

1 Clifford A. Chanler, State Bar No. 135534  
2 David S. Lavine, State Bar No. 166744  
3 CHANLER LAW GROUP  
4 2560 Ninth Street  
5 Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
6 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565  
7 Telephone: (510) 848-8880  
8 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118

9 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
10 ANTHONY E. HELD, Ph.D., P.E.

11  
12 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
13 FOR THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO  
14 UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION

15 ANTHONY E. HELD, Ph.D., P.E.,  
16 Plaintiff,  
17 v.  
18 BIG LOTS STORES, INC., *et al.*,  
19 Defendants.

Case No. CGC-08-480730

~~PROPOSED~~ JUDGMENT PURSUANT  
TO TERMS OF STIPULATION AND  
~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER RE: CONSENT  
JUDGMENT

Date: March 5, 2010  
Time: 9:30 a.m.  
Dept.: 611  
Judge: Hon. Jeffrey S. Ross

ENDORSED  
FILED  
San Francisco County Superior Court

MAR - 5 2010

GORDON PARK-LI, Clerk  
BY: RON ROSS  
Deputy Clerk

REC'D JAN 14 2010

1 In the above-entitled action, Plaintiff ANTHONY E. HELD, Ph.D., P.E. and Defendant  
2 BIG LOTS STORES, INC., having agreed through their respective counsel that judgment be  
3 entered pursuant to the terms of the Proposition 65 settlement agreement in the form of a  
4 Stipulation and [Proposed] Order Re: Consent Judgment (“Consent Judgment”) entered into by  
5 the parties, and following issuance of an order approving this Proposition 65 settlement  
6 agreement and entering the Consent Judgment on March 5, 2010.

7 IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that pursuant to Code of  
8 Civil Procedure §664.6, judgment is entered in accordance with the terms of the Consent  
9 Judgment attached hereto as **Exhibit 1**.

10  
11 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

12  
13 Dated: MAR - 5 2010

**JEFFREY S. ROSS**  
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

# **Exhibit 1**

1 Clifford A. Chanler, Bar No. 135534  
2 David Lavine, State Bar No. 166744  
3 CHANLER LAW GROUP  
4 2560 Ninth Street  
5 Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
6 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565  
7 Telephone: (510) 848-8880  
8 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
ANTHONY E. HELD, Ph.D., P.E.

Michael E. Delehunt, State Bar No. 70619  
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP  
One Maritime Plaza, Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 434-4484  
Facsimile: (415) 434-4507

Attorneys for Defendant  
BIG LOTS STORES, INC.

14 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
15 FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO  
16 UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION

18 ANTHONY HELD, Ph.D., P.E., )

19 Plaintiff, )

20 v. )

21 BIG LOTS, INC.; BIG LOTS STORES, INC.; )  
22 and DOES 1 through 150, inclusive, )

23 Defendants. )  
24 \_\_\_\_\_ )

Case No. CGC-08-480730

**STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]  
ORDER RE: CONSENT JUDGMENT**

1       **1. INTRODUCTION**

2               **1.1 Anthony E. Held, Ph.D., P.E., and Big Lots**

3               This proposed consent judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff Anthony E. Held,  
4       Ph.D., P.E. (“Dr. Held” or “Plaintiff”) and defendant Big Lots Stores, Inc. (“Big Lots” or  
5       “Defendant”), with Plaintiff and Defendant collectively referred to as the “parties.” This proposed  
6       consent judgment is intended to supersede an earlier proposed consent judgment executed by the  
7       parties on August 18, 2008.

8               **1.2 Plaintiff**

9               Dr. Held is an individual residing in the County of Sacramento who seeks to promote  
10       awareness of exposure to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating  
11       hazardous substances contained in consumer Products.

12              **1.3 Defendant**

13              Big Lots employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for  
14       purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health &  
15       Safety Code §25249.6 *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”).

16              **1.4 General Allegations**

17              Dr. Held alleges that Big Lots has manufactured, distributed and/or sold handbags, vinyl  
18       smocks, vinyl bags, vinyl placemats, vinyl zipper pulls, vinyl bathroom toys, sporting toys, stuffed  
19       toys, and tape measures containing the chemicals known as di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (hereinafter  
20       “DEHP”) and/or lead in the State of California without the requisite health hazard warnings. DEHP  
21       and lead are listed pursuant to Proposition 65, and are known to cause birth defects and other  
22       reproductive harm. DEHP and lead shall be referred to hereinafter as the “listed chemicals.”

23              **1.5 Products Description**

24              The Products that are covered by this consent judgment are defined as follows: (1) watch  
25       sets with handbags containing lead, including but not limited to *Tempreaux Watch Gift Set*,  
26       #410020786, # 410020156 (2) vinyl smocks and other children’s art items and accessories  
27       containing DEHP, including but not limited to *Bridgeport Art Smock*, #520017786, #520026074,  
28

1 *Item #C68K0928*; (3) vinyl bags containing DEHP, including but not limited to *Baby in Bath Tub*,  
2 *#510011360*, *#510018025*, *#510019987*, *Item #63968 (#0 42607 63968 9)*; *Bath Time Kids Bath*  
3 *Tote – Mango*, *#99441 (#7 09225 77610 2)*; and *Halloween Treat Bag*, *#363002962*; (4) children’s  
4 vinyl placemats containing DEHP, including but not limited to *Happy Halloween Placemat*,  
5 *#350043209*, *Item #63482*; (5) vinyl zipper pulls and bags with vinyl zipper pulls containing DEHP,  
6 including but not limited to *Cheeky Chimp Mini Pouchette*, *#120085323*, *#120085327 (#5 060081*  
7 *141165)*; (6) vinyl bathroom toys containing DEHP, including but not limited to *Duckies (3 Ducks)*,  
8 *#510017614*, *#510017611*, *Item #13570*; (7) sporting toys containing DEHP and/or lead, including  
9 but not limited to *Sofi Sports Ball*, *#510019331*, *#6866*, *WK41756N*; *World Champ Jr. Play Boxing*  
10 *Gloves Soft Touch*, *#510003242*, *#510015587*, *#19150*; *World Champ Play Boxing Gloves &*  
11 *Punching Bag Set Soft Touch*, *#19151*; *Grand Slam Easy Catch Baseball & Glove*, *#510008548*,  
12 *#510017039*, *Item #22377C*; and *Grand Slam 5 Piece Base Set*, *#510007244*, *Item #66034*; (8)  
13 stuffed toys with accessories containing lead, including but not limited to *Animated Friend*,  
14 *#510020216*, *#MD080070D*; and (9) tape measures containing lead, including but not limited to  
15 *Pro-Source 3 Pk Tape Measure*, *#230020121*, *Item #7396-3*. Such items containing DEHP and/or  
16 lead sold by Big Lots are referred to hereinafter as the “Products.”

17 **1.6 Notices of Violation**

18 On each of January 11, 2008, April 22, 2008, July 10, 2008, January 26, 2009, March 13,  
19 2009, April 2, 2009, August 14, 2009, September 15, 2009, and September 30, 2009, Dr. Held  
20 served Big Lots and various public enforcer agencies with one or more documents entitled “60-Day  
21 Notice of Violation” (together, “Notices”) that provided Big Lots and Public Enforcers with notice  
22 of alleged violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.6 for failing to warn consumers  
23 that the Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Big Lots exposed users in California to the  
24 listed chemicals, while the items were handled or chewed. To the best of parties’ knowledge, no  
25 Public Enforcer has filed a Proposition 65 enforcement action to prosecute, or diligently prosecuted,  
26 any of the allegations set forth in the Notices.

1           **1.7    Complaint**

2           On October 8, 2008, Dr. Held, who asserts that he was and is acting in the interest of the  
3           general public in California, filed a complaint ("Complaint") in the Superior Court in and for the  
4           County of San Francisco against Big Lots and Does 1 through 150, alleging violations of California  
5           Health & Safety Code §25249.6 based on the alleged exposures to the listed chemicals contained in  
6           certain vinyl smocks, vinyl bathroom toys and sporting toys manufactured, distributed or sold by  
7           Big Lots, as set out in the April 22, 2008 and July 10, 2008 Notices. As no public enforcer has  
8           begun to diligently prosecute the allegations related to the more recent Notices during the sixty-day  
9           period following each, the Complaint shall be deemed amended to include the corresponding  
10          allegations.

11          **1.8    No Admission**

12          Big Lots denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in Dr. Held's Notices  
13          and Complaint, and maintains that all Products that it has manufactured, distributed, and/or sold in  
14          California have been and are in compliance with Proposition 65 and all other relevant laws.  
15          Nothing in this consent judgment shall be construed as an admission by Big Lots of any fact,  
16          finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this consent judgment constitute  
17          or be construed as an admission by Big Lots of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or  
18          violation of law, such being specifically denied by Big Lots. In order to avoid the costs and  
19          expenses of litigation and without admitting liability or wrongdoing, Big Lots has elected to resolve  
20          this matter by settlement and on the terms set forth herein. However, this section shall not diminish  
21          or otherwise affect Big Lots' obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this consent judgment.

22          **1.9    Consent to Jurisdiction**

23          For purposes of this consent judgment only, the parties stipulate that this Court has  
24          jurisdiction over Big Lots as to the allegations contained in the Complaint, that venue is proper in  
25          the County of San Francisco and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions  
26          of this consent judgment.

1           **1.10 Effective Date**

2           For purposes of this consent judgment, the term “effective date” shall mean September 15,  
3 2009 with respect to all Products except for the handbags, vinyl zipper pulls, stuffed toys, and tape  
4 measures, for which the effective date shall mean February 1, 2010.

5           **2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS AND REFORMULATION**

6           **2.1 Reformulation Commitment in Lieu of Warnings**

7           After the effective date, Big Lots shall not sell or offer to be shipped for sale in California  
8 any Products containing the listed chemicals unless such Products comply with the reformulation  
9 provisions set forth in Sections 2.2 and 2.3.

10          **2.2 Reformulation Standards**

11          For purposes of this Consent Judgment, “Phthalate Free” Products shall mean Products  
12 containing less than or equal to 1000 parts per million (ppm), or 0.1%, of DEHP when analyzed  
13 pursuant to Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C, Consumer  
14 Product Safety Improvement Act of 2008 methodologies CPSD-AN-00095-MTHD and CPSD-AN-  
15 00143-MTHD or equivalent methods as may be allowed under Proposition 65; and “Lead Free”  
16 shall mean Products containing less than or equal to 300 parts per million, or .03%, of lead, when  
17 analyzed pursuant to EPA testing methodologies, 3050B and 6010B, CPSD-AN-00007-MTHD and  
18 CPSD-AN-00008-MTHD for lead or equivalent methods as may be allowed under Proposition 65.  
19 These reformulation standards shall only apply to materials that are accessible and not to those  
20 materials that are not accessible through reasonably foreseeable use and abuse.

21          **2.3 Reformulation Commitment**

22          Big Lots hereby commits that one hundred percent (100%) of the Products that it offers for  
23 sale in California after the applicable effective date shall qualify as Reformulated Products.

24          **3. MONETARY PAYMENTS**

25          **3.1 Payments Pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b)**

26          Pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b), the total civil penalty assessed shall be  
27 \$86,450. Civil penalties are to be apportioned in accordance with California Health & Safety Code  
28

1 §25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to the State of California's Office of Environmental  
2 Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty remitted to Anthony  
3 Held as provided by California Health & Safety Code §25249.12(d). Big Lots has already issued  
4 two separate checks, totaling \$80,000, toward the penalty payment: (1) one check made payable to  
5 "Hirst & Chanler LLP in Trust For OEHHA" in the amount of \$60,000; and (2) a second check to  
6 "Hirst & Chanler LLP in Trust for Anthony Held" in the amount of \$20,000.

7 For the outstanding portion of the penalty amount, Big Lots shall issue two additional  
8 checks: (1) a check payable to "Chanler Law Group in Trust for OEHHA" in the amount of  
9 \$4,837.50; and (2) a separate check to "Chanler Law Group in Trust for Anthony Held" in the  
10 amount of \$1,612.50. Two separate 1099s shall be issued for the above payments: (a) OEHHA,  
11 P.O. Box 4010, Sacramento, CA 95814 (EIN: 68-0284486); and (b) Anthony Held, whose  
12 information shall be provided confidentially to counsel for Big Lots five calendar days before the  
13 payment is due. The \$4,837.50 and \$1,612.50 payments shall be delivered to Dr. Held's counsel on  
14 or before February 1, 2010, at the following address:

15 CHANLER LAW GROUP  
16 Attn: Proposition 65 Controller  
17 2560 Ninth Street  
18 Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
19 Berkeley, CA 94710

#### 20 4. REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS

##### 21 4.1 Attorney Fees and Costs

22 The parties acknowledge that Dr. Held and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute  
23 without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving  
24 this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. Big Lots  
25 then expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue shortly after the other settlement terms had  
26 been finalized. The parties then attempted to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due to  
27 Dr. Held and his counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine  
28 codified at California Code of Civil Procedure (CCP) §1021.5, for all work performed through the  
mutual execution of this agreement. Big Lots shall reimburse Dr. Held and his counsel a total of

1 \$162,000 for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Big Lots'  
2 attention, and litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest, as well as for the post-  
3 execution activities described in paragraph 13 below. Big Lots has already issued a check in the  
4 amount of \$133,500 payable to "Hirst & Chanler LLP." Big Lots shall issue a second check in the  
5 amount of \$28,500 payable to "Chanler Law Group." Big Lots shall issue separate 1099s for fees  
6 and costs payment (Hirst & Chanler LLP: EIN 20-3929984; Chanler Law Group: EIN 94-3171522 ).

7 The \$28,500 payment shall be delivered to Dr. Held's counsel on or before February 1, 2010, at the  
8 following address:

9 CHANLER LAW GROUP  
10 Attn: Proposition 65 Controller  
11 2560 Ninth Street  
12 Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
13 Berkeley, CA 94710

14 **5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

15 **5.1 Dr. Held's Release of Big Lots**

16 In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the  
17 payments to be made pursuant to Sections 3 and 4, Dr. Held on behalf of himself, his past and  
18 current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, and in the interest of the  
19 general public, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form  
20 of legal action and releases all claims, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of  
21 action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties,  
22 losses, or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees)  
23 of any nature whatsoever, whether known or unknown, fixed or contingent (collectively "claims"),  
24 against Big Lots and each of its downstream wholesalers, licensors, licensees, auctioneers, retailers,  
25 franchisees, dealers, customers, owners, purchasers, users, parent companies, corporate affiliates,  
26 subsidiaries, and their respective officers, directors, attorneys, representatives, shareholders, agents,  
27 and employees, and sister and parent entities (collectively "Defendant Releasees"). This release is  
28 limited to those claims that arise under Proposition 65 that were or could have been asserted in the  
Complaint against Defendant (including any claims that could be asserted in connection with any of

1 the Products covered by this consent judgment) or Defendant Releasees, based on failure to warn  
2 about alleged exposures to the listed chemicals contained in the Products sold by Defendant. Dr.  
3 Held further hereby personally releases Defendant Releasees from any other claims he personally  
4 could have brought against Defendant or Defendant Releasees under any other California laws or  
5 regulations relating to the regulation of phthalates or lead content with respect to the Products.

6 The parties further understand and agree that this release shall not extend upstream to any  
7 entities that manufactured the Products or any component parts thereof, or any distributors or  
8 suppliers who sold the Products or any component parts thereof to Big Lots.

9 **5.2 Big Lots' Release of Dr. Held**

10 Big Lots waives any and all claims against Dr. Held, his attorneys, and other representatives  
11 for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by  
12 Dr. Held and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or  
13 otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against them in this matter, and/or with respect to  
14 the Products.

15 **6. COURT APPROVAL**

16 This consent judgment shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and  
17 entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by all parties, in which event  
18 any monies that have been provided to Plaintiff, or his counsel pursuant to Section 3 and/or Section  
19 4 above, shall be refunded within fifteen days after receiving written notice from Big Lots that the  
20 one-year period has expired.

21 **7. SEVERABILITY**

22 If, subsequent to the execution of this consent judgment, any of the provisions of this  
23 consent judgment are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions  
24 remaining shall not be adversely affected.

25 **8. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

26 This consent judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the  
27 parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions,  
28

1 negotiations, commitments, and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or  
2 otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any party  
3 hereto. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed  
4 to exist or to bind any of the parties.

5 **9. GOVERNING LAW**

6 The terms of this consent judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California  
7 and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise  
8 rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then Big Lots shall have no  
9 further obligations pursuant to this consent judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the  
10 Products are so affected.

11 **10. NOTICES**

12 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to  
13 this consent judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class,  
14 (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any party by the  
15 other party at the following addresses:

16 To Big Lots:

17 William H. Macbeth III  
18 Senior Counsel  
19 Big Lots!  
300 Phillipi Road  
Columbus, OH 43228

20 Michael E. Delehunt, Esq.  
21 FOLEY & LARDNER LLP  
One Maritime Plaza, Suite 600  
22 San Francisco, CA 94111

23 To Dr. Held:

24 Proposition 65 Coordinator  
25 CHANLER LAW GROUP  
2560 Ninth Street  
26 Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
Berkeley, CA 94710-2565

1 Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to  
2 which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

3 **11. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

4 This consent judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of which  
5 shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same  
6 document.

7 **12. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(f)**

8 Dr. Held agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California  
9 Health & Safety Code §25249.7(f).

10 **13. ADDITIONAL POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES**

11 The parties acknowledge that, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code §25249.7, a  
12 noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of this consent judgment. Accordingly,  
13 Plaintiff agrees to file a motion to approve the settlement. Defendant agrees to support the motion  
14 to approve this consent judgment in full and shall take all reasonable measures to ensure that it is  
15 entered without delay and support any defense to an appeal by a third party after court approval.  
16 The support referenced in this paragraph shall be limited to Defendant's entry into a joinder in the  
17 motion to approve the settlement and a joinder in any brief or briefs filed by Plaintiff in defense of  
18 an appeal, as well as refraining from making oral or written comments to the Court or the Attorney  
19 General that are inconsistent with this Consent Judgment.

20 **14. MODIFICATION**

21 This consent judgment may be modified only: (1) by written agreement of the parties and  
22 upon entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court thereon; or (2) upon a successful motion of  
23 any party and entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court. The Attorney General shall be  
24 served with notice of any proposed modification to this consent judgment at least fifteen days in  
25 advance of its consideration by the Court.

1 **15. AUTHORIZATION**

2 The undersigned are authorized to execute this consent judgment on behalf of their  
3 respective parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this  
4 consent judgment.

5 **AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

6 **APPROVED**  
7 *By Tony Held at 5:30 pm, Jan 12, 2010*  
Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: 1-8-10

8  
9 By: *Anthony E. Held*  
10 Plaintiff, ANTHONY E. HELD, Ph.D., P.E.

By: *Michael A. Schlarb*  
Defendant, BIG LOTS STORES, INC.

11 **APPROVED AS TO FORM:**

**APPROVED AS TO FORM:**

12 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

13 CHANLER LAW GROUP

FOLEY & LARDNER LLP

14  
15 By: \_\_\_\_\_  
16 David Lavine  
17 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
ANTHONY E. HELD, Ph.D., P.E.

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
Michael Delehunt  
Attorneys for Defendant  
BIG LOTS STORES, INC.

18  
19 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

20 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

1 **15. AUTHORIZATION**

2 The undersigned are authorized to execute this consent judgment on behalf of their  
3 respective parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this  
4 consent judgment.

5 **AGREED TO:**

6 **AGREED TO:**

7 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

8 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

9 By: \_\_\_\_\_  
10 Plaintiff, ANTHONY E. HELD, Ph.D., P.E.

9 By: \_\_\_\_\_  
10 Defendant, BIG LOTS STORES, INC.

11 **APPROVED AS TO FORM:**

11 **APPROVED AS TO FORM:**

12 Date: January 13, 2010

12 Date: January 13, 2010

13 CHANLER LAW GROUP

13 FOLEY & LARDNER LLP

14 By:   
15 David Lavine  
16 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
17 ANTHONY E. HELD, Ph.D., P.E.

14 By:   
15 Michael Delehunt  
16 Attorneys for Defendant  
17 BIG LOTS STORES, INC.

18  
19 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

20 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

20 \_\_\_\_\_  
21 JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT