1	WILLIAM F. WRAITH, SBN 185927 WRAITH LAW 24422 Avenida de la Carlota, Suite 400		
2	Laguna Hills, CA 92653 Tel: (949) 452-1234		
3	Fax: (949) 452-1102		
4	Attorneys for Plaintiff		
5	Environmental Research Center		
6			
7			
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA		
9	COUNTY OF ALAMEDA		
10			
11	ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH	Case No.: RG14748134	
12	CENTER, a California non-profit corporation,	[Judge: Hon. George C. Hernandez, Jr.]	
13	Plaintiffs,	) NOTICE OF ENTRY OF JUDGMENT	
14	VS.		
15	LIVING ECOLOGY INC, LIVING		
16	ECOLOGY MANUFACTURING INC. and DOES 1-25, Inclusive,		
17	Defendants.		
18			
19			
20	TO ALL PARTIES AND THEIR ATTORNEYS OF RECORD:		
21	NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN that the Court has entered Judgment and approved the		
22	settlement by Stipulated Consent Judgment in the above-entitled matter. A true and correct copy		
23	of the Stipulated Consent Judgment and Order is attached hereto as Exhibit 1.		
24			
25	Dated: January 5, 2016		
26		By: WILLIAM E WRAITH	
27	1	WILLIAMIT: WICHTII	
28		Attorney for Plaintiff Environmental Research Center	

# **EXHIBIT 1**



WILLIAM F. WRAITH, SBN 185927 1 WRAITH LAW 24422 Avenida de la Carlota, Suite 400 Laguna Hills, CA 92653 Tel: (949) 452-1234 Fax: (949) 452-1102 Attorney for Plaintiff 5 ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH CENTER 6 TIMOTHY F. SHIELDS, SBN 122079 7 JULIE E. RITCHIE, SBN 273484 GEORGE & SHIELDS, LLP 8 30 Corporate Park, Suite 300 Irvine, California 92606-5133 Telephone: (949) 263-1085 Facsimile: (949) 263-0585 10 Attorneys for Defendants 11 LIVING ECOLOGY INC. and LIVING ECOLOGY MANUFACTURING INC. 12

ALAMEDA COUNTY

DEC 1 5 2015

CLERK OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

Deputy

# SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH CENTER, a California non-profit corporation,

Plaintiff,

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

LIVING ECOLOGY INC., LIVING ECOLOGY MANUFACTURING INC., and DOES 1-25, Inclusive,

Defendants.

CASE NO. RG14748134

STIPULATED CONSENT **JUDGMENT** 

Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.

Action Filed: November 13, 2014 Trial Date: None set

#### INTRODUCTION 1.

On November 13, 2014, Plaintiff Environmental Research Center ("ERC"), a non-profit corporation, as a private enforcer, and in the public interest, initiated the action captioned above by filing a Complaint for Injunctive Relief and Civil Penalties (the "Complaint") pursuant to the provisions of California Health and Safety Code section 25249.5

STIPULATED CONSENT JUDGMENT

CASE NO. RG14748134

et seq. ("Proposition 65"), against Living Ecology Inc., Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc., and Does 1-25.

- 1.2 Defendant Living Ecology Inc. is an active Nevada Corporation. Defendant Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc. is an active California Corporation. Defendants Living Ecology Inc. and Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc. are hereinafter collectively referred to as "Living Ecology".
- 1.3 Thereafter, on July 22, 2015, ERC filed a separate Complaint for Injunctive Relieve and Civil Penalties in a second action against Living Ecology, Inc. Living Ecology Manufacturing, Inc. and Does 1-25, inclusive; i.e. Alameda County Superior Court Case Number RG15778780. The action captioned first above, and the second action filed in Alameda County Superior Court Case Number RG15778780 involve the same parties, similar products, and related claims and are collectively referred to herein as the "Actions". In the Actions, ERC alleges that a number of products manufactured, distributed or sold by Living Ecology contain lead (a-p below), cadmium (q and r below), or both lead and cadmium (l below), which are chemicals listed under Proposition 65 as carcinogens and reproductive toxins, and expose consumers to these chemicals at levels requiring a Proposition 65 warning. These products (referred to hereinafter individually as a "Covered Product" or collectively as "Covered Products") are:
  - a. Bio International Organic Active Greens Powder
  - b. Bio International Organic Active Greens
  - c. Organic Food Bar Inc. Raw Organic Food Bar Cinnamon Raisin
  - d. Organic Food Bar Inc. Raw Organic Food Bar Chocolatey Chocolate
    Chip
  - e. Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Chocolate Covered
    Active Greens
  - f. Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Active Greens- Protein
    Chocolate Covered
  - g. Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Active Greens

- h. Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Active Greens Chocolate
- i. Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Original
- j. Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Protein
- k. Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Vegan
- 1. Organic Food Bar Inc. OFB Vegan Protein Vanilla
- m. Organic Food Bar Inc. OFB Vegan Protein Strawberry
- n. Organic Food Bar Inc. OFB Vegan Protein Chocolate
- o. Organic Food Bar Inc. OFB Whey Protein Strawberry
- p. Organic Food Bar Inc. OFB Whey Protein Vanilla
- q. Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar High Energy Protein
- r. Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar High Energy Vegan
- 1.4 ERC and Living Ecology are hereinafter referred to individually as a "Party" or collectively as the "Parties."
- 1.5 ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by reducing the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.
- 1.6 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the Parties agree that Living Ecology is a business entity that has employed ten or more persons at all times relevant to this action, and qualifies as a "person in the course of business" within the meaning of Proposition 65. Living Ecology manufactures, distributes or sells the Covered Products.
- 1.7 The Actions are based on allegations contained in ERC's Notices of Violation dated January 31, 2014 and April 4, 2014, and April 10, 2015 that were served on the California Attorney General, other public enforcers, and Living Ecology (the "Notices"). True and correct copies of the Notices are attached as Exhibit A and are hereby incorporated by reference. More than 60 days have passed since the Notices were mailed and uploaded to the Attorney General's website, and no designated governmental entity has filed a complaint against Living Ecology with regard to the Covered Products or the alleged violations.

28

- 1.8 ERC's Notices and Complaint allege that use or consumption of the Covered Products exposes persons in California to lead and/or cadmium without first providing clear and reasonable warnings in violation of California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6. Living Ecology denies all material allegations contained in the Notices and the Complaint.
- 1.9 The Parties have entered into this Consent Judgment in order to settle, compromise and resolve disputed claims and thus avoid prolonged and costly litigation. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall constitute or be construed as an admission by any of the Parties, or by any of their respective officers, directors, shareholders, employees, agents, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions, affiliates, franchisees, licensees, customers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, or retailers. Except for the representations made above, nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, issue of law, or violation of law, at any time, for any purpose.
- 1.10 Except as expressly set forth herein, nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right, remedy, argument, or defense the Parties may have in any other or future legal proceeding unrelated to these proceedings, the Actions, or the Covered Products.
- 1.11 The Effective Date of this Consent Judgment is the date on which it is entered as a Judgment by this Court.

#### 2. JURISDICTION AND VENUE

For purposes of this Consent Judgment and any further court action that may become necessary to enforce this Consent Judgment, the Parties stipulate that this Court has subject matter jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint, personal jurisdiction over Living Ecology as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in Alameda County, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full and final compromise and resolution of all claims up through and including the Effective Date which were or could have been asserted in this action based on the facts alleged in the Notices and Complaint.

## 3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF AND WARNINGS

- 3.1 Beginning four (4) months following the Effective Date (the "Compliance Date"), Living Ecology shall be permanently enjoined from manufacturing for sale in the State of California, "Distributing into the State of California", or directly selling in the State of California, any Covered Product which exposes a person to a "Daily Lead Exposure Level" of more than 0.5 micrograms per day of lead or "Daily Cadmium Exposure Level" of more than 4.10 micrograms per day of cadmium when the maximum suggested dose is taken as directed on the Covered Product's label excluding the lead deemed "naturally occurring" for purposes of this Consent Judgment only pursuant to Section 3, unless it meets the warning requirements under Section 3.2.
- 3.1.1 As used in this Consent Judgment, the term "Distributing into the State of California" shall mean to directly ship a Covered Product into California for sale in California or to sell a Covered Product to a distributor that Living Ecology knows will sell the Covered Product in California.
- 3.1.2 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the "Daily Lead Exposure Level" and "Daily Cadmium Exposure Level" shall be measured in micrograms, and shall be calculated using the following formula: micrograms of lead or cadmium per gram of product, multiplied by grams of product per serving of the product (using the largest serving size appearing on the product label), multiplied by the servings of the product per day (using the largest number of servings in a recommended dosage appearing on the product label), which equals micrograms of lead or cadmium exposure per day.
- 3.1.3 For purposes of Section 3, the term "no more than 0.5 micrograms of lead per day" means that there is not more than 0.5 micrograms of lead when calculated using the formula in Section 3.1.2 after subtracting the amount of lead deemed to be "naturally occurring" for purposes of this Consent Judgment only for the ingredient cocoa powder as listed in Table 3 below. The amount of lead deemed "naturally occurring" listed in Table 3 is in micrograms of "naturally occurring" lead per gram of the ingredient that is contained in the Covered Product.

X

		TABLE 3
I	Ingredient	
II	]	

ingredient deemed naturally
occurring
Cocoa powder 1.0 micrograms/gram

Amount of lead per gram of

3.1.4. If Living Ecology uses Table 3 to calculate the amount of naturally occurring lead in a Covered Product, then Living Ecology must submit to ERC, prior to the Compliance Date, a complete list showing all the ingredients in that Covered Product including the ingredients from Table 3, that are being used in the Covered Product as well as the percentage and the amount in grams of each ingredient contained in the Covered Product. Living Ecology may update this list from time to time and will be entitled to submit this information to ERC confidentially.

### 3.2 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

If Living Ecology is required to provide a warning pursuant to Section 3.1, the following warning must be utilized:

WARNING: This product contains [a] chemical[s] known to the State of California to cause [cancer and] birth defects or other reproductive harm.

Living Ecology shall use the phrase "cancer and" in the warning only if the maximum daily dose recommended on the label contains more than 15 micrograms of lead. The term "a chemical" shall be used when Living Ecology has identified one Proposition 65 chemical in the Covered Product while the phrase "chemicals" shall be utilized when more than one Proposition 65 chemical has been identified by Living Ecology in the Covered Product.

The warning shall be securely affixed to or printed upon the container or label of each Covered Product. The warning shall be at least the same size as the largest of any other health or safety warnings also appearing on its website or on the label or container of Living Ecology's product packaging and the word "WARNING" shall be in all capital letters and in bold print. No other statements about Proposition 65 or lead or cadmium may be contained in the Warning.

Living Ecology must display the above warnings with such conspicuousness, as compared

with other words, statements, or design of the label or container, as applicable, to render the warning likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use of the product.

## 4. SETTLEMENT PAYMENT

- 4.1 In full satisfaction of all potential civil penalties, payment in lieu of civil penalties, attorney's fees, and costs claimable in the Actions, Living Ecology shall make a total of \$225,000.00 ("Total Settlement Amount") in settlement payments to ERC on the following schedule: An initial payment of \$37,500.00 shall be made to ERC within five (5) days of the Effective Date, followed by five (5) consecutive monthly payments in the amount of \$37,500.00 due and owing no later than the 15<sup>th</sup> of each month after the month the first payment is made. Living Ecology shall make these payments by wire transfer to ERC's escrow account, for which ERC will give Living Ecology the necessary account information. The Total Settlement Amount shall be apportioned as follows:
- 4.2 \$81,688.00 shall be considered a civil penalty pursuant to California Health and Safety Code §25249.7(b)(1). ERC shall remit 75% (\$61,266.00) of the civil penalty to the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") for deposit in the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Fund in accordance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.12(c). ERC will retain the remaining 25% (\$20,422.00) of the civil penalty.
- 4.3 \$11,737.45 shall be distributed to ERC as reimbursement to ERC for reasonable costs incurred in bringing this action.
- 4.4 \$61,538.80 shall be distributed to ERC in lieu of further civil penalties, for the day-to-day business activities such as (1) continued enforcement of Proposition 65, which includes work, analyzing, researching and testing consumer products that may contain Proposition 65 chemicals, focusing on the same or similar type of ingestible products that are the subject matter of the current action; (2) the continued monitoring of past consent judgments and settlements to ensure companies are in compliance with Proposition 65; and (3) giving a donation of \$3,075.00 to the Global Community Monitor to address reducing toxic chemical exposures in California.

4.5 \$44,555.00 shall be distributed to William F. Wraith as reimbursement of ERC's attorney's fees, while \$25,480.75 shall be distributed to ERC for its in-house legal fees.

4.6 In the event that Living Ecology fails to pay the Total Settlement Amount on or before the date that it is due and owing pursuant to section 4.1 above, then ERC will provide Defendant with ten days' written notice of default. If the Settling Defendant fails to cure the default within ten days, then at the option of ERC, all unpaid balances due pursuant to section 4 shall be accelerated, and shall become immediately due and payable, with interest thereon as specified in section 685.010 of the Code of Civil Procedure, commencing to accrue on the entire remaining unpaid balance as of the first day after the ten-day notice has expired. California Code of Civil Procedure section 1013, and the extensions provided therein, shall not apply to nor extend any deadline referred to in this paragraph. If ERC waives the optional acceleration as to any one or more default(s) in payment, the waiver or waivers shall not constitute a waiver of this option in the event of any other default.

#### 5. MODIFICATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

- 5.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only (i) by written stipulation of the Parties or pursuant to Section 5.4 and (ii) upon entry by the Court of a modified consent judgment.
- 5.2 If Living Ecology seeks to modify this Consent Judgment under Section 5.1, then Living Ecology must provide written notice to ERC of its intent ("Notice of Intent"). If ERC seeks to meet and confer regarding the proposed modification in the Notice of Intent, then ERC must provide written notice to Living Ecology within thirty days of receiving the Notice of Intent. If ERC notifies Living Ecology in a timely manner of ERC's intent to meet and confer, then the Parties shall meet and confer in good faith as required in this Section. The Parties shall meet in person or via telephone within thirty (30) days of ERC's notification of its intent to meet and confer. Within thirty days of such meeting, if ERC disputes the proposed modification, ERC shall provide to Living Ecology a written basis for its position. The Parties shall continue to meet and confer for an additional thirty (30) days in an effort to resolve any

remaining disputes. Should it become necessary, the Parties may agree in writing to different deadlines for the meet-and-confer period.

- 5.3 In the event that Living Ecology initiates or otherwise requests a modification under Section 5.1, and the meet and confer process leads to a joint motion or application of the Consent Judgment, Living Ecology shall reimburse ERC its costs and reasonable attorney's fees for the time spent in the meet-and-confer process and filing and arguing the motion or application.
- 5.4 Where the meet-and-confer process does not lead to a joint motion or application in support of a modification of the Consent Judgment, then either Party may seek judicial relief on its own. In such a situation, the prevailing Party may seek to recover costs and reasonable attorney's fees. As used in the preceding sentence, the term "prevailing party" means a party who is successful in obtaining relief more favorable to it than the relief that the other party was amenable to providing during the Parties' good faith attempt to resolve the dispute that is the subject of the modification.

# 6. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION, ENFORCEMENT OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure 664.6 to enforce, modify, or terminate this Consent Judgment.

#### 7. APPLICATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

This Consent Judgment may apply to, be binding upon, and benefit the Parties and their respective officers, directors, shareholders, employees, agents, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions, affiliates, franchisees, licensees, customers (including Private Labelers), distributors, wholesalers, retailers, predecessors, successors, and assigns. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term Private Labelers means a retailer that either (a) purchases any Living Ecology bar, which is an identical formulation as one of the Covered Product bars, to sell under the name of the retailer, or (b) purchases, on or before the Compliance Date, any Living Ecology product that is not a bar, which is an identical formulation as a Covered Product, to sell under the

1

3

4

8.

5 б

8

9

7

10 11

12 13

14 15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23 24

25

26

27

28

STIPULATED CONSENT JUDGMENT

BINDING EFFECT, CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

8.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between ERC, on behalf of itself and in the public interest, and Living Ecology, of any alleged violation of Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations for failure to provide Proposition 65 warnings of exposure to lead, and/or cadmium, from the handling, use, or consumption of the Covered Products and fully resolves all claims that have been or could have been asserted in these Actions up to and including the Effective Date for failure to provide Proposition 65 warnings for the Covered Products. For purposes of this Section 8, Covered Products includes the products sold by Private Labelers as defined in Section 7. ERC, on behalf of itself and in the public interest, hereby discharges Living Ecology and its respective officers, directors, shareholders, employees. agents, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions, affiliates, suppliers, franchisees, licensees, customers (including Private Labelers) and their respective distributors, wholesalers, retailers, and all other upstream and downstream entities in the distribution chain of any Covered Product, and the predecessors, successors and assigns of any of them (collectively, "Released Parties"), from any and all claims, actions, causes of action, suits, demands, liabilities, damages, penalties, fees, costs and expenses asserted, or that could have been asserted, as to any alleged violation of Proposition 65 arising from the failure to provide Proposition 65 warnings on the Covered Products regarding lead and/or cadmium, as these chemicals are alleged regarding the Covered Products in the Covered Products as set forth in the Notices and the Complaint up through and including the Compliance Date. Living Ecology warrants that as of the date Living Ecology executes this Consent Judgment: (a) no public enforcer is diligently prosecuting an action related to chemicals in the Covered Products from any of its Private Labelers; and (b) no Private Labeler has either received a pending 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 regarding lead and/or cadmium in the Covered Products or is currently in litigation, or been threatened with litigation, as to lead and/or cadmium in the Covered Products. The release provided herein in favor of Private Labelers shall not apply to any existing or pending 60-day Notices of Violations,

name of the retailer. This Consent Judgment shall have no application to Covered Products

which are distributed or sold exclusively outside the State of California.

CASE NO. RG14748134

X

litigation, or actions against any of the Private Labelers by any public or private enforcer regarding lead and/or cadmium in the Covered Products.

8.2 ERC on its own behalf only, on one hand, and Living Ecology on its own behalf only, on the other, further waive and release any and all claims they may have against each other for all actions or statements made or undertaken in the course of seeking or opposing enforcement of Proposition 65 in connection with the Notices or Complaint up through and including the Effective Date, provided, however, that nothing in Section 8 shall affect or limit any Party's right to seek to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment.

8.3 It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notices, the Actions or the Complaint and relating to the Covered Products will develop or be discovered. ERC on behalf of itself only, on one hand, and Living Ecology, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Consent Judgment is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date, including all rights of action therefore. ERC and Living Ecology acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 8.1 and 8.2 above may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code section 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code section 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

ERC on behalf of itself only, on the one hand, and Living Ecology, on the other hand, acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code section 1542.

8.4 Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed to constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by any releasee regarding alleged exposures to lead and/or cadmium, in the Covered Products as set forth in the Notices and the Complaint.

8.5 Nothing in this Consent Judgment is intended to apply to any occupational or environmental exposures arising under Proposition 65, nor shall it apply to any of Living Ecology's products other than the Covered Products. SEVERABILITY OF UNENFORCEABLE PROVISIONS In the event that any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining enforceable provisions shall not be adversely affected. 10. GOVERNING LAW The terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by and construed in accordance with the laws of the State of California 11. PROVISION OF NOTICE All notices required to be given to either Party to this Consent Judgment by the other shall be in writing and sent to the following agents listed below by: (a) first-class, registered, or certified mail; (b) overnight courier; or (c) personal delivery. Courtesy copies via email may also be sent. FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH CENTER: 14 l Chris Heptinstall, Executive Director, Environmental Research Center 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400 San Diego, CA 92108 Tel: (619) 500-3090 Email: chris\_erc501c3@yahoo.com With a copy to: WILLIAM F. WRAITH WRAITH LAW 24422 Avenida de la Carlota, Suite 400 Laguna Hills, CA 92653 Tel: (949) 452-1234 Fax: (949) 452-1102 LIVING ECOLOGY INC. and LIVING ECOLOGY MANUFACTURING INC. C/O Mr. Jack Singh 209 South Stephanie Street, B-235 Henderson, NV. 89012 and 240 Crouse Drive Corona, CA. 92879

STIPULATED CONSENT IUDGMENT

With a copy to:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

**CASE NO. RG14748134** 

TIMOTHY F. SHIELDS GEORGE & SHIELDS, LLP 30 Corporate Park, Suite 300 Irvine, California 92606-5133 Telephone: (949) 263-1085 Facsimile: (949) 263-0585

#### 12. COURT APPROVAL

- 12.1 Upon execution of this Consent Judgment by the Parties, ERC shall notice a Motion for Court Approval. The Parties shall use their best efforts to support entry of this Consent Judgment.
- 12.2 If the California Attorney General objects to any term in this Consent Judgment, the Parties shall use their best efforts to resolve the concern in a timely manner, and if possible prior to the hearing on the motion.
- 12.3 If this Stipulated Consent Judgment is not approved by the Court, it shall be void, inadmissible, unenforceable, mutually rescinded and cancelled, and have no force or effect.

### 13. EXECUTION AND COUNTERPARTS

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document. A facsimile or .pdf signature shall be construed as valid as the original signature.

#### 14. DRAFTING

The terms of this Consent Judgment have been reviewed by the respective counsel for each Party prior to its signing, and each Party has had an opportunity to fully discuss the terms and conditions with legal counsel. The Parties agree that, in any subsequent interpretation and construction of this Consent Judgment, no inference, assumption, or presumption shall be drawn, and no provision of this Consent Judgment shall be construed against any Party, based on the fact that one of the Parties and/or one of the Parties' legal counsel prepared and/or drafted all or any portion of the Consent Judgment. It is conclusively presumed that all of the Parties participated equally in the preparation and drafting of this Consent Judgment.

X

# 15. GOOD FAITH ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE DISPUTES

If a dispute arises with respect to either Party's interpretation or compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment entered by the Court, the Parties shall meet in person or by telephone and endeavor to resolve the dispute in an amicable manner. No action or motion may be filed in the absence of such a good faith attempt to resolve the dispute beforehand. In the event an action or motion is filed, however, the prevailing party may seek to recover costs and reasonable attorney's fees. As used in the preceding sentence, the term "prevailing party" means a party who is successful in obtaining relief more favorable to it than the relief that the other party was amenable to providing during the Parties' good faith attempt to resolve the dispute that is the subject of such enforcement action.

### 16. ENTIRE AGREEMENT, AUTHORIZATION

- 16.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter herein, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party. No other agreements, oral or otherwise, unless specifically referred to herein, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any Party.
- 16.2 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment. Except as explicitly provided herein, each Party shall bear its own fees and costs.

# 17. REQUEST FOR FINDINGS, APPROVAL OF SETTLEMENT AND ENTRY OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

This Consent Judgment has come before the Court upon the request of the Parties. The Parties request the Court to fully review this Consent Judgment and, being fully informed regarding the matters which are the subject of this action, to:

(1) Find that the terms and provisions of this Consent Judgment represent a fair and equitable settlement of all matters raised by the allegations of the Complaint, that the matter has been diligently prosecuted, and that the public interest is served by such settlement; and

	1
1	(2) Make the findings pursuant to California Health and Safety Code section
2	25249.7(f)(4), approve the Settlement, and approve this Consent Judgment.
3	it is so stipulated:
4	Dated: 8/29/ 2015 ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH
5	
6	Etris Hefrinatal, Experience Director
7	Dated: 8/3/ 2015 LIVING ECOLOGY INC.
8	
9	By: JACK L SINGH
10	Its: President
11	Dated: 873 LIVING ECOLOGY MANUFACTURING
12	INC.
13	By: JACK J. SINGH
14	Its: President
15	•
16	APPROVED AS TO FORM AND CONTENT:
17	Dated: 8/3/ 2015 WRAITH LAW
18	By: May Miles
19	William F. Wraith Attorney for Plaintiff Environmental
20	Research Center
21	
22	
23 24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	STIPULATED CONSENT JUDGMENT CASE NO. RG14748134
	15
11	· 1

1	APPROVED AS TO FORM AND CONTENT:
2	Dated: 831, 2015 GEORGE & SHIELDS, LLP
4	
5	By: Intelliget Sticker Timothy F. Shields
6	Julie E. Ritchie  Attorneys for Defendants Living Ecology
7	Inc. and Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc.
8	inc.
9	•
10	
11	
12	
13	ORDER AND JUDGMENT
14   15	Based upon the Parties' Stipulation, and good cause appearing, this Consent Judgment is
16	approved and Judgment is hereby entered according to its terms.
17	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED.
18	Dated: <u>Dec. 15</u> , 2015
19	Judge of the Superior Court
20	
21	
22	
23 24	
25	
26	
27	
8	
	STIPULATED CONSENT JUDGMENT CASE NO. RG14748134

## **WRAITH LAW**

16485 LAGUNA CANYON ROAD SUITE 250 IRVINE, CALIFORNIA 92618 Tel (949) 251-9977 Fax (949) 251-9978

January 31, 2014

# NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violators and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Environmental Research Center ("ERC"), 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. (619) 500-3090. ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall. ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

ERC has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq., with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violators identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violators and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, ERC intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

General Information about Proposition 65. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is attached with the copy of this letter served to the alleged Violators identified below.

Alleged Violator. The names of the companies covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violators") are:

Living Ecology Inc.
Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc.

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemicals</u>. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

- Bio International Organic Active Greens Powder Lead
- Bio International Organic Active Greens Lead

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq.

January 31, 2014

Page 2

- Organic Food Bar Inc. Raw Organic Food Bar Cinnamon Raisin Lead
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Raw Organic Food Bar Chocolatey Chocolate Chip Lead
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Chocolate Covered Active Greens Lead
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Active Greens Protein Chocolate Covered Lead
- • Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Active Greens Lead
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Active Greens Chocolate Lead
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Original Lead
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Protein Lead
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Vegan Lead
- Organic Food Bar Inc. OFB Vegan Protein Vanilla Lead
- Organic Food Bar Inc. OFB Vegan Protein Strawberry Lead
- Organic Food Bar Inc. OFB Vegan Protein Chocolate Lead

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

**Route of Exposure.** The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of these products. Consequently, the primary route of exposure to these chemicals has been and continues to be through ingestion, but may have also occurred and may continue to occur through inhalation and/or dermal contact.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least January 31, 2011, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because they failed to provide persons handling and/or using these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to these chemicals.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violators to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, as well as an expensive and time consuming litigation.

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. January 31, 2014
Page 3

ERC has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violations to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead.

Sincerely,

William F. Wraith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Living Ecology Inc., Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc., and their Registered Agents for Service of Process only)

Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. January 31, 2014
Page 4

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: Environmental Research Center's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Living Ecology Inc. and Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc.

I, William F. Wraith, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: January 31, 2014

William F Wraith

William Falaith

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. January 31, 2014 Page 5

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

l, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On January 31, 2014, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

President or CEO

Living Ecology Inc.

209 South Stephanie Street

B-235

Henderson, NV 89012

Sagebrush Corporate Services LLC

(Registered Agent for Living Ecology Inc.)

8670 West Cheyenne Avenue, Suite 2008

Las Vegas, NV 89129

President or CEO

240 Crouse Drive

Living Ecology Inc.

Corona, CA 92879 President or CEO

Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc. 240 Crouse Drive Corona, CA 92879

Robert George

(Registered Agent for Living Ecology

Manufacturing Inc.) George & Shields LLP

30 Corporate Park, Suite 300

Irvine, CA 92606

On January 31, 2014, I electronically served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE \$25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1) on the following party by uploading a true and correct copy thereof on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On January 31, 2014, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE \$25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed on January 31, 2014, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. January 31, 2014 Page 6

Service List

District Attorney, Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900 Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Płacerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo County 230 W. Line Street Bishop, CA 93514

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130

District Attorney, Los Angeles County 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Monterey County Post Office Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney, Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney, Nevada County 110 Union Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, Riverside County 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004

District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney, San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Suite 322 San Francsico, CA 94103

District Attorney, San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Ave. Rm. 202 Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1035 Palm St, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Blvd., Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291

District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Ave, Suite 314 Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney, Yolo County 301 2nd Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett PL San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113

# **WRAITH LAW**

16485 LAGUNA CANYON ROAD SUITE 250 IRVINE, CALIFORNIA 92618 Tel (949) 251-9977 Fax (949) 251-9978

April 4, 2014

# NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violators and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Environmental Research Center ("ERC"), 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. (619) 500-3090. ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall. ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

ERC has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq., with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violators identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violators and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, ERC intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

General Information about Proposition 65. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is attached with the copy of this letter served to the alleged Violators identified below.

Alleged Violators. The names of the companies covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violators") are:

Living Ecology Inc.
Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc.

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemicals</u>. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

Organic Food Bar Inc. OFB Whey Protein Strawberry - Lead Organic Food Bar Inc. OFB Whey Protein Vanilla - Lead Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. April 4, 2014
Page 2

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of these products. Consequently, the primary route of exposure to these chemicals has been and continues to be through ingestion, but may have also occurred and may continue to occur through inhalation and/or dermal contact.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least April 4, 2011, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because they failed to provide persons handling and/or using these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to these chemicals.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violators to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, as well as an expensive and time consuming litigation.

ERC has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violations to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead.

Sincerely.

William Falaith

William F. Wraith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Living Ecology Inc., Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc., and their Registered Agents for Service of Process only)

Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. April 4, 2014
Page 3

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: Environmental Research Center's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Living Ecology Inc. and Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc.

### I, William F. Wraith, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 4, 2014

William F. Wraith

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. April 4, 2014
Page 4

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On April 4, 2014, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO Living Ecology Inc. 209 South Stephanie Street, B-235 Henderson, NV 89012 Sagebrush Corporate Services LLC (Registered Agent for Living Ecology Inc.) 8670 West Cheyenne Avenue, Suite 2008 Las Vegas, NV 89129

Current President or CEO Living Ecology Inc. 240 Crouse Drive Corona, CA 92879 Robert George (Registered Agent for Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc.) George & Shields LLP 30 Corporate Park, Suite 300 Irvine, CA 92606

Current President or CEO Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc. 240 Crouse Drive Corona, CA 92879

On April 4, 2014, I electronically served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1) on the following party by uploading a true and correct copy thereof on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On April 4, 2014, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed on April 4, 2014, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

Tiffany Capehart

# Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. April 4, 2014

Page 5

**Service List** 

District Attorney, Alameda County
1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900
Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo County 230 W. Line Street Bishop, CA 93514

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130 District Attorney, Los Angeles County 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Monterey County Post Office Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney, Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney, Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, Riverside County 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004 District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney, San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Suite 322 San Francsico, CA 94103

District Attorney, San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Ave. Rm. 202 Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1035 Palm St, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12<sup>th</sup> Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Blvd., Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291 District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Ave, Suite 314 Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney, Yolo County 301 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett PL San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor San Jose, CA 95113 **WRAITH LAW** 

24422 AVENIDA DE LA CARLOTA SUITE 400 LAGUNA HILLS, CA 92653 Tel (949) 452-1234 Fax (949) 452-1102

April 10, 2015

# NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 *ET SEQ.* (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violators and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Environmental Research Center ("ERC"), 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. (619) 500-3090. ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall. ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

ERC has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq., with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violators identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violators and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, ERC intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

General Information about Proposition 65. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is attached with the copy of this letter served to the alleged Violators identified below.

Alleged Violators. The names of the companies covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violators") are:

Living Ecology Inc.
Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc.

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemical</u>. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

- Organic Food Bar Inc. Raw Organic Food Bar Cinnamon Raisin Cadmium
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Raw Organic Food Bar Chocolatey Chocolate Chip Cadmium
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar High Energy Protein Cadmium
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar High Energy Vegan Cadmium
- Organic Food Bar Inc. Organic Food Bar Vegan Protein Vanilla- Cadmium

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. April 10, 2015
Page 2

Cadmium was officially listed as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity and male reproductive toxicity on May 1, 1997 while Cadmium and Cadmium Compounds were listed as chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer on October 1, 1987.

It should be noted that ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of these products. Consequently, the primary route of exposure to this chemical has been and continues to be through ingestion, but may have also occurred and may continue to occur through inhalation and/or dermal contact.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least April 10, 2012, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemical. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because they failed to provide persons handling and/or using these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to this chemical.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violators to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemical, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical, as well as an expensive and time consuming litigation.

ERC has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violations to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead.

Sincerely.

William Flesaith

William F. Wraith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Living Ecology Inc., Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc., and their Registered Agents for Service of Process only)

Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. April 10, 2015 Page 3

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: Environmental Research Center, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Living Ecology Inc. and Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc.

### I, William F. Wraith, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 10, 2015

William F Wraith

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. April 10, 2015 Page 4

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On April 10, 2015, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEO.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO Living Ecology Inc. 209 South Stephanie Street, B-235

Henderson, NV 89012

Current President or CEO Living Ecology Inc. 240 Crouse Drive Corona, CA 92879

Current President or CEO Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc. 240 Crouse Drive Corona, CA 92879

Sagebrush Corporate Services LLC (Registered Agent for Living Ecology Inc.) 1810 East Sahara Avenue, Suite 214 Las Vegas, NV 89104

Robert K. George (Registered Agent for Living Ecology Manufacturing Inc.) George & Shields LLP

30 Corporate Park, Suite 300 Irvine, CA 92606

On April 10, 2015, I verified the following documents NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1) were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On April 10, 2015, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed on April 10, 2015, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

# Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. April 10, 2015

Page 5

#### Service List

District Attorney, Alameda County
1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900
Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo County 230 W. Line Street Bishop, CA 93514

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130 District Attorney, Los Angeles County 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Monterey County Post Office Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

District Attorney, Napa County Post Office Box 720 Napa, CA 94559

District Attorney, Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, Riverside County 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814

District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004 District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney, San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Suite 322 San Francsico, CA 94103

District Attorney, San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Ave. Rm. 202 Stockton, CA 95202

District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1035 Palm St, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110

District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12<sup>th</sup> Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Blvd., Room 224 Visalía, CA 93291 District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Ave, Suite 314 Ventura, CA 93009

District Attorney, Yolo County 301 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Woodland, CA 95695

District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 I Dr Carlton B Goodlett PL San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor San Jose, CA 95113

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1

2

3

4

5

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

I, William F. Wraith, am an active member of the State Bar of California and not a party to this action. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing took place. My business address is 24422 Avenida de la Carlota, Suite 400, Laguna Hills, CA 92653.

On January 5, 2016, I served the foregoing documents described as: **NOTICE OF ENTRY OF JUDGMENT** on the following interested party in this action in the manner identified below:

Timothy F. Shields, Esq.
David W. Sparks, Esq.
Julie E. Ritchie, Esq.
George & Shields, LLP
30 Corporate Park, Suite 300
Irvine, CA 92606
Tel: (949) 263-1085
Attorneys for Defendants

California Dept. of Justice, Office of the Attorney General

**Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting** 

Attention: Prop 65 Coordinator

1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000

Post Office Box 70550

Oakland, California 94612-0550

[X] **BY MAIL** – **COLLECTION:** I placed the envelope for collection and mailing following this business's ordinary business practices. I am readily familiar with this business's practice for collecting and processing correspondence for mailing. On the same day that correspondence is placed for collection and mailing, it is deposited in the ordinary course of business with the United States Postal Service in a sealed envelope with postage fully prepaid.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above is true and correct. Executed on January 5, 2016 at Laguna Hills, California.

William Falaith

William F. Wraith