

SEP 07 2007

KIM TURNER, Court Executive Officer MARIN COUNTY SUPERIOR COURT

By: J. Dale, Deputy

LEXINGTON LAW GROUP, LLP Eric S. Somers, State Bar No. 139050 Mark N. Todzo, State Bar No. 168389 Howard Hirsch, State Bar No. 213209 1627 Irving Street San Francisco, CA 94122 Telephone: (415) 759-4111 Facsimile: (415) 759-4112 4 5 Attorneys for Plaintiff CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

COUNTY OF MARIN 10

CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH,) 13 a non-profit corporation, 14 Plaintiff. 15

Case No. CV 064425

[PROPOSED]*CONSENT JUDGMENT

SMITH & HAWKEN, LTD:; and DOES 1 through 200, inclusive,

Defendants.

20

6

7

8

9

11

12

16

17

18

19

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

1.1 On or about April 24, 2006, Plaintiff the Center for Environmental Health ("CEH"), a non-profit corporation acting in the public interest, served Smith & Hawken, Ltd. ("Smith & Hawken") and the appropriate public enforcement agencies with the requisite 60-day notice (the "Notice") that Smith & Hawken was in violation of Proposition 65.

- 1.2 On October 11, 2006, CEH filed a complaint (the "Complaint") in Marin County Superior Court, entitled Center for Environmental Health v. Smith & Hawken, Ltd., et al., Marin County Superior Court Case No. CV 064425 (the "Action"), for civil penalties and injunctive relief pursuant to the provisions of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq. ("Proposition 65").
- 1.3 Defendant Smith & Hawken is a corporation that employs 10 or more persons and imports, distributes and sells copper containers with soldered parts (the "Products"), including without limitation copper trays, planters, urns, wall fountains, pots, flower buckets, birdbaths, and saucers, made of materials containing lead and/or lead compounds (referred to interchangeably herein as "Lead") in the State of California.
 - 1.4 Smith & Hawken and CEH are referred to herein as the "Parties."
- 1.5 CEH's Notice and the Complaint in this Action allege that Smith & Hawken exposes individuals who use or otherwise handle the Products to Lead, chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm, without first providing clear and reasonable warning to such persons regarding the carcinogenicity and reproductive toxicity of Lead. The Notice and Complaint allege that Smith & Hawken's conduct violates Health & Safety Code §25249.6, the warning provision of Proposition 65.
- 1.6 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of the violations alleged in CEH's Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Smith & Hawken as to the acts alleged in CEH's Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Marin, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent

Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein.

1.7 The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment pursuant to a settlement of certain disputed claims between the Parties as alleged in the Complaint. By executing this Consent Judgment, the Parties do not admit any facts or conclusions of law. It is the Parties' intent that nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive or impair any right, remedy, argument or defense the Parties may have in this or any other or future legal proceeding. This Consent Judgment is the product of negotiation and compromise and is accepted by the parties, for purposes of settling, compromising and resolving issues disputed in this action, including future compliance by Smith & Hawken with Section 2 of this Consent Judgment, and shall not be used for any other purpose.

2. COMPLIANCE - REFORMULATION

2.1 Lead reformulation. After October 1, 2007 (the "Reformulation Date"), Smith & Hawken shall not manufacture, purchase for distribution or sale, or accept delivery of any Product that contains Lead in concentrations that exceed 200 parts per million ("ppm") or is comprised of any material that contains Lead in concentrations that exceed 200 ppm.

2.2 Products in inventory.

2.2.1 Products In Inventory Sold To Consumers By Smith & Hawken. After October 1, 2007, Smith & Hawken shall not sell or cause to be sold in California any Product that was manufactured, purchased for distribution or sale, or delivered to Smith & Hawken prior to the Reformulation Date, unless the Product is sold with the following warning:

WARNING: This product contains lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm. Wash hands thoroughly after coming into contact with this product.

The warning shall be displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual. The warning statement shall not be preceded, followed, or surrounded by words, symbols, or other matter that reduces its conspicuousness or that introduces, modifies, qualifies, or explains the required text, such as "legal notice required by law." This warning may be conveyed by sticker, hang tag, or label on the Product itself, or by shelf signs or signs at all cash registers. Shelf and cash register signs shall have dimensions of no less than 7 inches by 11 inches, and shall both identify the specific Products that contain Lead and state the warning language set forth above. If the warning is a sign posted at each cash register, it shall be sufficiently specific such that a reasonable consumer can tell if a particular Product is covered by the warning. An example of a sign posted at a cash register that meets the requirements of this Section is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

2.2.2 Products In Inventory Sold To California Wholesale

Customers By Smith & Hawken. After October 1, 2007, Smith & Hawken shall send to all of its non-retail customers located in California ("Wholesale Customers") a copy of the warning sign attached hereto as Exhibit A and instructions requiring that the warning is displayed or conveyed in a manner consistent with this Section 2.2. If Smith & Hawken signs or contracts with a new Wholesale Customer, Smith & Hawken shall provide the new Wholesale Customer with a copy of the warning sign and instructions prescribed by this Section upon signing or contracting with that customer and before shipping any Products to that Wholesale Customer. A copy of instructions to be sent to Wholesale Customers is attached hereto as Exhibit B. Smith & Hawken shall make quarterly visits to each Wholesale Customer who has received a shipment of Products from Smith & Hawken to ensure that the instructions are followed. Smith & Hawken

shall make these quarterly visits so long as each Wholesale Customer continues to purchase the Products from Smith & Hawken and for a period of one year after the final purchase of Products by a particular Wholesale Customer. If Smith & Hawken finds that a Wholesale Customer has not complied with the instructions, it shall provide the Wholesale Customer with an additional copy of the warning sign and instructions on proper display of the warning signs. If Smith & Hawken provides warnings and instructions, and makes quarterly visits to Wholesale Customers as specified in this Section, Smith & Hawken shall not be held responsible if a Wholesale Customer fails to display or convey warnings consistent with this Section. Smith & Hawken's provision of warnings and instructions, and quarterly visits to Wholesale Customers consistent with the requirements of this Section constitute compliance with Proposition 65 with regard to Lead in Products sold to Wholesale Customers.

- 2.3 Certification of level from suppliers. With each shipment of Products received by Smith & Hawken on or after the Reformulation Date, Smith & Hawken shall obtain written certification with corresponding test results for the solder used in each of the Products from its suppliers of such Products certifying that neither the Products nor any materials from which the Products are made contain Lead in concentrations exceeding 200 ppm. For solder components of the Products, the test results may be obtained from the solder manufacturer, and such test results may be used to certify the solder on multiple shipments of the Products, provided however that the certification from the supplier must clearly state that all of the solder used in the particular Product that is the subject of the certification is the same as the solder referenced in the test results attached to such certification.
- 2.4 Testing. In order to help ensure compliance with the requirements of Sections 2.1, Smith & Hawken shall perform random testing of the Products to confirm that the solder used in making the Products contains less than 200 ppm Lead. Testing pursuant to this Section shall be conducted pursuant to the testing protocol attached hereto as Exhibit C (the "Test Protocol") by an independent, accredited domestic laboratory. The results of all testing performed pursuant to this Section shall be retained by Smith & Hawken for a period of three

years from the date of the test and shall be made available to CEH upon reasonable request. The frequency and amount of testing required shall be as follows:

the fiscal quarter ending on December 31, 2007, Smith & Hawken will select eight random Products with different Stock Keeping Units ("SKUs") for testing. If during any fiscal quarter, Smith & Hawken has less than eight Products with different SKUs, it may test multiple randomly selected Products with the same SKU. Smith & Hawken shall, to the extent that it has less than eight suppliers in a particular fiscal quarter, ensure that the eight selected pieces include at least one Product received from each of its suppliers for that fiscal quarter. Smith & Hawken shall continue the sample testing for a minimum period of three years (12 fiscal quarters of testing), provided however that the sample testing shall continue until such time as Smith & Hawken's testing pursuant to this Section shows no test results exceeding the 200 ppm reformulation level for a period of eight consecutive fiscal quarters (2 years).

2.5 Confirmatory testing by CEH. CEH may conduct periodic testing of the Products sold in California. Any such testing will be conducted pursuant to the Test Protocol at an independent laboratory. In the event that CEH's testing demonstrates Lead levels in excess of 200 ppm for one or more Products, CEH shall inform Smith & Hawken of the violation(s), including information sufficient to permit Smith & Hawken to identify the Product(s). Smith & Hawken shall, within seven days following receipt of such notice, provide CEH, at the address listed in Section 12, with the following certification and testing information demonstrating its compliance with Section 2.3 of this Consent Judgment: supplier certification and testing information for all shipments received since the Reformulation Date that included the same SKU(s) as that of the Product(s) referenced in CEH's notice to Smith & Hawken. The Parties shall then meet and confer in an attempt to informally determine an appropriate course of action to address the CEH test result. If the Parties are unable to informally agree upon an appropriate action to address the CEH test result, the provisions of Sections 2.6, 2.7 and 2.8 shall apply.

informally agree upon an appropriate action to address the CEH test result, the provisions of this Section shall apply. Should CEH or Smith & Hawken testing pursuant to Sections 2.4 or 2.5 demonstrate that a Product contains Lead levels in excess of 600 ppm ("Recall Product"), Smith & Hawken shall use its best efforts to identify and recall all Products with the same SKU that were purchased in the same purchase order as any Recall Product from its retail outlets in California. Smith & Hawken shall destroy or return to the supplier all such Products and send certification to CEH that it has completed this process. Such certification shall indicate how many units of the Products were returned or destroyed via the recall. In addition, Smith & Hawken shall increase its random testing by testing an additional six randomly selected Products from the supplier of each delivered shipment of Products that failed a random test from such supplier for the two shipments purchased immediately following a Product test exceeding 200 ppm.

course of action to address a test result exceeding 600 ppm Lead. If the Parties are unable to

3. SETTLEMENT PAYMENTS

3.1 Smith & Hawken shall pay a total of \$70,000 as a settlement payment. This total shall be paid in two separate checks delivered to the offices of the Lexington Law Group, LLP and made payable and allocated as follows:

3.1.1 Smith & Hawken shall pay the sum of \$23,000 as payment to CEH in lieu of penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, §3203(b). This payment in lieu of penalty check shall be made payable to the "Center For Environmental Health." CEH will use such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people from exposures to toxic chemicals, including heavy metals. In addition, CEH may use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with the reformulation requirements of this and other similar Consent Judgments.

3.1.2 Smith & Hawken shall pay the sum of \$47,000 to reimburse CEH and its attorneys for their reasonable investigation fees and costs, attorneys' fees, and any other costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Smith &

2425

23

·26

28

Hawken's attention, litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. The attorneys fees and cost reimbursement check shall be made payable to the Lexington Law Group, LLP.

3.2 Timing of payments. The payments required under this Section shall be delivered to the address set forth in Section 12 below within seven days of entry of this Consent Judgment by the Court. Any failure by Smith & Hawken to comply with the payment terms herein shall be subject to a stipulated late fee in the amount of \$100 for each day after the delivery date the payment is received. The late fees required under this Section shall be recoverable, together with reasonable attorneys' fees, in an enforcement proceeding brought pursuant to Section 5 of this Consent Judgment.

4. MODIFICATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

4.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified by written agreement of CEH and Smith & Hawken, or upon motion of CEH or Smith & Hawken as provided by law.

5. ENFORCEMENT OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

- 5.1 This Consent Judgment may be enforced against Smith & Hawken by CEH or the California Attorney General only. CEH may, by motion or application for an order to show cause before the Superior Court of the County of Marin, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent Judgment. Should CEH prevail on any motion or application under this Section, CEH shall be entitled to recover its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs associated with such motion or application.
- 5.2 Prior to filing any motion or application for an order to show cause before the Superior Court of the County of Marin to enforce the terms and conditions contained in this consent judgment, the Parties shall meet and confer in an attempt to informally solve any disputes between the Parties.

6. APPLICATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

6.1 This Consent Judgment shall apply to and be binding upon the Parties hereto, their divisions, subdivisions and subsidiaries, and the successors or assigns of any of them.

7.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between CEH, acting on behalf of itself and the general public, and Smith & Hawken of any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claim that was or could have been asserted in the Complaint against Smith & Hawken or its parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, directors, officers, employees, agents, downstream distributors, downstream retailers or customers, based on failure to warn about exposure to Lead contained in any Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Smith & Hawken on or prior to the date of entry of this Consent Judgment. Compliance with this Consent Judgment by Smith & Hawken shall hereinafter constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Smith & Hawken with respect to Lead in the Products. This release does not limit or effect the obligations of any Party created under this Consent Judgment.

8. SEVERABILITY

8.1 In the event that any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions shall not be adversely affected.

9. SPECIFIC PERFORMANCE

9.1 The Parties expressly recognize that Smith & Hawken's obligations under this Consent Judgment are unique. In the event that Smith & Hawken is found to be in breach of this Consent Judgment for failure to comply with the provisions of Section 2 hereof, the Parties agree that it would be extremely impracticable to measure the resulting damages and that such breach would cause irreparable damage. Accordingly, CEH, in addition to any other available rights or remedies, may sue in equity for specific performance, and Smith & Hawken expressly waives the defense that a remedy in damages will be adequate.

10. GOVERNING LAW

10.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California.

1	Consent Judgment. Except as explicitly provided herein, each party is to bear its own fees and
2	costs.
3	
4	AGREED TO:
5	
6	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
7	
8	Charlie Pizzaro PIZARRO
9	Assistant Executive Director Center for Environmental Health
10	ASSOCIATE
11	SMITH & HAWKEN, LTD.
12	
13	Signature
14	
15	Printed Name
16	
17	Title
18	
19	ORDER AND JUDGMENT
20	Based upon the stipulated Consent Judgment between the Parties, the settlement is
21	approved and judgment is hereby entered according to the terms herein.
22	
23	Dated:
24	
25	
26	Judge, Superior Court of the State of California
27	
28	

	1	Consent Judgment. Except as explicitly provided herein, each party is to bear its own fees and
·	2	costs.
-	3	
	4	AGREED TO:
	5	CENTED FOR THE THE
	6	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
	7	
	8	Charlie Pizzaro Assistant Executive Director
	9	Center for Environmental Health
	10	
	H	EMITH & HAWKEN, LTD.
	2	WM L
	3 - 4	Signature
1,	-	Goran Central
1(Printed Name
17	11	Title
18	3	ALIC
19	0	RDER AND JUDGMENT
20	1}	
21	apı	Based upon the stipulated Consent Judgment between the Parties, the settlement is proved and judgment is hereby entered according to the terms herein.
22		decorating to the terms herein.
23		Dated: SEP 0 7 2007
24		
25		Lynn Duryee
26		Judge, Superior Court of the State of California
27		
28		
		

Danillis de la Transcollo de la Collogia de la Coll

6)1111177 EFIVIOR

EXHIBIT B Letter of Instruction to Wholesale Customers 2 [Smith & Hawken Letterhead] IMPORTANT LEGAL NOTICE 3 Date: Attention: Dealers/Distributors of Smith & Hawken Copper Containers 4 Subject: California Proposition 65 Warnings 5 This letter is to advise you that certain copper containers sold by Smith & Hawken 6 (the "Products") contain solder that is made from lead. Smith & Hawken has entered into a Consent Judgment in a Proposition 65 Enforcement Action that requires the provision of warning materials with these copper containers. Lead is a chemical known to the State of California to 8 cause cancer and reproductive toxicity. 9 Although Smith & Hawken is in the process of reformulating its entire product line to no longer contain leaded solder, your shipments from Smith & Hawken have included, or may include, Products that pursuant to the Consent Judgment, require a Proposition 65 warning. 10 A copy of the warning required by the Consent Judgment is enclosed. This warning must be displayed with all Smith & Hawken Products. You must convey this warning by shelf signs on 11 all shelves with Smith & Hawken Products, or by placing these signs at all cash registers. The signs must be displayed in a manner that is conspicuous and that makes them likely to be read 12 and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase in your store. 13 Failure to provide a Proposition 65 warning for the Products may subject you to legal action by the California Attorney General or any person acting in the public interest, 14 wherein monetary penalties of up to \$2,500 per violation may be sought. Should you have any questions or concerns about this matter, please do not hesitate to contact [] at [] by phone, or by mail at the above address. In addition, we will be glad to supply additional warning signs if requested. Sincerely, Title

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

.28