1	KLAMATH ENVIRONMENTAL LAW		
2	CENTER WILLIAM VERICK, CSB #140972		
3	FREDRIC EVENSON, CSB #198059 424 First Street		
4	Eureka, CA 95501 Telephone: 707/268-8900		
5	Facsimile: 707/268-8901 ENDORSED		
	San Francisco County Superior Court		
6	DAVID H. WILLIAMS, CSB #144479 BRIAN ACREE, CSB #202505  DEC 0 7 2009		
7	370 Grand Avenue, Suite 5 Oakland, CA 94610 GORDON PARK-LI, Cler!		
8	Telephone: 510/271-0826 Facsimile: 510/271-0829  BY: JOCHLYN C. BOQUE Deputy Clock		
9	Email: davidhwilliams@earthlink.net brianacree@earthlink.net		
10	Attorneys for Plaintiff MATEEL		
11	ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION		
12	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
13	CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO		
14	UNLIMITED JURISDICTION		
15			
16	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ) Case No. CGC-08-476369		
17	FOUNDATION, ) CONSENT JUDGMENT		
18	Plaintiff,		
19	v.		
20	THE VOLLRATH COMPANY; and ) TOMLINSON INDUSTRIES, )		
21	Defendants.		
22	Defendants.		
23	)		
24	1. INTRODUCTION		
25	1.1 On or about March 12, 2008, plaintiff Mateel Environmental Justice		
26	Foundation ("MEJF"), provided a 60-day Notice of Violation to the California Attorney		
27	General, the District Attorneys of each county in California, the City Attorneys of every		
28 EPARED	California city with a population greater than 750,000, and defendant The Vollrath  102942939  - 1 -		
PAPER			

DOCUMENT PREP ON RECYCLED PAPER

Company, LLC ("Vollrath"), alleging that Vollrath, through its sales in California of cooking vessels and coffee urns with brass spigots or faucets that contain lead, was in violation of California Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq., ("Proposition 65") by knowingly and intentionally exposing persons to lead, a product known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, without first providing a clear and reasonable warning.

- 1.2 On or about August 13, 2009, MEJF provided a 60-day Notice of Violation to the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of each county in California, the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000, and Tomlinson Industries ("Tomlinson"), alleging that Tomlinson, through its sales in California of brass spigots or faucets that contain lead, and are used with cooking vessels and coffee urns, was in violation of Proposition 65 by knowingly and intentionally exposing persons to lead, a product known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, without first providing a clear and reasonable warning.
- 1.3 On or about June 16, 2008, MEJF, acting in the public interest pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d), filed a Complaint for Civil Penalties and Injunctive Relief in this action in San Francisco County Superior Court, Case No. CGC-08-476369 against Vollrath based on the allegations contained in the March 12, 2008 Notice Letter. MEJF alleges in the Complaint that Vollrath is a business that employs more than ten persons and manufactures, distributes and/or markets within the State of California cooking vessels and coffee urns with brass faucets or spigots that contain lead. Pursuant to Proposition 65, lead and lead compounds are chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity. MEJF further alleges that cooking vessels and coffee urns with brass faucets or spigots that are manufactured, distributed, sold and/or marketed by Vollrath for use in California, require a warning under Proposition 65.
- 1.4 On November 5, 2009, MEJF, acting in the public interest pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d), amended the Complaint to add Tomlinson based on the allegations contained in the August 13, 2009 Notice Letter.

DOCUMENT PREPARED

1.5 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the 60 Day Notice Letters and Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Settling Defendants as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of San Francisco and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement and resolution of the allegations contained in the Complaint and of all claims which were or could have been raised based on the facts alleged therein or arising therefrom.

1.6 The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment pursuant to a full and final settlement of disputed claims between the parties for the purpose of avoiding prolonged litigation. This Consent Judgment and compliance with it shall not constitute an admission with respect to any allegation made in the 60 Day Notice Letters or the Complaint, each and every allegation of which Settling Defendants deny, nor may this Consent Judgment or compliance with it be used as an admission or evidence of any fact, wrongdoing, misconduct, culpability or liability on the part of a Settling Defendant.

# 2. <u>DEFINITIONS.</u>

- 2.1 The term "Covered Product" means a faucet, spigot or shank associated with a faucet or spigot ("Shank"), made, in whole or in part, from brass or other copper alloy which contains lead manufactured, marketed or sold by Tomlinson, and designed to be used in a coffee urn or similar vessel designed for dispensing coffee, tea or water; or a faucet, spigot or Shank used on a stock pot; or a faucet, spigot or Shank used in a Vollrath cooking vessel or coffee dispensing vessel. The term "Covered Product" also includes products manufactured, marketed or sold by Vollrath which are used to dispense coffee, tea, or water or are used to prepare, store or serve soup stocks or cold beverages and which contain an external spigot, faucet or valve to dispense liquid that is made, in whole or in part, from brass or other copper alloy which contains lead.
  - 2.2 The term "Effective Date" means the date of entry of this Consent Judgment.
- 2.3 The term "Settling Defendants" means Vollrath and Tomlinson collectively and the term "Settling Defendant" means Vollrath or Tomlinson individually.

# 3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

3.1 At any time more than 120 days after the Effective Date, each Settling Defendant agrees that it will not knowingly ship for sale Covered Products for use in California unless the Covered Product meets the Reformulation Standard of paragraph 3.3.1, or both the Reformulation Standard of paragraph 3.3.2 and the Warning specification of paragraph 3.4.

# 3.2 Testing Protocol

- 3.2.1. For each product line or manufacturing specification of a Covered Product, 3 units of the Covered Product shall be selected to be tested. The Covered Products which will be tested shall be randomly selected using any generally accepted random sampling method such as International Standards Organization 2589-1 (1989).
- 3.2.2. The Exposure Solution shall be a national brand of commercially available ground coffee, brewed according to the coffee company's directions and using commercially available bottled water. The same coffee, bottled water and the same method of brewing the coffee shall be used for every test that uses coffee as an Exposure Solution and that is performed pursuant to this Consent Judgment. Notwithstanding the above, in the event the Covered Product is a spigot used in a Vollrath cooking vessel or a Vollrath product used to dispense cold beverages, the Exposure Solution shall be 4 percent acetic acid.
- 3.2.3. Prior to its use in any test of a Covered Product, the Exposure Solution shall be analyzed for lead, using the method of analysis (with a detection limit of 0.05 micrograms of lead per liter of solution) used in the test of the Covered Product under paragraph 3.2.7. The analysis shall be conducted using a sample of the size set forth in paragraph 3.2.5 and by dispensing the Exposure Solution into a container of the type set forth in such paragraph. The result shall be the Sample Blank Level.
- 3.2.4. The Covered Product to be tested will be washed in potable water containing dishwashing detergent, rinsed and dried and will be sanitized before use with a commercial sanitizing solution per the manufacturer's instructions. If the Covered Product is an unattached faucet, the Covered Product will be attached to a "test vessel" designed to accept the Covered Product in a manner similar to a retail version of vessel that

RED 102942939

vessel shall have a lid that will reduce evaporation of the Exposure Solution during subsequent steps, shall be of a size to contain a minimum of 3 liters of Exposure Solution, and manufactured from a material (such as 300 series stainless steel) that will not leach lead into the Exposure Solution during the testing. Notwithstanding the foregoing, any lead that does leach from the test vessel shall be added to any lead in the Sample Blank Level and considered to be a part thereof. If the Covered Product includes a vessel, which contains an external spigot, the vessel it shall be filled to a minimum of 3 liters or its full capacity, whichever is less.

incorporates the Covered Product and which has also been washed and sanitized. The test

3.2.5. The Covered Product, or if the Covered Product is an unattached faucet, the test vessel with the Covered Product faucet attached shall be filled with the 3 liters of Exposure Solution. Approximately 250 milliliters of the Exposure Solution shall be dispensed by opening the valve of the faucet and then closing the valve, and discarded. The Exposure Solution shall be held in the test vessel or Covered Product for a period of 4 hours, during which time no Exposure Solution is to be dispensed and no ingredients or contaminants or other Exposure Solution are to be added. If the Covered Product may be used for holding warm liquids, the Exposure Solution shall be maintained at a temperature between 185 and 195 degrees Fahrenheit. After the 4 hours, 266 milliliters (9 ounces) are to be dispensed (drawn) through the faucet by opening the valve. The sample is to be dispensed into a clean PTFE, polyethylene or HDPE container with an air-tight lid containing an appropriate preservative, if any.

- 3.2.6. An additional sample of 266 milliliters (9 ounces) is to be dispensed after 1/2 hour and a third is to be dispensed after an additional 1/2 hour.
- 3.2.7. Each Exposure Solution sample shall be analyzed for lead using a method of analysis which has a detection limit of 0.05 micrograms per liter (0.05 ug/L) or less The concentration level for the unit of the Covered Product shall be the level of lead that results from the analysis of the sample, minus the Sample Blank Level.

DOCUMENT PREPARED

ON RECYCLED PAPER

3.2.8. A total of 3 units of the Covered Products shall be tested, unless the mean
concentration for any single tested unit of a Covered Product is more than 2 times greater or less
than the mean of the other two units of the Covered Product, in which case, a fourth unit shall be
tested

- 3.2.9. The average concentration level of lead in the samples dispensed and analyzed shall be calculated. The result shall be the Lead Concentration Level for the Covered Product. This level shall apply to all Covered Products which are manufactured to the same specifications using the same materials as those tested.
- 3.2.10. Settling Defendants may rely upon the representations from its suppliers that these test standards have been met to the extent such reliance is in good faith.
  - 3.3 Reformulation Standards.
- 3.3.1 Any Covered Product for which the Lead Concentration Level (outcome of test protocol of 3.2) is less than or equal to 2 micrograms per liter may be shipped for sale in California with no warnings.
- 3.3.2 Any Covered Product for which the Lead Concentration Level (outcome of test protocol of 3.2) is greater than 2 micrograms per liter but less than 20 micrograms per liter may be shipped for sale in California if the warnings of 3.4 are provided.
- 3.3.3 Covered Products for which the Lead Concentration Level (outcome of test protocol of 3.2) is greater than 20 micrograms per liter may not be shipped for sale in California.
  - 3.4 Warnings
- 3.4.1 Any warning provided pursuant to 3.3.2 above, shall meet the following specifications.
- 3.4.2 If the customer is a purchaser of the Covered Product, the warning will be affixed to the packaging or labeling of each unit of the Covered Product.
- 3.4.3 As an alternative, with regard solely to a Settling Defendant's Commercial Vessels (defined as all Covered Products that are primarily marketed to commercial enterprises

1	that sell beverages at retail), if the customer is a purchaser of the Covered Product, the following		
2	warning may be provided:		
3	a) in letters to be sent by the Settling Defendant to all of the Settling		
4	Defendant's distributors and the Defendant's direct customers identifying the specific products		
5	for which the warning is issued; or		
6	b) if the Covered Product is accompanied by an owner's or user's manual,		
7	then in the owner's or user's manual accompanying the Covered Products.		
8	3.4.4 The warning shall state:		
9	WARNING: Consuming food or beverages that have been served from this vessel will expose you to lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.		
11	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •		
12	The text of this warning must be in 12 point type or larger. The word "WARNING" must be in		
13	capitalized and be in bold. The warning must either be on the front or top of the packaging of the		
14	Covered Product, unless the alternative methods as mentioned above are chosen by Defendant for		
15	the Commercial Vessels.		
16	3.4.5 In the event the Covered Product is sold as a single item (such as a		
17	replacement part), the label shall be no smaller than 1/2 inch tall x 1-1/2 inch wide and shall		
18	extend to within one-half inch of the edge of the Covered Product.		
19	3.4.6 For any entity that sells coffee, tea or other food product dispensed from a		
20	Covered Product that meets the standard of paragraph 3.3.2, if that entity provides a warning to		
21	the consumer purchasing the beverage that is substantially similar to that specified in paragraph		
22	3.4.4, (identifying the chemical as lead a chemical known to cause birth defects) that entity shall		
23	be deemed to be in compliance with the warning requirements of Health and Safety Code Section		
24	25249.6 et seq.		
25	4. <u>ENFORCEMENT OF JUDGMENT</u>		
26	4.1. The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be enforced exclusively by the		
27	Parties hereto.		
28			

9

8

11

10

13

12

14 15

16

17 18

19

20

22

21

23 24

25

26

27 28

#### 5. MONETARY RELIEF

- 5.1. Settling Defendants shall pay a total of \$220,000 in full and complete settlement of all monetary claims by MEJF, as follows:
- Payment shall be made to Klamath Environmental Law Center ("KELC"), and 5.2 sent to the attention of William Verick, Klamath Environmental Law Center, 424 First Street, Eureka, California 95501, so as to arrive on or before 5 days before any hearing of any motion for approval of the settlement. If the payments have not been so received, MEJF may continue or withdraw any motion to approve this agreement, and this Consent Judgment shall be deemed of no effect. If within 120 days, this Consent Judgment has not been approved by the Court, these payments will be returned.
- 5.3 Upon approval by the Court of this Consent Judgment, the payments shall subsequently and within a commercially reasonable time be allocated by KELC as follows:
- The sum of \$10,000 shall be paid in civil penalties, payable as follows: 5.3.1 75% of the penalty shall be made payable to the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, with the remaining 25% payable to Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation in accordance with California Health and Safety Code § 25192.
- 5.3.2 The sum of \$100,000 shall be paid as a charitable contribution as follows: \$50,000 to Ecological Rights Foundation, and \$50,000 to Californians For Alternatives to Toxics. These payments shall be used for reducing exposures to toxic chemicals and other pollutants, and for increasing consumer, worker and community awareness of health hazards posed by lead and other toxic chemicals. The Parties agree and acknowledge that the charitable contributions made pursuant to this Section shall not be construed as a credit against the personal claims of absent third parties for restitution against the defendant.
- 5.3.3 The sum of \$110,000, shall be retained by Klamath Environmental Law Center, as payment in part for the attorneys fees and costs incurred in this action.

# 6. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE

As to lead exposures alleged to be caused by Covered Products sold by 6.1 Settling Defendants prior to the Effective Date, this Consent Judgment is a final and binding resolution between MEJF, acting on behalf of itself and as to those matters raised in the 60 Day Notice Letters in the public interest, and Settling Defendants and their parents, subsidiaries, and affiliates as well as their customers, distributors, wholesalers, retailers, or any other person in the course of doing business, and the successors and assigns of any of them, who may have used, maintained, distributed or sold or use, maintain, distribute or sell Covered Products or other products that include as components Covered Products ("Releasees") of: (i) as to lead exposures from Covered Products, any violation of Proposition 65 (including but not limited to the claims made in the Complaints and the Notices); and (ii) any other claim that could have been asserted by MEJF in the public interest against the Releasees, based on exposure of persons to lead from Covered Products or failure to provide a clear and reasonable warning of such exposure, whether based on actions committed by the Releasees or others. Further, as part of entry of this Judgment, the Court finds that compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment meet the warning requirements of Proposition 65.

6.1.1. This Consent Judgment contemplates that faucets and spigots will be sold by themselves to be installed onto coffee urns and vessels designed to dispense coffee, tea or hot water by third party manufacturers and that these vessels will then be sold to end users such as restaurants and institutions which will use them to sell beverages to the public. Collectively these third party manufacturers and end users shall be referred to as "Downstream Entities." To the extent any Downstream Entity fails to convey to its customers a warning required by paragraph 3.3.2 that is substantially similar, to that specified in paragraph 3.4 (identifying the chemical as lead a chemical known to cause birth defects), or sells any Covered Product (sold to such Downstream Entities by Tomlinson at any time more than 120 days after the Effective Date) in California that is subject to the prohibition of paragraph 3.3.3, then that Downstream Entity shall

28

i

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

n 102942939

not benefit from any release or other protection that would otherwise be provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment.

6.2 In furtherance of the Parties' intention that this Consent Judgment shall be effective as a full and final accord, satisfaction, and release as to the Releasees of and from any and all matters released hereunder, MEJF acknowledges familiarity and understanding of California Civil Code § 1542, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

To the extent that Section 1542 or any similar law or statute may otherwise apply to this Consent Judgment, MEJF hereby waives and relinquishes as to all matters released hereunder all rights and benefits it has, or may have, under Section 1542 or the laws of any other jurisdiction to the same or similar effect. MEJF further acknowledges that, subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment, it may discover Claims that were unsuspected at the time this Consent Judgment was executed, and which might have materially affected its decision to execute this Consent Judgment, but nevertheless MEJF releases the Releasees from any and all such Claims, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, at the time of the execution of this Consent Judgment.

6.3 The provisions of this Section 6 shall not apply to or affect any claims that may be brought by MEJF or a Settling Defendant against a Supplier that is not a Settling Defendant, unless such Supplier is a Defendant Releasee.

# 7. APPLICATION OF JUDGMENT

7.1 The obligations of this Consent Judgment shall apply to and be binding upon all plaintiffs acting in the public interest pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7, and Setting Defendants, and their successors or assigns. The terms contained in this Consent Judgment shall be submitted to the California Attorney General's office prior to the entry of this Consent Judgment by the Court.

- 10 -

DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER

DOCUMENT PREPARED

ON RECYCLED PAPER

7.2 This Consent Judgment shall have no effect on Covered Products sold or offered for sale by Settling Defendants outside the State of California.

# 8. MODIFICATION OF JUDGMENT

- 8.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only upon written agreement of the parties and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon or upon motion of any party as provided by law and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court.
- 8.2 If the Attorney General of the State of California or Plaintiff permit any sale with warnings, or alternative reformulation standard and/or test protocol for lead in products similar to the Covered Products by way of settlement or compromise with any other person in the course of doing business, or any other entity, or if a warning scheme or reformulation standard and/or test protocol for lead in Covered Products is incorporated by Plaintiff in any final judgment as to any other person in the course of doing business, or any other entity, then Settling Defendants shall be entitled to apply any such warning scheme, reformulation standard and/or test protocol to Covered Products.
- 8.4 Settling Defendants shall be entitled to a modification to this Consent

  Judgment to establish a reformulation standard and/or test protocol for lead content in

  Covered Products consistent with any "safe use determination" regarding lead content in

  Covered Products issued by the California Environmental Protection Agency Office of

  Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, pursuant to 27 Cal. Code Regs. § 25204 or any successor regulation.

### 9. COURT APPROVAL

9.1 If the Court does not approve this Consent Judgment, it shall be of no force or effect, and cannot be used in any proceeding for any purpose.

# 10. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

10.1. This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement this Consent Judgment.

CONSENT JUDGMENT

#### 11. **GOVERNING LAW** 1 The laws of the State of California shall govern the validity, construction and 2 performance of this Consent Judgment. 3 12. **NOTICES** 4 When any Party is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, 5 12.1 the notice or report shall be sent by U.S. mail or overnight courier service to the following 6 persons: 7 8 If to MEJF: William Verick, Esq. 9 Klamath Environmental Law Center 424 First Street 10 Eureka, CA 95501 11 If to Vollrath: Steve Heun Chief Financial Officer 12 Steven Gedman 13 Vice President, Supply Chain & Logistics The Vollrath Company, LLC 14 1236 N. 18th Street Sheyboygan, WI 53081 15 With a copy to: 16 Michael E. Delehunt 17 Foley & Lardner LLP One Maritime Plaza, 6th Floor 18 San Francisco, CA 94111 19 If to Tomlinson: Louis J. Castro Tomlinson Industries 20 13700 Broadway Avenue Cleveland, OH 44125 21 With a copy to: 22 John F. Cermak, Jr. 23 Baker & Hostetler LLP 12100 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 1500 24 Los Angeles, CA 90025 25 26 27 28 102942939

DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER

- 12 -

12.2 Any Party may modify the person and address to whom notice is to be sent by sending each other Party notice in accordance with this Section.

# 13. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE

13.1 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party he or she represents to enter into this Consent Judgment and to execute it on behalf of the party represented and legally to bind that party.

## 14. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

14.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire, agreement and understanding of the parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any party hereto. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the parties.

# 15. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS

15.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and/or by facsimile or portable document format (pdf), which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one original document.

• 1	IT IS SO STIPULATED:	
: 2		
3		
4	Dated:, 2009	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION
5		
6		D
7		Ву
8	Dated:, 2009	THE VOLLRATH COMPANY, LLC
9		
10		n.
11		Ву
12	Dated: November 20, 2009	TOMLINSON INDUSTRIES
13		
14		for In
15		By/Louis J. Castro Executive Vice President
16		
17		
18	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED	AND DECREED:
19	Date:	
20	Date.	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
ON SECUCION PARED	102942939	- 14 -

1	IT IS SO STIPULATED:		
2			
3	Dated:/2/5, 2009	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE	
4	12,	FOUNDATION	
5		ath ha	
6		By you should the	
7	/		
8	Dated:/2/2_, 2009	THE VOLLRATH COMPANY, LLC	
9			
10		By often R. Jem	
11 12	Dated:, 2009	TOMLINSON INDUSTRIES	
13	Dated, 2009	I OMEINSON INDUSTRIES	
14			
15		Ву	
16			
17			
18	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGE	O AND DECREED:	
19		PAUL H. ALVARADO	
20	DEC 0 7 2009	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT	
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28 DOCUMENT PREPARED	102942939	14	
ON RECYCLED PAPER			