| 1 | WILLIAM VERICK, SBN 140972 FREDRIC EVENSON, SBN 198059 KLAMATH ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CENT | ENDORSED FILED San Francisco County Superior Court |
|----|---|--|
| 2 | 424 First Street | FEB 2 8 2011 |
| 3 | Eureka, CA 95501 Telephone: (707) 268-8900 Facsimile: (707) 268-8901 | CLERK OF THE COURT |
| 4 | E-mail: (707) 268-8901 E-mail: wverick@igc.org | BY: Deputy Clerk |
| 5 | DAVID WILLIAMS, SBN 144479 | |
| 6 | DAVID WILLIAMS, SBN 144479 BRIAN ACREE, SBN 202505 PUBLIC INTEREST LAWYERS GROUP | |
| 7 | 370 Grand Avenue, Suite 5 Oakland, CA 94610 | |
| 8 | Telephone: (510) 271-0826 Facsimile: (510) 271-0829 | |
| 9 | E-mail: dhwill7@gmail.com | |
| 10 | Attorneys for Plaintiff MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION | |
| 11 | | |
| 12 | SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA | |
| 13 | FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO | |
| 14 | MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL | Case No. CGC-10-504376 |
| 15 | JUSTICE FOUNDATION, | CONSENT JUDGMENT |
| 16 | Plaintiff, | (GREAT NECK SAW MANUFACTURERS, INC.) |
| 17 | v. | , , |
| 18 | FLORIDA PNEUMATIC MANUFACTURING CORP., et al., | |
| 19 | Defendants. | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | 1. INTRODUCTION | |
| 23 | 1.1 On October 5, 2010, the MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE | |
| 24 | FOUNDATION ("Mateel") acting on behalf of itself and the general public, filed a | |
| 25 | Complaint for civil penalties and injunctive relief in San Francisco Superior Court, Case | |
| 26 | No. 504376, against Defendant Great Neck Saw Manufacturers, Inc. ("Great Neck"); The | |
| 27 | Complaint alleges, among other things, that Great Neck violated provisions of the Safe | |
| 20 | | |

Case No. CGC-10-502296 – [PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT

Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5, et seq. ("Proposition 65"). In particular, Mateel alleges that Great Neck knowingly and intentionally exposed persons to brass hose fittings commonly used on pneumatic hoses (collectively "leaded brass fittings") that are made of or that include a component made of leaded brass, without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individuals. Lead and lead compounds are chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

- 1.2 On July 22, 2010, Mateel sent a Notice of Violation letter ("Notice Letter") to Great Neck, the California Attorney General, all California District Attorneys, and all City Attorneys of every California city with populations exceeding 750,000.
- manufactures, distributes, and/or markets leaded brass fittings within the State of California. These products are alleged to contain lead and/or lead compounds. Lead and lead compounds are chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer, and lead is a chemical known to the State of California to cause reproductive toxicity pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.9. Under specified circumstances, products containing lead and/or lead compounds that are sold or distributed in the State of California are subject to the Proposition 65 warning requirement set forth in Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6. Plaintiff Mateel alleges that products that are made from leaded brass, or that have leaded brass components, are manufactured, distributed, sold and/or marketed by Great Neck for use in California and require a warning under Proposition 65.
- 1.4 In the Complaint, Mateel alleges that Great Neck violated Cal. Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by knowingly and intentionally exposing persons to products that are made of brass, or include a component made of brass, that contain lead and/or lead compounds, without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such

individuals. Lead and lead compounds are chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

- 1.5 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Covered Products" shall be defined as: (a) brass products, as set forth in the Notice Letter, that are made from leaded brass or that have leaded brass components and that are manufactured, distributed, marketed and/or sold by Great Neck.
- 1.6 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Great Neck as to the acts alleged in the Complaints, that venue is proper in the County of San Francisco and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full settlement and resolution of the allegations contained in the Complaint and of all claims that were or could have been raised by any person or entity based in whole or in part, directly or indirectly, on the facts alleged therein or arising therefrom or related thereto.
- 1.7 This Consent Judgment resolves claims that are denied and disputed. The parties enter into this Consent Judgment pursuant to a full and final settlement of any and all claims between the parties for the purpose of avoiding prolonged litigation. This Consent Judgment shall not constitute an admission with respect to any material allegation of the Complaints, each and every allegation of which Great Neck denies, nor may this Consent Judgment or compliance with it be used as evidence of any wrongdoing, misconduct, culpability or liability on the part of Great Neck.

2. SETTLEMENT PAYMENTS

- 2.1 In settlement of all of the claims referred to in this Consent Judgment,
 Great Neck shall collectively pay an aggregate of \$30,000 (thirty_thousand dollars) in total
 monetary relief.
- 2.2 Of the foregoing \$30,000 amount, a total of \$10,000 (ten thousand dollars) shall collectively be paid by the Great Neck in lieu of, and as an offset for, any civil

penalty. The \$10,000 amount shall be made payable to Californians for Alternatives to Toxics.

- total amount of \$20,000 (twenty thousand dollars) shall be paid by the Great Neck to the Klamath Environmental Law Center ("KELC") as reimbursement for attorneys fees and costs incurred by KELC on behalf of Plaintiff in investigating and prosecuting this matter and in negotiating this Consent Judgment on behalf of itself and in the public interest. The payments described in Paragraphs 2.2 and 2.3 above shall be delivered at least 5 days prior to any hearing on a motion to approve this settlement, to William Verick, 424 First Street, Eureka, CA 95501. If payment has not been received as provided in this paragraph, Plaintiff may withdraw any motion to approve and enter the agreement and the agreement shall become null and void. If this Consent Judgment has not been approved and entered by the Court within 120 days of the execution of the agreement by the parties, the payments described above shall be promptly returned to Great Neck, and the terms of this agreement shall be null and void.
- 2.4 MEJF and KELC represent and warrant that Californians for Alternatives to Toxics is a tax exempt, section 501(c)(3) non-profit organization and that funds distributed to these organizations pursuant to this Consent Judgment may only be spent to reduce harm from toxic chemicals, or to increase consumer, worker and community awareness of health hazards posed by lead and other toxic chemicals.
- 2.5 Except as specifically provided in this Consent Judgment, each side shall bear its own costs and attorney's fees.

3. ENTRY OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

3.1 The parties hereby request that the Court promptly enter this Consent Judgment. Upon entry of the Consent Judgment, Great Neck and Mateel waive their respective rights to a hearing or trial on the allegations of the Complaints.

25

26

27

28

4. MATTERS COVERED BY THIS CONSENT JUDGMENT

- 4.1 As to lead and lead compound exposures alleged to be caused by Covered Products, this Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between Great Neck and Mateel, acting on behalf of itself and the public interest pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(d), of all matters that are or that could have been alleged in the Complaints, including any violation of Proposition 65, or the regulations promulgated thereunder, to the fullest extent that any violation could have been asserted by Mateel against the Great Neck based upon, arising out of, or relating to Great Neck' compliance with Proposition 65, or regulations promulgated thereunder, whether based on actions committed by Great Neck, or by any other entity within the chain of manufacture, distribution and sale of the Covered Products. As to alleged lead and lead compound exposures from Covered Products, compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment resolves any issue, now and in the future, concerning compliance by Great Neck and their parents, subsidiaries or affiliates, divisions, predecessors, successors, assigns, officers, directors, shareholders, attorneys, representatives, agents, employees, and all manufacturers, customers, distributors, wholesalers, retailers or any other person in the course of doing business involving the Covered Products, and the successors and assigns of any of these who may manufacture, use, maintain, distribute, market or sell Covered Products, with the current requirements and standards of Proposition 65. This Consent Judgment also is a full, final, and binding resolution between Plaintiff and Great Neck as to any other claims that could have been asserted against Great Neck or its affiliates, parents or subsidiaries, divisions, successors, officers, directors, shareholders, attorneys, representatives, agents, assigns, distributors, manufacturers, retailers, or customers for failure to disclose the presence of lead (or lead compounds) in or associated with use of the Covered Products.
 - 4.2 As to alleged lead and lead compound exposures associated with Covered

Products, Mateel, acting on behalf of itself, and its agents, attorneys, representatives, successors and assigns, waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly, or indirectly, any form of legal action, and releases all claims as between Mateel and Great Neck, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, agreements, promises, royalties, accountings, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorney's fees) of any nature whatsoever, whether known or unknown, fixed or contingent (collectively "claims"), against Great Neck and its parents, subsidiaries or affiliates, predecessors, officers, directors, shareholders, attorneys, representatives, agents, employees, and all customers, manufacturers, distributors, wholesalers, retailers, or any other person in the course of doing business involving the Covered Products, and the successors and assigns of any of them, who may manufacture, use, maintain, distribute or sell the Covered Products or components found in the Covered Products, including, but not limited to, any claims regarding exposure to, and/or failure to warn with respect to, the Covered Products. In furtherance of the foregoing, Mateel on its own behalf hereby waives any and all rights and benefits which it now has, or in the future may have respecting the Covered Products, conferred upon it with respect to claims involving Covered Products by virtue of the provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

"A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR."

Mateel understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code Section 1542 is that even if Mateel suffers future damages arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, the Covered Products, including but not limited to any exposure to, or failure to warn

28

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

with respect to exposure to lead or lead compounds from, the Covered Products, Mateel will not be able to make any claim for those damages against Great Neck, its parents, subsidiaries or affiliates, predecessors, officers, directors, shareholders, representatives, attorneys, agents, employees, and all customers, manufacturers, distributors, wholesalers, retailers or any other person in the course of doing business involving the Covered Products, and the successors and assigns of any of them, who may manufacture, use, maintain, distribute or sell the Covered Products. Furthermore, Mateel acknowledges that it intends these consequences for any such claims and any other claims which may exist as of the date of this release but which Mateel does not know exist, and which, if known, would materially affect its decision to enter into this Consent Judgment, regardless of whether its lack of knowledge is the result of ignorance, oversight, error, negligence, or any other cause.

5. ENFORCEMENT OF JUDGMENT

5.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be enforced exclusively by the parties hereto. The parties may, by noticed motion or order to show cause before the Superior Court of San Francisco County, giving the notice required by law, enforce the terms and conditions contained herein. The parties hereto agree that prior to any such enforcement action, they will notify each other of any perceived violation of this Consent Judgment. The parties further agree to take no enforcement action for 30 days after such notice is given, in order to allow the parties to meet and confer in good faith in an effort to resolve the alleged violation.

6. MODIFICATION OF JUDGMENT

6.1 Except as provided for in Paragraph 7.3(c), this Consent Judgment may be modified only upon written agreement of the parties and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon, or upon motion of any party as provided by law and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court.

7. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF - CLEAR AND REASONABLE WARNING

- Covered Products' brass components shall be deemed to comply with current requirements of Proposition 65 for lead and be exempt from any Proposition 65 warning requirements for lead if the brass that is part of the Covered Products meets the following criteria: (a) the brass alloy from which the brass components are made shall have no intentionally added lead and a lead content by weight of no more than 0.03% (300 parts per million, or "300 ppm"). Great Neck may comply with the above requirements by relying on information obtained from its suppliers regarding the content of the brass alloy from which the brass products or components are made, provided such reliance is in good faith. Obtaining test results showing that the lead content is no more than 0.03%, using a method of sufficient sensitivity to establish a limit of quantification (as distinguished from detection) of less than 300 ppm shall be deemed to establish good faith reliance.
- 7.2 Covered Products that do not meet the warning exemption standard set forth in Section 7.1 of the Consent Judgment shall be accompanied by a warning as described in paragraph 7.3 below. The warning requirements set forth in paragraph 7.3 shall apply only to products Great Neck manufactures, distributes, markets, sells or ships for distribution after 120 days after the Effective Date for sale or use inside the State of California.
 - 7.3 Great Neck shall provide Proposition 65 warnings as follows:
 - (a) Great Neck shall provide either of the following warning statements: WARNING: This product contains lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. Do not place your hands in your mouth after handling the product. Wash your hands after touching this product.

or

WARNING: This product contains one or more chemicals, including lead, known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other

reproductive harm. Wash hands after handling.

The word "WARNING" shall be in bold and capitalized. The words "Wash hands after handling" shall be in bold and italicized.

Great Neck shall provide such warning with the unit package of the Covered Products. Such warning shall be prominently affixed to or printed on each Covered Product's label or package. The warning shall be at least the same size as the largest of any other safety warnings, if any, on the product container. If printed on the label itself, the warning shall be contained in the same section that states other safety warnings, if any, concerning the use of the product.

- (b) The requirements for product labeling, set forth in subparagraph (a) above are imposed pursuant to the terms of this Consent Judgment. The parties recognize that product labeling is not the exclusive method of providing a warning under Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations.
- (c) If Proposition 65 warnings for lead or lead compounds should no longer be required, Great Neck shall have no further warning obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment.
- (d) If following 120 days after the Effective Date, Great Neck ships
 Covered Products to a retailer or distributor outside of California that
 neither provide the warnings specified in this paragraph nor meets the
 Reformulation Standard specified in paragraph 7.1 of this Consent Judgment
 ("Non-Conforming Covered Products"), and if the retailer or distributor then
 offers those Non-Conforming Covered Products for sale in California, then
 as to those Non-Conforming Covered Products, that retailer or distributor,
 and their customers, are not released pursuant to Sections 4.1 and 4.2 above.
- (e) Except as provided in paragraph 4.2 hereof, nothing in this Consent Judgment shall create a limitation on a Proposition 65 enforcement action

based on future conduct if such future conduct is not in compliance with the injunctive terms of this Consent Judgment.

8. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE

Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party he or she represents to enter into this Consent Judgment and to execute it on behalf of the party represented and legally to bind that party.

9. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement the Consent Judgment.

10. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any party hereto. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the parties.

11. GOVERNING LAW

The validity, construction and performance of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California, without reference to any conflicts of law provisions of California law.

╢..

12. NOTICES

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight currier on any party by the other party at the following addresses:

To Mateel:

William Verick, Esq. Klamath Environmental Law Center 424 First Street Eureka, CA 95501

To Great Neck:

With a copy to:

Robin Stafford, Esq. Morrison & Foerster LLP 425 Market Street, 32nd Floor San Francisco, California 94105

13. COURT APPROVAL If this Consent Judgment is not approved by the Court, it shall be of no force or effect, and cannot be used in any proceeding for any purpose. IT IS SO STIPULATED: DATED: ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE William Verick CEO Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation, Klamath Environmental Law Center DATED: GREAT NECK SAW MANUFACTURĘRS, INC Its: IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED: **DATEDEEB 2 8 2011** LINEETTA M. GIORGI JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT