

NOV 17 2016

CLERK OF THE COURT

BY: FELICIA M. GREEN  
Deputy Clerk

1 Clifford A. Chanler, State Bar No. 135534  
2 Christopher Tuttle, State Bar No. 264545  
3 THE CHANLER GROUP  
4 2560 Ninth Street  
5 Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
6 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565  
7 Telephone: (510) 848-8880  
8 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118  
9 E-mail: cliff@chanler.com  
10 E-mail: ctuttle@chanler.com

11 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
12 WHITNEY R. LEEMAN, PH.D.

13 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

14 COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

15 UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION

16 WHITNEY R. LEEMAN, PH.D.,

17 Plaintiff,

18 v.

19 CW INTERNATIONAL SALES LLC, *et al.*,

20 Defendants.

Case No. CGC-16-551059

~~PROPOSED~~ JUDGMENT PURSUANT  
TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65  
SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT  
JUDGMENT

Date: November 17, 2016

Time: 9:30 a.m.

Dept. 302

Judge: Hon. Harold F. Kahn

Reservation No. 09231117-01

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Plaintiff Whitney R. Leeman, Ph.D., and Defendant CW International Sales LLC, having agreed through their respective counsel that Judgment be entered pursuant to the terms of their settlement agreement in the form of a consent judgment, and following this Court's issuance of an order approving their Proposition 65 settlement and Consent Judgment,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f)(4) and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6, judgment is hereby entered in accordance with the terms of the Consent Judgment attached hereto as Exhibit 1. By stipulation of the parties, the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the terms of the settlement under Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: NOV 17 2016

HAROLD KAHN  
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

# **EXHIBIT 1**

1 Clifford A. Chanler, State Bar No. 135534  
2 Christopher F. Tuttle, State Bar No. 264545  
3 THE CHANLER GROUP  
4 2560 Ninth Street  
5 Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
6 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565  
7 Telephone: (510) 848-8880  
8 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118  
9 E-mail: cliff@chanler.com  
10 E-mail: ctuttle@chanler.com

11 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
12 WHITNEY R. LEEMAN, PH.D.

13 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
14 COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO  
15 UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION

16 WHITNEY R. LEEMAN, PH.D.,

17 Plaintiff,

18 v.

19 CW INTERNATIONAL SALES LLC;  
20 CRYSTALWARE INT'L LLC; and DOES 1-  
21 150, inclusive,

22 Defendants.

Case No. CGC-16-551059

**[Proposed] CONSENT JUDGMENT**

(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* and  
Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6)

23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
CONSENT JUDGMENT

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 **1.1 Parties**

3 This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff Whitney R. Leeman,  
4 Ph.D. ("Leeman") and defendants CW International Sales LLC and Crystalware Int'l LLC  
5 (collectively "CW International"), with Leeman and CW International each referred to  
6 individually as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties."

7 **1.2 Plaintiff**

8 Leeman is a resident of the State of California who seeks to promote awareness of  
9 exposures to toxic chemicals, and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating harmful  
10 substances contained in consumer and commercial products.

11 **1.3 Defendant**

12 CW International employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing  
13 business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California  
14 Health and Safety Code section 25249.5 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65").

15 **1.4 General Allegations**

16 Leeman alleges that CW International manufactures, imports, sells and/or distributes for  
17 sale in California, vinyl/PVC gloves containing the phthalate chemical di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate  
18 ("DEHP"), and that it does so without providing the health hazard warning that Leeman alleges is  
19 required by Proposition 65.

20 **1.5 Product Description**

21 The products covered by this Consent Judgment are vinyl/PVC gloves containing DEHP,  
22 including, but not limited to, the *Sterex Vinyl Powder Free Gloves, VGPCPFGS, UPC #8 15797*  
23 *01058 9* (collectively, "Products").

24 **1.6 Notice of Violation**

25 On December 29, 2015, Leeman served CW International and the requisite public  
26 enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice"), alleging that CW  
27 International violated Proposition 65 when it failed to warn its customers and consumers in  
28 California that the Products expose users to DEHP. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no

1 public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the allegations  
2 set forth in the Notice.

3 **1.7 Complaint**

4 On March 22, 2016, Leeman commenced the instant action, naming CW International,  
5 among others, as a defendant for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of  
6 the Notice.

7 **1.8 No Admission**

8 CW International denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice  
9 and Complaint, and maintains that all of the products that it has sold or distributed for sale in  
10 California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in  
11 this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by CW International of any fact,  
12 finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this  
13 Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by CW International of any fact,  
14 finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This Section shall not, however,  
15 diminish or otherwise affect CW International's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this  
16 Consent Judgment.

17 **1.9 Jurisdiction**

18 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has  
19 jurisdiction over CW International as to the allegations contained in the Complaint, that venue is  
20 proper in the County of San Francisco, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the  
21 provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure  
22 section 664.6.

23 **1.10 Effective Date**

24 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date that  
25 the Court grants the motion for approval of this Consent Judgment contemplated by Section 5.

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

1 **2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION**

2 **2.1 Reformulated Products**

3 Commencing on or before the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, CW International  
4 agrees to only sell, distribute for sale, manufacture for sale, or purchase for sale in or into  
5 California, "Reformulated Products". For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Reformulated  
6 Products" are Products containing DEHP in concentrations of less than 0.1 percent (1,000 parts  
7 per million) when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing  
8 methodologies 3580A and 8270C or other methodology utilized by federal or state government  
9 agencies for the purpose of determining DEHP content in a solid substance.

10 **2.2 Exception for Existing Inventories and Non-California Customers**

11 The Parties agree that the reformulation commitment required by Section 2.1 of this  
12 agreement shall not apply to Products already in the stream of commerce prior to the Effective  
13 Date. For purposes of this section, "sell, distribute for sale, manufacture for sale, or purchase for  
14 sale in or into California" shall mean Products that CW International ships: (i) to a California  
15 address with actual or constructive knowledge that the purchaser is or is expected to re-sell to a  
16 California consumer or business; or (ii) to a customer with an address outside of California which  
17 CW International reasonably believes will re-sell to a California consumer or business. Products  
18 in third party, California-based inventories prior to the Effective Date are released under Section 4  
19 of this agreement.

20 **3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS**

21 **3.1 Payments Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b)(2)**

22 Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b)(2), and in settlement of all the  
23 claims referred to in this Consent Judgment, CW International shall pay \$3,100 in civil penalties  
24 in accordance with this Section. The penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with  
25 California Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the penalty amount  
26 remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEIHA") and  
27 the remaining 25% of the penalty amount paid to Plaintiff. Leeman's counsel shall be responsible  
28 for remitting CW International's penalty payment(s) under this Consent Judgment to OEIHA.

1           **3.2 Reimbursement of Attorneys' Fees and Costs**

2           The Parties acknowledge that Leeman and her counsel offered to resolve this dispute  
3 without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby  
4 leaving the issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled.  
5 Shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized, CW International expressed a desire  
6 to resolve Leeman's fees and costs. The Parties then negotiated a resolution of the compensation  
7 due to Leeman and her counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general  
8 doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5. For all work performed  
9 through the mutual execution of this agreement and the Court's approval of the same, but  
10 exclusive of fees and costs on appeal, if any, CW International shall reimburse Leeman and her  
11 counsel \$30,900. CW International's payment shall be delivered to the address in Section 3.4 in  
12 the form of a check payable to "The Chanler Group." The reimbursement shall cover all fees  
13 and costs incurred by Leeman investigating, bringing this matter to CW International's attention,  
14 litigating, and negotiating a settlement of the matter in the public interest.

15           **3.3 Payment Timing**

16           Within ten (10) business days of the Effective Date, CW International shall deliver all  
17 settlement payments to Leeman's counsel at the address provided in Section 3.4, including  
18 Leeman's fees and costs described in Section 3.2.

19           **3.4 Payment Address**

20           All payments required by this Consent Judgment shall be delivered to the following  
21 address:

22                           The Chanler Group  
23                           Attn: Proposition 65 Controller  
24                           2560 Ninth Street  
                              Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
                              Berkeley, CA 94710

25           **4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED**

26           **4.1 Leeman's Release of Proposition 65 Claims**

27           Leeman, acting on her own behalf and in the public interest, releases CW International  
28 and their parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers,



1 employees, and attorneys ("Releasees") and each entity to whom they directly or indirectly  
2 distribute or sell the Products including, but not limited to, their downstream distributors,  
3 wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisers, cooperative members, licensors and licensees  
4 ("Downstream Releasees") for any violations arising under Proposition 65 for unwarned  
5 exposures to DEHP from the Products manufactured, imported, distributed or sold by CW  
6 International prior to the Effective Date, as set forth in the Notice. Compliance with the terms of  
7 this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 by CW International with  
8 respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to DEHP from Products  
9 manufactured, sold or distributed for sale by CW International after the Effective Date.

#### 10 4.2 Leeman's Individual Release of Claims

11 Leeman, in her individual capacity only and *not* in her representative capacity, also  
12 provides a release to Defendants, Releasees, and Downstream Releasees which shall be effective  
13 as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations,  
14 costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of Leeman of  
15 any nature, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out  
16 of alleged or actual exposures to DEHP in Products manufactured, imported, distributed or sold  
17 by CW International before the Effective Date.

#### 18 4.3 CW International's Release of Leeman

19 CW International, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents,  
20 representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against  
21 Leeman and her attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements  
22 made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Leeman and her attorneys and other  
23 representatives in the course of investigating claims, seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it  
24 in this matter, or with respect to the Products.

### 25 5. COURT APPROVAL

26 This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and  
27 shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one  
28 year after it has been fully executed by the Parties. Leeman and CW International agree to

1 support the entry of this agreement as a judgment, and to obtain the Court's approval of their  
2 settlement in a timely manner. The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to California Health and  
3 Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required for judicial approval of this Consent  
4 Judgment, which motion Leeman shall draft and file and CW International shall support,  
5 including by appearing at the hearing if so requested. If any third-party objection to the motion is  
6 filed, Leeman and CW International agree to work together to file a reply and appear at any  
7 hearing. This provision is a material component of the Consent Judgment and shall be treated as  
8 such in the event of a breach.

9 **6. SEVERABILITY**

10 If, subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment as a judgment,  
11 any provision of this Consent Judgment is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the  
12 remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

13 **7. GOVERNING LAW**

14 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of  
15 California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed,  
16 preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products,  
17 then CW International may provide Leeman with written notice of any asserted change in the law,  
18 and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment, with respect to, and to  
19 the extent that, the Products are so affected. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be  
20 interpreted to relieve CW International from its obligation to comply with any pertinent state or  
21 federal law or regulation.

22 **8. NOTICE**

23 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment  
24 shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery, (ii) first-class registered or certified mail,  
25 return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to any Party by the other at the  
26 following addresses:  
27  
28

1  
2 To CW International:  
3 Carol Brophy, Esq.  
4 Sedgwick, LLP  
5 333 Bush St., 30<sup>th</sup> Floor  
6 San Francisco, CA 94104

To Leeman:  
Attn: Proposition 65 Coordinator  
The Chanler Group  
2560 Ninth Street  
Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
Berkeley, CA 94710-2565

7 Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other Party a change of address to  
8 which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

9 **9. COUNTERPARTS, FACSIMILE AND PDF SIGNATURES**

10 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable  
11 document format (pdf) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original and, all of which,  
12 when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

13 **10. COMPLIANCE WITH REPORTING REQUIREMENTS**

14 Leeman and her counsel agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced  
15 in California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f).

16 **11. MODIFICATION**

17 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties  
18 and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon; or (ii) upon a successful  
19 motion of any party and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon.

20 ///

21 ///

22 ///

23 ///

24 ///

25 ///

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**12. AUTHORIZATION**

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

**AGREED TO:**

*Whitney J. Leeman*  
WHITNEY J. LEEMAN, PH.D.

Dated: 9/8/16

**AGREED TO:**

*Abraham Weinberger*  
CW INTERNATIONAL SALES LLC

By: *Abraham Weinberger*  
(Print Name)

Its: *CEO*  
(Title)

Dated: 9/12/16