

State of California - Department of Justice - Attorney General's Office - Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting

Attention: Prop 65 Coordinator, 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000, Oakland, CA 94612

FORM JUS 1502  
(03-01)

PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT FILING - Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(e) and (f)

**REPORT OF ENTRY OF JUDGMENT**

Original Filing     Supplemental Filing     Corrected Filing

Please print or type required information

<b>PARTIES TO THE ACTION</b>	PLAINTIFF(S)				
	DEFENDANT(S) INVOLVED IN JUDGMENT				
<b>CASE INFO</b>	COURT DOCKET NUMBER		COURT NAME		
	SHORT CASE NAME				
<b>REPORT INFO</b>	INJUNCTIVE RELIEF				
	PAYMENT: CIVIL PENALTY	PAYMENT: ATTORNEYS FEES		PAYMENT: OTHER	
	DATE SUBMITTED TO COURT / /	IS JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO SETTLEMENT? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	IF YES, DATE SETTLEMENT WAS REPORTED TO ATTORNEY GENERAL / /		For Internal Use Only
	<b>COPY OF JUDGMENT MUST BE ATTACHED</b>				
<b>FILER INFO</b>	NAME OF CONTACT				
	ORGANIZATION			TELEPHONE NUMBER (    )	
	ADDRESS			FAX NUMBER (    )	
	CITY	STATE	ZIP	E-MAIL ADDRESS	

**FILING INSTRUCTIONS:** This form can be completed online and printed. If electronic filing is not available, mail the completed form with a copy of the judgment to the attention of the Prop 65 Coordinator at the address shown above. If you need additional space to complete this form please use an attachment.

1 Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq. (SBN 268104)  
2 LAW OFFICE OF DANIEL N. GREENBAUM  
3 14752 Otsego Street  
4 Sherman Oaks, CA 91403  
5 Telephone: (310) 200-2631  
6 Facsimile: (424) 243-7689  
7 Email: danielgreenbaumesq@gmail.com

8 Attorney for Plaintiff  
9 SHEFA LMV, LLC

10 Michaeline A. Re (SBN 77853)  
11 Law Offices of Michaeline A. Re  
12 100 E. Corson Street, 3rd Floor  
13 Pasadena, CA 91103  
14 Telephone: 626 396-9230  
15 Facsimile: 626 396-9430  
16 Email: michaeliner@earthlink.net

17 Attorney for Defendant  
18 JOHN PAUL MITCHELL SYSTEMS

19 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
20 COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

21 Coordination Proceeding  
22 Special Title (Rule 3.350)

23 PROPOSITION 65 COCAMIDE DEA  
24 CASES

25 ) JUDICIAL COUNCIL COORDINATION  
26 ) PROCEEDING NO: 4765

27 ) [*Shefa LMV, LLC v. Ross Stores, et al.*,  
28 ) Los Angeles County Superior Court  
29 ) No. BC521400

30 ) **[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT**  
31 ) **AS TO JOHN PAUL MITCHELL**  
32 ) **SYSTEMS**

33 ) Judge: Hon. George C. Hernandez, Jr.

34 ) Action filed: October 11, 2013

35 \_\_\_\_\_  
36 **[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO JOHN PAUL MITCHELL SYSTEMS.**

1 I. INTRODUCTION

2 1.1 This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Plaintiff Shefa  
3 LMV, LLC ("Shefa") and Defendant John Paul Mitchell Systems, a California corporation  
4 ("JPMS").

5 1.2 Shefa and JPMS are collectively referred to as the "Parties" and  
6 individually as a "Party."

7 1.3 Shefa is a limited liability company in California that is acting as a private  
8 enforcer pursuant to the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California  
9 Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"), and is enforcing Proposition 65.

10 1.4 JPMS employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing  
11 business for purposes of Proposition 65.

12 1.5 The products covered by this Consent Judgment ("Covered Products") are  
13 shampoos, hand washes, hand soaps, body washes and liquid soaps manufactured, distributed  
14 and/or sold by JPMS that contain or are alleged to contain coconut oil diethanolamine condensate  
15 (cocamide diethanolamine) (referred to herein as "Cocamide DEA"), including but not limited to  
16 Tea Tree Special Shampoo, which are distributed, marketed, sold, or offered for sale in California  
17 by JPMS or any supplier, distributor, or retailer and any of their subsidiaries or affiliates..

18 1.6 On or about July 11, 2013, Shefa served JPMS and various public  
19 enforcement agencies with documents entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" pursuant to Health &  
20 Safety Code § 25249.7(d) (the "Notice"), alleging that JPMS was in violation of Proposition 65.

21 1.7 Shefa's Notice alleges that the Covered Products expose consumers to  
22 Cocamide DEA without the requisite Proposition 65 warnings.

23 1.8 Cocamide DEA is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known  
24 to the State of California to cause cancer.

25 1.9 On or around January 14, 2014, Shefa filed a Complaint in the above-  
26 captioned action ("Action"), alleging Proposition 65 violations as to the Covered Products and  
27 asserting causes of action against JPMS under Proposition 65.

1           1.10       JPMS denies the claims of alleged violations asserted against it in the  
2 Action and denies that it has any liability under Proposition 65.

3           1.11       The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment to resolve all Proposition 65  
4 claims concerning the Covered Products set forth in the Notice and the Action.

5           1.12       Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by  
6 the Parties of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall  
7 compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of  
8 any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law.

9           1.13       Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive or impair any  
10 right, remedy, argument or defense the Parties may have in this or any other or future legal  
11 proceedings.

12          1.14       The term "Effective Date" means the date on which this Consent  
13 Judgment is approved and entered by the Court.

14  
15           **2.       INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

16          2.1       **Reformulation of Covered Products.** As of the Effective Date, JPMS  
17 shall not manufacture, distribute, sell or offer for sale any Covered Product that contains Cocamide  
18 DEA that will be sold or offered for sale to California consumers, and all JPMS products have been  
19 reformulated without Cocamide DEA.

20          2.2       For purposes of this Consent Judgment, a Covered Product "contains  
21 Cocamide DEA" if Cocamide DEA is an intentionally added ingredient in the Covered Product.

22          2.3       **Sell through period.** JPMS's Products that were manufactured,  
23 distributed, shipped, sold that are otherwise in the stream of commerce prior to the Effective Date  
24 shall be subject to the release of liability pursuant to Section 5 of this Consent Judgment, without  
25 regard to when such Products were, or are in the future, sold to consumers. As a result, the  
26 obligations of JPMS as set forth in this Consent Judgment, including but not limited Section 2.1, do  
27 not apply to these products.

1           **3.       ENFORCEMENT**

2           Shefa may, by motion or application for an order to show cause before the Alameda County  
3 Superior Court, or, if the case is transferred back to the Los Angeles County Superior Court at the  
4 conclusion of the Coordination Action, the Los Angeles Superior Court, may enforce the terms and  
5 conditions contained in this Consent Judgment. Prior to bringing any motion or application to  
6 enforce the requirements of Section 2 above, Shefa shall provide the Defendant with Notice of  
7 Violation and a copy of any test results which purportedly support Shefa's Notice of Violation. The  
8 Parties shall then meet and confer regarding the basis for Shefa's anticipated motion or application  
9 in an attempt to resolve the matter informally, including providing Settling Defendant a reasonable  
10 opportunity of at least thirty (30) days to cure any alleged violation. Should such attempts at  
11 informal resolution fail, Shefa may file its enforcement motion or application. The prevailing party  
12 on any motion to enforce this Consent Judgment shall be entitled to its reasonable attorney's fees  
13 and costs incurred as a result of such motion or application.

14           **4.       MONETARY PAYMENTS**

15           **4.1       Civil Penalty Payment Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b)**

16           JPMS shall pay a total civil penalty payment of \$4,000.00 within ten (10) days of Court  
17 entry of this Consent Judgment, as follows: the civil penalty shall be apportioned in accordance  
18 with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 (c) and (d), with 75% of these funds remitted to  
19 the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the  
20 remaining 25% of the penalty remitted to Plaintiff, both pursuant to the procedures set forth in  
21 Section 4.3.

22           **4.2       Reimbursement of Plaintiff's Fees and Costs**

23           The parties acknowledge that Plaintiff and its counsel offered to resolve this dispute  
24 without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving  
25 this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. JPMS  
26 expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue after the other settlement terms had been  
27 agreed. The Parties then attempted to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due to  
28

1 Plaintiff and its counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine  
2 codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed in this matter,  
3 except fees that may be incurred on appeal. Under these legal principles, JPMS shall pay the  
4 amount of \$12,000.00 for fees and costs incurred investigating, litigating and enforcing this matter,  
5 including the fees and costs incurred (and yet to be incurred) negotiating, drafting, and obtaining  
6 the Court's approval of this Consent Judgment in the public interest.

7 **4.3 Payment Procedures**

8 All payments required by Sections 4.1 and 4.2 shall be within ten (10) days Court entry of  
9 this Consent Judgment, in three checks made payable as follows:

- 10 (a) one check to "OEHHA" in the amount of \$3,000.00;  
11 (b) one check to "Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum in Trust for Shefa LMV, LLC" in  
12 the amount of \$1,000.00;  
13 (c) one check to "Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum" in the amount of \$12,000.00.

14 **4.4 Issuance of 1099 Forms**

15 After the settlement funds have been transmitted to Plaintiff's counsel, DEFENDANT shall  
16 issue separate 1099 forms, as follows:

- 17 (a) one 1099 form to the "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" (EIN:  
18 68-0284486) in the amount of \$3,000.00;  
19 (b) a second 1099 form to "Shefa LMV, LLC" in the amount of \$1,000.00, whose  
20 address and tax identification number shall be furnished upon request;  
21 (c) a third 1099 to "Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum" (EIN: 46-4580172) in the  
22 amount of \$12,000.00;

23 **4.5 Issuance of Payments.**

24 **4.5.1** All payments owed to Plaintiff, pursuant to Section 4.1, shall  
25 be delivered to the following payment address:

26 Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq.  
27 Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum  
28 14752 Otsego Street

1 Sherman Oaks, CA 91403

2  
3 4.5.2 All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant  
4 to Section 4.1, shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the  
5 following addresses:

6 Mike Gyrics  
7 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
8 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
9 P.O. Box 4010  
10 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

11 With a copy of the checks payable to OEHHA mailed to the Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum at  
12 the address set forth above in 4.5.1, as proof of payment to OEHHA.

13 **5. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED**

14 5.1 **Full and Binding Resolution of Proposition 65 Allegations:** This  
15 Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution of the Action as set forth in this Section 5.  
16 Shefa, on behalf of itself, its attorneys, agents, representatives, successors and assigns, and in the  
17 public interest, waives all rights to participate in any action and releases and discharges (a) JPMS,  
18 its parents, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and  
19 affiliates, and their successors and assigns (collectively, the "Defendant Releasees"), and (b)  
20 finished product or ingredient manufacturers, distributors, and suppliers, and all entities to whom  
21 any Defendant Releasee directly or indirectly distributed or sold any Covered Products, including  
22 but not limited to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members,  
23 and Defendant Releasees' licensors and licensees (collectively, "Additional Releasees"), with  
24 respect to all claims, including, without limitation, causes of action (in law or in equity), suits,  
25 liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, expenses (including, but not  
26 limited to, investigation fees, expert fees and attorneys' fees) or losses (collectively, "Claims")  
27 regarding any violation of Proposition 65 based on failure to warn about alleged exposures to  
28 Cocamide DEA in any Covered Products shipped, distributed or sold by JPMS prior to the Effective  
Date.

1                   5.2           **Individual Release:** Shefa, on behalf of itself, its past and current  
2 agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and *not* in its representative  
3 capacity, hereby provides a release that shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction,  
4 as a bar to all Claims under Proposition 65, Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code §§ 17200 *et seq.*, or any other  
5 statutory or common law, that are or may be asserted against Defendant Releasees and Additional  
6 Releasees, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged exposures  
7 to, and/or failure to warn of alleged exposures to, Cocamide DEA in the Covered Products shipped,  
8 distributed or sold by JPMS prior to the Effective Date.

9                   5.3           **General Release:** It is possible that other Claims not known to the Parties  
10 arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice or the Action will develop or be discovered. Shefa, on  
11 behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assigns,  
12 and not in its representative capacity, acknowledges that this Consent Judgment is expressly  
13 intended to cover and include all such Claims, including all rights of action therefor. Shefa has full  
14 knowledge of the contents of California Civil Code § 1542. Shefa acknowledges that the Claims  
15 released in Section 5.2 include unknown Claims, and Shefa nevertheless waives California Civil  
16 Code § 1542 as to any such unknown Claims. California Civil Code § 1542 reads as follows:

17                   **“A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS**  
18                   **WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT**  
19                   **TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF**  
20                   **EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM**  
21                   **OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR**  
22                   **HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.”**

23 Shefa, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors  
24 and/or assignees, and not in its representative capacity, acknowledges and understands the  
25 significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

26                   5.4           Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by JPMS shall be  
27 deemed to constitute compliance by any Defendant Releasee or Additional Releasee with  
28 Proposition 65 regarding alleged exposures to Cocamide DEA in the Covered Products.



1                   5.5       **JPMS's Release:** On behalf of itself and Defendant Releasees, JPMS  
2 waives all rights to institute any form of action against Shefa or Shefa's attorneys, consultants and  
3 representatives for all actions taken or statements made in the course of this Action prior to the date  
4 of the execution of this Consent Judgment.

5                   6.       **COURT APPROVAL**

6                   6.1       This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by  
7 the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court  
8 within one year after it has been fully executed by all Parties.

9                   7.       **SOLE AGREEMENT**

10                  7.1       This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and  
11 understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior  
12 discussions, negotiations, commitments or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged  
13 herein and therein.

14                  7.2       No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those  
15 specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto.

16                  7.3       No supplementation, modification, waiver or termination of this Consent  
17 Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby.

18                  7.4       No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be  
19 deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor  
20 shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

21                  8.       **MODIFICATION**

22                  8.1       This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to time by (i) a written  
23 agreement of the Parties and upon entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court thereon; or  
24 (ii) upon a successful motion or application of any Party and the entry of a modified consent  
25 judgment by the Court.

26                  9.       **GOVERNING LAW AND APPLICATION**

1           9.1       The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the  
2 State of California and shall apply only to Covered Products that are sold or offered for sale in the  
3 State of California.

4           9.2       In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted or otherwise  
5 rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or in the event California's Office of  
6 Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") establishes a "safe harbor" limit for  
7 Cocamide DEA, the Parties agree that it shall be grounds for modification of this Consent Judgment  
8 with regard to any products thereafter manufactured, imported, distributed and/or sold by JPMS for  
9 sale in the State of California, that are so affected.

10          9.3       This Consent Judgment shall apply to and be binding upon Shefa and  
11 JPMS and their respective, divisions, subdivisions, and subsidiaries, successors and assigns.

12          9.4       The Parties, including their counsel, have participated in the preparation of  
13 this Consent Judgment and this Consent Judgment is the result of the joint efforts of the Parties.

14          9.5       This Consent Judgment was subject to revision and modification by the  
15 Parties and has been accepted and approved as to its final form by all Parties and their counsel.

16          9.6       Each Party to this Consent Judgment agrees that any statute or rule of  
17 construction providing that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting Party should not be  
18 employed in the interpretation of this Consent Judgment and, in this regard, the Parties hereby  
19 waive California Civil Code § 1654.

20       **10.   PROVISION OF NOTICE**

21       All notices required pursuant to this Consent Judgment and correspondence shall be sent to  
22 the following:

23       For Shefa:     Daniel Greenbaum, Esq.,  
24                       Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum  
25                       14752 Otsego Street  
26                       Sherman Oaks, CA 91403

27       For JPMS:     Michaeline A. Re  
28                       Law Offices of Michaeline A. Re  
                      100 E. Corson Street, 3rd Floor  
                      Pasadena, CA 91103

1           **10.1**     A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this  
2 Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing Party's reasonable attorney's fees and  
3 costs.

4           **10.2**     For purposes of this Section 10.1, the prevailing Party refers to the Party  
5 that was successful in obtaining relief more favorable to it than the relief that the other Party was  
6 amenable to providing during the Parties' good faith attempt to resolve the dispute under Section  
7 5.1.

8           **10.3**     Nothing in this Section 11 shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of  
9 sanctions pursuant to law.

10           **11.    EXECUTION AND COUNTERPARTS**

11           The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by means of  
12 facsimile and/or portable document format (pdf), which taken together shall be deemed to constitute  
13 one document.

14           **12.    COURT APPROVAL**

15           **12.1**     This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until the Effective Date.

16           **12.2**     Shefa shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent  
17 Judgment and JPMS shall make no objections to entry of this Consent Judgment.

18           **12.3**     If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force  
19 or effect.

20           **12.4**     This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify  
21 the Consent Judgment.

22           **13.    COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)**

23           **13.1**     Shefa agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in  
24 California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

25           **14.    AUTHORIZATION**

1           14.1       Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully  
2 authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into  
3 and execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party.

4           14.2       The undersigned have read, understand and agree to all of the terms and  
5 conditions of this Consent Judgment.

6           14.3       Except as explicitly provided herein, each Party is to bear its own fees and  
7 costs.

8           **15.    REQUEST FOR FINDINGS, APPROVAL OF SETTLEMENT AND ENTRY**  
9 **OF CONSENT JUDGMENT**

10          15.1       This Consent Judgment came before this Court upon the request of the  
11 Parties. The Parties request the Court to review this Consent Judgment and to make the following  
12 findings pursuant to Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4):

- 13           1. The injunctive relief required by the Consent Judgment complies with Cal. Health &  
14 Safety Code § 25249.7;
- 15           2. The reimbursement of fees and costs to be paid pursuant to the Consent Judgment is  
16 reasonable under California law; and
- 17           3. The civil penalty amount to be paid pursuant to Consent Judgment is reasonable.

18  
19 AGREED TO:


SHEFA LMV, LLC

20 Dated: 5/21/14

By: 

Alisa Fried

21  
22  
23  
24 Approved as to form:

  
25  
26 Daniel Greenbaum, Esq.  
27 Attorney for Shefa LMV, LLC

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Dated: 5-14-14

JOHN PAUL MITCHELL SYSTEMS,  
LLC

By: *Luke Jacobellis*  
Luke Jacobellis, President

5-15-14

Approved as to form:

*Michael A. Re*  
Michaeline A. Re  
Attorney for John Paul Mitchell Systems,  
a California corporation

