1 Laralei Paras, State Bar No. 203319 THE CHANLER GROUP 2 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 3 Berkeley, CA 94710 SEP 27 2016 Telephone: (510) 848-8880 4 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118 CLERK OF THE COURT Bv: ___ ROSIE NOGUERA 5 Attorneys for Plaintiff Deputy Clerk PETER ENGLANDER 6 7 8 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA 9 CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO 10 UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION 11 12 PETER ENGLANDER, Case No. CGC-16-552854 13 Plaintiff, PROPOSED JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65 14 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT v. JUDGMENT 15 THE FOUNTAINHEAD GROUP, INC.; and DOES 1-150, inclusive, Date: September 27, 2016 16 Time: 9:30 a.m. Defendants. Courtroom: 302 17 Judge: Hon. Harold E. Kahn 18 Reservation No.: 08050927-12 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

In the above-entitled action, Plaintiff Peter Englander and Defendant The Fountainhead Group, Inc. (collectively, the "Parties") having agreed through their respective counsel that judgment be entered pursuant to the terms of their settlement agreement in the form of a Consent Judgment, and following this Court's issuance of an Order Approving Proposition 65 Settlement and Consent Judgment,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4) and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6, judgment is hereby entered in accordance with the terms of the Consent Judgment attached hereto as Exhibit 1. By stipulation of the parties, the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the settlement under Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: 9/24/16

JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

HAROLD KAHN

EXHIBIT 1

1 2 3 4	Laralei Paras, State Bar No. 203319 THE CHANLER GROUP 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565 Telephone: (510) 848-8880 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118	
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff PETER ENGLANDER	
6		
7	Frederick W. Kosmo Jr., State Bar No. 138036 WILSON TURNER KOSMO LLP	
8	550 West C Street, Suite 1050 San Diego, CA 92101-3532	
9	Telephone: (619) 236-9600 Facsimile: (619) 236-9669	
10	Attorneys for Defendant	
11	THE FOUNTAINHEAD GROUP, INC.	
12		
13	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA COUNTY OF ALAMEDA UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION	
14		
15		
16	DETER ENGLANDER	L C N CCC 16 552054
17	PETER ENGLANDER,	Case No. CGC-16-552854
18	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED]
19	V.	CONSENT JUDGMENT
20	THE FOUNTAINHEAD GROUP, INC., and DOES 1-150, inclusive,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq.)
21	Defendants.	
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff, Peter Englander ("Englander"), and defendant, The Fountainhead Group, Inc. ("Fountainhead"), with Englander and Fountainhead each referred to individually as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties."

1.2 Plaintiff

Englander is an individual residing in California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

1.3 Defendant

Fountainhead employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65").

1.4 General Allegations

Englander alleges that Fountainhead has manufactured, imported, shipped, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California, sprayers with vinyl/PVC tubing containing di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate ("DEHP"). DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

1.5 Product Description

The "Products" are defined as (i) sprayers with vinyl/PVC tubing ("Sprayers"), including but not limited to *Roundup Multi-Purpose Sprayer*, *Item No. 190315*, *UPC No. 8 41688 00240 1*, that are manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Fountainhead and that are sold to consumers in California; and (ii) vinyl/PVC tubing components ("Components") manufactured, imported, distributed, and/or sold by Fountainhead for use in Sprayers that are sold to consumers in California, including but not limited to *Roundup Ready-To-Use Weed & Grass Killer*, *UPC No. 70183 51001 6*. The term "Exemplar Sprayers" refers to Sprayers described in italics in this Section 1.5.

1.6 Notices of Violation

On September 24, 2015, Englander served Fountainhead and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" ("Fountainhead Notice") that provided the recipients thereof with notice of the allegation that Fountainhead was in violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 for failing to warn consumers that its sprayers with vinyl/PVC tubing exposed users in the State of California to DEHP. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Fountainhead Notice.

On September 24, 2015, Englander served The Monsanto Company ("Monsanto") and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" ("Monsanto Notice") that provided the recipients thereof with notice of the allegation that Monsanto was in violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 for failing to warn consumers that its sprayers with vinyl/PVC tubing exposed users in the State of California to DEHP. Englander was notified by counsel for Fountainhead that Fountainhead supplied the Product specifically identified in the Monsanto Notice. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Monsanto Notice.

The Fountainhead Notice and the Monsanto Notice are referred to herein collectively as the "Notices."

1.7 Complaint

On July 5, 2016, Englander filed the instant action against Fountainhead for the alleged violations of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 that are the subject of the Notices.

1.8 No Admission

Fountainhead denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notices and Complaint, and maintains that all of the products that it has sold in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, the same being specifically denied by

7

6

8 9

10

11

12 13

14 15

16 17

19

20

18

21

22

23

24 25

26 27

28

Fountainhead. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Fountainhead's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.9 **Consent to Jurisdiction**

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that the Court has jurisdiction over Fountainhead as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of San Francisco, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment.

1.10 **Execution Date**

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Execution Date" shall mean the date the Consent Judgment is signed by all Parties.

1.11 **Effective Date**

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date the Consent Judgment is approved by the Court.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION

Commencing on the date that is 30 days after the Effective Date (the "Compliance Date"), Fountainhead shall only manufacture, import, distribute, ship, sell or offer for sale Products that qualify as Reformulated Products, as defined in Section 2.1. Products that Fountainhead distributed, shipped, sold, or offered for sale prior to the Compliance Date, for which Fountainhead will pay a civil penalty pursuant to Section 3.1, are not subject to the requirements of Section 2 and are nonetheless covered within the scope of released claims in Section 4.

2.1 **Reformulation Standards**

"Reformulated Products" are defined as Products containing concentrations less than 0.1 percent (1000 parts per million) of DEHP, butyl benzyl phthalate ("BBP"), di-n-butyl ("DBP"), di-isodecyl phthalate ("DIDP"), and diisononyl phthalate ("DINP"), and di-n-hexyl phthalate ("DnHP") when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C, or equivalent methodologies utilized by federal or state agencies for the purpose of determining DEHP, BBP, DBP, DIDP, DINP, and DnHP content in a solid substance. By entering into this Consent Judgment, the Parties do not intend to expand or restrict any obligations or responsibilities

that may be imposed upon Fountainhead by laws other than Proposition 65, nor do the Parties intend this Consent Judgment to affect any defenses available to Fountainhead under laws other than Proposition 65.

2.2 Vendor Notification Requirement

To the extent it has not already done so, no more than ten (10) days after the Execution Date, Fountainhead shall provide the reformulation standards specified in Section 2.1 for Reformulated Products to any and all of its vendors of Products, and shall instruct each vendor to use its best efforts to provide only Reformulated Products, as defined in Section 2.1.

3. MONETARY PAYMENTS

3.1 Civil Penalties Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b)

In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Consent Judgment, Fountainhead shall pay a total of \$135,000 in civil penalties in accordance with this Section. Each penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the funds remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty retained by Englander, as follows:

- 3.1.1 Initial Civil Penalty. Within ten (10) business days of the Execution Date, Fountainhead shall issue a check for the intial civil penalty payable to "The Chanler Group in Trust for Peter Englander" in the amount of \$45,000. Plaintiff's counsel shall provide appropriate tax identification information for the payment. Wilson Turner Kosmo LLP shall provide The Chanler Group with written confirmation within five (5) business days of receipt that said funds are being held in trust by Wilson Turner Kosmo LLP. Within five (5) business days of the Effective Date, Wilson Turner Kosmo LLP shall issue a check to "The Chanler Group in Trust for Peter Englander" in the amount of \$45,000.
- 3.1.2 Final Civil Penalty. On or before the Effective Date, Fountainhead shall pay a final civil penalty in the amount of \$90,000 with one check made payable to "Peter Englander, Client Trust Account." The final civil penalty shall be waived in its entirety, however, if, no later than August 30, 2016, an officer of Fountainhead provides Englander with written certification that, as of the date of said certification, and continuing into the future, Fountainhead has met the reformulation standard

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

specified in Section 2.1 above for all Products. The certification in lieu of a final civil penalty payment provided by this Section is a material term, and time is of the essence.

3.2 Reimbursement of Englander's Fees and Costs

The Parties acknowledge that Englander and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving the issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. Shortly after all other settlement terms had been finalized, Fountainhead expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue. The Parties then attempted to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due Englander and his counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 for all work performed in this matter exclusive of fees and costs incurred on appeal, if any. Under these legal principles, Fountainhead shall pay \$54,000 for fees and costs incurred investigating, litigating, and enforcing this matter, including the fees and costs incurred (and to be incurred) drafting, negotiating, and obtaining the Court's approval of this Consent Judgment in the public interest. Plaintiff's counsel shall provide appropriate tax identification information for the payment. Within ten (10) business days of the Execution Date, Fountainhead shall issue a check payable to "The Chanler Group" in the amount of \$54,000 to be held in trust by Wilson Turner Kosmo LLP for The Chanler Group. Wilson Turner Kosmo LLP shall provide The Chanler Group with written confirmation within five (5) business days of receipt that said funds have been received by Wilson Turner Kosmo LLP. Within five (5) business days of the Effective Date, Wilson Turner Kosmo LLP shall issue a check for \$54,000 payable to "The Chanler Group."

3.3 Payment Procedures

All payments owed to Plaintiff and his counsel, pursuant to Sections 3.1 and 3.3 shall be

delivered to:

The Chanler Group

Attn: Proposition 65 Controller

2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710

26 ///

27 ///

28 //

4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

4.1 Englander's Release of Proposition 65 Claims

Englander, acting in the public interest in a representative capacity, and acting on his own behalf in an individual capacity and on behalf of his past and current attorneys, agents, representatives, successors, assigns, and heirs, forever discharges and releases all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, fees (including, but not limited to, attorneys' fees, investigation fees, and expert fees), damages, losses, penalties, claims, liabilities, rights, judgments, obligations, duties, and demands (collectively, "Claims"), and waives all rights to institute or participate in (directly or indirectly) any form of legal action, against Fountainhead, each entity to which Fountainhead directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Products including, but not limited to, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, franchisees, brokers, cooperative members, licensees and retailers, and all other downstream entities in the distribution chain of any Products, and the directors, officers, owners, shareholders, employees, attorneys, representatives, successors, and assigns of any of them (collectively, "Releasees") with respect to alleged violations of Proposition 65 for any exposures to DEHP from (i) Components manufactured, purchased, imported, distributed or sold by Fountainhead prior to the Compliance Date, (ii) Exemplar Sprayers and the products sold in the Exemplar Sprayers, (iii) Sprayers and/or products sold in Sprayers to the extent that any DEHP in the Sprayers or in the products sold in Sprayers results from Sprayers or Components that are manufactured, imported, distributed, and/or sold by Fountainhead prior to the Compliance Date, and (iv) Components manufactured, imported, distributed, and/or sold by Fountainhead prior to the Compliance Date incorporated in Sprayers sold or assembled by any Releasee, as set forth in the Notices. This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution as to the Claims referenced in this Section 4.1. Fountainhead's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 by any Releasee for any exposures to DEHP from (i) Components distributed or sold by Fountainhead on and after the Compliance Date, (ii) Exemplar Sprayers and the products sold in the Exemplar Sprayers, (iii) Sprayers and/or products sold in Sprayers to the extent that any DEHP in the Sprayers or in the products sold in Sprayers results from Sprayers or Components that are manufactured, imported, distributed, and/or sold by Fountainhead on and after the Compliance Date,

and (iv) Components distributed, and/or sold by Fountainhead on and after the Compliance Date incorporated in Sprayers sold or assembled by any Releasee, as set forth in the Notices.

4.2 Englander's Individual Release of Claims

Englander, in his individual capacity only and *not* in his representative capacity, also provides a release on behalf of himself, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, assigns, and heirs as to all Releasees, which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all Claims of any nature, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to DEHP, BBP, DBP, DIDP, DINP, and DnHP from (i) Components manufactured, purchased, imported, distributed or sold by Fountainhead prior to the Compliance Date, (ii) Exemplar Sprayers and the products sold in the Exemplar Sprayers, (iii) Sprayers and/or products sold in Sprayers to the extent that any DEHP in the Sprayers or in the products sold in Sprayers results from Sprayers or Components that are manufactured, imported, distributed, and/or sold by Fountainhead prior to the Compliance Date, and (iv) Components manufactured, imported, distributed, and/or sold by Fountainhead prior to the Compliance Date incorporated in Sprayers sold or assembled by any Releasee, as set forth in the Notices. The Parties agree that Fountainhead's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance by any Releasee with Proposition 65 with respect to any DEHP, BBP, DBP, DIDP, DINP, and DnHP from (i) Components distributed or sold by Fountainhead on and after the Compliance Date, (ii) Exemplar Sprayers and the products sold in the Exemplar Sprayers, (iii) Sprayers and/or products sold in Sprayers to the extent that any DEHP in the Sprayers or in the products sold in Sprayers results from Sprayers or Components that are manufactured, imported, distributed, and/or sold by Fountainhead on and after the Compliance Date, and (iv) Components distributed or sold by Fountainhead on and after the Compliance Date incorporated in Sprayers sold or assembled by any Releasee, as set forth in the Notices. Englander acknowledges that he is familiar with California Civil Code § 1542, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF

24

25

26

27

KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

Englander understands and acknowledges the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code § 1542 is that if Englander hereafter discovers facts different from or in addition to those that he now believes to be true with respect to the matters released herein, he will not be able to assert any Claims arising from such facts. Englander acknowledges that he intends these consequences even as to any Claims that may exist as of the date of his execution of this Consent Judgment but which he does not know exist, and which, if known, would materially affect his decision to execute this Consent Judgment, regardless of whether his lack of knowledge is the result of ignorance, oversight, error, negligence, or any other cause except as otherwise provided herein. Englander, in his individual capacity only, and on behalf of himself, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assigns expressly waives and relinquishes any and all rights and benefits which he may have under California Civil Code § 1542 to the fullest extent that it may lawfully waive such rights or benefits pertaining to the released matters.

4.3 Fountainhead's Release of Englander

Fountainhead on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Englander, his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Englander and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Products. Fountainhead also acknowledges that it is familiar with California Civil Code § 1542, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

Fountainhead understands and acknowledges the significance and consequence of this waiver

of California Civil Code § 1542 is that if Fountainhead hereafter discovers facts different from or in addition to those that it now believes to be true with respect to the matters released herein, it will not be able to assert any Claims arising from such facts. Fountainhead acknowledges that it intends these consequences even as to any Claims that may exist as of the date of its execution of this Consent Judgment but which it does not know exist, and which, if known, would materially affect its decision to execute this Consent Judgment, regardless of whether its lack of knowledge is the result of ignorance, oversight, error, negligence, or any other cause except as otherwise provided herein. Fountainhead, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assigns expressly waives and relinquishes any and all rights and benefits which it may have under California Civil Code § 1542 to the fullest extent that it may lawfully waive such rights or benefits pertaining to the released matters.

5. COURT APPROVAL

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by all Parties.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment, any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or if any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment are rendered inapplicable or no longer required as a result of any such repeal or preemption or rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally as to the Products, then Fountainhead shall provide written notice to Englander of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be interpreted to relieve Fountainhead from any applicable obligation to comply with any pertinent state or federal toxics control law.

8. NOTICES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and (i) personally delivered, (ii) sent by first-class (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested, or (iii) sent by overnight courier, to one Party by the other Party at the following addresses:

For Fountainhead:

For Englander:

Daniel J. O'Toole, President The Fountainhead Group, Inc. 23 Garden Street New York Mills, NY 13417 Proposition 65 Coordinator The Chanler Group 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565

With a copy on behalf of Fountainhead to:

Frederick W. Kosmo Jr. Wilson Turner Kosmo LLP 550 West C Street, Suite 1050 San Diego, CA 92101-3532

Any Party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other Party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or pdf signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Englander agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, Englander and Fountainhead agree to mutually employ their best efforts, and those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as a Consent Judgment and to obtain judicial approval of the settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, cooperating on the drafting and filing of the necessary moving papers and supporting the motion for judicial approval.

111

11. **MODIFICATION** This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and upon entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court thereon; or (ii) upon a successful motion or application of any Party and the entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court. 12. **AUTHORIZATION** The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein. **AGREED TO:** AGREED TO: Date: 7/26/2016 The Fountainhead Group, Inc.