1			
2		and the same and the same of t	
3		ALAMPIA CONTINUE	
4		JUN 1 6 2015	
5		CLEEK OF TALL LIKE A	
6		EVYOLANDA ESTRADA	
7			
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
9	FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA		
10			
11	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH, a non-profit corporation,) Case No. RG 14-722774	
12) (PROPOSED) CONSENT JUDGMENT	
13	Plaintiff,) AS TO C. LUCE, INC. DBA TCEC	
14	vs.))	
15	CECICO, INC., et al.,		
16	Defendants.))	
17)	
18			
19	1. INTRODUCTION		
20	1.1 This Consent Judgment is entered into by the Center For Environmental		
21	Health, a California non-profit corporation ("CEH") on the one hand, and C. Luce, Inc. dba		
22	TCEC ("Defendant") on the other hand, to settle certain claims asserted by CEH against		
23	Defendant as set forth in the operative complaint in the matter entitled Center for Environmental		
24	Health v. Cecico, Inc., et al., Alameda County Superior Court Case No. RG 14-722774 (the		
25	"Action").		
26	1.2 On October 31, 2014, CEH provided a "Notice of Violation" relating to the		
27	California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") to the		
28 DOCUMENT PREPARED	-1-		
ON RECYCLED PAPER		- 1	

CONSENT JUDGMENT - C. LUCE, INC. DBA TCEC - Case No. RG 14-722774

DOCUMENT PREPARED

California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every county in California, the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000, and to Defendant regarding the presence of lead and lead compounds (collectively referred to herein as "Lead") in clothing made with leather, vinyl, or imitation leather materials ("Covered Products").

- 1.3 On April 24, 2014, CEH filed the original Complaint in the Action. On March 9, 2015, CEH filed the operative First Amended Complaint naming Defendant as a defendant in the Action.
- 1.4 Defendant manufactures, distributes, and/or sells Covered Products in the State of California.
- 1.5 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, CEH and Defendant (the "Parties") stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein with respect to Covered Products manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Defendant.
- settlement of all claims that were raised in the Complaint, or which could have been raised in the Complaint, arising out of the facts or conduct related to Defendant alleged therein. By execution of this Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any facts or conclusions of law including, but not limited to, any facts or conclusions of law suggesting or demonstrating any violations of Proposition 65 or any other statutory, common law, or equitable requirements. Nothing in this Consent Judgment is or shall be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law. Defendant denies the material, factual and legal allegations in CEH's Complaint and expressly denies any wrong doing whatsoever. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right,

DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER

remedy, argument, or defense the Parties may have in this or any other pending or future legal proceedings. This Consent Judgment is the product of negotiation and compromise and is accepted by the Parties solely for purposes of settling, compromising, and resolving issues disputed in this action.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

- 2.1 **Reformulation of Covered Products.** As of the date of entry of this Consent Judgment (the "Effective Date"), Defendant shall not manufacture, ship, sell, or offer for sale any Covered Product in California or anywhere else unless such Covered Product complies with the following Lead Limits:
- 2.1.1 "Paint or other Surface Coatings" as that term is defined in 16 C.F.R. § 1303.2(b): no more than 0.009 percent Lead by weight (90 parts per million ("ppm").
- 2.1.2 Polyvinyl chloride ("PVC"): no more than 0.02 percent Lead by weight (200 ppm).
- 2.1.3 All other materials other than cubic zirconia (sometimes called cubic zirconium, CZ), crystal, glass or rhinestones: no more than 0.03 percent Lead by weight (300 ppm).
- 2.2 Market Withdrawal of Covered Products. On or before the Effective Date, Defendant shall cease shipping the (i) the TCEC Asymmetrical Zip Faux Leather Jacket in Olive, SKU No. 1-712-187520503, Item No. 187520503, Style No. CJ5228, and (ii) the Foreign Exchange Mini Skirt with Quilts in Burgundy, Item No. 102014, Style No. CS2225FE ("Recall Covered Products"), to stores and/or customers in California, and Defendant shall withdraw the Recall Covered Products from the market in California, and, at a minimum, send instructions to any of its stores and/or customers that offer the Recall Covered Products for sale in California to cease offering such Recall Covered Products for sale and to either return all Recall Covered Products to Defendant for destruction, or to directly destroy the Recall Covered Products. Any destruction of the Recall Covered Products shall be in compliance with all applicable laws. Defendant shall keep and make available to CEH for inspection and copying records and correspondence regarding the market withdrawal and destruction of the Recall Covered Products.

If there is a dispute over the corrective action, the Parties shall meet and confer before seeking any remedy in court.

3. ENFORCEMENT

2.1 Enforcement Procedures. Prior to bringing any motion or order to show cause to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, a Party seeking to enforce shall provide the violating party thirty (30) days advanced written notice of the alleged violation. The Parties shall meet and confer during such thirty (30) day period in an effort to try to reach agreement on an appropriate cure for the alleged violation. After such thirty (30) day period, the Party seeking to enforce may, by new action, motion, or order to show cause before the Superior Court of Alameda, seek to enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent Judgment.

4. PAYMENTS

- 4.1 **Payments From Defendant.** Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$35,000 as a settlement payment. This total payment shall be made in two installments according to the following schedule: (a) within 5 days of the Effective Date, Defendant shall pay \$17,500 as a settlement payment; (b) within 45 days of the Effective Date, Defendant shall pay \$17,500 as a settlement payment. Each of these payments shall be paid in three separate checks delivered to the address set forth in Section 7.1.2 and shall be made payable and allocated as set forth in Section 4.2. Any failure by Defendant to comply with the payment terms herein shall be subject to a stipulated late payment fee of \$100 per day, which amount shall be recoverable by CEH, together with its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs, in an enforcement proceeding brought pursuant to Section 3.
- 4.2 **Allocation of Payments.** The total settlement amount for Defendant shall be paid in three separate checks delivered to the offices of the Lexington Law Group (Attn: Howard Hirsch), 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, California 94117, and made payable and allocated as follows:
- 4.2.1 Defendant shall pay a total sum of \$4,600 as a penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), such money to be apportioned by CEH in accordance with Health & Safety Code § 25249.12. \$2,300 of this amount shall be included with the first payment due

within 5 days of the Effective Date, and \$2,300 of this amount shall be included with the second payment due within 45 days of the Effective Date. Each penalty check shall be made payable to the Center for Environmental Health.

4.2.2 Defendant shall pay a total sum of \$6,900 as payment to CEH in lieu of penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, § 3202(b). CEH will use such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people from exposures to toxic chemicals, including heavy metals. CEH may also use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with the reformulation requirements of this and other similar Consent Judgments and to purchase and test Covered Products to confirm compliance with such reformulation requirements. In addition, as part of its *Community Environmental Action and Justice Fund*, CEH will use four percent of such funds to award grants to grassroots environmental justice groups working to educate and protect people from exposures to toxic chemicals. The method of selection of such groups can be found at the CEH web site at www.ceh.org/justicefund. \$3,450 of this amount shall be included with the first payment due within 5 days of the Effective Date, and \$3,450 of this amount shall be included with the second payment due within 45 days of the Effective Date. Each payment in lieu of penalty check shall be made payable to the Center for Environmental Health.

4.2.3 Defendant shall pay a total sum of \$23,500 as reimbursement of reasonable attorneys' fees and costs. \$11,750 of this amount shall be included with the first payment due within 5 days of the Effective Date, and \$11,750 of this amount shall be included with the second payment due within 45 days of the Effective Date. Each attorneys' fees and cost reimbursement check shall be made payable to the Lexington Law Group.

5. MODIFICATION AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION

- 5.1 **Modification.** This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to time by express written agreement of the Parties, with the approval of the Court, or by an order of this Court upon motion and in accordance with law.
- 5.2 **Notice; Meet and Confer.** Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with the other Party prior to filing a

3

4

motion to modify the Consent Judgment.

by Defendant prior to the Effective Date.

6.1

6.2

6. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE

5 6

7

9

8

11 12

10

13

14

15 16

17

18 19

20

21

2223

24

25

5 7. PROVISION OF NOTICE

after the Effective Date.

prior to the Effective Date.

6.3

26

27

28

7.1 When any Party is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail as follows:

This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between CEH

CEH, for itself and acting on behalf of the public interest pursuant to Health &

Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Defendant and the

and Defendant and Defendant's parents, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries,

whom they distribute or sell Covered Products including, but not limited to, distributors,

partners, sister companies, and their successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all to

wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees ("Downstream

Defendant Releasees"), of any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law

Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Defendant Releasees, regarding the failure to warn about

exposure to Lead arising in connection with Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold

Safety Code § 25249.7(d), releases, waives, and forever discharges any and all claims against

violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that have been or could

have been asserted in the public interest regarding the failure to warn about exposure to Lead

arising in connection with Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendant

Defendant Releasees shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Defendant, the

Defendant Releasees, and their Downstream Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged

failure to warn about Lead in Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendant

Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Defendant Releasees arising from any

claims that have been or could have been asserted in the public interest against Defendant,

-6-

1	7.1.1 Notices to Defendant. The person for Defendant to receive notices		
2	pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be:		
3 4 5	Mark Brutzkus Ezra Brutzkus Gubner LLP 21650 Oxnard Street, Suite 500 Woodland Hills, CA 91367-4911 mbrutzkus@ebg-law.com		
6			
7	7.1.2 Notices to Plaintiff. The person for CEH to receive notices pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be:		
8	Howard Hirsch		
9	Lexington Law Group 503 Divisadero Street		
10 11	San Francisco, CA 94117 hhirsch@lexlawgroup.com		
12	7.2 Any Party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent		
13	by sending the other Party notice by first class and electronic mail.		
14	8. COURT APPROVAL		
15	8.1 This Consent Judgment shall become effective on the Effective Date, provided		
16	however, that CEH shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and		
17	Defendant shall support approval of such Motion.		
18	8.2 If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force or		
19	effect and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any		
20	purpose.		
21	9. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION		
22	9.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State		
23	of California.		
24	10. ENTIRE AGREEMENT		
25	10.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and		
26	understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior		
27	discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby		
28	merged herein and therein. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between		

the Parties except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein. No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

11. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

12. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT

12.1 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally to bind that Party.

13. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS

13.1 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim against another entity on terms that are different than those contained in this Consent Judgment.

14. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS

14.1 The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.

1	HE 10 CO CEVENTA AMERICA	
1 2	IT IS SO STIPULATED:	
3		
4	Dated: Agan 22 , 2015 C	ENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
5		O(1-
6		Có-
7		gnature
8		\sim D
9	H 1	Course Pizaras
10		Timed Name
11		ASSOCIATE DIRECTOR
12		itle
13	Dated:, 2015 C.	LUCE, INC. DBA TCEC
14		ACCE, N. C. DDAY TCEC
15		
16	Si	gnature
17		
18		
19	P	rinted Name
20		
21		1
22		itle
23		
24	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED	
25 26	AND DECREED	
26	Dated:	
28		UDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE TATE OF CALIFORNIA
DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER		-9-
START PULLUT PAPER	CONSENT JUDGMENT - C. LUCE, INC. DBA TCEC Case No. RG 14-722774	

1	IT IS SO STIPULATED:	
2		
3	Dated: 2015	CENTED TOD ENVIDONMENTAL HEAT TH
4	Dated:, 2015	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
5		
6		Signature
7		
8		
9		Printed Name
10		
11		TO I
12		Title
13	Dated: 4, 20 , 2015	C. LUCE, INC. DBA TCEC
14		
15		thoughout though
16		Signature
17		
18		CHONG MO CHONG
19		Printed Name
20 21		
22		President.
23		
24		
25	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED	
26		
27	Dated: JUN 1 6 2015	GEORGE C. HERNANDEZ, JR.
28	·	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER		-9-

CONSENT JUDGMENT - C. LUCE, INC. DBA TCEC - Case No. RG 14-722774