

APR 1 4 2017

CLERK OF THE COURT Green Deputy Clerk

PACIFIC JUSTICE CENTER Melvin B. Pearlston (State Bar No. 54291) Robert B. Hancock (State Bar No. 179438) rbh@lawyer.com 50 California Street, Suite 1500 San Francisco, California 94111 Telephone: 415.310.1940

Attorneys for Plaintiff

б

10

11

12

13

14

3

ROGERS JOSEPH O'DONNELL James Robert Maxwell (State Bar No. 143203) jmaxwell@rjo.com 311 California Street San Francisco, California 94104 Telephone: 415.956.2828 Facsimile: 415.956.6457

Attorneys for Defendants

through 500, inclusive,

Plaintiff,

. Defendants.

ADVANTAGE HEALTH MATTERS, INC., a

corporation; HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA, INC., a Delaware corporation, and DOES 1

SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA

COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

15

ERIKA MCCARTNEY, in the public interest, 16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24

25 26

27

CIVIL ACTION NO. CGC-15-545930

[PROPOSED] STIPULATED CONSENT JUDGMENT; [PROPOSED] ORDER

[Cal. Health and Safety Code Sec. 25249.6, et seg.]

PROPOSED STIPULATED CONSENT JUDGMENT; PROPOSED ORDER McCartney v. Advantage Health Matters, Inc., et al., Case No. CGC-15-545930

385733,1

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 This Action arises out of the alleged violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. (also known as and hereinafter referred to as "Proposition 65") regarding Organic Traditions Cacao Nibs, hereinafter the "Covered Product."
- 1.2 Plaintiff ERIKA MCCARTNEY ("MCCARTNEY") is a California resident acting as a private enforcer of Proposition 65. MCCARTNEY brings this Action in the public interest pursuant to California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6 MCCARTNEY asserts that she is dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by reducing the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.
- 1.3 Defendant and signatory hereto, HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA, INC. is a Delaware corporation, and is referred to hereinafter as "HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA."
- 1,4 HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA distributes and sells the Covered Product in California.
- 1.5 MCCARTNEY and HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA are hereinafter sometimes referred to individually as a "Party" or collectively as the "Parties."
- 1.6 On or about December 18, 2014, and March 11, 2015, pursuant to California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)(1), MCCARTNEY served 60-Day Notices of Violation of Proposition 65 ("Notice of Violations") on HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA and defendant Advantage Health Matters, Inc., the California Attorney General, and other public enforcers. True and correct copies of the Notices of Violations are attached hereto as Exhibits A and B, respectively.
- 1.7 After more than sixty (60) days passed since service of the Notices of Violation, and no designated governmental agency filed a complaint or otherwise is diligently prosecuting a claim against HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA or Advantage Health Matters, Inc. with regard to the Covered Product or the alleged violations therein, MCCARTNEY filed an initial and first amended

.8

complaint (the "FAC") for injunctive relief and civil penalties. The FAC is based on the allegations in the Notice of Violations.

- 1.8 The FAC and the Notice of Violations each allege, in pertinent part that HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA manufactured, distributed, and/or sold in California the Covered Product containing cadmium, a chemical listed under Proposition 65 as a reproductive toxin, and exposed consumers at a level requiring a Proposition 65 warning. Further, the FAC and Notice of Violations allege that the Covered Product was sold in California without first providing clear and reasonable warnings, in violation of California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6. HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA generally denies all material and factual allegations of the Notice of Violation and the FAC, filed an answer asserting various affirmative defenses, specifically denies that the Plaintiff or California consumers have been harmed or damaged by its conduct in any manner whatsoever, and maintains that the Covered Product is completely safe for its intended use. HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA and MCCARTNEY each reserve all rights to allege additional facts, claims, and affirmative defenses if the Court does not approve this Consent Judgment.
- 1.9 The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment in order to settle, compromise and resolve disputed claims and avoid prolonged and costly litigation. Nothing in this Consent Judgment, nor compliance with its terms, shall constitute or be construed as an admission by any of the Parties, or by any of their respective officers, directors, shareholders, employees, agents, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions, affiliates, suppliers, franchisees, licensees, distributors, wholesalers, or retailers, of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, violation of law, fault, wrongdoing, or liability, including without limitation, any admission concerning any alleged violation of Proposition 65. Except as expressly set forth herein, nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right, remedy, argument, or defense the Parties may have in any other or future legal proceeding. Provided, however, nothing in this Section shall affect the enforceability of this Consent Judgment.
- 1.10 The "Effective Date" of this Consent Judgment shall be the date this Consent Judgment is entered as a Judgment by the Court.

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Action and personal jurisdiction over the Parties, that venue is proper in this Court, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment pursuant to the terms set forth herein.

3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF, REFORMULATION, TESTING, AND WARNINGS

permanently enjoined from offering for sale to a consumer in California, directly selling to a consumer in California, or "Distributing into California" any of the Covered Product for which an 18 gram serving size contains more than 4.1 micrograms of cadmium unless the label of the Covered Product contains a Proposition 65 warning, consistent with Section 3.4, below. "Distributing into California" or "Distribute into California" means to ship any of the Covered Product to California for sale or to sell any of the Covered Product to a distributor that HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA knows or has reason to know will sell the Covered Product in California. Provided, however, that HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA may manufacture or package and sell Covered Product for which an 18 gram serving size contains more than 4.1 micrograms of cadmium per day without providing a Proposition 65 warning so long as such products are only for sale to consumers located outside of California and HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA does not distribute them into California.

After the Effective Date, HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA shall not publish on the label of the Covered Product or on its website any recipe that calls for the use of the Covered Product which would, by serving, result in an exposure to cadmium greater than 4.1 micrograms without providing a Proposition 65 warning.

3.2 All Covered Product that has been or will have been distributed, shipped, sold, or otherwise placed in the stream of commerce through and including the Effective Date of this Consent Judgment are exempt from the provisions of Sections 3.1, and 3.3 through 3.4 and are included within the release in Sections 8.1 through 8.4. To be in compliance with the terms of this

Consent Judgment, HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA is not required to undertake any efforts or conduct to remove such Covered Product from the stream of commerce or otherwise alter its labeling.

- 3.3 For a period of three (3) years from the Effective Date, each batch or lot number of the Covered Product offered for sale to any consumer in California without a Proposition 65-compliant warning shall be tested for cadmium utilizing inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometry. All tests shall be conducted at the expense of HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA. Upon Plaintiff's written request, HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA shall provide the verified results of all tests to counsel for MCCARTNEY, via regular U.S. Mail, within fifteen (15) days of receipt of such written request. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, daily cadmium exposure levels shall be measured in micrograms and shall be calculated using the following formula: Micrograms of cadmium per gram of product, multiplied by 18 grams per serving of the product, which equals micrograms of cadmium exposure per day.
- 3.4 For the Covered Product that is subject to the warning requirement of Section 3.1, HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA shall provide the following warning ("Warning") as specified below:

[California Proposition 65] WARNING: This product contains [cadmium,] [a] chemical[s] known to the State of California to cause [cancer,] birth defects or other reproductive harm.

The text in brackets in the warning above is optional.

The Warning shall be permanently affixed to or printed on (at the point of manufacture, prior to shipment to California, or prior to distribution within California) the outside packaging or container of each unit of the Covered Product. The Warning shall be displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements designs or devices on the outside packaging or labeling, as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to use. If the Warning is displayed on the product container or labeling, the Warning shall be at least the same size as the largest of any other health or safety warnings on the product container

 or labeling, and the word "WARNING" shall be in all capital letters and in bold print. If printed on the labeling itself, the Warning shall be contained in the same section of the labeling that states other safety warnings concerning the use of the Covered Product.

Although Health Matters America remains free to warn in any manner consistent with the requirements above, displaying the Warning on the outside packaging, labeling, or container of each unit of the Covered Product is deemed to be a clear and reasonable warning under this Consent Judgment.

4. SETTLEMENT PAYMENT

- 4.1 In complete resolution of all of Plaintiff's claims, HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA shall make a total payment of \$60,000, which shall be in full and final satisfaction of any and all civil penalties, payment in lieu of civil penalties, and attorneys' fees and costs incurred in connection with Plaintiff's investigation and litigation of this matter through entry of this Consent Judgment by the Court.
- 4.2 The payment shall be made in three separate installments, in the form of separate checks sent to counsel for MCCARTNEY, Robert B. Hancock, Pacific Justice Center, 50 California Street, San Francisco, California 94111. The checks shall be payable to the following parties and shall be apportioned as follows: Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date: \$20,000 (twenty thousand dollars). Of this amount, \$15,000 (fifteen thousand dollars) shall be deemed penaltics, with \$11,250 payable to the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA"), and \$3,750 (three thousand seven hundred fifty) shall be payable to MCCARTNEY. (Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(c)(1) & (d)). MCCARTNEY's counsel shall have sole responsibility for delivering OEHHA's portion of the civil penalty to OEHHA. The remaining \$5,000 (five thousand dollars) shall be payable to Robert B. Hancock as partial reimbursement of MCCARTNEY's attorneys' fees, costs and investigation expenses. Two additional installments, of \$20,000 (twenty thousand dollars) each shall be paid in remaining satisfaction of MCCARTNEY's attorneys' fees, costs and investigation expenses. The second and third installments shall be due 60 (sixty) days and one hundred twenty (120) days after the Effective Date.

2 stipulation of the Parties and upon having such stipulation entered as a modified Consent Judgment by the Court; or (ii) upon entry of a modified Judgment by the Court pursuant to a motion by one of 5 б 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19

21

22

23

24

25

26

the Parties after exhausting the meet and confer process set forth as follows. If either Party requests or initiates a modification of this Consent Judgment, then it shall meet and confer with the other Party in good faith before filing a motion with the Court seeking to modify it. MCCARTNEY is entitled to reimbursement of all reasonable attorneys' fees and costs regarding the Parties' meet and confer efforts for any modification requested or initiated by HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA. Similarly, HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA is entitled to reimbursement of all reasonable attorney's fees and costs regarding the Parties' meet and confer efforts for any modification requested or initiated by MCCARTNEY. If, despite their meet and confer efforts, the Parties are unable to reach agreement on any proposed modification, the party seeking the modification may file the appropriate motion and the prevailing party on such motion shall be entitled to recover its reasonable fees and costs associated with such motion. One basis, but not the exclusive basis, for HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA to seek a modification of this Consent Judgment is if Proposition 65 is changed, narrowed, limited, or otherwise rendered inapplicable in whole or in part to the Covered Product or cadmium due to legislative change, a change in the implementing regulations, court decisions, or other legal basis. in the event that MCCARTNEY or the Attorney General's Office enters into an agreement 20

or consent judgment with any other person or entity that received a 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 alleging cadmium in cacao nibs, where such agreement or consent judgment establishes a serving size of less than 18 grams for purposes of determining whether the 4.1 microgram Proposition 65 cadmium MADL is exceeded, or at such time, if ever, that the California Office of Health Hazard Assessment or the FDA establishes a serving size for cacao nibs that is less than 18 grams, then that allowable level shall be deemed incorporated into this Consent Judgment, and HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA shall be permitted to distribute, sell or offer to

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) written agreement and

sell to California consumers any cacao nibs that it sells without a Proposition 65 Warning so long as such products do not exceed the 4.1 microgram cadmium MADL based on the revised serving size incorporated herein. Should MCCARTNEY in the future enter into any such agreement or consent judgment it shall notify HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA of such within 30 days after such agreement has been fully executed. Should a Court of Appeal hold that cacao nibs with specified levels of cadmium sold without a warning do not violate Proposition 65, then that level or shall be deemed incorporated into this Consent Judgment, and HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA shall be permitted to distribute, sell or offer to sell to California consumers any cacao nibs that it sells without a Proposition 65 Warning so long as such products comply with the allowable level for cadmium.

6. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION, ENFORCEMENT OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

- 6.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to enforce, modify or terminate this Consent Judgment.
- 6.2 Any Party may, by motion or application for an order to show cause filed with this Court, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent Judgment. The prevailing party in any such motion or application may request that the Court award its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs associated with such motion or application.

7. APPLICATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

This Consent Judgment shall apply to and be binding upon the Parties and their respective officers, directors, successors and assigns, and it shall benefit the Parties and their respective officers, directors, shareholders, employees, agents, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions, affiliates, franchisees, licensees, customers (including "Co-Brand" customers; excluding only "Private Labeler" customers), distributors, wholesalers, retailers, predecessors, successors, and assigns. "Private Labelers" excluded from the benefits of this Consent Judgment are companies who rebrand and offer Defendants' manufactured or distributed products under their own brand, not under Defendants' brand. "Co-Brand" customers who shall benefit from this Consent Judgment are companies who offer Defendants' manufactured or distributed products with their

8. BINDING EFFECT, CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

2

3

5

б

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

- This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between 8.1 MCCARTNEY, on behalf of herself and in the public interest, and HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA, of any and all direct or derivative violations (or claimed violations) of Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations for failure to provide Proposition 65 warnings of exposure to cadmium from the handling, use, or consumption of the Covered Product and fully resolves all claims that have been or could have been asserted in this Action up to and including the Effective Date for alleged failure to provide Proposition 65 warnings for the Covered Product regarding cadmium. MCCARTNEY, on behalf of herself and in the public interest, hereby forever releases and discharges, HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA and its past and present officers, directors, owners, shareholders, employees, agents, attorneys, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions, affiliates, suppliers, franchisees, licensees, customers (including "Co-Brand" customers; excluding only "Private Labeler" customers), distributors, wholesalers, retailers, and all other upstream and downstream entities and persons in the distribution chain of any Covered Product, and the predecessors, successors and assigns of any of them (collectively, "Released Parties"), from any and all claims and causes of action and obligations to pay damages, restitution, fines, civil penalties, payment in lieu of civil penalties and expenses (including but not limited to expert analysis fees, expert fees, attorney's fees and costs) (collectively, "Claims") arising under, based on, or derivative of Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations up through the Effective Date based on alleged or actual exposure to cadmium from the Covered Product and/or failure to warn about cadmium in the Covered Product, as set forth in the Notice of Violations and the FAC.
- 8.2 Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed to constitute compliance by any Released Party with Proposition 65 regarding alleged exposures to cadmium from the Covered Product as set forth in the Notice of Violations and the FAC.
- 8.3 It is possible that other claims or alleged violations relating to Covered Products or other cacao based products distributed or sold by Health Matters America or Advantage Health

Matters through the Effective Date not known to MCCARTNEY will develop or be discovered. MCCARTNEY, on behalf of herself, and each of her successors, assigns, legatees, heirs, attorneys, and personal representatives only, acknowledges that any such claims concerning such products distributed or sold by Health Matters America or Advantage Health Matters through the Effective Date are released herein as to the Released Parties including all known and unknown claims, and waives California Civil Code Section 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code Section 1542 reads as follows:

"A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR."

MCCARTNEY, on behalf of herself only, acknowledges and understands the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code section 1542.

8.4 MCCARTNEY, on one hand, and HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA, on the other hand, each release and waive all Claims they may have against each other for any statements or actions made or undertaken by them in connection with the Notice of Violations or the FAC. However, this shall not affect or limit any Party's right to seek to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment.

9. CONSTRUCTION AND SEVERABILITY

- 9.1 The terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment have been reviewed by the respective counsel for the Parties prior to its signing, and each Party has had an opportunity to fully discuss the terms and conditions with its counsel. In any subsequent interpretation or construction of this Consent Judgment, the terms and conditions shall not be construed against any Party.
- 9.2 In the event that any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining enforceable provisions shall not be adversely affected.
 - 9.3 The terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by and

McCarling v. Advantage Health Matters. Inc., of al., Case No. CGC-15-545930

385733,1

shall be deemed one document. A faosimile or .pdf signature shall be construed as valid and as the original signature.

13. ENTIRE AGREEMENT, AUTHORIZATION

- 13.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter herein, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party with respect to the subject matter herein. No other agreements, oral or otherwise, unless specifically referred to herein, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any Party with respect to the subject matter herein.
- 13.2 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment. Except as explicitly provided herein, each Party shall bear its own fees and costs.

14. REQUEST FOR FINDINGS AND FOR APPROVAL

- 14.1 This Consent Judgment has come before the Court upon the request of the Parties.

 The Parties request that the Court fully review this Consent Judgment and, being fully informed regarding the matters which are the subject of this action:
- (a) Find that the terms and provisions of this Consent Judgment represent a good faith settlement of all matters raised by the allegations of the Notice of Violations and FAC, that the matter has been diligently prosecuted, and that the public interest is served by such settlement; and

21 an

22 | ///

23 | ///

24 ///

25 ///

26 ///

27 ///

1	(b) Make the required findings pursuant to California Health and Safety Code							
2	Section 25249.7(f)(4), and approve this Consent Judgment.							
3								
4	IT IS SO STIPULATED.							
5	2/5/17 -							
6	Dated:	Erika McCaringy						
7		()						
8	Dated: JAN 3 /2017	Heath Matters America, Ing.						
9	Thinks of the second of the se	1 Hellen						
10		Name: PR & DENT						
11		Title: 1K ES WEN 1						
12	•							
13 14	APPROVED AS TO FORM;							
15	0 6							
16	Dated;, 2017	PACIFIC JUSTICE CENTER						
17	•	RR If						
18		By: Robert B. Hancock						
19		Attorneys for Plaintiff ERIKA MCCARTNEY						
20								
21	Dated: 1/31, 2017	ROGERS JOSEPH O'DONNELL						
22	•							
23		Ву:						
24		James Robert Maxwell						
25	•	Audrneys for Defendant HEALTH MATTERS AMERICA, INC.						
26								
27								

GRDERAND JUDGMENT

Based upon the Parties' Stipulation, and good cause appearing therefor, this Consent Judgment is approved in accordance with Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(f)(4) and judgment is hereby entered according to its terms.

2

3

23

24

25

26

27

5				,					
6	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED.								
7	Dated:	4/14, 2017	•	Judge of the S	Superior Co				
9	gergergeneries his disk jobal had ig i bis dikbooks stell in hely.	and the supplier with earlier to be to be a first street of the	*		_D KAHN				
10	,								
11									
12		•					42		
13	,					•			
14				•		•	•		
15					•				
16					•		,		
17		•	•	,		•			
18									
19		•							
20			-						
21	,		•						
22									

Page 13