELAUNDE 147 CENTRO
EMPRESARIAL TORRE REAL SIETE
SAN ISIDRO, LIMA, PERU, LIMA27

AZANTIS, INC. 4885 RIVERBEND RD. SUITE D BOULDER, CO 80301

BARLEAN'S ORGANIC OILS, LLC 980 9TH STREET, SUITE 1700 SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

BASF CORPORATION 100 CAMPUS DRIVE FLORHAM PARK, NJ 07932

BIODROGA, INC. 301 JOSEPH CARRIER JAUDREUIL, QC J7V5VS

BIORIGINAL FOOD AND SCIENCE CORP. 102 MELVILLE STREET SASHATOON, SK. S7J ORI CANADA

BIZEN CHEMICAL CO., LTD. 363 TOKUTOMI AKAIUA-SHI, OKAYAMA JAPAN 709-0716

COPEINCA S.A.C. CALLE FRANCISCO GRAÑA 155, URB. SANTA CATALINA, LA VICTORIA LIMA, PERU, L13

CRODA INTERNATIONAL CRODA, INC 300-A COLUMBUS CIRCLE EDISON, NEW JERSEY 08837-3907

BORREGAARD WD. LTD., DIVISION DEN OMEGA PURE HEALTH P.O. BOX 162 NO-1701 SARPSBORG, NORWAY

DSM NUTRITIONAL PRODUCTS 45 WATERVIEW BLVD. PARSIPPANY, NJ 07054

EPAX AS AARSETER VEIEN 17 N-6028 NORWAY

GC RIEBER OILS AS POST B 454 N-6501 KRISTIANSUND NORWAY GOLDEN OMEGA S.A. AV. EL GOLF 150, 15TH FLOOR LAS CONDES SANTIAGO, CHILE

JR CARLSON LABORATORIES 15 W COLLEGE DR ARLINGTON HEIGHTS, IL 60004

K.D. PHARMA BEXBACH GMBH AM KRAFTWERK 6 BEXBACH 66450 GERMANY

MARINE NUTRICEUTICAL CORP. 794 SUNRISE BOULEVARD MOUNT BETHEL, PA 18343

MARUHA NICHIRO FOODS, INC. 3-2-10 TOYOSU, KOTO TOKYO, JAPAN 135-8605

ORIGINATES, INC. 20900 NE 30TH AVE. SUITE 707 AVENTURA, FL 33180

NORDIC NATURALS, INC., 111 JENNINGS DRIVE WATSONVILLE, CA 95076

OCEAN NUTRITION CANADA LIMITED 101 RESEARCH DRIVE DARTMOUTH, NOVA SCOTIA, CANADA B2Y 4T6

OMEGA NATURAL SCIENCE, INC. 1050 WINTER STREET, SUITE 1000 WALTHAM, MA 02451

WILEY ORGANICS, INC. DBA ORGANIC TECHNOLOGIES P.O. BOX 640 COSHOCTON, OH 43812

PHARMA MARINE AS TEROY 6280 SOVIK, NORWAY

PHARMLINE, INC. 41 BRIDGE STREET, PO BOX 291 FLORIDA, NY 10921

SOLUCIONES EXTRACTIVAS ALIMENTARIAS, SL AURA DE BARAJAS, 24-3 28109-ALCOBENDAS MADRID SPAIN

TECNOLOGICS DE ALIMENTS S.A. LAS BEGONIAS 441-352 LIMA, LIMA, PERU LIMA 27

TISHCON CORP. 50 SYLVESTER STREET WESTBURY, NY 11590

#### SERVICE LIST

PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCEMENT REPORTING ATTENTION: PROP 65 COORDINATOR 1515 CLAY STREET, SUITE 2000 POST OFFICE BOX 70550 OAKLAND, CA 94612-0550

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF OAKLAND 505 14TH ST 12TH FLOOR OAKLAND, CA 94612

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO CITY HALL ROOM 206 400 VAN NESS SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SACRAMENTO PO BOX 1948 SACRAMENTO, CA 95812-1948

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN JOSE 200 EAST SANTA CLARA STREET SAN JOSE, CA 95113

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF LOS ANGELES 200 N. MAIN ST. LOS ANGELES, CA 90012

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN DIEGO CONSUMER & ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 1200 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 700 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ALAMEDA 1225 FALLON STREET ROOM 900 OAKLAND, CA 94612

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ALPINE P.O. BOX 248 MARKLEEVILLE, CA 96120

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF AMADOR 708 COURT STREET JACKSON, CA 95642

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF BUTTE 25 COUNTY CENTER DR. OROVILLE, CA 95965

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF CALAVERAS GOVERNMENT CENTER 891 MOUNTAIN RANCH ROAD SAN ANDREAS, CA95249

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF COLUSA 547 MARKET STREET COLUSA, CA 95932

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF CONTRA COSTA P.O. BOX 670 MARTINEZ, CA 94553

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF DEL NORTE 450 H ST #171 CRESCENT CITY, CA 95531

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF EL DORADO 515 MAIN ST. PLACERVILLE, CA 95667

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF FRESNO 2220 TULARE ST #1000 FRESNO, CA 93721

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF GLENN P.O. BOX 430 WILLOWS, CA 95988 OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT 825 5TH ST. EUREKA, CA 95501

COUNTY OF IMPERIAL COURTHOUSE, FLOOR 2 939 W. MAIN ST EL CENTRO, CA 92243

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF INYO P.O. DRAWER D INDEPENDENCE, CA 93526

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF KERN 1215 TRUXTÙN AVE. FLOOR 4 BAKERSFIELD, CA 93301

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF KINGS 1400 W. LACEY BLVD. HANFORD, CA 93230

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LAKE 255 N. FORBES ST # 424 LAKEPORT, CA 95453

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LASSEN 220 SOUTH LASSEN ST. STE 8 SUSANVILLE, CA 96130

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES 18000 CRIMINAL COURTS BUILDING 210 W. TEMPLE ST. LOS ANGELES, CA 90012

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MADERA 209 W. YOSEMITE AVE. MADERA, CA 93637

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MARIN HALL OF JUSTICE #183 SAN RAFAEL, CA 94903

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MARIPOSA P.O. BOX 730 MARIPOSA, CA 95338

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MENDOCINO PO BOX 1000 UKIAH, CA 95482

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MERCED 2222 M ST. MERCED, CA 95340

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MODOC 204 SOUTH COURT STREET ALTURAS, CA 96101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MONO P.O. BOX 617 BRIDGEPORT, CA 93517

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MONTEREY 240 CHURCH STREET P.O. BOX 1131 SALINAS, CA 93902

COUNTY OF NAPA 931 PARKWAY MALL P.O. BOX 720 NAPA, CA 94559-0720

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF NEVADA 110 UNION STREET NEVADA CITY, CA 95959

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ORANGE 401 CIVIC CENTER DR WEST SANTA ANA, CA 92701

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF PLACER 10810 JUSTICE CENTER DR. STE 240 ROSEVILLE, CA 95678

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF PLUMAS 520 MAIN STREET #404 QUINCY, CA 95971

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE 4075 MAIN ST. RIVERSIDE, CA 92501

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SACRAMENTO 901 G STREET SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN BENITO 419 4TH ST HOLLISTER, CA 95023

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN BERNARDINO 316 MT. VIEW AVE. SAN BERNARDINO, CA 92415-0004

OFFICE.OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO 330 W. BROADWAY, SUITE 1100 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO 850 BRYANT ST #322 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94103

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN JOAQUIN 222 E. WEBER AVE #202 STOCKTON, CA 95202

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY GOVERNMENT CENTER #450 SAN LUIS OBISPO, CA 93408

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN MATEO HALL OF JUSTICE AND RECORDS REDWOOD CITY, CA 94063

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA 1112 SANTA BARBARA ST. SANTA BARBARA, CA 93101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA 70 W. HEDDING ST. SAN JOSE, CA 95110

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA CRUZ 701 OCEAN ST. #200 SANTA CRUZ, CA 95060

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SHASTA 1525 COURT ST. REDDING, CA 96001

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SIERRA P.O. BOX 457 DOWNIEVILLE, CA 95936

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SISKIYOU P.O. BOX 986 YREKA, CA 96097

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SOLANO 600 UNION AVE FAIRFIELD, CA 94533

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SONOMA 600 ADMINISTRATION DR. #212J SANTA ROSA, CA 95403

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF STANISLAUS 1100 | ST. #200 MODESTO, CA 95354

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SUTTER 1160 CIVIC CENTER BLVD. #A YUBA CITY, CA 95993

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TEHAMA P.O. BOX 519 REDBLUFF, CA 96080

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TRINITY P.O. BOX 310 WEAVERVILLE, CA 96093

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TULARE COURTHOUSE #224 VISALIA, CA 93291

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TUOLUMNE 2 S. GREEN ST. SONORA, CA 95370

VENTURA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 800 SOUTH VICTORIA AVE VENTURA, CA 93009

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF YOLO 301 SECOND STREET WOODLAND, CA 95695

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF YUBA 215 5TH ST. MARYSVILLE, CA 95901

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

I, William Verick, hereby declare: This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached notice(s) of violation in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings. I am the attorney for the noticing party. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the person(s) consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 14, 2011

William Verick

This notice alleges the violation of Proposition 65 with respect to occupational exposures governed by the California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health. The State Plan incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California. The approval also provides that an employer may use the means of compliances in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement is subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the Attorney General.

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Nicole Frank, declare:

If called, I could and would testify as follows: I am over eighteen. My business address is 424 First Street, Eureka, California, 95501. On April 14, 2011, I caused the attached NOTICE OF VIOLATION LETTER, or a letter identical in substance, to be served by U.S. Mail on those public enforcement agencies listed on the attached SERVICE LIST; in addition on the same date and by U.S. Mail I caused the attached NOTICE OF VIOLATION and PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY to be sent by Certified U.S. Mail to the private business entities also listed on the attached SERVICE LIST. I deposited copies of these documents in envelopes, postage pre-paid, with the U.S. Postal Service on the day on which the mail is collected. I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on April 14, 2011, at Eureka, California.

Nicole Frank



April 15, 2011

To All of Those Listed on Attachmenta A and B:

Corrected Notice of Violation of Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 (concerning exposures to PCBs, Dioxins, and Furans from EPA and DHA containing oils)

Please note that this is a follow-up letter that is a corrected version of a letter we mailed to you yesterday which contained several inadvertant errors regarding our notice of violation of California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 ("Proposition 65") concerning fish, fish liver, shark, shark liver and other EPA and DHA-containing oils. This corrected letter incorporates by reference the Proposition 65 Certificate of Merit attached to our letter yesterday, another copy of which is attached.

The Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation ("Mateel"), Chris Manthey and Benson Chiles (collectively, the "Noticing Parties") give you and the public prosecutors identified on Attachment B notice that your company has been, is, will be and threatens to be in violation of Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.6. The Noticing Parties are private enforcers of Proposition 65; all may be contacted at the below listed address and telephone number. I am a responsible individual at Mateel. The Noticing Parties are also represented by David Roe. Mr. Roe may be reached at: Law Offices of David Roe, 1061 Walker Ave, Oakland, CA 94610, (510) 465-5860.

The above-referenced violations occur and have occurred when people ingest fish (including, but not limited to, cod and salmon) oils, fish (including, but not limited to, cod) liver oils, shark or squid oils, and/or shark liver oils, as well as other oils containing eicosapentanoica acid (EPA) and docosahexaenoic acid (DHA) (collectively, the "Products") which your company manufacturers or directly or indirectly distributes, markets for sale, or sells to consumers in California. These Products expose the people who use or ingest them to polychlorinated biphenyls ("PCBs"), polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins, polychlorinated dibenzo-furans and 2,3,7,8 tetrachlorodibenzo-para-dioxin via the ingestion, dermal absorption and, absorption through mucous membrane routes of exposure.

Your company did not and does not provide California consumers with clear and reasonable warnings as required by Proposition 65 before you expose them to the aforementioned chemicals via your Products. The above referenced violations have occurred every day since at least April 14, 2008 and will continue every day until these chemicals are reduced in, or eliminated from, your Products or until clear and reasonable warnings are given to California consumers for them as required by Proposition 65.

villatii veilek

# ATTACHMENT A

Each of the below-listed businesses is being served with this notice by mailing a copy of the notice to: Robert Falk, Morrison & Foerster LLP, 425 Market Street, San Francisco, CA 94105-2482, their authorized agent for service of this notice.

AKER BIOMARINE FJORDALLEEN 16 OSLO, NORWAY -0115

AURORA ALGAE, INC. 3325 INVESTMENT BLVD. HAYWARD, CA 94545

AUSTRAL GROUP S.A.A.
AV. VICTOR ANDRES BELAUNDE 147 CENTRO
EMPRESARIAL TORRE REAL SIETE
SAN ISIDRO, LIMA, PERU, LIMA27

AZANTIS, INC. 4885 RIVERBEND RD. SUITE D BOULDER, CO 80301

BARLEAN'S ORGANIC OILS, LLC 980 9TH STREET, SUITE 1700 SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

BASE CORPORATION 100 CAMPUS DRIVE FLORHAM PARK, NJ 07932

BIODROGA, INC. 301 JOSEPH CARRIER JAUDREUIL, QC J7V5VS

BIORIGINAL FOOD AND SCIENCE CORP. 102 MELVILLE STREET SASHATOON, SK. S7J ORI CANADA

BIZEN CHEMICAL CO., LTD. 363 TOKUTOMI AKAJUA-SHI, OKAYAMA JAPAN 709-0716

COPEINCA S.A.C.
CALLE FRANCISCO GRAÑA 155, URB. SANTA CATALINA,
LA VICTORIA
LIMA, PERU, L13

CRODA INTERNATIONAL CRODA, INC 300-A COLUMBUS CIRCLE EDISON, NEW JERSEY 08837-3907

BORREGAARD WD. LTD., DIVISION DEN OMEGA PURE HEALTH P.O. BOX 162 NO-1701 SARPSBORG, NORWAY

DSM NUTRITIONAL PRODUCTS 45 WATERVIEW BLVD. PARSIPPANY, NJ 07054

EPAX AS AARSETER VEIEN 17 N-6028 NORWAY

GC RIEBER OILS AS POST B 454 N-6501 KRISTIANSUND NORWAY GOLDEN OMEGA S.A. AV. EL GOLF 150, 15TH FLOOR LAS CONDES SANTIAGO, CHILE

JR CARLSON LABORATORIES 15 W COLLEGE DR ARLINGTON HEIGHTS, IL 60004

K.D. PHARMA BEXBACH GMBH AM KRAFTWERK 6 BEXBACH 66450 GERMANY

MARINE NUTRICEUTICAL CORP. 794 SUNRISE BOULEVARD MOUNT BETHEL, PA 18343

MARUHA NICHIRO FOODS, INC. 3-2-10 TOYOSU, KOTO TOKYO, JAPAN 135-8605

ORIGINATES, INC. 20900 NE 30TH AVE. SUITE 707 AVENTURA, FL 33180

NORDIC NATURALS, INC., 111 JENNINGS DRIVE WATSONVILLE, CA 95076

OCEAN NUTRITION CANADA LIMITED 101 RESEARCH DRIVE DARTMOUTH, NOVA SCOTIA, CANADA B2Y 4T6

OMEGA NATURAL SCIENCE, INC. 1050 WINTER STREET, SUITE 1000 WALTHAM, MA 02451

WILEY ORGANICS, INC. DBA ORGANIC TECHNOLÓGIES P.O. BOX 640 COSHOCTON, OH 43812

PHARMA MARINE AS TEROY 6280 SOVIK, NORWAY

PHARMLINE, INC. 41 BRIDGE STREET, PO BOX 291 FLORIDA, NY 10921

SOLUCIONES EXTRACTIVAS ALIMENTARIAS, SL AURA DE BARAJAS, 24-3 28109-ALCOBENDAS MADRID SPAIN

TECNOLOGICS DE ALIMENTS S.A. LAS BEGONIAS 441-352 LIMA, LIMA, PERU LIMA 27

TISHCON CORP. 50 SYLVESTER STREET WESTBURY, NY 11590

# **ATTACHMENT B**

#### SERVICE LIST

PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCEMENT REPORTING ATTENTION: PROP 65 COORDINATOR 1515 CLAY STREET, SUITE 2000 POST CHICE BOX 70550 OAKLAND, CA 94612-0550

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF OAKLAND 505 14TH ST 12TH ROOR OAKLAND, CA 94612

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO CITY HALL ROOM 206 400 VAN NESS SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SACRAMENTO PO BOX 1948 SACRAMENTO, CA 95812-1948

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN JOSE 200 EAST SANTA CLARA STREET SAN JOSE, CA 95173

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF LOS ANGELES 200 N. MAIN ST. LOS ANGELES, CA 90012

OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY CITY OF SAN DIEGO CONSUMER & ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 1200 THERD AVENUE SUITE 700 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ALAMEDA 1225 FALLON STREET ROOM 900 OAKLAND, CA 94612

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF ALPINE P.O. BOX 248 MARKI FEVILLE, CA 96120

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF AMADOR 708 COURT STREET JACKSON, CA 95642

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF BUTTE 25 COUNTY CENTER DR. OROWILE, CA 95965

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF CALAVERAS GOVERNMENT CENTER 891 MOUNTAIN RANCH ROAD SAN ANDREAS, CA95249

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF COLUSA 547 MARKET STREET COLUSA, CA 95932

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF CONTRA COSTA P.O. BOX 670 MARTINEZ, CA 94553

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF DEL NORTE 450 H ST #171 CRESCENT CITY, CA 95531

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF EL DORADO 515 MAIN ST. PLACERVILLE, CA 95667

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF FRESNO 2220 TULARE ST # 1000 FRESNO. CA 93721

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF GLENN P.O BOX 430 WILLOWS CA 95988 OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT 825 5TH ST. EUREKA, CA 95501

COUNTY OF IMPERIAL COURTHOUSE, FLOOR 2 939 W. MAIN ST EL CENTRO, CA 92243

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF INYO P.O. DRAWER D INDEPENDENCE, CA 93526

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF KERN 121 STRUXTUN AVE. FLOOR 4 BAKERSFIELD, CA 93301

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF KINGS 1400 W, LACEY BLVD. HANFORD, CA 93230

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LAKE 255 N. FORBES ST # 424 LAKEPORT, CA 95453

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LASSEN 220 SOUTH LASSEN ST. STE 8 SUSANVILLE, CA 96130

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES 18000 CRIMINAL COURTS BUILDING 210 W. TEMPLE ST. LOS ANGELES, CA 90012

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MADERA 209 W. YOSEMITE AVE. MADERA, CA 93637

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MARIN HALL OF JUSTICE # 183 SAN RAFAFL CA 94903

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MARIPOSA P.O. 80X 730 MARIPOSA, CA 95338

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MENDOCINO PO BOX 1000 UKIAH, CA 95482

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MERCED 2222 M ST. MERCED, CA 95340

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MODOC 204 SOUTH COURT STREET ALTURAS. CA 96101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MONO P.O. BOX 617 BRIDGEPORT, CA 93517

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF MONTEREY 240 CHURCH STREET P.O. BOX 1131 SALINAS, CA 93902

COUNTY OF NAPA 931 PARKWAY MALL P.O. BOX 720 NAPA, CA 94559-0720

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF NEVADA 110 UNION STREET NEVADA CITY, CA 95959

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY
COUNTY OF ORANGE
401 CIVIC CENTER DR WEST
SANTA ANA. CA 92701

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF PLACER 10810 JUSTICE CENTER DR. STE 240 ROSEVILLE, CA 95678

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF PLUMAS 520 MAIN STREET #404 QUINCY, CA 95971

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE 4075 MAIN ST. RIVERSIDE. CA 92501

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SACRAMENTO 901 G STREET SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN BENITO 419 4TH ST HOULSTER, CA 95023

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN BERNARDINO 316 MT. VIEW AVE. SAN BERNARDINO, CA 92415-0004

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO 330 W. BROADWAY, SUITE 1100 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO 850 BRYANT ST #322 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94103

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN JOAQUIN 222 E. WEBER AVE #202 STOCKTON, CA 95202

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY GOVERNMENT CENTER #450 SAN LUIS OBISPO, CA 9:3408

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SAN MATEO HALL OF JUSTICE AND RECORDS REDWOOD CITY, CA 94063

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA 1112 SANTA BARBARA ST. SANTA BARBARA, CA 93101

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA 70 W. HEDDING ST. SAN JOSE, CA 95110

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SANTA CRUZ 701 OCEAN ST. #200 SANTA CRUZ, CA 95060

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SHASTA 1525 COURT ST. REDDING, CA 96001

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SIERRA P.O. BOX 457 DOWNIEVILLE, CA 95936

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SISKIYOU P.O. BOX 986 YREKA, CA 96097

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SOLANO 600 UNION AVE FAIRFIELD, CA 94533

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SONOMA 600 ADMINISTRATION DR. #2123 SANTA ROSA, CA 95403

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF STANISLAUS 1100 1 ST. #200 MODESTO, CA 95354

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF SUTTER 1160 CTVIC CENTER BLVD. #A YUBA CITY, CA 95993

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TEHAMA P.O. BOX 519 REDBLUFF, CA 96080

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TRINITY P.O. BOX 310 WEAVERVILLE, CA 96093

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TULARE COURTHOUSE \$224 VISALIA, CA 93291

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF TUOLUMNE 2 S. GREEN ST. SONORA, CA 95370

VENTURA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 800 SOUTH VICTORIA AVE VENTURA, CA 93009

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF YOLO 301 SECOND STREET WOODLAND, CA 95695

OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY COUNTY OF YUBA 215 5TH ST. MARYSVILLE, CA 95901

### CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

I, William Verick, hereby declare: This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached notice(s) of violation in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings. I am the attorney for the noticing party. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the person(s) consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 14, 2011

William Verick

This notice alleges the violation of Proposition 65 with respect to occupational exposures governed by the California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health. The State Plan incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California. The approval also provides that an employer may use the means of compliances in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement is subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the Attorney General.

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

## I, Sara Davis, declare:

If called, I could and would testify as follows: I am over eighteen. My business address is 425 Market Street, San Francisco, California 94115. On April 15, 2011, I caused the attached Corrected NOTICE OF VIOLATION letter, or a letter identical in substance, and Certificate of Merit to be served by U.S. Mail on those public enforcement agencies listed on ATTACHMENT B SERVICE LIST. I deposited copies of these documents in envelopes, postage prepaid, with the U.S. Postal Service on the day on which the mail is collected. In addition, on the same date, I caused the attached Corrected NOTICE OF VIOLATION letter, Certificate of Merit and PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY to be sent to the private business entities listed on ATTACHMENT A by personally serving them on their agent authorized for service of this notice, Robert Falk, Morrison & Foerster LLP, 425 Market Street, San Francisco, CA 94105-2482. I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on April 15, 2011 at San Francisco, California.

Sara Davis

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Section 25249.7, Health and Safety Code.

APPENDIX A

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT

CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and its implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information. Proposition 65 appears in California law as Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 22 of the California Code of Regulations, Sections 25000 through 27001. WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Governor's List." Proposition 65 requires the Governor to publish a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm. This list must be updated at least once a year. Over 735 chemical listings have been included as of November 16, 2001. Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under this law. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving those chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed. Exposures are exempt from the warning requirement if they occur less than twelve months after the date of listing of the chemical.

June 2008

Prohibition from discharges into drinking water. A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Discharges are exempt from this requirement if they occur less than twenty months after the date of listing of the chemical.

DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY

EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. The law exempts:

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, State or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Businesses with nine or fewer employees. Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employs a total of nine or fewer employees.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed as known to the State to cause cancer ("carcinogens"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "no significant risk" levels for more than 250 listed carcinogens.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm ("reproductive toxicants"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level (NOEL)," divided by a 1,000-fold safety or uncertainty factor. The "no observable effect level" is the highest dose level which has not been associated with an observable adverse reproductive or developmental effect.

Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering into any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not enter any drinking water source, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" or "no observable effect" test if an individual were exposed to such an amount in drinking water.

HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys (those in cities with a

June 2008 population exceeding 750,000). Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. A notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in regulations (Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25903). A private party may not pursue an enforcement action directly under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court of law to stop committing the violation.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900.