

1 Evan J. Smith, Esquire (SBN 242352)
2 Ryan P. Cardona, Esquire (SBN 302113)
3 BRODSKY SMITH
4 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900
5 Beverly Hills, CA 90212
6 Telephone: (877) 534-2590
7 Facsimile: (310) 247-0160

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

ELECTRONICALLY
FILED
Superior Court of California,
County of San Francisco

08/15/2023
Clerk of the Court
BY: BOWMAN LIU
Deputy Clerk

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

9 EMA BELL,

10 Plaintiff,

11 vs.

12 THE TJX COMPANIES, INC.,

13 Defendant.

Case No.: CGC-23-608056

**FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT FOR CIVIL
PENALTIES AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

**(Violation of Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et
seq.)**

14 Plaintiff Ema Bell (“Plaintiff”), by and through her attorneys, alleges the following cause
15 of action in the public interest of the citizens of the State of California.

16 **BACKGROUND OF THE CASE**

17 1. Plaintiff brings this representative action on behalf of all California citizens to
18 enforce relevant portions of Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at
19 the Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq (“Proposition 65”), which reads, in relevant part,
20 “[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any
21 individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first
22 giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual ...”. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6.

23 2. This first amended complaint is a representative action brought by Plaintiff in the
24 public interest of the citizens of the State of California to enforce the People’s right to be informed
25 of the health hazards caused by exposure to lead, diethanolamine (DEA), and/or diisononyl
26 phthalate (DINP), toxic chemicals found in products sold and/or distributed by defendant The TJX
27 Companies, Inc. (“TJX” or “Defendant”) in California.

1 3. Lead¹ is a harmful chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and
2 birth defects or other reproductive harm. DEA² and DINP³ are harmful chemicals known to the
3 State of California to cause cancer.

4 4. Proposition 65 requires all businesses with ten (10) or more employees that operate
5 within California or sell products therein to comply with Proposition 65 regulations. Included in
6 such regulations is the requirement that businesses must label any product containing a Proposition
7 65-listed chemical that will create an exposure above safe harbor levels with a “clear and
8 reasonable” warning before “knowingly and intentionally” exposing any person to any such listed
9 chemical.

10 5. Proposition 65 allows for civil penalties of up to \$2,500.00 per day per violation
11 for up to 365 days (up to a maximum civil penalty amount per violation of \$912,000.00) to be
12 imposed upon defendants in a civil action for violations of Proposition 65. Health & Safety Code
13 § 25249.7(b). Proposition 65 also allows for any court of competent jurisdiction to enjoin the
14 actions of a defendant which “violate or threaten to violate” the statute. Health & Safety Code §
15 25249.7.

16 6. Plaintiff alleges that Defendant distributes and/or offers for sale in California,
17 without a requisite exposure warning, (a) *Nicole Miller*® heels, # 2518-1850-374452-01 (DINP),
18 (b) Retinol facial essence masks, UPC # 4582419536982 (DEA), (c) *Cooksmart*® fine china mugs,
19 # 2865-708246 (lead), (d) *Heathcote & Ivory*® magical myth marvel mugs, # 9418-639010 (lead),
20 and (e) *Botanical Collection by CornerRuby*® spoons, # 1280 108702297 01499 14-1 (lead)

21 _____
22 ¹ On October 1, 1992, the state of California listed lead as a chemical known to cause cancer and
23 it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit.
24 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b). On February 27, 1987, the State
of California listed lead as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.

25 ² On June 22, 2012, the State of California listed DEA as a chemical known to the State to cause
26 cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal. Code
Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b).

27 ³ On December 20, 2013, the State of California listed DINP as a chemical known to the State to
28 cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal.
Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b).

1 (collectively, the “Products”) that expose persons to lead, DEA, and/or DINP when used for their
2 intended purpose.

3 7. Defendant’s failure to warn consumers and other individuals in California of the
4 health hazards associated with exposure to lead, DEA, and/or DINP in conjunction with the sale
5 and/or distribution of the Products is a violation of Proposition 65 and subjects Defendant to the
6 enjoinder and civil penalties described herein.

7 8. Plaintiff seeks civil penalties against Defendant for its violations of Proposition 65
8 in accordance with Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b).

9 9. Plaintiff also seeks injunctive relief, preliminarily and permanently, requiring
10 Defendant to provide purchasers or users of the Products with required warnings related to the
11 dangers and health hazards associated with exposure to lead, DEA, and/or DINP pursuant to Health
12 and Safety Code § 25249.7(a).

13 10. Plaintiff further seeks a reasonable award of attorney’s fees and costs.

14 **PARTIES**

15 11. Plaintiff is a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general
16 public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and to
17 improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. She brings this
18 action in the public interest pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

19 12. Defendant TJX, through its business, effectively imports, distributes, sells, and/or
20 offers the Products for sale or use in the State of California, or it implies by its conduct that it
21 imports, distributes, sells, and/or offers the Products for sale or use in the State of California.

22 13. Plaintiff alleges that defendant TJX is a “person” in the course of doing business
23 within the meaning of Health & Safety Code sections 25249.6 and 25249.11.

24 **VENUE AND JURISDICTION**

25 14. Venue is proper in the County of San Francisco because one or more of the
26 instances of wrongful conduct occurred, and continue to occur in this county and/or because
27 Defendant conducted, and continues to conduct, business in the County of San Francisco with
28 respect to the Products.

1 reproductive harm. In summary, lead was listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the
2 State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

3 23. On December 20, 2013, the State of California listed DINP as a chemical known to
4 the State to cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since
5 that time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b).

6 24. On June 22, 2012, the State of California listed DEA as a chemical known to the
7 State to cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that
8 time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b).

9 25. The exposures that are the subject of the Notices result from the purchase,
10 acquisition, handling, and recommended use of the Products. The primary route of exposure to
11 lead, DEA, and/or DINP is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers
12 use, touch, or handle the Products. Exposure through ingestion will occur by touching the Product
13 with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided
14 with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure.

15 26. Defendant has processed, marketed, distributed, offered to sell and/or sold the
16 Products in California since at least August 3, 2022 with respect to the *Nicole Miller*® Product;
17 since at least August 4, 2022 with respect to the Retinol facial essence masks; since at least August
18 18, 2022 with respect to the *Cooksmart*® Product; since at least February 3, 2023 with respect to
19 the *Heathcote & Ivory*® Product; and since at least April, 18, 2023 with respect to the *Botanical*
20 *Collection by CornerRuby*® Product. The Products continue to be distributed and sold in
21 California without the requisite warning information.

22 27. At all times relevant to this action, Defendant has knowingly and intentionally
23 exposed users and/or consumers of the Products to lead, DEA, and/or DINP without first giving a
24 clear and reasonable exposure warning to such individuals.

25 28. As a proximate result of acts by Defendant, as a person in the course of doing
26 business within the meaning of H&S Code § 25249.11, individuals throughout the State of
27 California, including in San Francisco County, have been exposed to lead, DEA, and/or DINP
28 without a clear and reasonable warning on the Products. The individuals subject to the violative

1 exposures include normal and foreseeable users and consumers that use the Products, as well as
2 all others exposed to the Products.

3 **SATISFACTION OF NOTICE REQUIREMENTS**

4 29. Plaintiff purchased the Products from TJX. At the time of purchase, TJX did not
5 provide a Proposition 65 exposure warning for lead, DEA, DINP, or any other Proposition 65 listed
6 chemical in a manner consistent with H&S Code § 25603.1 as described *supra*.

7 30. The *Cooksmart*® product, *Heathcote & Ivory*® product, and *Botanical Collection*
8 *by CornerRuby*® product were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount of
9 lead would migrate and/or leach from the products; the *Nicole Miller*® product was sent to a testing
10 laboratory for phthalate testing to determine the phthalate content of the product; and the Retinol
11 facial essence masks were sent to a testing laboratory for diethanolamine testing to determine the
12 diethanolamine content of the product.

13 31. For each Product that was sent to the laboratory, Plaintiff received a chemical test
14 report (collectively, the “Chemical Test Reports”). The Chemical Test Report findings determined
15 the *Cooksmart*® product, *Heathcote & Ivory*® product, and *Botanical Collection by CornerRuby*®
16 product exposes users to lead; the *Nicole Miller*® product exposes users to DINP; and the Retinol
17 facial essence masks exposes users to DEA.

18 32. Plaintiff provided each Chemical Test Report and each Product to an analytical
19 chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Reports and the reasonable
20 and foreseeable use of the Products, exposure to lead, DEA, and/or DINP will occur at levels that
21 require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title
22 27 of the California Code of Regulations.

23 33. On August 3, 2022, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure
24 assessment report for the *Nicole Miller*® product that concluded that persons in California who
25 use the *Nicole Miller*® product will be exposed to levels of DINP that require a Proposition 65
26 exposure warning. On August 4, 2022, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure
27 assessment report for the Retinol facial essence masks that concluded that persons in California
28 who use the Retinol facial essence masks will be exposed to levels of DEA that require a

1 Proposition 65 exposure warning. On August 18, 2022, Plaintiff received from the analytical
2 chemist an exposure assessment report for the *Cooksmart*® product that concluded that persons in
3 California who use the *Cooksmart*® product will be exposed to levels of lead that require a
4 Proposition 65 exposure warning. On February 3, 2023, Plaintiff received from the analytical
5 chemist an exposure assessment report for the *Heathcote & Ivory*® product that concluded that
6 persons in California who use the *Heathcote & Ivory*® product will be exposed to levels of lead
7 that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning. On April 18, 2023, Plaintiff received from the
8 analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the *Botanical Collection by CornerRuby*®
9 product that concluded that persons in California who use the *Botanical Collection by*
10 *CornerRuby*® product will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure
11 warning.

12 34. On August 3, 2022 (*Nicole Miller*® heels), August 4, 2022 (Retinol facial essence
13 masks), August 18, 2022 (*Cooksmart*® fine china mugs), February 3, 2023 (*Heathcote & Ivory*®
14 magical myth marvel mugs), and April 18, 2023 (*Botanical Collection by CornerRuby*® spoons),
15 Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 (collectively, the
16 “Notices”) to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead, DEA and/or DINP
17 contained in the Products without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to
18 the California Attorney General’s office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City
19 Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein
20 violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibits “A” – “E” a true and correct copy of the
21 Notices.

22 35. The Notices complied with all procedural requirements of Proposition 65 including
23 the attachment of a Certificate of Merit affirming that Plaintiff’s counsel had consulted with at
24 least one person with relevant and appropriate expertise who reviewed relevant data regarding
25 lead, DEA, and/or DINP exposure, and that counsel believed there was meritorious and reasonable
26 cause for a private action.

27 36. After receiving the Notices, and to Plaintiff’s best information and belief, none of
28 the noticed appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and diligently prosecuted a

1 cause of action against Defendant under Proposition 65 to enforce the alleged violations which are
2 the subject of the Notices.

3 37. Plaintiff is commencing this action more than sixty (60) days from the date of each
4 Notice to Defendant, as required by law.

5 **FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION**

6 **(By Plaintiff against Defendant for the Violation of Proposition 65)**

7 38. Plaintiff hereby repeats and incorporates by reference paragraphs 1 through 37 of
8 this First Amended Complaint as though fully set forth herein.

9 39. Defendant has, at all times mentioned herein, acted as distributor, and/or retailer of
10 the Products.

11 40. Use of the Products will expose users to lead, DEA, and/or DINP, hazardous
12 chemicals found on the Proposition 65 list of chemicals known to be hazardous to human health.

13 41. The Products do not comply with the Proposition 65 warning requirements.

14 42. Plaintiff, based on her best information and belief, avers that at all relevant times
15 herein, and at least since at least August 3, 2022 with respect to the *Nicole Miller*® heels; since at
16 least August 4, 2022 with respect to the Retinol facial essence masks; since at least August 18,
17 2022 with respect to the *Cooksmart*® fine china mugs; since at least February 3, 2023 with respect
18 to the *Heathcote & Ivory*® magical myth marvel mugs; and since at least April 18, 2023 with
19 respect to the *Botanical Collection by CornerRuby*® spoons continuing until the present, that
20 Defendant has continued to knowingly and intentionally expose California users and consumers
21 of the Products to lead, DEA, and/or DINP without providing required warnings under Proposition
22 65.

23 43. The exposures that are the subject of the Notices result from the purchase,
24 acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Products. The primary route of exposure to the
25 is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the
26 Products. Exposure through ingestion will occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching
27 of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products
28 regarding the health hazards of exposure.

1 44. Plaintiff, based on her best information and belief, avers that such exposures will
2 continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to purchasers and users or
3 until these known toxic chemicals are removed from the Products.

4 45. Defendant has knowledge that the normal and reasonably foreseeable use of the
5 Products expose individuals to lead, DEA, and/or DINP, and Defendant intends that exposures to
6 lead, DEA, and/or DINP will occur by its deliberate, non-accidental participation in the
7 importation, distribution, sale and offering of the Products to consumers in California

8 46. Plaintiff has engaged in good faith efforts to resolve the herein claims prior to this
9 First Amended Complaint.

10 47. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b), as a consequence of the above
11 described acts, Defendant is liable for a maximum civil penalty of \$2,500 per day per violation.

12 48. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(a), this Court is specifically
13 authorized to grant injunctive relief in favor of Plaintiff and against Defendant.

1 **PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

2 WHEREFORE, Plaintiff demands judgment against Defendant and requests the following
3 relief:

4 A. That the court assess civil penalties against each Defendant in the amount of \$2,500
5 per day for each violation for up to 365 days (up to a maximum civil penalty amount per
6 violation of \$912,000.00) in accordance with Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b);

7 B. That the court preliminarily and permanently enjoin Defendant mandating
8 Proposition 65 compliant warnings on the Products;

9 C. That the court grant Plaintiff reasonable attorney's fees and costs of suit, in the
10 amount of \$50,000.00.

11 D. That the court grant any further relief as may be just and proper.

12 Dated: August 15, 2023

BRODSKY SMITH

13 By: 
14 Evan J. Smith (SBN242352)
15 Ryan P. Cardona (SBN302113)
16 9595 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 900
17 Beverly Hills, CA 90212
18 Telephone: (877) 534-2590
19 Facsimile: (310) 247-0160

Attorneys for Plaintiff

EXHIBIT "A"

LAW OFFICES
BRODSKY & SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900
BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212
877.534.2590
www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE
1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY
CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934
856.795.7250

NEW YORK OFFICE
240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD
MINEOLA, NY 11501
516.741.4977

PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE
TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805
BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004
610.667.6200

August 3, 2022

President/CEO Kobra International, Ltd. c/o CT Corporation System 28 Liberty Street New York, NY 10005	Kenneth S. Frieze, CEO Kobra International, Ltd. dba Nicole Miller 800 Boylston Street, 27 th Floor Boston, MA 02199
President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801	President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801

60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act¹

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky & Smith ("Brodsky Smith") represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

¹ The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

1. **Enforcer:** Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
2. **Alleged Violator(s):** Kobra International, Ltd.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls
3. **Time Period of Exposure:** Violations have been occurring since at least August 3, 2022 and are continuing to this day.
4. **Listed Chemical:** Diisononyl phthalate (DINP). DINP is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer.
5. **Product:**

Product ²	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
heels	Nicole Miller Heels 2518-1850-374452-01

6. **Description of Exposure:** The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

² The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky & Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,


Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

EXHIBIT “B”

LAW OFFICES
BRODSKY & SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900
BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212
877.534.2590
www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE
1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY
CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934
856.795.7250

NEW YORK OFFICE
240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD
MINEOLA, NY 11501
516.741.4977

PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE
TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805
BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004
610.667.6200

August 4, 2022

President/CEO Mitomo Co., Ltd. 3-3-9 Rinkaicho Edogawa-Ku Tokyo, JAPAN	President/CEO Mitomo Cosmetic Co., Ltd. Kitahinata Chosei Gun Shirako Machi Chiba JAPAN 2994206
President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801	President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801

60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act¹

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky & Smith ("Brodsky Smith") represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

¹ The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

1. **Enforcer:** Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
2. **Alleged Violator(s):** Mitomo Co., Ltd.; Mitomo Cosmetic Co., Ltd.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies dba TJ Maxx
3. **Time Period of Exposure:** Violations have been occurring since at least August 4, 2022 and are continuing to this day.
4. **Listed Chemical:** Diethanolamine (DEA) is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer.
5. **Product:**

Product ²	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Facial Mask	Retinol Facial Essence Mask UPC# 4582419536982

6. **Description of Exposure:** The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal exposure. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

² The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky & Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,


Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

EXHIBIT “C”

LAW OFFICES
BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900
BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212
877.534.2590
www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE
1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY
CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934
856.795.7250

NEW YORK OFFICE
240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD
MINEOLA, NY 11501
516.741.4977

PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE
TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805
BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004
610.667.6200

August 18, 2022

President/CEO Citylook Imports Ltd. Harrison Trading Estate Longworth Street Preston Lancashire UNITED KINGDOM PR 15DL	President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801
President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801	President/CEO The TJX Operating Companies, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801

60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act¹

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky & Smith, LLC ("Brodsky Smith") represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

¹ The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

1. **Enforcer:** Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
2. **Alleged Violator(s):** Citylook Imports Ltd.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx; The TJX Operating Companies, Inc.
3. **Time Period of Exposure:** Violations have been occurring since at least August 18, 2022 and are continuing to this day.
4. **Listed Chemical:** Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity.
5. **Product:**

Product ²	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Mug	Cooksmart Fine China Mug

6. **Description of Exposure:** The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through ingestion and dermal absorption exposure. When used for its intended purpose, the Product will be in contact with foods. The Listed Chemical will leach into the foods it comes into contact with. When foods contaminated with the Listed Chemical are consumed, ingestion of the Listed Chemical will occur which will increase BLLs. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.


III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

² The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky & Smith, LLC, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,



Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

EXHIBIT “D”

LAW OFFICES
BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900
BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212
877.534.2590
www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE
1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY
CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934
856.795.7250

NEW YORK OFFICE
240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD
MINEOLA, NY 11501
516.741.4977

PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE
TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805
BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004
610.667.6200

February 3, 2023

President/CEO Heathcote & Ivory Limited 2 Lonsdale Road London, NW6 6RD GREAT BRITAIN	President/CEO Heathcote & Ivory Limited 7 Chalcot Road London NW6 6RD GREAT BRITAIN
President/CEO Heathcote & Ivory Limited Rm 1701-02A 17/F 625 King's Road, North Point, Hong Kong	President/CEO Heathcote & Ivory (Asia Pacific) PTY LTD 12 Illawara Cres, North Ballajura Western Australia, 6066 Australia
President/CEO Heathcote & Ivory Ireland Limited RBK House, Irishtown, Athlone Co. Westmeath, Athlone, Westmeath N37 XP52	President/CEO H & I Toiletries Ltd. 25 Oldbury Place, London, W1U 5PN GREAT BRITAIN
The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx c/o CT Corporation System 101 Federal Street Boston, MA 02110	The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801

60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act¹

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky & Smith, LLC ("Brodsky Smith") represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to

¹ The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that “[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ...” Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

1. **Enforcer:** Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
2. **Alleged Violator(s):** Heathcote & Ivory Limited; Heathcote & Ivory (Asia Pacific) PTY LTD; Heathcote & Ivory Ireland Limited; H & I Toiletries Ltd.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx
3. **Time Period of Exposure:** Violations have been occurring since at least February 3, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
4. **Listed Chemical:** Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity.
5. **Product:**

Product ²	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Mug	Heathcote & Ivory Magic Myth Marvel Mug UPC# 5 015632102782

6. **Description of Exposure:** The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through ingestion and dermal absorption exposure. When used for its intended purpose, the Product will be in contact with foods. The Listed Chemical will leach into the foods it comes into contact with. When foods contaminated with the Listed Chemical are consumed, ingestion of the Listed Chemical will occur which will increase BLLs. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators’ reference, enclosed is a copy of “Proposition 65: A Summary” that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.


² The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients’ investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell’s position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators’ custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. **Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky & Smith, LLC, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.**

Sincerely,



Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

EXHIBIT “E”

LAW OFFICES
BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900
BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212
877.534.2590
www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE
1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY
CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934
856.795.7250

NEW YORK OFFICE
240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD
MINEOLA, NY 11501
516.741.4977

PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE
TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805
BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004
610.667.6200

April 18, 2023

Member/Manager CornerRuby International LLC c/o Mei Ha Erica Hui 8603 Augustine Road Irving, TX 75063	Member/Manager China Accent (HK) Limited Rm. 2505 25/F Wing Fung Industrial Bldg, 40-50 Sha Tsui Road Tsuen Wan Hong Kong
President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801	President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o CT Corporation System 101 Federal Street Boston, MA 02110
President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801	

60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act¹

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky & Smith, LLC ("Brodsky Smith") represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or

¹ The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

1. **Enforcer:** Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
2. **Alleged Violator(s):** CornerRuby International LLC; China Accent (HK) Limited; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls
3. **Time Period of Exposure:** Violations have been occurring since at least April 18, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
4. **Listed Chemical:** Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity.
5. **Product:**

Product ²	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Spoon	Botanical Collection by CornerRuby Spoon 1280 108702297 01499 14-1

6. **Description of Exposure:** The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through ingestion and dermal absorption exposure. When used for its intended purpose, the Product will be in contact with foods. The Listed Chemical will leach into the foods it comes into contact with. When foods contaminated with the Listed Chemical are consumed, ingestion of the Listed Chemical will occur which will increase BLLs. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health &

² The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. **Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky & Smith, LLC, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.**

Sincerely,



Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary