Evan J. Smith, Esquire (SBN 242352) 1 Ryan P. Cardona, Esquire (SBN 302113) **ELECTRONICALLY** 2 BRODSKY SMITH FILED 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900 Superior Court of California, 3 Beverly Hills, CA 90212 County of San Francisco Telephone: (877) 534-2590 04/16/2024 Facsimile: (310) 247-0160 4 Clerk of the Court **BY: DAEJA ROGERS Deputy Clerk** 5 Attorneys for Plaintiff 6 7 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA 8 COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO CGC-24-613988 9 Case No.: 10 ANTHONY FERREIRO, COMPLAINT FOR CIVIL PENALTIES AND 11 **INJUNCTIVE RELIEF** Plaintiff, 12 (Violation of Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et VS. seq.) 13 WALMART, INC., 14 Defendant. 15 Plaintiff Anthony Ferreiro ("Plaintiff"), by and through his attorneys, alleges the following 16 cause of action in the public interest of the citizens of the State of California. 17 **BACKGROUND OF THE CASE** 18 1. Plaintiff brings this representative action on behalf of all California citizens to 19 enforce relevant portions of Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at 20 the Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq ("Proposition 65"), which reads, in relevant part, 21 "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any 22 individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first 23 giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual ...". Health & Safety Code § 25249.6. 24 2. This complaint is a representative action brought by Plaintiff in the public interest 25 of the citizens of the State of California to enforce the People's right to be informed of the health 26 hazards caused by exposure to chromium (hexavalent compounds) ("chromium (VI)"), a toxic 27 chemical found in (a) Moosejaw softshell gloves, RN # 118940 and (b) Quietwear leather gloves, 28

COMPLAINT FOR CIVIL PENALTIES AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF – VIOLATION OF HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5

UPC # 033977556027 sold and/or distributed by defendant Walmart, Inc. ("Walmart" or "Defendant") in California.

- 3. Chromium (VI) is a harmful chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. On February 27, 1987, the State of California listed chromium (VI) as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b). On December 19, 2008, the State of California listed chromium (VI) as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.
- 4. Proposition 65 requires all businesses with ten (10) or more employees that operate within California or sell products therein to comply with Proposition 65 regulations. Included in such regulations is the requirement that businesses must label any product containing a Proposition 65-listed chemical that will create an exposure above safe harbor levels with a "clear and reasonable" warning before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing any person to any such listed chemical.
- 5. Proposition 65 allows for civil penalties of up to \$2,500.00 per day per violation for up to 365 days (up to a maximum civil penalty amount per violation of \$912,000.00) to be imposed upon defendants in a civil action for violations of Proposition 65. Health & Safety Code \$ 25249.7(b). Proposition 65 also allows for any court of competent jurisdiction to enjoin the actions of a defendant which "violate or threaten to violate" the statute. Health & Safety Code \$ 25249.7.
- 6. Plaintiff alleges that Defendant distributes and/or offers for sale in California, without a requisite exposure warning, (a) Moosejaw softshell gloves, RN # 118940 and (b) Quietwear leather gloves, UPC # 033977556027 (collectively, the "Products" and each a "Product") that expose persons to chromium (VI) when used for their intended purpose.
- 7. Defendant's failure to warn consumers and other individuals in California of the health hazards associated with exposure to chromium (VI) in conjunction with the sale and/or distribution of the Products is a violation of Proposition 65 and subjects Defendant to the enjoinment and civil penalties described herein.

8. Plaintiff seeks civil penalties against Defendant for its violations of Proposition 65 in accordance with Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b).

- 9. Plaintiff also seeks injunctive relief, preliminarily and permanently, requiring Defendant to provide purchasers or users of the Products with required warnings related to the dangers and health hazards associated with exposure to chromium (VI) pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(a).
  - 10. Plaintiff further seeks a reasonable award of attorney's fees and costs.

# **PARTIES**

- 11. Plaintiff is a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. He brings this action in the public interest pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d).
- 12. Defendant Walmart, Inc., through its business, effectively imports, distributes, sells, and/or offers the Products for sale or use in the State of California, or it implies by its conduct that it imports, distributes, sells, and/or offers the Products for sale or use in the State of California. Plaintiff alleges that defendant Walmart, Inc. is a "person" in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code sections 25249.6 and 25249.11.

#### **VENUE AND JURISDICTION**

- 13. Venue is proper in the County of San Francisco because one or more of the instances of wrongful conduct occurred and continue to occur in this county and/or because Defendant conducted, and continues to conduct, business in the County of San Francisco with respect to the Products.
- 14. This Court has jurisdiction over this action pursuant to California Constitution Article VI, § 10, which grants the Superior Court original jurisdiction in all causes except those given by statute to other trial courts. Health and Safety Code § 25249.7 allows for the enforcement of violations of Proposition 65 in any Court of competent jurisdiction; therefore, this Court has jurisdiction over this lawsuit.

15. This Court has jurisdiction over Defendant because Defendant is either a citizen of the State of California, has sufficient minimum contacts with the State of California, is registered with the California Secretary of State as foreign corporations authorized to do business in the State of California, and/or has otherwise purposefully availed itself of the California market. Such purposeful availment has rendered the exercise of jurisdiction by California courts consistent and permissible with traditional notions of fair play and substantial justice.

# STATUTORY BACKGROUND

- 16. The people of the State of California declared in Proposition 65 their right "[t]o be informed about exposures to chemicals that cause cancer, birth defects, or other reproductive harm." (Section 1(b) of Initiative Measure, Proposition 65.)
- 17. To effect this goal, Proposition 65 requires that individuals be provided with a "clear and reasonable warning" before being exposed to substances listed by the State of California as causing cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm. H&S Code § 25249.6 states, in pertinent part:

No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...

- 18. An exposure to a chemical in a consumer product is one "which results from a person's acquisition, purchase, storage, consumption or other reasonably foreseeable use of a consumer good, or any exposure that results from receiving a consumer service." (27 CCR § 25602, para (b).) H&S Code § 25603(c) states that "a person in the course of doing business ... shall provide a warning to any person to whom the product is sold or transferred unless the product is packaged or labeled with a clear and reasonable warning."
- 19. Pursuant to H&S Code § 25603.1, the warning may be provided by using one or more of the following methods individually or in combination:<sup>1</sup>

Alternatively, a person in the course of doing business may elect to comply with the warning requirements set out in the amended version of 27 CCR 25601, *et.seq.*. as amended on August 30, 2016, and operative on August 30, 2018.

- a. A warning that appears on a product's label or other labeling.
- b. Identification of the product at the retail outlet in a manner which provides a warning. Identification may be through shelf labeling, signs, menus, or a combination thereof.
- c. The warnings provided pursuant to subparagraphs (a) and (b) shall be prominently placed upon a product's labels or other labeling or displayed at the retail outlet with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices in the label, labeling or display as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use.
- d. A system of signs, public advertising identifying the system and toll-free information services, or any other system that provides clear and reasonable warnings.
- 20. Proposition 65 provides that any "person who violates or threatens to violate" the statute may be enjoined in a court of competent jurisdiction. (H&S Code § 25249.7.) The phrase "threaten to violate" is defined to mean creating "a condition in which there is a substantial probability that a violation will occur." (H&S Code § 25249.11(e).) Violators are liable for civil penalties of up to \$2,500.00 per day for each violation of the Act (H&S Code § 25249.7) for up to 365 days (up to a maximum civil penalty amount per violation of \$912,000.00).

# FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 21. On February 27, 1987, the State of California listed chromium (VI) as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b). On December 19, 2008, the State of California listed chromium (VI) as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. In summary, chromium (VI) was listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.
- 22. The exposures that are the subject of the Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Products. Increased duration of contact with the Products, natural aging of the Products, temperature, light exposure, and contact of the Products

with oxidizing agents and alkaline solutions will result in increased conversion of chromium (III) to chromium (VI) in the Products and thus increased dermal exposure to chromium (VI). Direct mouthing of the Products and indirect hand to mouth exposure to chromium (VI) will occur by touching the Products with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth.

- 23. Defendants have manufactured, processed, marketed, distributed, offered to sell and/or sold the Products in California since at least May 9, 2023. The Products continue to be distributed and sold in California without the requisite warning information.
- 24. At all times relevant to this action, Defendant has knowingly and intentionally exposed users, consumers and/or patients to the Products and the chromium (VI) without first giving a clear and reasonable exposure warning to such individuals.
- 25. As a proximate result of acts by Defendant, as a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of H&S Code § 25249.11, individuals throughout the State of California, including in San Francisco County, have been exposed to chromium (VI) without a clear and reasonable warning on the Products. The individuals subject to the violative exposures include normal and foreseeable users, consumers and patients that use the Products, as well as all others exposed to the Products.

# SATISFACTION OF NOTICE REQUIREMNTS

- 26. Plaintiff purchased the Products from Walmart. At the time of purchase, Defendant did not provide a Proposition 65 exposure warning for chromium (VI) or any other Proposition 65 listed chemical in a manner consistent with H&S Code § 25603.1 as described *supra*.
- 27. On April 19, 2023, the Products were sent to a testing laboratory to determine the chromium (VI) content of the Products.
- 28. On April 28, 2023, the laboratory provided the results of its analysis. Results of these tests determined the Products exposes users to chromium (VI) (collectively, the "Chemical Test Reports" and each a "Chemical Test Report").
- 29. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Reports and Products to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Reports and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Products, exposure to chromium (VI) will occur at levels that require

Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations.

- 30. On May 9, 2023, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report which concluded that persons in California who use the Products will be exposed to levels of chromium (VI) that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.
- On May 9, 2023, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 (collectively, the "Notices" and each a "Notice") to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to chromium (VI) contained in the Products without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibits "A" "B" a true and correct copy of each Notice.
- 32. The Notices complied with all procedural requirements of Proposition 65 including the attachment of a Certificate of Merit affirming that Plaintiff's counsel had consulted with at least one person with relevant and appropriate expertise who reviewed relevant data regarding chromium (VI) exposure, and that counsel believed there was meritorious and reasonable cause for a private action.
- 33. After receiving the Notices, and to Plaintiff's best information and belief, none of the noticed appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and diligently prosecuted a cause of action against Defendant under Proposition 65 to enforce the alleged violations which are the subject of the Notices.
- 34. Plaintiff is commencing this action more than sixty (60) days from the date of the each Notice to Defendant, as required by law.

### **FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION**

# (By Plaintiff against Defendant for the Violation of Proposition 65)

35. Plaintiff hereby repeats and incorporates by reference paragraphs 1 through 34 of this Complaint as though fully set forth herein.

- 36. Defendant has, at all times mentioned herein, acted as distributer, and/or retailer of the Products.
- 37. Use of the Products will expose users and consumers thereof to chromium (VI), a hazardous chemical found on the Proposition 65 list of chemicals known to be hazardous to human health.
  - 38. The Products do not comply with the Proposition 65 warning requirements.
- 39. Plaintiff, based on his best information and belief, avers that at all relevant times herein, and at least since May 9, 2023, continuing until the present, that Defendant has continued to knowingly and intentionally expose California users and consumers of the Products to chromium (VI) without providing required warnings under Proposition 65.
- 40. The exposures that are the subject of the Notices result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Products. Consequently, the primary route of exposure to these chemicals is through dermal exposure. Increased duration of contact with the Products, natural aging of the Products, temperature, light exposure, and contact of the Products with oxidizing agents and alkaline solutions will result in increased conversion of chromium (III) to chromium (VI) in the Products and thus increased dermal exposure to chromium (VI). Direct mouthing of the Products and indirect hand to mouth exposure to chromium (VI) will occur by touching the Products with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth.
- 41. Plaintiff, based on his best information and belief, avers that such exposures will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the Products.
- 42. Defendant has knowledge that the normal and reasonably foreseeable use of the Product exposes individuals to chromium (VI), and Defendant intends those exposures to chromium (VI) will occur by its deliberate, non-accidental participation in the importation, distribution, sale and offering of the Products to consumers in California
- 43. Plaintiff has engaged in good faith efforts to resolve the herein claims prior to this Complaint.

# EXHIBIT "A"

#### LAW OFFICES

#### **BRODSKY & SMITH**

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### May 9, 2023

Member/Manager	Member/Manager
New Moosejaw, LLC	New Moosejaw, LLC
c/o Corporation Service Company	c/o CT Corporation System
251 Little Falls Drive	208 So. LaSalle Street, Suite 814
Wilmington, DE 19808	Chicago, IL 60604
Member/Manager	Member/Manager
New Moosejaw, LLC	New Moosejaw, LLC
850 Cherry Ave.	c/o The Corporation Company
San Bruno, CA 94066	40600 Ann Arbor Rd. E., Ste. 201
	Plymouth, MI 48170
President/CEO	President/CEO
Moosejaw Mountaineering and Backcountry Travel	Outdoor Lifestyle Holdings, Inc.
650 Mandoline,	c/o The Corporation Company
Madison Heights, MI 48071	40600 Ann Arbor Rd. E., Ste. 201
	Plymouth, MI 48170
Member/Manager	President/CEO
Walmart Apollo, LLC	Walmart, Inc.
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky & Smith ("Brodsky Smith") represents Anthony Ferreiro ("Ferreiro"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Ferreiro has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Anthony Ferreiro, 10833 Wilshire Blvd., Apt. 606, Los Angeles, CA 90024, (Ph) 267-438-3403.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): New Moosejaw, LLC; Moosejaw Mountaineering and Backcountry Travel; Outdoor Lifestyle Holdings, Inc.; Walmart, Inc.; Walmart Apollo, LLC
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least May 9, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Chromium (VI). Chromium (VI) is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity and cancer.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Glove	Moosejaw Softshell Glove
	RN# 118940

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Ferreiro's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Ferreiro against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Ferreiro is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Ferreiro has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky & Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY & SMITH

9595 WILSTIIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### May 9, 2023

President/CEO Reliable Knitting Works	President/CO Reliable Knitting Works
c/o Reckmeyer Law, LLC 4701 N. Port Washington Road, Suite 200	6737 W. Washington Street., Suite 3200 Milwaukee, WI 53214-5651
Milwaukee, WI 53212-1050	
President/CEO/Owner Reliable of Milwaukee	President/CEO
PO Box 563	Walmart, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Milwaukee, WI 53201-0563	Corporation Trust Center
33201 0303	1209 Orange Street
	Wilmington, DE 19801
Member/Manager	
Walmart Apollo, LLC	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	
Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky & Smith ("Brodsky Smith") represents Anthony Ferreiro ("Ferreiro"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Ferreiro has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Anthony Ferreiro, 10833 Wilshire Blvd., Apt. 606, Los Angeles, CA 90024, (Ph) 267-438-3403.
- Alleged Violator(s): Reliable Knitting Works; Reliable of Milwaukee; Walmart, Inc.; Walmart Apollo, LLC
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least May 9, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Chromium (VI). Chromium (VI) is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity and cancer.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Glove	Quietwear Leather Glove
	UPC# 033977556027

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Ferreiro against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health &

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Ferreiro's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Ferreiro is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Ferreiro has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky & Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary