

1 California, the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000, and
2 to Defendant regarding the presence of lead in jewelry manufactured, distributed or sold by
3 Defendant.

4 1.3 On September 15, 2011, CEH amended the operative complaint to name Defendant
5 in the Action.

6 1.4 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, CEH and Defendant (the "Parties")
7 stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the
8 Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that
9 venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this
10 Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised
11 in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein with respect to Covered Products
12 manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Defendant.

13 1.5 CEH and Defendant enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement
14 of all claims that were raised in the Complaint, or which could have been raised in the Complaint,
15 arising out of the facts or conduct related to Defendant alleged therein. By execution of this
16 Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any facts or
17 conclusions of law including, but not limited to, any facts or conclusions of law suggesting or
18 demonstrating any violations of Proposition 65 or any other statutory, common law or equitable
19 requirements relating to lead in jewelry. Nothing in this Consent Judgment is or shall be
20 construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of
21 law, nor shall compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission
22 by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. Defendant denies
23 the material, factual and legal allegations in CEH's Complaint and expressly denies any wrong
24 doing whatsoever. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive or impair any right,
25 remedy, argument or defense the Parties may have in this or any other pending or future legal
26 proceedings. This Consent Judgment is the product of negotiation and compromise and is
27 accepted by the Parties solely for purposes of settling, compromising, and resolving issues
28 disputed in this action.

1 **2. DEFINITIONS**

2 2.1 The term "Covered Product" means (a) the following ornaments worn by a person:
3 an anklet, arm cuff, bracelet, charm, brooch, chain, crown, cuff link, decorated hair accessories,
4 earring, necklace, pin, ring and body piercing jewelry; or (b) any bead, chain, link, pendant, or
5 other component of such an ornament.

6 2.2 The term "Effective Date" means the date of entry of this Consent Judgment.

7 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

8 3.1 **Reformulation of Covered Products.** After the Effective Date, Defendant shall
9 not manufacture, ship, sell or offer for sale in California or anywhere else any Covered Product
10 that contains:

11 3.1.1 Any component not covered under Section 3.1.2, or that is made of any
12 material not covered under Section 3.1.2, that is more than 0.02 percent (200 parts per million
13 ("ppm")) Lead by weight; or

14 3.1.2 Any Paint or Surface Coating that is more than 0.009 percent Lead by
15 weight (90 ppm). For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Paint or Surface Coating" shall carry
16 the same meaning as "Paint or other similar surface coating" under 16 C.F.R. §1303.2(b)(1)
17 ("Paint and other similar surface-coating materials means a fluid, semi-fluid, or other material,
18 with or without a suspension of finely divided coloring matter, which changes to a solid film when
19 a thin layer is applied to a metal, wood, stone, paper, leather, cloth, plastic, or other surface. This
20 term does not include printing inks or those materials which actually become a part of the
21 substrate, such as the pigment in a plastic article, or those materials which are actually bonded to
22 the substrate, such as by electroplating or ceramic glazing.").

23 3.2 **Market Withdrawal of Covered Products.** On or before the Effective Date,
24 Defendant shall cease shipping the Hot Topic Necklace with Black Bead Chain and Black Jewel
25 Heart and Lock, SKU No. 001522230005, the Wet Seal Necklace with Heart & Arrow Charms,
26 SKU No. 435932800006, and the 5-7-9 Necklace with Heart, Key & Wishbone Charms, SKU No.
27 0-00143-36473-1 as identified in CEH's pre-suit Notices of Violation to Defendant (the "Recall
28 Covered Products"), to stores and/or customers in California, and Defendant shall withdraw the

1 Recall Covered Products from the market in California, and, at a minimum, send instructions to
2 any of its stores and/or customers that offer the Recall Covered Products for sale in California to
3 cease offering such Recall Covered Products for sale and to either return all Recall Covered
4 Products to Defendant for destruction, or to directly destroy the Recall Covered Products. Any
5 destruction of the Recall Covered Products shall be in compliance with all applicable laws.
6 Defendant shall keep and make available to CEH for inspection and copying records and
7 correspondence regarding the market withdrawal and destruction of the Recall Covered Products.
8 If there is a dispute over the corrective action, the Parties shall meet and confer before seeking any
9 remedy in court

10 **4. ENFORCEMENT**

11 **4.1 Enforcement Procedures.** Prior to bringing any motion or order to show cause to
12 enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, a Party seeking to enforce shall provide the violating
13 party forty-five (45) days advanced written notice of the alleged violation. The Parties shall meet
14 and confer during such forty-five (45) day period in an effort to try to reach agreement on an
15 appropriate cure for the alleged violation. If, after such forty-five (45) day period, the Parties are
16 unable to agree on an appropriate cure, the Party seeking to enforce may, by motion or order to
17 show cause before the Superior Court of Alameda, seek to enforce the terms and conditions
18 contained in this Consent Judgment. The procedure outlined in this section shall be Plaintiff's
19 exclusive means of enforcement as to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 by Defendant
20 relating to lead in Covered Products.

21 **5. PAYMENTS**

22 **5.1 Payments From Defendant.** Within five (5) days of the entry of this Consent
23 Judgment, Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$40,000 as a settlement payment.

24 **5.2 Allocation of Payments.** The total settlement amount for Defendant shall be paid
25 in three separate checks delivered to the offices of the Lexington Law Group (Attn: Howard
26 Hirsch), 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, California 94117 and made payable and allocated
27 as follows:
28

1 5.2.1 Defendant shall pay the sum of \$5,250 as a penalty pursuant to Health &
2 Safety Code §25249.7(b), such money to be apportioned by CEH in accordance with Health &
3 Safety Code §25249.12. The penalty check shall be made payable to the Center For
4 Environmental Health.

5 5.2.2 Defendant shall pay the sum of \$7,900 as payment to CEH in lieu of
6 penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, Title
7 11, §3202(b). CEH will use such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people from
8 exposures to toxic chemicals, including heavy metals. CEH may also use a portion of such funds
9 to monitor compliance with the reformulation requirements of this and other similar Consent
10 Judgments and to purchase and test Covered Products to confirm compliance with such
11 reformulation requirements. In addition, as part of its Community Environmental Action and
12 Justice Fund, CEH will use four percent of such funds to award grants to grassroots environmental
13 justice groups working to educate and protect people from exposures to toxic chemicals. The
14 method of selection of such groups can be found at the CEH web site at [www.ceh.org/what-we-](http://www.ceh.org/what-we-do/supporting-communities/the-justice-fund)
15 [do/supporting-communities/the-justice-fund](http://www.ceh.org/what-we-do/supporting-communities/the-justice-fund). The payment in lieu of penalty check shall be made
16 payable to the Center For Environmental Health.

17 5.2.3 Defendant shall pay the sum of \$26,850 as reimbursement of reasonable
18 attorneys' fees and costs. The attorneys fees and cost reimbursement check shall be made payable
19 to the Lexington Law Group.

20 **6. MODIFICATION AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION**

21 6.1 **Modification.** This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to time by
22 express written agreement of the Parties, with the approval of the Court, or by an order of this
23 Court upon motion and in accordance with law.

24 6.2 **Notice; Meet and Confer.** Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment
25 shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with all affected Parties prior to filing a motion to
26 modify the Consent Judgment.

27 **7. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE**

28 7.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between CEH and

1 Defendant and Defendant's parents, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners,
2 sister companies and their successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities other
3 than those listed on Exhibit A of this Consent Judgment to whom they distribute or sell Covered
4 Products including, but not limited to, distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees,
5 cooperative members, and licensees ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of any violation of
6 Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that have been or could have been
7 asserted in the public interest against Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream
8 Defendant Releasees, regarding the failure to warn about exposure to lead arising in connection
9 with Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendant prior to the Effective Date.

10 7.2 CEH, for itself and acting on behalf of the public interest pursuant to Health &
11 Safety Code §25249.7(d), releases, waives, and forever discharges any and all claims against
12 Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Defendant Releasees arising from any violation
13 of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that have been or could have been
14 asserted in the public interest regarding the failure to warn about exposure to lead arising in
15 connection with Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant prior to the
16 Effective Date.

17 7.3 Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Defendant and the
18 Defendant Releasees shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Defendant, the Defendant
19 Releasees and their Downstream Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged failure to warn
20 about lead in Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant after the Effective
21 Date.

22 8. PROVISION OF NOTICE

23 8.1 When any Party is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the
24 notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail as follows:

25 8.1.1 **Notices to Defendant.** The person for Defendant to receive Notices
26 pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be:
27
28

William W. Funderburk, Jr.
Castellon & Funderburk LLP
811 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1025
Los Angeles, CA 90017
wfunderburk@candffirm.com

8.1.2 **Notices to Plaintiff.** The person for CEH to receive Notices pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be:

Howard Hirsch
Lexington Law Group
503 Divisadero Street
San Francisco, CA 94117
hhirsch@lexlawgroup.com

8.2 Any Party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by sending the other Party notice by first class and electronic mail.

9. COURT APPROVAL

9.1 This Consent Judgment shall become effective on the Effective Date, provided however, that CEH shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and Defendant shall support approval of such Motion.

9.2 If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force or effect and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any purpose.

10. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION

10.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California.

11. ATTORNEYS' FEES

11.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing Party's reasonable attorneys' fees and costs unless the unsuccessful Party has acted with substantial justification. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term substantial justification shall carry the same meaning as used in the Civil Discovery Act of 1986, Code of Civil Procedure §§2016.010, *et seq.*

11.2 Notwithstanding Section 11.1, a Party who prevails in a contested enforcement action brought pursuant to Section 4 may seek an award of attorneys' fees pursuant to Code of

1 Civil Procedure §1021.5 against a Party that acted with substantial justification. The Party
2 seeking such an award shall bear the burden of meeting all of the elements of §1021.5, and this
3 provision shall not be construed as altering any procedural or substantive requirements for
4 obtaining such an award.

5 11.3 Nothing in this Section 11 shall preclude a party from seeking an award of
6 sanctions pursuant to law.

7 **12. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

8 12.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding
9 of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions,
10 negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein
11 and therein. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties
12 except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied,
13 other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party
14 hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise,
15 shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically
16 contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the
17 Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein. No supplementation,
18 modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in
19 writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent
20 Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof
21 whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

22 **13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

23 13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the
24 Consent Judgment.

25 **14. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT**

26 14.1 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized
27 by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and
28 execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally to bind that Party.


1
2 **15. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS**

3 15.1 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim
4 against an entity that is not Defendant on terms that are different than those contained in this
5 Consent Judgment.

6 **16. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS**

7 16.1 The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by
8 means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.

9 **IT IS SO STIPULATED:**

<p>10 Dated: <u>Feb 21</u>, 2012</p> <p>11</p> <p>12</p> <p>13</p> <p>14</p> <p>15</p> <p>16</p> <p>17</p> <p>18</p> <p>19</p>	<p>CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH</p> <p></p> <hr/> <p><u>Charlotte Pizman</u></p> <p>Printed Name</p> <hr/> <p><u>Associate Director</u></p> <p>Title</p>
--	--

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 Dated: March 14, 2012

2 INTERNATIONAL INSPIRATIONS, LTD.
3 DBA LUX ACCESSORIES, LTD.


4 
5

6 Saul S. Reiter
7 Printed Name

8 President
9 Title
10

11
12
13 IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED,
AND DECREED

14 Dated: 6-6-12

15 
16 Judge of the Superior Court of the State of California
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A
(LIST OF ENTITIES NOT SUBJECT
TO DOWNSTREAM DEFENDANT RELEASE)

1. Albertson's LLC; Albertson's, Inc.; New Albertson's, Inc.
2. AZ3, Inc.
3. Banana Republic, LLC
4. Barnes & Noble, Inc.
5. Big A Drug Stores, Inc.
6. Candela Sales Company, Inc.
7. Forum Novelties, Inc.
8. Georgiou Studio, Inc.
9. I Love Bracelets, Inc.
10. Ivorette-Texas, Inc. dba Upstart Crow Trading Company
11. Jacadi USA, Inc.
12. Legoland California LLC
13. Marin Beauty Company
14. Rite Aid Corporation
15. Rubie's Costume Company, Inc.
16. Safeway, Inc.
17. Scünci International, Inc.
18. Sea World, Inc.
19. Shoe Pavilion Corporation; Shoe Pavilion, Inc.
20. Six Flags Theme Parks, Inc.