

1 Reuben Yeroushalmi (SBN 193981)
reuben@yeroushalmi.com
2 **YEROUSHALMI & YEROUSHALMI***
9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 240W
3 Beverly Hills, California 90212
4 Telephone: (310) 623-1926
Facsimile: (310) 623-1930

5 Attorneys for Plaintiff,
6 CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC.

ELECTRONICALLY FILED
Superior Court of California,
County of Alameda
12/22/2022 at 03:44:08 PM
By: Angela Linhares,
Deputy Clerk

7 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**
8 **COUNTY OF ALAMEDA**

9
10
11 CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC.,
in the public interest,

12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14
15 FOOD FOR ALL, INC., a Delaware
Corporation;
16 and DOES 1-10,

17 Defendants.

CASE NO. **22CV024428**

COMPLAINT FOR PENALTY AND
INJUNCTION

Violation of Proposition 65, the Safe
Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement
Act of 1986 (*Health & Safety Code*, §
25249.5, *et seq.*)

ACTION IS AN UNLIMITED CIVIL
CASE (exceeds \$25,000)

18
19
20
21
22 Plaintiff CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC. alleges one cause of action against
23 defendants FOOD FOR ALL, INC. and DOES 1-10 as follows:

24 **THE PARTIES**

- 25 1. Plaintiff CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC. (“Plaintiff” or “CAG”) is an
26 organization qualified to do business in the State of California. CAG is a person within
27 the meaning of Health and Safety Code Section 25249.11, subdivision (a). CAG, acting
28

1 as a private attorney general, brings this action in the public interest as defined under
2 Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7, subdivision (d).

3 2. Defendant FOOD FOR ALL, INC. (“FOOD FOR ALL”) is a California Corporation
4 qualified to do business in California and doing business in the State of California at all
5 relevant times herein.

6 3. Plaintiff is presently unaware of the true names and capacities of defendants DOES 1-10,
7 and therefore sues these defendants by such fictitious names. Plaintiff will amend this
8 Complaint to allege their true names and capacities when ascertained. Plaintiff is
9 informed, believes, and thereon alleges that each fictitiously named defendant is
10 responsible in some manner for the occurrences herein alleged and the damages caused
11 thereby.

12 4. At all times mentioned herein, the term “Defendants” includes FOOD FOR ALL and
13 DOES 1-10.

14 5. Plaintiff is informed and believes, and thereon alleges that each of the Defendants at all
15 times mentioned herein have conducted business within the State of California.

16 6. Upon information and belief, at all times relevant to this action, each of the Defendants,
17 including DOES 1-10, was an agent, servant, or employee of each of the other
18 Defendants. In conducting the activities alleged in this Complaint, each of the
19 Defendants was acting within the course and scope of this agency, service, or
20 employment, and was acting with the consent, permission, and authorization of each of
21 the other Defendants. All actions of each of the Defendants alleged in this Complaint
22 were ratified and approved by every other Defendant or their officers or managing
23 agents. Alternatively, each of the Defendants aided, conspired with and/or facilitated the
24 alleged wrongful conduct of each of the other Defendants.

25 7. Plaintiff is informed, believes, and thereon alleges that at all relevant times, each of the
26 Defendants was a person doing business within the meaning of Health and Safety Code
27

28

1 Section 25249.11, subdivision (b), and that each of the Defendants had ten (10) or more
2 employees at all relevant times.

3 **JURISDICTION**

- 4 8. The Court has jurisdiction over this lawsuit pursuant to California Constitution Article
5 VI, Section 10, which grants the Superior Court original jurisdiction in all causes except
6 those given by statute to other trial courts. This Court has jurisdiction over this action
7 pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7, which allows enforcement of
8 violations of Proposition 65 in any Court of competent jurisdiction.
- 9 9. This Court has jurisdiction over Defendants named herein because Defendants either
10 reside or are located in this State or are foreign corporations authorized to do business in
11 California, are registered with the California Secretary of State, or who do sufficient
12 business in California, have sufficient minimum contacts with California, or otherwise
13 intentionally avail themselves of the markets within California through their
14 manufacture, distribution, promotion, marketing, or sale of their products within
15 California to render the exercise of jurisdiction by the California courts permissible
16 under traditional notions of fair play and substantial justice.
- 17 10. Venue is proper in the County of Alameda because one or more of the instances of
18 wrongful conduct occurred, and continues to occur, in the County of Alameda and/or
19 because Defendants conducted, and continue to conduct, business in the County of
20 Alameda with respect to the consumer product that is the subject of this action.

21 **BACKGROUND AND PRELIMINARY FACTS**

- 22 11. In 1986, California voters approved an initiative to address growing concerns about
23 exposure to toxic chemicals and declared their right “[t]o be informed about exposures to
24 chemicals that cause cancer, birth defects, or other reproductive harm.” Ballot Pamp.,
25 Proposed Law, Gen. Elec. (Nov. 4, 1986) at p. 3. The initiative, The Safe Drinking
26 Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at Health and Safety Code Sections
27 25249.5, *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”), helps to protect California’s drinking water sources
28

1 from contamination, to allow consumers to make informed choices about the products
2 they buy, and to enable persons to protect themselves from toxic chemicals as they see
3 fit.

4 12. Proposition 65 requires the Governor of California to publish a list of chemicals known
5 to the state to cause cancer, birth defects, or other reproductive harm. *Health & Safety*
6 *Code* § 25249.8. The list, which the Governor updates at least once a year, contains over
7 700 chemicals and chemical families. Proposition 65 imposes warning requirements and
8 other controls that apply to Proposition 65-listed chemicals.

9 13. All businesses with ten (10) or more employees that operate or sell products in California
10 must comply with Proposition 65. Under Proposition 65, businesses are: (1) prohibited
11 from knowingly discharging Proposition 65-listed chemicals into sources of drinking
12 water (*Health & Safety Code* § 25249.5), and (2) required to provide “clear and
13 reasonable” warnings before exposing a person, knowingly and intentionally, to a
14 Proposition 65-listed chemical (*Health & Safety Code* § 25249.6).

15 14. Proposition 65 provides that any person "violating or threatening to violate" the statute
16 may be enjoined in any court of competent jurisdiction. *Health & Safety Code* §
17 25249.7. "Threaten to violate" means "to create a condition in which there is a
18 substantial probability that a violation will occur." *Health & Safety Code* § 25249.11(e).
19 Defendants are also liable for civil penalties of up to \$2,500.00 per day per violation,
20 recoverable in a civil action. *Health & Safety Code* § 25249.7(b).

21 15. Plaintiff identified certain practices of manufacturers and distributors of Dried Salted
22 Mullet Fish of exposing, knowingly and intentionally, persons in California to Lead and
23 Lead Compounds of such products without first providing clear and reasonable warnings
24 of such to the exposed persons prior to the time of exposure. Plaintiff later discerned
25 that Defendants engaged in such practice.

26 16. On October 1, 1992 the Governor of California added Lead and Lead Compounds
27 (“Lead”) to the list of chemicals known to the State to cause cancer (*Cal. Code Regs.* tit.

28

1 27, § 27001(b)). Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.9 and 25249.10,
2 twenty (20) months after addition of Lead to the list of chemicals known to the State to
3 cause cancer, Lead became fully subject to Proposition 65 warning requirements and
4 discharge prohibitions.

5 17. On February 27, 1987, the Governor of California added Lead to the list of chemicals
6 known to the State to cause developmental and reproductive toxicity (*Cal. Code Regs.*
7 tit. 27, § 27001(c)). Lead is known to the State to cause developmental, female, and
8 male reproductive toxicity. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.9 and
9 25249.10, twenty (20) months after addition of Lead to the list of chemicals known to
10 the State to cause developmental and reproductive toxicity, Lead became fully subject to
11 Proposition 65 warning requirements and discharge prohibitions.

12 **SATISFACTION OF PRIOR NOTICE**

13 18. Plaintiff served the following notices for alleged violations of Health and Safety Code
14 Section 25249.6, concerning consumer products exposures:

15 a. On or about May 26, 2022, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violations of Health
16 and Safety Code Section 25249.6, concerning consumer products exposures
17 subject to a private action to FOOD FOR ALL, and to the California Attorney
18 General, County District Attorneys, and City Attorneys for each city containing
19 a population of at least 750,000 people in whose jurisdictions the violations
20 allegedly occurred, concerning the Dried Salted Mullet Fish.

21 19. Before sending the notice of alleged violations, Plaintiff investigated the consumer
22 products involved, the likelihood that such products would cause users to suffer
23 significant exposures to Lead, and the corporate structure of each of the Defendants.

24 20. Plaintiff's notice of alleged violation included a Certificate of Merit executed by the
25 attorney for the noticing party, CAG. The Certificate of Merit stated that the attorney for
26 Plaintiff who executed the certificate had consulted with at least one person with relevant
27 and appropriate expertise who reviewed data regarding the exposures to Lead, the

28

1 subject Proposition 65-listed chemical of this action. Based on that information, the
2 attorney for Plaintiff who executed the Certificate of Merit believed there was a
3 reasonable and meritorious case for this private action. The attorney for Plaintiff
4 attached to the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General the confidential
5 factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the Certificate of Merit.

6 21. Plaintiff's notice of alleged violations also included a Certificate of Service and a
7 document entitled "The Safe Drinking Water & Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986
8 (Proposition 65) A Summary." *Health & Safety Code* § 25249.7(d).

9 22. Plaintiff is commencing this action more than sixty (60) days from the dates that Plaintiff
10 gave notice of the alleged violations to FOOD FOR ALL, and the public prosecutors
11 referenced in Paragraph 18.

12 23. Plaintiff is informed, believes, and thereon alleges that neither the Attorney General, nor
13 any applicable district attorney or city attorney has commenced and is diligently
14 prosecuting an action against the Defendants.

15 **FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION**

16 **(By CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC. and against FOOD FOR ALL, and**
17 **DOES 1-10 for Violations of Proposition 65, The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic**
18 **Enforcement Act of 1986 (*Health & Safety Code*, §§ 25249.5, *et seq.*))**

19 **Seafood Product**

20 24. Plaintiff repeats and incorporates by reference paragraphs 1 through 23 of this complaint
21 as though fully set forth herein.

22 25. Each of the Defendants is, and at all times mentioned herein was, a manufacturer,
23 distributor, promoter, or retailer of Dried Salted Mullet Fish (Dried Fish), including but
24 not limited to "Dried Salted Mullet (Banak) Butterfly-Cut"; "Pangasinan Brand"; "Net
25 Weight: 227g (8 oz)"; "UPC 022392876506"; "Product of the Philippines".

26 26. Dried Fish contains Lead.

27 27. Defendants knew or should have known that Lead has been identified by the State of
28 California as a chemical known to cause cancer, and reproductive toxicity and therefore

1 was subject to Proposition 65 warning requirements. Defendants were also informed of
2 the presence of Lead in Dried Fish within Plaintiff's notice of alleged violations further
3 discussed above at Paragraph 18a.

4 28. Plaintiff's allegations regarding Dried Fish concerns "[c]onsumer products exposure[s],"
5 which "is an exposure that results from a person's acquisition, purchase, storage,
6 consumption, or other reasonably foreseeable use of a consumer good, or any exposure
7 that results from receiving a consumer service." *Cal. Code Regs.* tit. 27, § 25602(b).
8 Dried Fish is consumer products, and, as mentioned herein, exposures to Lead took place
9 as a result of such normal and foreseeable consumption and use.

10 29. Plaintiff is informed, believes, and thereon alleges that between May 26, 2019 and the
11 present, each of the Defendants knowingly and intentionally exposed California
12 consumers and users of Dried Fish, which Defendants manufactured, distributed, or sold
13 as mentioned above, to Lead, without first providing any type of clear and reasonable
14 warning of such to the exposed persons before the time of exposure. Defendants have
15 distributed and sold Dried Fish in California. Defendants know and intend that
16 California consumers will use and consume Dried Fish, thereby exposing them to Lead.
17 Further, Plaintiff is informed, believes, and thereon alleges that Defendants are selling
18 Dried Fish under a brand or trademark that is owned or licensed by the Defendants or an
19 entity affiliated thereto; have knowingly introduced Lead into product or knowingly
20 caused Lead to be created in Dried Fish; have covered, obscured or altered a warning
21 label that has been affixed to Dried Fish by the manufacturer, producer, packager,
22 importer, supplier or distributor of Dried Fish; have received a notice and warning
23 materials for exposure from Dried Fish without conspicuously posting or displaying the
24 warning materials; and/or have actual knowledge of potential exposure to Lead from
25 Dried Fish. Defendants thereby violated Proposition 65.

26 30. The principal routes of exposure are through dermal contact, ingestion and inhalation.
27 Persons sustain exposures by handling Dried Fish without wearing gloves or any other
28

1 personal protective equipment, or by touching bare skin or mucous membranes with
2 gloves after handling Dried Fish, as well as through direct and indirect hand to mouth
3 contact, hand to mucous membrane, or breathing in particulate matter dispersed from
4 Dried Fish.

5 31. Plaintiff is informed, believes, and thereon alleges that each of Defendants' violations of
6 Proposition 65 as to Dried Fish have been ongoing and continuous, as Defendants
7 engaged and continue to engage in conduct which violates Health and Safety Code
8 Section 25249.6, including the manufacture, distribution, promotion, and sale of Dried
9 Fish, so that a separate and distinct violation of Proposition 65 occurred each and every
10 time a person was exposed to Lead by Dried Fish as mentioned herein.

11 32. Plaintiff is informed, believes, and thereon alleges that each violation of Proposition 65
12 mentioned herein is ever continuing. Plaintiff further alleges and believes that the
13 violations alleged herein will continue to occur into the future.

14 33. Based on the allegations herein, Defendants are liable for civil penalties of up to
15 \$2,500.00 per day per individual exposure to Lead from Dried Fish, pursuant to Health
16 and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b).

17 34. Plaintiff has engaged in good faith efforts to resolve the claims alleged herein prior to
18 filing this Complaint.

19
20 **PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

21 Plaintiff demands against each of the Defendants as follows:

22 35. A permanent injunction mandating Proposition 65-compliant warnings;

23 36. Penalties pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7, subdivision (b);

24 37. Costs of suit;

25 38. Reasonable attorney fees and costs; and

26 39. Any further relief that the court may deem just and equitable.
27
28

1 Dated: December 22, 2022

YEROUSHALMI & YEROUSHALMI*

2
3
4 /s/ Reuben Yeroushalmi

Reuben Yeroushalmi

Attorneys for Plaintiff,

CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC.

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28