

State of California - Department of Justice - Attorney General's Office - Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting

Attention: Prop 65 Coordinator, 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000, Oakland, CA 94612

FORM JUS 1502
(03-01)

PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT FILING - Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(e) and (f)

REPORT OF ENTRY OF JUDGMENT

Please print or type required information

Original Filing Supplemental Filing Corrected Filing

PARTIES TO THE ACTION	PLAINTIFF(S) Shefa LMV LLC			
	DEFENDANT(S) INVOLVED IN JUDGMENT Belwith Management, Inc. & Belwith Products LLC			
CASE INFO	COURT DOCKET NUMBER BC528514		COURT NAME Los Angeles Superior Court	
	SHORT CASE NAME Shefa LMV LLC v. Belwith Management, Inc.			
REPORT INFO	INJUNCTIVE RELIEF Warning Label			
	PAYMENT: CIVIL PENALTY \$4,000.00	PAYMENT: ATTORNEYS FEES \$33,500.00	PAYMENT: OTHER 0	For Internal Use Only
	DATE SUBMITTED TO COURT 12 / 21 / 2016	IS JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO SETTLEMENT? <input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	IF YES, DATE SETTLEMENT WAS REPORTED TO ATTORNEY GENERAL 12 / 21 / 2016	
	COPY OF JUDGMENT MUST BE ATTACHED			
NAME OF CONTACT Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq.				
FILER INFO	ORGANIZATION Law Office of Daniel Greenbaum		TELEPHONE NUMBER (818) 809-2199	
	ADDRESS 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave., Suite 320		FAX NUMBER (424) 243-7689	
	CITY Van Nuys	STATE ZIP CA 91406	E-MAIL ADDRESS dgreenbaum@greenbaumlawfirm.com	

FILING INSTRUCTIONS: This form can be completed online and printed. If electronic filing is not available, mail the completed form with a copy of the judgment to the attention of the Prop 65 Coordinator at the address shown above. If you need additional space to complete this form please use an attachment.

1 LAW OFFICE OF DANIEL N. GREENBAUM
 2 Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq. (SBN 268104)
 3 The Hathaway Building
 4 7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320
 5 Van Nuys, CA 91406
 Telephone: (818) 809-2199
 6 Facsimile: (424) 243-7689
 Email: dgreenbaum@greenbaumlawfirm.com

7 Attorney for Plaintiff SHEFA LMV, LLC

8 ROPERS, MAJESKI, KOHN & BENTLEY
 9 Thomas H. Clarke, Jr. (SBN 47592)
 10 1001 Marshall Street, Suite 500
 Redwood City, CA 94063-2052
 Telephone: (650) 364-8200
 Facsimile: (650) 780-1701
 Email: tclarke@rmkb.com

11 Attorneys for Defendants BELWITH MANAGEMENT, INC.
 12 & BELWITH PRODUCTS, LLC

FILED
 Superior Court of California
 County of Los Angeles
FEB 07 2017
 Sherri B. Carter, Executive Officer/Clerk
 By S. Carter
 Steve Temblador Deputy

13 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
 14 FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

16 SHEFA LMV, LLC
 17 Plaintiff,
 18 vs.
 19 BELWITH MANAGEMENT, INC.;
 20 BELWITH PRODUCTS, LLC; and DOES 1
 THROUGH 25, Inclusive
 21 Defendants.

CASE NO. BC528514
The Honorable Ernest M. Hiroshige
**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED
 SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT
 AND Judgment**
 Action filed: November 21, 2013

02/16/2017

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 1.1 This Stipulated Settlement Agreement pursuant To Section 664.6 C.C.P. (the
3 "Stipulated Settlement Agreement") is entered into by and between Shefa LMV LLC ("Shefa")
4 and Belwith Products LLC and Belwith Management, Inc. (jointly referred to as "Belwith"),
5 with Shefa and Belwith each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively as the
6 "Parties."

7 1.2 The products covered by this Stipulated Settlement Agreement (the "Covered
8 Products") are brass hardware products manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Belwith
9 Products LLC that contain lead and/or lead compounds ("Lead" or "Pb"), including but not
10 limited to the First Watch Flush Bolt, UPC 078555770389.

11 1.3 On or about April 30, 2013, Shefa mailed a 60-Day Notice (the "First Notice") to
12 Orchard Supply Hardware, Belwith International Ltd. ("BIL") and Belwith under Proposition 65
13 (The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code §§
14 25249.5, *et seq.*) to Belwith Products, LLC, the California Attorney General, the District
15 Attorneys of every County in the State of California, and the City Attorneys for every City in the
16 State of California with a population greater than 750,000.

17 1.4 Belwith was not listed as an alleged violator in the First Notice.

18 1.5 Belwith denied and does deny that BIL was related to or part of Belwith.

19 1.6 On November 21, 2013, Shefa filed its complaint naming Belwith; BIL was not
20 named.

21 1.7 Thereafter, on March 5, 2014, Shefa dismissed without prejudice Belwith; the
22 complaint was not dismissed.

23 1.8 On March 6, 2014, Shefa mailed a 60-Day Notice of Violation (the "Second
24 Notice") to Belwith Products, LLC, the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of
25 every County in the State of California, and the City Attorneys for every City in the State of
26 California with a population greater than 750,000.

27
28

02/10/2017

1 1.9 On June 10, 2014, Shefa filed two LACIV 105 Form Amendments substituting
2 Belwith Products LLC and Belwith Management, Inc., for DOE Defendants 1 & 2, respectively.

3 1.10 Shefa alleges that the First Notice and the Second Notice alleged violations of
4 Proposition 65 with respect to the presence of Lead in certain of the Covered Products sold,
5 distributed and/or manufactured by Belwith.

6 1.11 Belwith denies the claims of alleged violations asserted against it in the
7 Complaint and deny that they have any liability under Proposition 65.

8 1.12 Belwith further denies that the normal use of the Covered Products will result in
9 any exposure to lead that would require a warning pursuant to Proposition 65.

10 1.13 For purposes of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement only, the Parties stipulate
11 that: (i) this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the operative
12 Complaint applicable to Belwith and personal jurisdiction over Belwith as to the acts alleged in
13 the Complaint; (ii) venue is proper in the County of Los Angeles; and, (iii) this Court has
14 jurisdiction to approve this Stipulated Settlement Agreement.

15 1.14 Nothing in this Stipulated Settlement Agreement is or shall be construed as an
16 admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor
17 shall compliance with the Stipulated Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an
18 admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law.

19 1.15 Nothing in this Stipulated Settlement Agreement shall prejudice, waive, or impair
20 any right, remedy, argument, or defense the Parties may have in any other legal proceeding.

21 1.16 Further, Belwith denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in
22 the 60-Day Notices and in the operative Complaint, and maintains that all of the products that
23 Belwith has imported, manufactured, distributed, wholesaled, or retailed for sale in California,
24 including the Covered Products, have been and are in compliance with all laws, including but not
25 limited to Proposition 65.

26 1.17 Nothing herein shall be construed as an admission by Belwith of any fact, finding,
27 issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Stipulated Settlement Agreement

28

1 constitute or be construed as an admission by Belwith of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of
2 law, or violation of law.

3 1.18 Except as expressly set forth herein, nothing in this Stipulated Settlement
4 Agreement shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right, remedy, argument, complaint, or defense
5 the Parties may have in any other or future legal proceeding unrelated to this specific
6 proceeding.

7 1.19 This Stipulated Settlement Agreement is the product of negotiation and
8 compromise and is accepted by the Parties for purposes of settling, compromising, and resolving
9 issues disputed in this action.

10 1.20 The term "Effective Date" means the date on which this Stipulated Settlement
11 Agreement is approved and entered by the Court.

12 2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

13 2.1 **Covered Products.** Any Covered Product manufactured after the Effective Date
14 that contains lead (Pb) and that Belwith thereafter sell in California, markets or distributes for
15 sale in California, or offers for sale to a third party for retail sale in California shall provide a
16 warning on the product label as described in § 2.2 and defined in § 2.3.

17 2.2 **Warning Label.** The warning label required per ¶§ 2.1 must be at least the same
18 size as the largest of any other health or safety warnings appearing on the product label, as
19 applicable, of such product. To the extent that any subsequent revisions to Proposition 65 or its
20 implementing regulations require additional or different warning language, Belwith may at its
21 option a) revise the above warning to comply with such new law or regulations before such new
22 regulations will formally go into effect, or b) provide warnings that comply with any subsequent
23 revisions to Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations on all Covered Products
24 manufactured after the date such revisions become effective and which are thereafter shipped or
25 delivered for sale or distribution in California.

26 2.3 **Warning Language.** The Parties agree that labeling stating "WARNING: This
27 product contains a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or
28

1 other reproductive harm” shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to
2 Paragraph 2.1.

3 **2.4 Optional Warning Language.** Prior to September 1, 2018, Belwith may at its
4 option provide any clear and reasonable warning that meets the requirements of Title 27, Div. 4,
5 Chapter 1, Article 6, C.C.R. as effective on September 1, 2018. On and after September 1,
6 2018, Belwith shall meet the requirements for a clear and reasonable warning as set forth in Title
7 27, Div. 4, Chapter 1, Article 6, C.C.R., as effective on September 1, 2018.

8 **3. PAYMENTS**

9 **3.1** Within ten (10) business days following the Effective Date, Belwith shall make a
10 Total Settlement Payment of \$37,500.00 by delivering checks payable to “Shefa LMV, LLC”
11 and “Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum” as set forth below to counsel for Shefa.

12 **3.2** The funds paid by Belwith shall be allocated as follows:

13 **3.2.1 Civil Penalty.** A civil penalty in the amount of \$4,000.00 payable to
14 “Shefa LMV, LLC,” pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), with
15 such money to be apportioned and distributed by Shefa in accordance with
16 Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 as follows: 25% to Shefa and 75% to
17 the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard
18 Assessment (“OEHHA”).

19 **3.2.2 Attorneys' Fees and Costs.** A reimbursement of Shefa's attorney's fees
20 and costs in the amount of \$33,500.00 payable to the “Law Office of
21 Daniel N. Greenbaum.”

22 **3.3** Shefa shall provide and actually deliver to Belwith a W-9 for each payment noted
23 in ¶¶ 3.2.1. & 3.2.2 prior to the Effective Date.

24 **4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED**

25 **4.1 Full and Binding Resolution of Proposition 65 Allegations:** This Stipulated
26 Settlement Agreement is a full, final, and binding resolution between
27 (i) Shefa on behalf of itself and the public interest; and

1 (ii) Belwith and their affiliates, their former affiliates, any person or entity who directly
2 or indirectly owns or controls, is owned or controlled by, or is under common ownership or
3 control with Belwith, and their current and past directors, officers, employees, and attorneys
4 (“Defendant Releasees”), and each entity to whom (or from whom) any of them directly or
5 indirectly distribute, receive for distribution, and/or sell the Covered Products, including but not
6 limited to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members,
7 licensors, and licensees (“Distributor Releasees”), of any violation of Proposition 65 that was or
8 could have been asserted in the Complaint against Belwith, Defendant Releasees, and Distributor
9 Releasees, based on failure to warn about an alleged exposure to Lead from the reasonably
10 foreseeable use of the Covered Products shipped, distributed, or sold by Belwith prior to the
11 Effective Date.

12 4.2 **Individual Release:** Shefa, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents,
13 representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and *not* in its representative capacity,
14 hereby provides a release that shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a
15 bar to all Claims under Proposition 65, Bus. & Prof. Code §§ 17200 *et seq.*, and any other
16 statutory or common law, that are or may be asserted against Belwith, Defendant Releasees, and
17 Distributor Releasees, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of
18 alleged exposures to, and/or failure to warn of alleged exposures to, Lead from the Covered
19 Products shipped, distributed, or sold prior to the Effective Date by Belwith.

20 4.3 **General Release:** It is possible that other Claims not known to the Parties which
21 arise out of the facts alleged in the Notices and/or the Complaint will develop or be discovered.
22 Shefa, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors
23 and/or assigns, and *not* in its representative capacity, acknowledges that this Stipulated
24 Settlement Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such Claims, including all
25 rights of action therefor. Shefa has full knowledge of the contents of Civil Code § 1542. Shefa
26 acknowledges that the Claims released in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 include unknown Claims, and
27

28

1 Shefa nevertheless waives Civil Code § 1542 as to any such unknown Claims. Civil Code §
2 1542 reads as follows:

3 A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH
4 THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS
5 OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE,
6 WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY
7 AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

8 Shefa, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, and
9 successors and/or assignees, and not in its representative capacity, acknowledges and
10 understands the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of Civil Code § 1542.

11 4.4 Compliance with the terms of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement by Belwith
12 shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Belwith, Defendant Releasees, and
13 Distributor Releasees with respect to any alleged failure to warn about Lead in Covered Products
14 manufactured, distributed, or sold by Belwith after the Effective Date.

15 4.5 Nothing in this Section 4 affects Shefa's right to commence or prosecute an action
16 pursuant to Proposition 65 against any person other than Belwith, Defendant Releasees, or
17 Distributor Releasees.

18 **5. ENFORCEMENT**

19 5.1 Shefa may, by motion or application for an order to show cause before the
20 Superior Court of Los Angeles County, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this
21 Stipulated Settlement Agreement.

22 5.2 Prior to bringing any motion or application to enforce the requirements of this
23 Stipulated Settlement Agreement, Shefa shall provide Belwith with a Notice of Violation and
24 proof of purchase and a copy of any test results which purportedly support the Notice of
25 Violation.

26 5.3 The Parties shall then meet and confer regarding the basis for the anticipated
27 motion or application in an attempt to resolve it informally, including providing Belwith with a
28 reasonable opportunity of at least thirty (30) days to cure any alleged violation.

1 5.4 Should such attempts at informal resolution fail, Shefa may file an enforcement
2 motion or application.

3 **6. ATTORNEYS' FEES**

4 6.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this
5 Stipulated Settlement Agreement shall be required to pay the prevailing Party's reasonable
6 attorney's fees and costs.

7 6.2 For purposes of Section 6.1, the term "prevailing Party" refers to the Party that
8 was successful in obtaining relief more favorable to it than the relief that the other Party was
9 amenable to providing during the Parties' good faith attempt to resolve the dispute pursuant to
10 Section 5.

11 6.3 Except as otherwise provided in this Stipulated Settlement Agreement, each Party
12 shall bear its own attorneys' fees and costs.

13 6.4 Nothing in this Section 6 shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of
14 sanctions pursuant to law.

15 **7. NOTICE**

16 7.1 When Shefa is entitled to receive any notice under this Stipulated Settlement
17 Agreement, the notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to:

18 Daniel N. Greenbaum
19 Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum
20 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave., Suite 320
21 Van Nuys CA 91406
22 dgreenbaum@greenbaumlawfirm.com

23 7.2 When Belwith is entitled to receive any notice under this Stipulated Settlement
24 Agreement, the notice shall be sent by electronic mail to:

25 Thomas H. Clarke, Jr. (SBN 47592)
26 ROPER, MAJESKI, KOHN & BENTLEY
27 1001 Marshall Street, Suite 500
28 Redwood City, CA 94063-2052
 tclarke@rmkb.com

 and

1 Michael J. Morrisroe
2 Morrisroe & Associates, Ltd.
3 114 S. Bloomingdale Road
4 Bloomingdale, Illinois 60108
5 mjm@morrisroelaw.com

6 and by facsimile to:

7 Greg Simsa, CFO
8 Belwith Products LLC
9 3100 Broadway Ave., SW
10 Granville, MI 49418
11 Facsimile: 616-237-4060

12 7.3 Any Party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by
13 sending the other Party notice by electronic mail.

14 8. MODIFICATION

15 8.1 **Written Consent.** This Stipulated Settlement Agreement may be modified from
16 time to time by express signed written agreement of the Parties with the approval of the Court, or
17 by an order of this Court upon motion and in accordance with law.

18 8.2 **Meet and Confer.** Any Party seeking to modify this Stipulated Settlement
19 Agreement shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with all affected Parties prior to filing
20 a motion to modify the Stipulated Settlement Agreement.

21 9. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

22 9.1 Shefa agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health
23 and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

24 10. COURT APPROVAL

25 10.1 This Stipulated Settlement Agreement shall become effective upon entry by the
26 Court of judgment pursuant to C.C.P. Section 664.6.

27 10.2 Shefa shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Stipulated Settlement
28 Agreement and Belwith shall support entry of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement.

10.3 The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7, a
noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement,

1 and Shefa shall draft and file such motion within fifteen (15) days of the date this Stipulated
2 Settlement Agreement is fully executed by the Parties, and Belwith shall not oppose it if such
3 motion is consistent with the terms and conditions of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement.

4 10.4 If this Stipulated Settlement Agreement is not entered by the Court, it shall be of
5 no force or effect and shall never be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any
6 proceeding for any purpose.

7 **11. OTHER TERMS**

8 11.1 The terms of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws
9 of the State of California.

10 11.2 This Stipulated Settlement Agreement shall apply to and be binding upon Shefa,
11 Belwith, its affiliates, and the successors or assigns of any of them.

12 11.3 This Stipulated Settlement Agreement contains the sole and entire agreement and
13 understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior
14 discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby
15 merged herein and therein.

16 11.4 There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties
17 except as expressly set forth herein.

18 11.5 No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those
19 specifically referred to in this Stipulated Settlement Agreement have been made by any Party
20 hereto.

21 11.6 No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or
22 otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto.

23 11.7 No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Stipulated
24 Settlement Agreement shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound
25 thereby, except as provided by ¶¶ 8.1 & 8.2.

26
27
28

02/10/2017

1 11.8 No waiver of any of the provisions of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement shall
2 be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not
3 similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

4 11.9 Nothing in this Stipulated Settlement Agreement shall release, or in any way
5 affect any rights Belwith might have against any other party, whether or not that party is a
6 Defendant Releasee or Distributor Releasee.

7 11.10 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the
8 Stipulated Settlement Agreement.

9 11.11 The signatories of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement may execute in
10 counterparts, and by means of facsimile or portable document format (pdf) such separate
11 signatures may be taken together and shall be deemed to constitute one document.

12 11.12 Each signatory to this Stipulated Settlement Agreement certifies that he or she is
13 fully authorized by the relevant Party to consent to this Stipulated Settlement Agreement and to
14 enter into and execute the Stipulated Settlement Agreement on behalf of the Party represented
15 and legally to bind that Party.

16 11.13 The terms of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement have been reviewed by the
17 respective counsel for each Party prior to its signing, and each Party has had an opportunity to
18 fully discuss the terms and conditions with legal counsel.

19 11.14 The Parties agree that, in any subsequent interpretation and construction of this
20 Stipulated Settlement Agreement, no inference, assumption, or presumption shall be drawn, and
21 no provision of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement shall be construed against any Party,
22 based on the fact that one of the Parties and/or one of the Parties' legal counsel prepared and/or
23 drafted all or any portion of the Stipulated Settlement Agreement.

24 11.15 It is conclusively presumed that all of the Parties participated equally in the
25 preparation and drafting of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement.

26 **12. REQUEST FOR FINDINGS, APPROVAL OF SETTLEMENT AND ENTRY OF**
27 **STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT**

02/19/2014

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

12.1 This Stipulated Settlement Agreement came before this Court upon the request of the Parties.

12.2 The Parties request the Court to review this Stipulated Settlement Agreement and to make the following findings pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4):

- a. The injunctive relief required by the Stipulated Settlement Agreement complies with Health & Safety Code § 25249.7;
- b. The reimbursement of fees and costs to be paid pursuant to the Stipulated Settlement Agreement is reasonable under California law; and
- c. The civil penalty amount to be paid pursuant to Stipulated Settlement Agreement is reasonable.

0211912917

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

AGREED TO:

Dated: 12/6/16

FOR: SHEFA LMV, LLC

By: 

Its: Managing member

Dated: 12/06/16

FOR: BEL WITH PRODUCTS LLC

By: 

Its: President

Dated: 12/06/16

FOR: BEL WITH MANAGEMENT, INC.

By: 

Its: President

02/10/2017

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

ORDER AND JUDGMENT

Based upon the stipulated Stipulated Settlement Agreement between Shefa LMV, LLC and Belwith Management, Inc. and Belwith Products LLC, the settlement is approved and the clerk is directed to enter judgment in accordance with the terms herein.

Dated: 2-7-17

Judge of the Superior Court

02/10/2017