1 2 3 4 .5	Jeffrey M. Judd (SBN 136358) jeff@juddlawgroup.com JUDD LAW GROUP LLP 222 Sutter Street, Suite 600 San Francisco, California 94108 Telephone: 415.597.5500 Facsimile: 888.308.7686 Attorneys for Plaintiff Public Interest Alliance LLC		
7 8	SUPERIOR COURT OF T	HE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
9	FOR THE COUN	TY OF ALAMEDA	
10	•	VIL JURISDICTION	
11	ONEMATIEDCIV	LIGRISDICTION	
12)) Case No. RG13697992	
13	THE PUBLIC INTEREST ALLIANCE, LLC, a California limited liability company) [PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS	
14	Plaintiff,) TO BONNE BELL, LLC	
15	vs.) (Cal. Health & Safety Code section 25249.6 et) seq.)	
16	ACCESS BUSINESS GROUP LLC, et al.)	
17	Defendants.)	
18		_)	
19	1. INTRODUCTION	·	
20	1.1 <u>Parties</u> . This Consent Judgment is	entered into by and between plaintiff The Public	
21	Interest Alliance LLC ("PIA") and BONNE BELL, LLC DBA THE BONNE BELL COMPANY		
22	("Bonne Bell, LLC dba The Bonne Bell Company"), with PIA and Bonne Bell, LLC dba The Bonne		
23	Bell Company collectively referred to as the "Parties."		
24	1.2 <u>Public Interest Alliance LLC</u> . The	ne Public Interest Alliance LLC is a California	
25	limited liability company dedicated to improving human health, preserving the natural environment,		
26	and promoting compliance with environmental and consumer disclosure laws.		
27	1.3 <u>Bonne Bell, LLC</u> . Bonne Bell em	ploys ten or more persons and is a "person in the	
28	course of doing business" for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of		
	Case No [PROP] CONSENT JU	RG13697992 DGMENT – BONNE BELL	

1.4 General Allegations

1.6

for the County of Alameda styled, PIA v. Access Business Group, LLC, et al., Case No. RG13697992,

Complaint.

- 1.4.1 PIA alleges that Bonne Bell manufactured, imported, sold and/or distributed for sale in California, cosmetic and personal care powders that contain Titanium dioxide ("TiO2"). During use, some TiO2 is released into the air, exposing consumers to unbound TiO2 particles of respirable size without the health hazard warnings that Proposition 65 requires. A list of such products is identified on Exhibit A attached hereto (the "Covered Products"). TiO2 is a chemical widely used as a whitening agent in a wide range of consumer products, including, without limitation, paper, paints, printers' inks, toothpaste, cosmetics, and personal care products. In 2010, the International Agency for Research on Cancer ("IARC") issued Monograph 93, which concluded that TiO2 is "possibly carcinogenic" to humans when inhaled.
- 1.4.2 Pursuant to Proposition 65, on September 2, 2011, California identified and listed Titanium Dioxide (airborne, unbound chemicals of respirable size) as a chemical known to cause cancer. Titanium Dioxide (airborne, unbound chemicals of respirable size) became subject to the "clear and reasonable warning" requirements of the Act one year later on September 2, 2012. Cal. Code Regs., Tit. 27, § 27001(c); Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.8, 25249.10(b).
- 1.4.4 Titanium Dioxide (airborne, unbound chemicals of respirable size) is hereinafter referred to as the "Listed Chemical." PIA alleges that the Listed Chemical is released into the air when the Covered Products are applied to the skin by brush, pad or sponge, leading to human exposures.
- 1.5 <u>Notice of Violation</u>. On or about June 21, 2013, PIA served Bonne Bell and certain requisite public enforcement agencies with Proposition 65 60-Day Notices of Violation and Proposition 65 Supplemental Notices of Violation (the "NOV") that provided the recipients with notice of alleged violations of Proposition 65 based on the recipient's alleged failure to warn customers and consumers, workers and other individuals that the Products exposed users in California to the Listed Chemical. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced or is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the NOVs.

On October 3, 2013, PIA filed a Complaint in the Superior Court in and

Bonne Bell shall not distribute or sell to California Customers, manufacture or import for distribution

28

or sale to California Customers, or cause to be manufactured or imported for distribution or sale to California Customers, any Covered Products that are not Reformulated Products or unless and until Bonne Bell complies with the provisions of Paragraph 3.5., below (Product Warnings) (the "Reformulation Covenant").

- 3.2 <u>Vendor Notification/Certification</u>. Bonne Bell has provided written notice to the manufacturer of its Deep Down Detox product, the only Covered Product that it plans to reformulate, that it should provide Bonne Bell with Deep Down Detox products that are Reformulated Products for sale in California. Bonne Bell has obtained written certification from the vendor of its Deep Down Detox product that Deep Down Detox is in compliance with the Reformulation Covenant and provided a copy of such certification to PIA.
- 3.3 Products No Longer in Bonne Bell's Control. Bonne Bell has advised all California stores or establishments that it reasonably understands or believes had any inventory of Covered Products available for sale in California as of the date that Bonne Bell was served with the NOV that it plans to cease sales of all Covered Products in California, except its Deep Down Detox product, which will comply with the Reformulation Covenant. Bonne Bell shall maintain records of all correspondence or other communications generated pursuant to this Section for two years after the Effective Date and shall promptly produce to PIA copies of such records upon PIA's written request therefor.
- 3.4 <u>Current Inventory</u>. Commencing on the Effective Date, Bonne Bell shall not sell or otherwise distribute any Covered Product in California or to a California Customer unless such product is certified as complying with the Reformulation Covenant or contains a clear and reasonable warning as set forth in Section 3.5 below.
- 3.5 <u>Product Warnings: Product Labeling and Internet Sales</u>. Bonne Bell plans to cease sales of all Covered Products in California to California stores or establishments, except its Deep Down Detox product, which will comply with the Reformulation Covenant. It may, however, from time to time, sell Covered Products directly to California residents if Covered Products are ordered directly online from Bonne Bell.

If California residents order Covered Products from Bonne Bell directly online, a

ı			
1	warning shall be given in conjunction with any sale of the Covered Products to California residents via		
2	the internet, which warning shall be included in the shipping container and/or on the packing slip,		
3	which shall be used and shall appear in the same type size or larger than the text of the Covered		
4	Product listing, as follows:		
5	IMPORTANT - PLEASE READ THIS NOTICE BEFORE OPENING THE PRODUCT(S)		
6	CONTAINED IN THIS SHIPMENT		
7	WARNING: This product contains a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer.		
8	Bonne Bell Glimmer Bronze		
9	Smackers Get Glowin' Blushes		
10	Smackers Dazzle Dust		
11	Bonne Bell Blush 'n Glow		
12	Bonne Bell Blend 'n Glow		
13	Bonne Bell Powder Bronze		
14	Bonne Bell Eye Style Shadow Box		
15	Bonne Bell Eye Play Set		
16 17	SO LONG AS (1) THE PRODUCT HAS NOT BEEN OPENED AND (2) THE		
18	IN ORDER TO RETURN THE UNOPENED PRODUCTS TO ASPIRE BRANDS, PLEASE CALL 800-321-1006 TO RECEIVE SHIPPING INSTRUCTIONS.		
19	4. MONETARY PAYMENTS		
20	7		
21	the claims referred to in this Consent Judgment, Bonne Bell shall pay a civil penalty in the amount of		
22	Six Thousand United States Dollars (\$ 6000.00) in accordance with this Section. The penalty payment		
23	will be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with		
24	seventy-five percent (75%) of the funds remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health		
25			
26	Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty remitted to "Judd Law Group		
27	LLP in Trust for Public Interest Alliance LLC." All penalty payments shall be made within five (5)		
28	business days after this Consent Judgment has been approved by the Court, and delivered to the		
	5 Case No.: RG13697992		
	[PROP] CONSENT JUDGMENT – BONNE BELL		

Case No.: RG13697992 [PROP] CONSENT JUDGMENT – BONNE BELL

28

1001 I Street

Sacramento, CA 95814

б

10

14

17

16

18 19

20

22 |

24

25

27

28

4.3.2 Proof of Payment to OEHHA. A copy of each check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed, simultaneous with payment, to Judd Law Group LLP at the address set forth in Section 4.3.1(a) above, as proof of payment to OEHHA.

4.3.3 Tax Documentation. Bonne Bell shall issue a separate 1099 form for each payment required by this Section to: (a) PIA (EIN 46-3826361), to the address set forth in Section 4.3.1(a) above; (b) OEHHA, who shall be identified as "California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" (EIN 68-0284486) in the 1099 form, to be delivered directly to OEHHA, P.O. Box 4010, Sacramento, CA 95814, and (c) "Judd Law Group LLP" (EIN: 90-0789749) to the address set forth in Section 4.3.1(a) above.

5. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

PIA's Release of Proposition 65 Claims. PIA, acting on his own behalf and in the 5.1 public interest, releases Bonne Bell, its parents, subsidiaries, directors, officers, attorneys, and each entity to whom Bonne Bell directly or indirectly distributed or sold Covered Products, including, but not limited, to downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees (collectively, "Releasees"), or have in the past directly or indirectly distributed or sold Covered Products, from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 through the Effective Date based on unwarned exposures to the Listed Chemicals in the Covered Products, as set forth in the NOV and Complaint. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to the Listed Chemicals from the Covered Products, as set forth in the NOV. The Parties further understand and agree that this Section 5.1 release shall not extend upstream to any entities, other than affiliates of Bonne Bell, LLC dba The Bonne Bell Company. For the sake of clarity, the Parties confirm that the Section 5.1 release does extend to Bonne Bell, LLC's affiliate companies, Bonne Bell, Inc. and Aspire Brands, Inc. and any other companies affiliated with Bonne Bell and under common control. In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, PIA, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations,

damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses (including but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees) of any nature whatsoever, whether known or unknown, fixed, or contingent (collectively "Claims") that were brought or could have been brought against Bonne Bell or the Releasees, based on claims arising under Proposition 65 with respect to Listed Chemicals in the Covered Products, as such claims relate to the alleged failure to warn under Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6.

In furtherance of the foregoing, PIA on its own behalf hereby waives any and all rights and benefits which it now has, or in the future may have respecting the Covered Products, conferred upon it with respect to claims involving Covered Products by virtue of the provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

"A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR."

By executing this Consent Judgment, PIA understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code Section 1542 is that even if PIA suffers future damages arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, the Covered Products, including but not limited to any exposure to, or failure to warn with respect to exposure to Listed Chemicals from, the Covered Products, PIA will not be able to make any claim for those damages against Bonne Bell or the Releasees, and the successors and assigns of any of them, who may manufacture, use, maintain, distribute, retail or sell the Covered Products. Furthermore, PIA acknowledges that it intends these consequences for any such claims and any other claims which may exist as of the date of this release pertaining to the Covered Products listed in the NOV but which PIA does not know exist, and which, if known, would materially affect its decision to enter into this Consent Judgment, regardless of whether its lack of knowledge is the result of ignorance, oversight, error, negligence, or any other cause.

Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Bonne Bell resolves any issue, now and in the future, raised by the parties to this Consent Judgment or any other person suing in the public interest pursuant to § 25249.7(d) concerning compliance by Bonne Bell or the Releasees with the

22 | 23

requirements of Proposition 65 in any Covered Products that are manufactured, shipped, or sold by Bonne Bell or the Releasees following the Effective Date.

5.2 <u>Bonne Bell's Release of PIA</u>. Bonne Bell, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against PIA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by PIA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter with respect to the Covered Products.

In furtherance of the foregoing, Bonne Bell on its own behalf hereby waives any and all rights and benefits which it now has, or in the future may have against PIA with respect to for any and all actions taken or statements made in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter with respect to the Covered Products by virtue of the provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

"A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR."

By executing this Consent Judgment, Bonne Bell understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code Section 1542 is that even if Bonne Bell suffers future damages arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, any and all actions taken or statements made regarding the Covered Products and PIA's alleged enforcement of Proposition 65, Bonne Bell will not be able to make any claim for those damages against PIA, and its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees. Furthermore, Bonne Bell acknowledges that it intends these consequences for any such claims and any other claims which may exist as of the date of this release but which Bonne Bell does not know exist, and which, if known, would materially affect its decision to enter into this Consent Judgment, regardless of whether its lack of knowledge is the result of ignorance, oversight, error, negligence, or any other cause.

6. PRESERVATION OF COMPETITIVENESS. The intent of this section 6 is to protect the

7. <u>COURT APPROVAL</u>. This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by all Parties. If the Court does not approve the Consent Judgment, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the language or appeal the ruling. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, then the case shall proceed

24

26

27

Case No.: RG13697992 [PROP] CONSENT JUDGMENT – BONNE BELL

of the Parties and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon; or (2) upon a

successful motion of any party and entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court.

27

٠.	
1	15. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u> . The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on
2	behalf of their respective parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and
3	conditions of this Consent Judgment.
4	Dated: June, 2014 PUBLIC INTEREST ALLIANCE LLC
5	
6	By:
7	Daniel P. Madison Managing Member
8	Dated: June 2.3, 2014 BONNE BELL, LLC]
9	
10	By: Robert Evans
11	Managing Member
12	A
13	Approved as to form:
14	JUDD LAW GROUP LLP
15	Dated: June 24, 2013
16	By Jeffrey M./Judd /
17	Attorneys for Plaintiff PUBLIC INTEREST ALLIANCE LLC
18	A
19	Approved as to form: HANSON BRIDGETT LLP
20	
21	By Sophia Bellon Dated: June 4, 2013 WB
22	By Gopala Bonsay
23	Attorneys for Defendant BONNE BELL, LLC
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	13 Case No.: RG13697992 [PROP] CONSENT JUDGMENT – BONNE BELL

EXHIBIT A

COVERED PRODUCTS

Bonne Bell Glimmer Bronze

Smackers Get Glowin' Blushes

Smackers Dazzle Dust

Bonne Bell Blush 'n Glow

Bonne Bell Blend 'n Glow

Bonne Bell Powder Bronze

10.0.06 Deep Down Detox Ultra-Cleansing Mud Mask

Bonne Bell Eye Style Shadow Box

Bonne Bell Eye Play Set