1 2 3	Evan J. Smith, Esquire (SBN 242352) Ryan P. Cardona, Esquire (SBN 302113) BRODSKY SMITH 9465 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 300 Beverly Hills, CA 90212 Telephone: (877) 534-2590	FILED Superior Court of California, County of San Francisco 10/31/2024
4	Facsimile: (310) 247-0160	Clerk of the Court BY: SAHAR ENAYATI Deputy Clerk
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff	
6	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
7	COUNTY OF	SAN FRANCISCO
8	EMA DELI	Case No.: CGC-24-619421
9	EMA BELL,  Plaintiff,	COMPLAINT FOR CIVIL PENALTIES AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF
11	VS.	(Violation of Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et
12	THE TJX COMPANIES, INC.,	seq.)
13	Defendant.	
14	Plaintiff Ema Bell ("Plaintiff"), by and through her attorneys, alleges the following cause	
15	of action in the public interest of the citizens of	of the State of California.
16	BACKGROUND OF THE CASE	
17	1. Plaintiff brings this representa	ative action on behalf of all California citizens to
18	enforce relevant portions of Safe Drinking Wa	ater and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at
19	the Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 et sec	("Proposition 65"), which reads, in relevant part,
20	"[n]o person in the course of doing busine	ss shall knowingly and intentionally expose any
21	individual to a chemical known to the state to	cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first
22	giving clear and reasonable warning to such in	ndividual". Health & Safety Code § 25249.6.
23	2. This complaint is a representat	ive action brought by Plaintiff in the public interest
24	of the citizens of the State of California to ent	Force the People's right to be informed of the health
25	hazards caused by exposure to lead, diethano	lamine ("DEA"), and/or di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate
26	("DEHP"), toxic chemicals found in produc	ets sold and/or distributed by defendant The TJX
27	Companies, Inc. ("TJX" or "Defendant") in C	alifornia.
28		

- 3. DEHP<sup>1</sup> and lead<sup>2</sup> are harmful chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. DEA<sup>3</sup> is a harmful chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer.
- 4. Proposition 65 requires all businesses with ten (10) or more employees that operate within California or sell products therein to comply with Proposition 65 regulations. Included in such regulations is the requirement that businesses must label any product containing a Proposition 65-listed chemical that will create an exposure above safe harbor levels with a "clear and reasonable" warning before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing any person to any such listed chemical.
- 5. Proposition 65 allows for civil penalties of up to \$2,500.00 per day per violation for up to 365 days (up to a maximum civil penalty amount per violation of \$912,000.00) to be imposed upon defendants in a civil action for violations of Proposition 65. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Proposition 65 also allows for any court of competent jurisdiction to enjoin the actions of a defendant which "violate or threaten to violate" the statute. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7.
- 6. Plaintiff alleges that Defendant distributes and/or offers for sale in California, without a requisite exposure warning, (a) *Maison Sucasa*<sup>TM</sup> salt and pepper shakers manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Maison Sucasa LLC (lead), (b) *Shabby Chic*® teaware collections sets manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Coastline Imports (lead), (c) Nalini Originals woven

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> On January 1, 1988, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b). On October 24, 2003, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> On October 1, 1992, the state of California listed lead as a chemical known to cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b). On February 27, 1987, the State of California listed lead as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> On June 22, 2012, the State of California listed DEA as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b).

18

19

20

21 22

23 24

25

26

27

28

manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Wesmo Industries Ltd. and/or Kassatex Inc. (lead), (e) Fortune Cat hand cream manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Mamosy International Co. Ltd. (DEA), (f) Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers bowls manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Pegasus Sports, LLC (lead), (g) Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers canisters manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Pegasus Sports, LLC (lead), (h) Nathalie Lete body creams manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Heathcote & Ivory Ltd. (DEA), (i) Elizabeth Arden green tea refreshing body lotions manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Electronic Explosion, Inc. (DEA), (j) snack jars manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Culturefly LLC and/or Yongrui Home Textile Co. Ltd. (lead), (k) snack jars manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Kaysons Handicrafts (lead), (l) Modern Gourmet Foods chocolate cake mugs manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Coastal Cocktails, Inc. (lead), (m) Gentle Real Gold glass mushroom mugs manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Shanxi JingPeng Industry & Trade Co., Ltd. and/or JP Glassware Inc. (lead), and (n) DOF glasses manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Shanxi JingPeng Industry & Trade Co., Ltd. and/or JP Glassware Inc. (lead) (collectively, the "Products" and each a "Product") that expose persons to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP when used for their intended purpose.

- 7. Defendant's failure to warn consumers and other individuals in California of the health hazards associated with exposure to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP in conjunction with the sale and/or distribution of the Products is a violation of Proposition 65 and subjects Defendant to the enjoinment and civil penalties described herein.
- 8. Plaintiff seeks civil penalties against Defendant for its violations of Proposition 65 in accordance with Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b).
- 9. Plaintiff also seeks injunctive relief, preliminarily and permanently, requiring Defendant to provide purchasers, users, or consumers of the Products with required warnings related to the dangers and health hazards associated with exposure to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(a).
  - 10. Plaintiff further seeks a reasonable award of attorney's fees and costs.

# **PARTIES**

- 11. Plaintiff is a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. She brings this action in the public interest pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d).
- 12. Defendant The TJX Companies, Inc., through its business, effectively imports, distributes, sells, and/or offers the Products for sale or use in the State of California, or it implies by its conduct that it imports, distributes, sells, and/or offers the Products for sale or use in the State of California. Plaintiff alleges that defendant The TJX Companies, Inc. is a "person" in the course of doing business within the meaning of Health & Safety Code sections 25249.6 and 25249.11.

# **VENUE AND JURISDICTION**

- 13. Venue is proper in the County of San Francisco because one or more of the instances of wrongful conduct occurred, and continue to occur in this county and/or because Defendant conducted, and continues to conduct, business in the County of San Francisco with respect to the Products.
- 14. This Court has jurisdiction over this action pursuant to California Constitution Article VI, § 10, which grants the Superior Court original jurisdiction in all causes except those given by statute to other trial courts. Health and Safety Code § 25249.7 allows for the enforcement of violations of Proposition 65 in any Court of competent jurisdiction; therefore, this Court has jurisdiction over this lawsuit.
- 15. This Court has jurisdiction over Defendant because Defendant is either a citizen of the State of California, has sufficient minimum contacts with the State of California, is registered with the California Secretary of State as foreign corporations authorized to do business in the State of California, and/or has otherwise purposefully availed itself of the California market. Such purposeful availment has rendered the exercise of jurisdiction by California courts consistent and permissible with traditional notions of fair play and substantial justice.

5

10

8

13

14

12

15

17

16

18

19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26 2.7

28

# STATUTORY BACKGROUND

- 16. The people of the State of California declared in Proposition 65 their right "[t]o be informed about exposures to chemicals that cause cancer, birth defects, or other reproductive harm." (Section 1(b) of Initiative Measure, Proposition 65.)
- 17. To effect this goal, Proposition 65 requires that individuals be provided with a "clear and reasonable warning" before being exposed to substances listed by the State of California as causing cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. H&S Code § 25249.6 states, in pertinent part:

No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...

- 18. An exposure to a chemical in a consumer product is one "which results from a person's acquisition, purchase, storage, consumption or other reasonably foreseeable use of a consumer good, or any exposure that results from receiving a consumer service." (27 CCR § 25602, para (b).) H&S Code § 25603(c) states that "a person in the course of doing business ... shall provide a warning to any person to whom the product is sold or transferred unless the product is packaged or labeled with a clear and reasonable warning."
- 19. Pursuant to H&S Code § 25603.1, the warning may be provided by using one or more of the following methods individually or in combination:<sup>4</sup>
  - A warning that appears on a product's label or other labeling. a.
  - b. Identification of the product at the retail outlet in a manner which provides a warning. Identification may be through shelf labeling, signs, menus, or a combination thereof.
  - The warnings provided pursuant to subparagraphs (a) and (b) shall be c. prominently placed upon a product's labels or other labeling or displayed at the retail outlet

Alternatively, a person in the course of doing business may elect to comply with the warning requirements set out in the amended version of 27 CCR 25601, et. seq.. as amended on August 30, 2016, and operative on August 30, 2018.

 with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices in the label, labeling or display as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use.

- d. A system of signs, public advertising identifying the system and toll-free information services, or any other system that provides clear and reasonable warnings.
- 20. Proposition 65 provides that any "person who violates or threatens to violate" the statute may be enjoined in a court of competent jurisdiction. (H&S Code § 25249.7.) The phrase "threaten to violate" is defined to mean creating "a condition in which there is a substantial probability that a violation will occur." (H&S Code § 25249.11(e).) Violators are liable for civil penalties of up to \$2,500.00 per day for each violation of the Act (H&S Code § 25249.7) for up to 365 days (up to a maximum civil penalty amount per violation of \$912,000.00).

# **FACTUAL BACKGROUND**

- 21. On January 1, 1988, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b). On October 24, 2003, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.
- 22. On October 1, 1992, the state of California listed lead as a chemical known to cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b). On February 27, 1987, the State of California listed lead as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.
- 23. On June 22, 2012, the State of California listed DEA as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and it has come under the purview of Proposition 65 regulations since that time. Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8 & 25249.10(b).
- 24. The exposures that are the subject of the Notices result from the purchase, acquisition, handling, consumption, and recommended use of the Products. The primary route of exposure to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when

consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Exposure through ingestion will occur by touching the Products with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure.

- 25. Defendant has processed, marketed, distributed, offered to sell and/or sold the Products in California since at least July 31, 2023 with respect to the *Maison Sucasa*™ salt and pepper shakers; since at least November 2, 2023 with respect to the *Shabby Chic*® teaware collections sets; since at least November 30, 2023 with respect to the Nalini Originals woven bags; since at least December 8, 2023, with respect to the Kassatex soap pumps; since at least January 25, 2024 with respect to the Fortune Cat hand cream; since at least February 2, 2024 with respect to the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers bowls; since at least February 15, 2024 with respect to the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers canisters; since at least February 26, 2024 with respect to the Nathalie Lete body creams and Elizabeth Arden green tea refreshing body lotions; since at least February 29, 2024 with respect to the snack jars; since at least March 22, 2024 with respect to the snack jars; since at least April 25, 2024 with respect to the Modern Gourmet Foods chocolate cake mugs; since at least May 10, 2024 with respect to the Gentle Real Gold glass mushroom mugs; and since at least June 24, 2024 with respect to the DOF glasses. The Products continue to be distributed and sold in California without the requisite warning information.
- 26. At all times relevant to this action, Defendant has knowingly and intentionally exposed users and/or consumers of the Products to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP without first giving a clear and reasonable exposure warning to such individuals.
- 27. As a proximate result of acts by Defendant, as a person in the course of doing business within the meaning of H&S Code § 25249.11, individuals throughout the State of California, including in San Francisco County, have been exposed to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP without a clear and reasonable warning on the Products. The individuals subject to the violative exposures include normal and foreseeable users and consumers that use the Products, as well as all others exposed to the Products.

# SATISFACTION OF NOTICE REQUIREMNTS

- 28. Plaintiff purchased the Products from TJX. At the time of purchase, Defendant did not provide a Proposition 65 exposure warning for lead, DEA, DEHP, or any other Proposition 65 listed chemical in a manner consistent with H&S Code § 25603.1 as described *supra*.
- 29. The Nalini Originals woven bags were sent to a testing laboratory for phthalate testing to determine the phthalate content of the Product. For the Nalini Originals woven bags, Plaintiff received a chemical test report (collectively, the "Chemical Test Reports" and each a "Chemical Test Report"). The Chemical Test Report findings determined the Nalini Originals woven bags expose users to DEHP. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Reports and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Products, exposure to DEHP will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On November 30, 2023, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Nalini Originals woven bags that concluded that persons in California who consume the Nalini Originals woven bags will be exposed to levels of DEHP that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.
- 30. The Fortune Cat hand creams were sent to a testing laboratory for diethanolamine testing to determine the DEA content of the Products. For the Fortune Cat hand creams, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the Fortune Cat hand creams expose users to DEA. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Reports and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to DEA will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On January 25, 2024, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Fortune Cat hand cream duos that concluded that persons in California who use the Fortune Cat hand cream duos will be exposed to levels of DEA that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.

- 31. The Nathalie Lete body creams were sent to a testing laboratory for diethanolamine testing to determine the DEA content of the Products. For the Nathalie Lete body creams, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the Nathalie Lete body creams expose users to DEA. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Reports and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to DEA will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On February 26, 2024, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Nathalie Lete body creams that concluded that persons in California who use the Nathalie Lete body creams will be exposed to levels of DEA that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.
- 32. The Elizabeth Arden green tea refreshing body lotions were sent to a testing laboratory for diethanolamine testing to determine the DEA content of the Products. For each Product that was sent to the laboratory, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the Elizabeth Arden green tea refreshing body lotions expose users to DEA. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Report and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Products, exposure to DEA will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On February 26, 2024, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Elizabeth Arden green tea refreshing body lotions that concluded that persons in California who use the Elizabeth Arden green tea refreshing body lotions will be exposed to levels of DEA that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.
- 33. The *Maison Sucasa*<sup>TM</sup> salt and pepper shakers were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount of, lead would migrate and/or leach from the Product. For the *Maison Sucasa*<sup>TM</sup> salt and pepper shakers, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the *Maison Sucasa*<sup>TM</sup> salt and pepper shakers expose users to lead. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to

10

13

16

15

17 18

19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26

27

28

determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Report and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to lead will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On July 31, 2023, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Maison Sucasa<sup>TM</sup> salt and pepper shakers that concluded that persons in California who consume the *Maison Sucasa*<sup>TM</sup> salt and pepper shakers will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.

- 34. The Shabby Chic® teaware collections sets were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount of, lead would migrate and/or leach from the Product. For the Shabby Chic® teaware collections sets, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the *Shabby Chic*® teaware collections sets expose users to lead. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Report and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to lead will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On November 2, 2023, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Shabby Chic® teaware collections sets that concluded that persons in California who consume the Shabby Chic® teaware collections sets will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.
- 35. The Kassatex soap pumps were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount of, lead would migrate and/or leach from the Product. For the Kassatex soap pumps, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the Kassatex soap pumps expose users to lead. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Report and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to lead will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On December 8, 2023, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Kassatex soap pumps that concluded that

1

4 5 6

8 9 10

7

11 12 13

15

14

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24 25

26

27 28 persons in California who use the Kassatex soap pumps will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.

- 36. The Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers bowls were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount of, lead would migrate and/or leach from the Product. For the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers bowls, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers bowls expose users to lead. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Report and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to lead will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On February 2, 2024, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers bowls that concluded that persons in California who use the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers bowls will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.
- 37. The Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers canisters were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount of, lead would migrate and/or leach from the Product. For the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers canisters, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers bowls expose users to lead. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Report and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to lead will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On February 15, 2024, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers canisters that concluded that persons in California who use the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers canisters will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.
- 38. The snack jars manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Culturefly LLC and/or Yongrui Home Textile Co. Ltd. were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount

of, lead would migrate and/or leach from the Product. For the snack jars, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the snack jars expose users to lead. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Report and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to lead will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On February 29, 2024, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the snack jars that concluded that persons in California who use the snack jars will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.

- 39. The snack jars manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Kaysons Handicrafts were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount of, lead would migrate and/or leach from the Product. For the snack jars, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the snack jars expose users to lead. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Report and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to lead will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On March 22, 2024, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the snack jars that concluded that persons in California who use the snack jars will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.
- 40. The Modern Gourmet Foods chocolate cake mugs were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount of, lead would migrate and/or leach from the Product. For the Modern Gourmet Foods chocolate cake mugs, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the Modern Gourmet Foods chocolate cake mugs expose users to lead. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Report and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to lead will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California

Code of Regulations. On April 25, 2024, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Modern Gourmet Foods chocolate cake mugs that concluded that persons in California who use the Modern Gourmet Foods chocolate cake mugs will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.

- 41. The Gentle Real Gold glass mushroom mugs were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount of, lead would migrate and/or leach from the Product. For the Modern Gourmet Foods chocolate cake mugs, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the Gentle Real Gold glass mushroom mugs expose users to lead. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Report and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to lead will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On May 10, 2024, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the Gentle Real Gold glass mushroom mugs that concluded that persons in California who use the Gentle Real Gold glass mushroom mugs will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.
- 42. The DOF glasses were sent to a testing laboratory to determine if, and what amount of, lead would migrate and/or leach from the Products. For the DOF glasses, Plaintiff received a Chemical Test Report. The Chemical Test Report findings determined the DOF glasses expose users to lead. Plaintiff provided the Chemical Test Report and Product to an analytical chemist to determine if, based on the findings of the Chemical Test Reports and the reasonable and foreseeable use of the Product, exposure to lead will occur at levels that require Proposition 65 warnings under the Clear and Reasonable Warnings section 25601 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. On June 24, 2024, Plaintiff received from the analytical chemist an exposure assessment report for the DOF glasses that concluded that persons in California who use the DOF glasses will be exposed to levels of lead that require a Proposition 65 exposure warning.

# **NOTICES OF VIOLATION**

- 43. On July 31, 2023, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of the *Maison Sucasa*<sup>TM</sup> salt and pepper shakers without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "A" a true and correct copy of the July 31, 2023 notice of violation.
- 44. On November 2, 2023, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of the *Shabby Chic*® teaware collections sets without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. On February 19, 2024, Plaintiff gave additional notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of the Product without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "B" a true and correct copy of the November 2, 2023 notice of violation.
- 45. On November 30, 2023, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to DEHP from use of the Nalini Originals woven bags without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. On February 2, 2024, Plaintiff gave additional notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to DEHP from use of the Product without proper warning, subject to a private

action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "C" a true and correct copy of the November 30, 2023 notice of violation.

- A6. On December 8, 2023, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of the Kassatex soap pumps without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. On May 15, 2024, Plaintiff gave additional notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of the Product without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "D" a true and correct copy of the December 8, 2023 notice of violation.
- 47. On January 25, 2024, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to DEA from use of the Fortune Cat hand cream duos without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "E" a true and correct copy of the January 25, 2024 notice of violation.
- 48. On February 2, 2024, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of Pegasus Sports, LLC exterior decoration ceramic products, including but not limited to, Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers bowls without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City

Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. On February 15, 2024, Plaintiff provided additional notice to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of Pegasus Sports, LLC exterior decoration ceramic products, including but not limited to, Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers canisters without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "F" a true and correct copy of the February 2, 2024 notice of violation. See attached at Exhibit "G" a true and correct copy of the February 15, 2024 notice of violation.

- 49. On February 26, 2024, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant and Heathcote & Ivory Ltd. concerning the exposure of California citizens to DEA from use of the Nathalie Lete body creams without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "H" a true and correct copy of the February 26, 2024 notice of violation.
- 50. On February 26, 2024, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to DEA from use of the Elizabeth Arden green tea refreshing body lotions without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. On April 12, 2024, Plaintiff gave additional notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to DEA from use of the Product without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population

11 12

13 14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

28

greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "I" a true and correct copy of the February 26, 2024 notice of violation.

- 51. On February 29, 2024, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of the snack jars manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Culturefly LLC and/or Yongrui Home Textile Co. Ltd. without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. On July 8, 2024, Plaintiff gave additional notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of the Product without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "J" a true and correct copy of the February 29, 2024 notice of violation.
- 52. On March 22, 2024, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of the snack jars manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Kaysons Handicrafts without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. On May 15, 2024, Plaintiff gave additional notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of the Product without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "K" a true and correct copy of the March 22, 2024 notice of violation.

23

24

25

26

27

28

53. On April 25, 2024, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of the Modern Gourmet Foods chocolate cake mugs without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "L" a true and correct copy of the April 25, 2024 notice of violation.

54. On May 10, 2024, Plaintiff gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of Shanxi JingPeng Industry & Trade Co., Ltd. and/or JP Glassware Inc. exterior decoration products, including but not limited to, the Gentle Real Gold glass mushroom mugs without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. On August 15, 2024, Plaintiff gave additional notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of Shanxi JingPeng Industry & Trade Co., Ltd. and/or JP Glassware Inc. exterior decoration products, including but not limited to, the Gentle Real Gold glass mushroom mugs without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. On June 24, 2024, Plaintiff gave additional notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of Shanxi JingPeng Industry & Trade Co., Ltd. and/or JP Glassware Inc. exterior decoration products, including but not limited to, DOF glasses without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. On October 22, 2024, Plaintiff gave additional notice of alleged

violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 to Defendant concerning the exposure of California citizens to lead from use of Shanxi JingPeng Industry & Trade Co., Ltd. and/or JP Glassware Inc. exterior decoration products, including but not limited to, DOF glasses without proper warning, subject to a private action to Defendant and to the California Attorney General's office and the offices of the County District attorneys and City Attorneys for each city with a population greater than 750,000 persons wherein the herein violations allegedly occurred. See attached at Exhibit "M" a true and correct copy of the May 10, 2024 notice of violation. See attached at Exhibit "N" a true and correct copy of the June 24, 2024 notice of violation.

- 55. The Notices complied with all procedural requirements of Proposition 65 including the attachment of a Certificate of Merit affirming that Plaintiff's counsel had consulted with at least one person with relevant and appropriate expertise who reviewed relevant data regarding lead, DEA, and/or DEHP exposure, and that counsel believed there was meritorious and reasonable cause for a private action.
- 56. After receiving the Notices, and to Plaintiff's best information and belief, none of the noticed appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and diligently prosecuted a cause of action against Defendant under Proposition 65 to enforce the alleged violations which are the subject of the Notices.
- 57. Plaintiff is commencing this action more than sixty (60) days from the date of each Notice to Defendant, as required by law.

# **FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION**

# (By Plaintiff against Defendant for the Violation of Proposition 65)

- 58. Plaintiff hereby repeats and incorporates by reference paragraphs 1 through 57 of this Complaint as though fully set forth herein.
- 59. Defendant has, at all times mentioned herein, acted as distributer, and/or retailer of the Products.
- 60. Use of the Products will expose users to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP, hazardous chemicals found on the Proposition 65 list of chemicals known to be hazardous to human health.
  - 61. The Products do not comply with the Proposition 65 warning requirements.

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 62. Plaintiff, based on her best information and belief, avers that at all relevant times herein, and since at least July 31, 2023 with respect to the Maison Sucasa<sup>TM</sup> salt and pepper shakers; since at least November 2, 2023 with respect to the Shabby Chic® teaware collections sets; since at least November 30, 2023 with respect to the Nalini Originals woven bags; since at least December 8, 2023, with respect to the Kassatex soap pumps; since at least January 25, 2024 with respect to the Fortune Cat hand cream; since at least February 2, 2024 with respect to the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers bowls; since at least February 15, 2024 with respect to the Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers canisters; since at least February 26, 2024 with respect to the Nathalie Lete body creams and Elizabeth Arden green tea refreshing body lotions; since at least February 29, 2024 with respect to the snack jars; since at least March 22, 2024 with respect to the snack jars; since at least April 25, 2024 with respect to the Modern Gourmet Foods chocolate cake mugs; since at least May 10, 2024 with respect to the Gentle Real Gold glass mushroom mugs; and since at least June 24, 2024 with respect to the DOF glasses, continuing until the present, that Defendant has continued to knowingly and intentionally expose California users and consumers of the Products to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP without providing required warnings under Proposition 65.
- 63. The exposures that are the subject of the Notices result from the purchase, acquisition, handling, consumption, and recommended use of the Products. The primary route of exposure to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Exposure through ingestion will occur by touching the Products with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure.
- 64. Plaintiff, based on her best information and belief, avers that such exposures will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are removed from the Products.
- 65. Defendant has knowledge that the normal and reasonably foreseeable use of the Products expose individuals to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP, and Defendant intends that exposures to lead, DEA, and/or DEHP will occur by its deliberate, non-accidental participation in the importation, distribution, sale and offering of the Products to consumers in California.

# EXHIBIT "A"

# LAW OFFICES

# **BRODSKY SMITH**

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

July 31, 2023

Member/Manager	Member/Manager
Maison Sucasa LLC	EMS Mind Reader LLC
c/o Michael Betesh	c/o National Corporate Services, Inc.
250 Passaic Street	203 NE Front St., Suite 101
Newark, NJ 07104	Milford, DE 19963
Member/Manager	Member/Manager
EMS Mind Reader LLC	EMS Mind Reader LLC
c/o TRAC - The Registered Agent Company	250 Passaic Street
316 Berrhill Drive	Newark, NJ 07104
Williamstown, NJ 08094	
President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJMaxx
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801
President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc.
c/o CT Corporation System	Jay Meltzer
101 Federal Street	c/o TJX Co.
Boston, MA 02110	770 Cochituate Road
	Framingham, MA 01701

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

# I. <u>DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION</u>

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Maison Sucasa LLC; EMS Mind Reader LLC; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJMaxx
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least July 31, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
lt & Pepper Shakers	Maison Sucasa Salt & Pepper Shakers
	UPC# 810094756116

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

# II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

## III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534,2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795,7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### November 2, 2023

Member/Manager	President/CEO
SC Licensing, LLC	The TJX Companies, Inc.
c/o Rachel Ashwill	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
24412 S. Main Street, Suite 105	Corporation Trust Center
Carson, CA 90745	1209 Orange Street
	Wilmington, DE 19801
Member/Manager	President/CEO
Marshalls of CA, LLC	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls
c/o CT Corporation System	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
330 N. Brand Blvd., Suite 700	.Corporation Trust Center
Glendale, CA 91203	1209 Orange Street
	Wilmington, DE 19801
President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc.	
c/o CT Corporation System	
101 Federal Street	
Boston, MA 02110	

# 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): SC Licensing, LLC; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls; Marshalls of CA, LLC
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least November 2, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Teaware Set	Shabby Chic Teaware Collection Set
	1280-112262310-01999-23-1

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

## II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

# EXHIBIT "C"

# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516,741.4977

PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### November 30, 2023

President/CEO	President/CEO
Newton Buying Corp.	Newton Buying Corp.
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o CT Corporation System
Corporation Trust Center	155 Federal Street, Suite 700
1209 Orange Street	Boston, MA 02110
Wilmington, DE 19801	
President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801
P. II. John	
President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc.	
c/o CT Corporation System	
101 Federal Street	
Boston, MA 02110	

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- Alleged Violator(s): Newton Buying Corp.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least November 30, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP). DEHP is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Woven Bag	Nalini Originals Woven Bag
	RN# 75343

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

# III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health &

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely

Evan J. Smith

# Attachments

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

# EXHIBIT "D"

#### LAW OFFICES

# **BRODSKY SMITH**

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977

PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610 667.6200

#### December 8, 2023

President/CEO Kassatex Inc. 330 Fifth Ave., Floor 11 New York, NY 10001	President/CEO Kassatex Inc. 295 Fifth Avenue, Suite 111 New York, NY 10016
President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o CT Corporation System 101 Federal Street Boston, MA 02110	President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801
President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801	

# 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Kassatex Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least December 8, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Soap Pump	Kassatex Soap Pump
	452976

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

## II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

## III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

# EXHIBIT "E"

# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667,6200

#### January 25, 2024

President/CEO	President/CEO
Mamosy International Co. Ltd.	Mamosy International Co. Ltd.
3F, No. 89, Section 1	3F, No. 89, Sec. 1, Zhongqing Road, Wenzhuang
Zhongqing Road	Village
Talchung City 404638	North District
TAIWAN, R.O.C.	Taichung City 404638
	TAIWAN (R.O.C.)
President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801
Partitude Pos	
President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc.	
c/o CT Corporation System	
101 Federal Street	
Boston, MA 02110	

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. <u>DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION</u>

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Mamosy International Co. Ltd.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx
- Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least January 25, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Diethanolamine (DEA) is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Hand Cream	Fortune Cat Hand Cream Duo
	UPC# 4715862369092

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal exposure. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

# EXHIBIT "F"

# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSTIIRE BLVD., STE, 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYI.VANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

## February 2, 2024

Member/Manager	Member/Manager
Pegasus Sports, LLC	Pegasus Sports, LLC
c/o Stephen Spinella	1349 Locust Ave. South
1200 Ocean Avenue	Denmark, SC 29042
Belmar, NJ 07719	,
President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801
President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc.	
c/o CT Corporation System	
101 Federal Street	
Boston, MA 02110	

## 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

## I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Pegasus Sports, LLC; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies Inc., dba TJ Maxx
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least February 2, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Bowl	Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers Dog Bowl
	65-3446-166984-000999-23-1

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

# EXHIBIT "G"

# LAW OFFICES

# **BRODSKY SMITH**

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877,534,2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516,741,4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### February 15, 2024

Member/Manager Pegasus Sports, LLC c/o Stephen Spinella 1200 Ocean Avenue Belmar, NJ 07719	Member/Manager Pegasus Sports, LLC 1349 Locust Ave. South Denmark, SC 29042
President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801 President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o CT Corporation System 101 Federal Street Boston, MA 02110	President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

# I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- Alleged Violator(s): Pegasus Sports, LLC; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies
  Inc., dba TJ Maxx
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least February 15, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Canister	Pegasus Sports LA Dodgers Dog Treat Canister
	RN# 166620

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

# BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856,795,7250

NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610,667,6200

#### February 26, 2024

President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJMaxx
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801
President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	Heathcote & Ivory Limited
c/o CT Corporation System	2 Londsdale Road, 7 Chalcot Road
101 Federal Street	LONDON
Boston, MA 02110	NW6 6RD
	UNITED KINGDOM
President/CEO	
Heathcote & Ivory Limited	
Acre House 11-15 William Road	
London NW1 3ER	
UNITED KINGDOM	

## 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- Alleged Violator(s): The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJMaxx; Heathcote & Ivory Limited
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least February 26, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Diethanolamine (DEA) is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Body Cream	Nathalie Lete Body Cream
	UPC# 5 015632 112460

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal exposure. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

## II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

## III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

## Attachments

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

# EXHIBIT "I"

# BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534,2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### February 26, 2024

President/CEO Elizabeth Arden, Inc. c/o Corporate Creations Network Inc. 1521 Concord Pike, Suite 201 Wilmington, DE 19803	President/CEO Elizabeth Arden, Inc. c/o Corporate Creations Network, Inc. 801 US Highway 1 North Palm Beach, FL 33408
President/CEO Elizabeth Arden, Inc. c/o Prentice-Hall Corporation System, Inc. 110 North Magnolia Street Tallahassee, FL 32301	President/CEO Elizabeth Arden, Inc. c/o Corporate Creations Network Inc. 7801 Folsom Boulevard, #202 Sacramento, CA 95826
President/CEO FD Management, Inc. c/o Corporate Creations Network, Inc. 1521 Concord Pike, Suite 201 Wilmington, DE 19803 President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc.	President/CEO FD Management, Inc. c/o James Artiano 3828 Carson Street, #102 Torrance, CA 90503 President/CEO The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJMaxx
c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801 President/CEO	c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801
The TJX Companies, Inc. c/o CT Corporation System 101 Federal Street Boston, MA 02110	

## 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Elizabeth Arden, Inc.; FD Management, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJMaxx
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least February 26, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Diethanolamine (DEA) is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Body Lotion	Elizabeth Arden Green Tea Refreshing Body Lotion
	UPC# 0 85805 07137 0

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal exposure. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

## II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSI (IRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250

NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### February 29, 2024

President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc.
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o CT Corporation System
Corporation Trust Center	101 Federal Street
1209 Orange Street	Boston, MA 02110
Wilmington, DE 19801	
President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJMaxx	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	
Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	

### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

## I. <u>DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc., dba TJMaxx
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least February 29, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Cookie Jar	Oreo Cookie Jar
	20-7811-552044-001999-22-1
	RN# 152992

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

# EXHIBIT "K"

# LAW OFFICES

## **BRODSKY SMITH**

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE, 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### March 22, 2024

President/CEO	President/CEO
Homegoods, Inc.	Homegoods, Inc.
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o CT Corporation System
Corporation Trust Center	330 N. Brand Blvd., Suite 700
1209 Orange Street	Glendale, CA 91203
Wilmington, DE 19801	
President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc.
c/o CT Corporation System	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
101 Federal Street	Corporation Trust Center
Boston, MA 02110	1209 Orange Street
	Wilmington, DE 19801
President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Homegoods	
c/o The Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	

# 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Homegoods, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Homegoods
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least March 22, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Food Storage Jar	Food Storage Jar
	301242

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

# II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

## III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

# EXHIBIT "L"

LAW OFFICES

## **BRODSKY SMITH**

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE, 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250

NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### April 25, 2024

President/CEO	President/CEO
Coastal Cocktails, Inc.	Coastal Cocktails, Inc.
c/o Frank Blundo	1920 E. Deere Avenue, Suite 100
15760 Ventura Blvd.	Santa Ana, CA 92705
Encino, CA 91436	·
President/CEO	President/CEO
Modern Gourmet Foods, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc.
1920 E. Deere Ave., Ste. 100	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Santa Ana, CA 92705	Corporation Trust Center
	1209 Orange Street
	Wilmington, DE 19801
President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx
c/o CT Corporation System	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
101 Federal Street	Corporation Trust Center
Boston, MA 02110	1209 Orange Street
	Wilmington, DE 19801

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Coastal Cocktails, Inc.; Modern Gournet Foods, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least April 25, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Mug	Modern Gourmet Foods Chocolate Mug Cake S721664

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

## III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

# EXHIBIT "M"

# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE, 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667,6200

#### May 10, 2024

President/CEO	President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc.	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o CT Corporation System	
Corporation Trust Center	101 Federal Street	
1209 Orange Street	Boston, MA 02110	
Wilmington, DE 19801		
President/CEO		
The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx		
c/o The Corporation Trust Company		
Corporation Trust Center		
1209 Orange Street		
Wilmington, DE 19801		

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least May 10, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Mug	Gentle Real Gold Glass Mushroom Mug
	80 1270 827084 000799 03 9

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

# EXHIBIT "N"

# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250

NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516,741,4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610 667 6200

#### June 24, 2024

President/CEO	President/CEO
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801
President/CEO	Member/Manager
The TJX Companies, Inc.	Marshalls of CA, LLC
c/o CT Corporation System	c/o CT Corporation System
101 Federal Street	330 N. Brand Blvd., Suite 700
Boston, MA 02110	Glendale, CA 91203

# 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- Alleged Violator(s): The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls; Marshalls of CA, LLC
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least June 24, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Glasses	DOF Glasses
	1280-115535015-00999-04-9

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

## III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan I Smith

## Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service