ENDORSED FILED ALAHEDA COUNTY

2013 NOV 18 PM 3: 47

TATALIA

Michael Freund SBN 99687 Ryan Hoffman SBN 283297 Michael Freund & Associates 1919 Addison Street, Suite 105 Berkeley, CA 94704

Telephone: (510) 540-1992 Facsimile: (510) 540-5543

Attorneys for Plaintiff Environmental Research Center

ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH CENTER,

a California non-profit corporation

Plaintiff,

IDEAL SHAPE, LLC and DOES 1-100

Defendants.

7 8

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25 26

27

28

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

CASE NO.

RG13704155

COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTIVE AND DECLARATORY RELIEF AND CIVIL PENALTIES

[Miscellaneous Civil Complaint (42)] Proposition 65, Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq.]

Plaintiff Environmental Research Center hereby alleges:

I

INTRODUCTION

1. Plaintiff Environmental Research Center (hereinafter "Plaintiff" or "ERC") brings this action as a private attorney general enforcer and in the public interest pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 25249.7, subdivision (d). This complaint seeks injunctive and declaratory relief and civil penalties to remedy Defendant Ideal Shape, LLC and Does 1-100 (hereinafter "Ideal Shape")'s failure to warn consumers that they have been exposed to lead from several of Ideal Shape's nutritional health products. Lead is a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm. Based on the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Page 1 of 7

.

Enforcement Act of 1986 (Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq.) also known as "Proposition 65," businesses with ten or more employees must provide a "clear and reasonable warning" prior to exposing persons to these chemicals.

\mathbf{II}

PARTIES

- Plaintiff ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by reducing the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees and encouraging corporate responsibility.
- 3. Defendant Ideal Shape is a business that distributes and/or sells nutritional health products that have exposed users to lead in the State of California within the relevant statute of limitations period. These "Covered Products" are Ideal Shape LLC Ideal Shape Ideal Shake Meal Replacement Shake Chocolate, Ideal Shape LLC Ideal Shape Meal Replacement Shake Vanilla, and Ideal Shape LLC Ideal Bar Enhanced Hunger Blocker Double Chocolate. Ideal Shape is a company subject to Proposition 65 as it employs ten or more persons.
- 4. Defendants Does 1-100, are named herein under fictitious names, as their true names and capacities are unknown to ERC. ERC is informed and believes, and thereon alleges, that each of said Does is responsible, in some actionable manner, for the events and happenings hereinafter referred to, either through said Defendant's conduct, or through the conduct of its agents, servants or employees, or in some other manner, causing the harms alleged by ERC in this complaint. When said true names and capacities of Does are ascertained, ERC will seek leave to amend this complaint to set forth the same.

Ш

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 5. This Court has jurisdiction pursuant to California Constitution Article VI, Section 10 because this case is a cause not given by statute to other trial courts.
- The Complaint is based on allegations contained in a Notice of Violation dated May
 2013, served on the California Attorney General, other public enforcers and Ideal Shape. A

Page 2 of 7

true and correct copy of the Notice of Violation is attached as Exhibit A. More than 60 days have passed since the Notice of Violation was mailed and no public enforcement entity has filed a complaint in this case.

7. This Court is the proper venue for the action because the causes of action have arisen in the County of Alameda where some of the violations of law have occurred. Furthermore, this Court is the proper venue under Code of Civil Procedure section 395.5 and Health & Safety Code section 25249.7.

IV

STATUTORY BACKGROUND

A. Proposition 65

- 8. The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 is an initiative statute passed as "Proposition 65" by an overwhelming majority vote of the people in November of 1986.
- The warning requirement of Proposition 65 is contained in Health & Safety Code section
 25249.6, which provides:

No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual, except as provided in Section 25249.10.

- 10. Implementing regulations for Proposition 65 define expose as "to cause to ingest, inhale, contact via body surfaces or otherwise come into contact with a listed chemical." An individual may come into contact with a listed chemical through water, air, food, consumer products and any other environmental exposure as well as occupational exposures." (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 25102, subd. (i).)
- 11. In this case, the exposures at issue are caused by consumer products. Implementing regulations for Proposition 65 define a consumer product exposure as "an exposure which results from a person's acquisition, purchase, storage, consumption, or other reasonably foreseeable use of a consumer good, or any exposure that results from receiving a consumer service." (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 25602, subd. (b).)
 - 12. Whenever a clear and reasonable warning is required under Health & Safety Code

section 25249.6, the "method employed to transmit the warning must be reasonably calculated considering the alternative methods available under the circumstances, to make the warning message available prior to exposure." (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 25601.) The warning requirement may be satisfied by a warning that appears on a product's label or other labeling, shelf labeling, signs, a system of signs, public advertising identifying the system and toll-free information services, or any other, system, that provides clear and reasonable warnings. (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 25603.1, subd. (a)-(d).)

- 13. Proposition 65 establishes a procedure by which the State is to develop a list of chemicals "known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity." (Health & Safety Code, § 25249.8.) There is no duty to provide a clear and reasonable warning until 12-months after the chemical was published on the State list. (Health & Safety Code, § 25249.10, subd. (b).) Lead was listed as a chemical known to the State of California to cause developmental toxicity in the fetus and male and female reproductive toxicity on February 27, 1987. Lead was listed as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer on October 1, 1992. (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 27001.)
- 14. The Maximum Allowable Dose Level for lead as a chemical known to cause reproductive toxicity is 0.5 micrograms per day. (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 25805.) The No Significant Risk Level for lead as a carcinogen is 15 micrograms per day. (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 25705.)
- 15. Proposition 65 may be enforced by any person in the public interest who provides notice sixty days before filing suit to both the violator and designated law enforcement officials. The failure of law enforcement officials to file a timely complaint enables a citizen suit to be filed pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 25249.7, subdivisions (c) and (d).
- 16. Proposition 65 provides that any person "violating or threatening to violate" Proposition 65 may be enjoined in any court of competent jurisdiction. (Health & Safety Code, § 25249.7, subd. (a).) To "threaten to violate" means "to create a condition in which there is a substantial probability that a violation will occur." (Health & Safety Code, § 25249.11, subd. (e).)

 Furthermore, violators are subject to a civil penalty of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. (Health & Safety Code, § 25249.7, subd. (b)(1).

v

STATEMENT OF FACTS

- 17. Ideal Shape has distributed and/or sold the Covered Products containing lead into the State of California. Consumers have been ingesting these products for many years, without any knowledge of their exposure to lead, a very dangerous chemical.
- 18. For many years, Ideal Shape has knowingly and intentionally exposed numerous persons to lead. Ideal Shape has at all times relevant hereto been aware that the Covered Products contained lead and that persons using these products have been exposed to the chemical.
- 19. Ideal Shape has been aware of the lead in the Covered Products and has failed to disclose the presence of this chemical to the public, who undoubtedly believed they have been ingesting totally healthy and pure products. Both prior and subsequent to ERC's Notice of Violation, Ideal Shape failed to provide consumers of the Covered Products with a warning that they have been exposed to a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION

(Violation of Section 25249.6 of the Health and Safety Code, Failure to Provide Clear and Reasonable Warning under Proposition 65)

- 20. ERC refers to paragraphs 1-19, inclusive, and incorporates them herein by this reference.
- 21. By committing the acts alleged above, Ideal Shape has, in the course of doing business, knowingly and intentionally exposed users of the Covered Products to lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individuals, within the meaning of Health & Safety Code section 25249.6.
- 22. Said violations render Ideal Shape liable for civil penalties up to \$2,500 per day, for each violation.

5

6

7

9

10

11

12 13

14

15 16

17

18 19

20

21 22

2324

25

26

27

28

SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION

(Declaratory Relief)

- 23. ERC refers to paragraphs 1-22, inclusive, and incorporates them herein by this reference.
- 24. There exists an actual controversy relating to the legal rights and duties of the parties, within the meaning of Code of Civil Procedure section 1060, between ERC and Ideal Shape concerning whether Ideal Shape has exposed individuals to a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm without providing clear and reasonable warning.

VI

PRAYER

WHEREFORE ERC prays for relief as follows:

- On the First Cause of Action, for civil penalties for each and every violation according to proof;
- 2. On the First Cause of Action, and pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 25249.7, subdivision (a), for such temporary restraining orders, preliminary and permanent injunctive orders, or other orders, prohibiting Ideal Shape from exposing persons to lead without providing clear and reasonable warning;
- 3. On the Second Cause of Action, for a declaratory judgment pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1060 declaring that Ideal Shape has exposed individuals to a chemical known to the State of California to cause, birth defects and other reproductive harm without providing clear and reasonable warning; and
- On all Causes of Action, for reasonable attorneys' fees pursuant to section 1021.5 of the Code of Civil Procedure or the substantial benefit theory;
 - 5. For costs of suit herein; and
 - 6. For such other relief as the Court may deem just and proper.

Dated: November 14, 2013

б

By

MILL

Michael Freund Ryan Hoffman

Attorneys for Environmental Research Center

Page 7 of 7

LAW OFFICE OF MICHAEL FREUND

RYAN HOFFMAN ATTORNEY AT LAW 1919 ADDISON STREET, SUITE 105 BERKELEY, CALIFORNIA 94704-1101

TEL (510) \$40-1992 FAX (510) \$40-5543 EMAIL RRHOFFMA@GMAIL.COM

May 17, 2013

NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violator and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Environmental Research Center ("ERC"), 3111 Camino Del Rio North. Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. (619) 500-3090. ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall. ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

ERC has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq., with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violator identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violator and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), ERC intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

General Information about Proposition 65. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with this letter served to the alleged Violator identified below.

Alleged Violator. The name of the company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violator") is:

Ideal Shape, LLC

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemicals</u>. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

IdealShape LLC Ideal Shape Ideal Shake Meal Replacement Shake Chocolate – Lead IdealShape LLC Ideal Shape Meal Replacement Shake Vanilla – Lead IdealShape LLC Ideal Bar Enhanced Hunger Blocker Double Chocolate – Lead

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

Exhibit A

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of these products. Consequently, the primary route of exposure to these chemicals has been and continues to be through ingestion, but may have also occurred and may continue to occur through inhalation and/or dermal contact.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least May 17, 2010, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violator violated Proposition 65 because it failed to provide persons handling and/or using these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to these chemicals.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violator to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, as well as an expensive and time consuming litigation.

ERC has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violations to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead.

Sincerely,

Ryan Hoffman

Attachments

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
OEHHA Summary (to Ideal Shape, LLC and its Registered Agent for Service of Process only)
Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Re: Environmental Research Center's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Ideal Shape, LLC

I, Ryan Hoffman, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
 - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: May 17, 2013

Ryan Hoffman

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On May 17, 2013, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO Ideal Shape, LLC 921 West 500 North Lindon, UT 84042

David A. Meine (Ideal Shape, LLC's Registered Agent for Service of Process) 176 Dry Canyon Lindon, UT 84042

On May 17, 2013, I electronically served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1) on the following party by uploading a true and correct copy thereof on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On May 17, 2013, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed on May 17, 2013, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

Rebesca Turner-Smith
Rebesca Turner-Smith

Service List

District Attorney, Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900 Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo County 230 W. Line Street Bishop, CA 93514

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130 District Attorney, Los Angeles County 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Monterey County Post Office Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney, Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney, Nevada County 110 Union Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, Riverside County 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Atterney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004 District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney, San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Suite 322 San Francsico, CA 94103

District Attorney, San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Ave. Rm. 202 Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1035 Palm St, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Atterney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Atterney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Blvd., Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291 District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Ave, Suite 314 Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney, Yolo County 301 2nd Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 I Dr Carlton B Goodlett PL San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113