(ENDORSED) FILFO Clifford A. Chanler, State Bar No. 135534 1 Warren M. Klein, State Bar No. 303958 THE CHANLER GROUP FEB -7 2017 2 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 CLERK OF THE COURT SUPERIOR COURT OF CA COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA 3 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565 Telephone: (510) 848-8880 4 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118 T. NGO cliff@chanler.com 5 warren@chanler.com 6 Attorneys for Plaintiff RUSSELL BRIMER 7 8 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA 9 COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA 10 UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION 11 Case No. 16CV302093 RUSSELL BRIMER, 12 PROPOSED JUDGMENT PURSUANT Plaintiff. 13 TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT 14 v. **JUDGMENT** 15 KALTEX NORTH AMERICA, INC., et al., Date: February 7, 2017 Time: 9:00 a.m. 16 Defendants. Dept.: 3 17 Judge: Hon. William Elfving 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26

27

Plaintiff Russell Brimer and Defendants Kaltex North America, Inc. and Revman International, Inc., having agreed through their respective counsel that judgment be entered pursuant to the terms of their settlement agreement in the form of a consent judgment, and following this Court's issuance of an order approving their Proposition 65 settlement and Consent Judgment,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4) and California Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6, judgment is entered in accordance with the terms of the Consent Judgment attached hereto as **Exhibit 1**. By stipulation of the parties, the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the settlement pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: **FEB = 7 2017**

JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

EXHIBIT 1

1 2 3 4 5 6	Josh Voorhees, State Bar No. 241436 Warren M. Klein, State Bar No. 303958 THE CHANLER GROUP 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565 Telephone: (510) 848-8880 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118 Attorneys for Plaintiff RUSSELL BRIMER	
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF	THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
9	COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA	
10	UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION	
11	0112111112	
12	RUSSELL BRIMER,	Case No. 16CV302093
13	·	
14	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT
15	V.	(Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq.)
16	KALTEX NORTH AMERICA, INC., REVMAN INTERNATIONAL, INC., et al.	
17	Defendants.	
18	S-00-010-0-0-0	
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff Russell Brimer ("Brimer"), and defendants Kaltex North America. Inc. and Revman International, Inc. ("Defendants"), with Brimer and Defendants each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties."

1.2 Plaintiff

Brimer is an individual residing in California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

1.3 Defendant

Defendants employ ten or more individuals and is a "person in the course of doing business" for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code §25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

1.4 General Allegations

Brimer alleges that Defendants manufacture, import, sell, or distribute for sale in California, tumblers with exterior designs that contain lead without providing clear and reasonable warnings under Proposition 65. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65, by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm.

1.5 Product Description

The products covered by this Consent Judgment are certain tumblers with exterior designs containing lead and available for sale in California including, but not limited to, *Laura Ashley Eleanora G/C Tumbler*, *SKU 197052*, #1485333, *UPC* #8 83892 270664, hereinafter the "Covered Products".

1.6 Notice of Violation

On or about January 29, 2016, Brimer served Defendants, and certain requisite public enforcement agencies with a "60-Day Notice of Violation" ("Notice") alleging that Defendants

violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Covered Products expose users to lead. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notice.

1.7 Complaint

On October 31, 2016 Brimer filed the instant action ("Complaint") naming Defendants as defendants for the alleged violations of Health and Safety Code §25249.6 that are the subject of the Notice.

1.8 No Admission

Defendants deny the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint, and maintain that, to the best of their knowledge, based on testing in the normal course of business, its products that are or have been sold and distributed for sale in California, including the Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Defendants' obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.9 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Defendants as to the allegations contained in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Santa Clara and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure §664.6.

1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" means the date on which Brimer's counsel provides written notice to Defendant's counsel that the Motion to Approve the Consent Judgment has been granted and entered by the Court.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION AND WARNINGS

Commencing sixty (60) days after the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Covered Products which the Defendant manufactures for sale in California shall either: (a) be Reformulated Products pursuant to the definition that follows; or (b) have a clear and reasonable warning pursuant to Section 2.2.

2.1 Reformulated Covered Products

"Reformulated Products" are defined as those Covered Products containing a maximum of 90 parts per million of lead by weight in any accessible component (i.e., any component that can be touched or handled during reasonably a foreseeable use, such as exterior decorations) when analyzed pursuant to Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3050B and/or 6010B, *and* that yield a result of less than 1.0 micrograms of lead when analyzed pursuant to the NIOSH 9100 testing protocol as applied to exterior decorations of the Covered Products. In addition, Reformulated Products shall yield a result of no detectable lead in the "Lip and Rim Area", when analyzed according to any test methodology appropriate under Proposition 65. "Lip and Rim Area" is defined as the exterior top 20 millimeters of a Covered Product.

2.2 Product Warnings

Commencing on the Effective Date, Defendants shall provide clear and reasonable warnings for all Covered Products as set forth in subsections 2.2(a) and (b) for all products that do not currently have warnings and that do not qualify as Reformulated Products. Each warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands to which *specific* Product the warning applies, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

(a) Retail Store Sales.

(i) Covered Product Labeling. Defendants shall affix a warning to the packaging, labeling, or directly on each Covered Product provided for sale in retail outlets in California that states:

1	WARNING:	This product contains lead, a chemical
2		known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.
3	Or,	
4	WARNING:	This product contains a chemical
5		known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.
6	Or,	
7	WARNING:	This product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer, and birth defects or
8		other reproductive harm. For more information, go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
9	Or,	
10	WARNING:	Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
11	(ii) Point-	of-Sale Warnings. Alternatively, Defendants may provide warning
12		
13	proximity to the point of display of the Covered Products. Such instruction sent to Defendants'	
14	customers shall be sent by certified mail, return receipt requested.	
15	•	This product contains lead, a chemical
16		known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.
17	Or,	
18	WARNING:	This product contains a chemical known
19		to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects and other reproductive harm.
20	Or,	
21	WARNING:	This product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is
22		known to the State of California to cause cancer, and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information, go to
23		www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		CONSENT JUDGMENT

Where more than one Product is sold in proximity to other like items or to those that do not require a warning (e.g., Reformulated Products as defined in Section 2.1), the following statement shall be used:¹

WARNING: The following products contain lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects

and other reproductive harm:

[list products for which warning is required]

Or,

WARNING: The following products contain a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects and other reproductive harm.

[list products for which warning is required]

Or,

WARNING: The following products can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer, and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information, go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

[list products for which warning is required]

- (b) Mail Order Catalog and Internet Sales. In the event that Defendants sell Covered Products via mail order catalog and/or the internet, to customers located in California, after the Effective Date, that are not Reformulated Products, Defendants shall provide warnings for such Covered Products sold via mail order catalog or the internet to California residents. Warnings given in the mail order catalog or on the internet shall identify the *specific* Covered Product to which the warning applies as further specified in Sections 2.2(b)(i) and (ii).
- (i) Mail Order Catalog Warning. Any warning provided in a mail order catalog shall be in the same type size or larger than the Covered Product description text within the catalog.

 The following warning shall be provided on the same page and in the same location as the display

¹ For purposes of the Consent Judgment, "sold in proximity" shall mean that the Covered Product and another similar product are offered for sale close enough to each other that the consumer, under customary conditions of purchase, could not reasonably determine which of the two products is subject to the warning sign.

1	and/or description of the Covered Product:		
2 3	WARNING: This product contains lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.		
4	Or,		
5	WARNING: This product contains a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer		
6	and birth defects and other reproductive harm.		
7	Or,		
8	WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer, and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information, go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.		
10	www.ros wainings.ca.gov.		
11	Where it is impracticable to provide the warning on the same page and in the same location as		
12	the display and/or description of the Covered Product, Defendants may utilize a designated symbol to		
13	cross reference the applicable warning and shall define the term "designated symbol" with the		
14	following language on the inside of the front cover of the catalog or on the same page as any order		
15	form for the Covered Product(s): WARNING: Certain products identified with this symbol V		
16 17	and offered for sale in this catalog contain lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.		
18	Or,		
19	WARNING: Certain products identified with this symbol ▼		
20	and offered for sale in this catalog contain a chemical known to the State of California to cause		
21	cancer and birth defects and other reproductive harm.		
22	Or,		
23	WARNING: Certain products identified with this symbol ▼ and offered for sale in this catalog can expose you to chemicals		
24	including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer, and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more		
25	information, go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.		
26			
27	The designated symbol must appear on the same page and in close proximity to the display and/or description of the Covered Product. On each page where the designated symbol appears,		
28	CONSENT JUDGMENT		

1	Defendants must provide a header or footer directing the consumer to the warning language and			
2	definition of the designated symbol.			
3	(ii) Internet Websi	te Warning. A warning shall be given in conjunction with the		
4	sale of the Covered Products via the in	ternet, which warning shall appear either: (a) on the same web		
5	page on which a Covered Product is displayed; (b) on the same web page as the order form for a			
6	Covered Product; (c) on the same page as the price for any Covered Product; or (d) on one or more			
7	web pages displayed to a purchaser during the checkout process. The following warning statement			
8	shall be used and shall appear in any o	shall be used and shall appear in any of the above instances adjacent to or immediately following the		
9	display, description, or price of the Pro	display, description, or price of the Product for which it is given in the same type size or larger than		
10	the Covered Product description text:	the Covered Product description text:		
11	WARNING: This pro	duct contains lead, a chemical		
12	known t	o the State of California to cause ects and other reproductive harm.		
13	1	•		
14	1	duct contains a chemical		
15		o the State of California to cause and birth defects and other reproductive harm.		
16	Or,	·		
17 18	known t	duct can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is the State of California to cause cancer, and birth defects or productive harm. For more information, go to		
19	www.P6	5Warnings.ca.gov.		
20		Alternatively, the designated symbol may appear adjacent to or immediately following the		
21	display, description, or price of the Product for which a warning is being given, provided that the			
22	following warning statement also appears elsewhere on the same web page, as follows:			
23	WARNING: This pro	duct contains lead, a chemical		
24	known t	o the State of California to cause ects and other reproductive harm.		
25		•		
26		duct contains a chemical		
27	_ known t	o the State of California to cause and birth defects and other reproductive harm.		
28	R	CONSENT HIDGMENT		

2 3

1

4

5

6 7

8 9

10 11

12

13 14

15 16

17

18 19

20

21 22

23

24

25 26

27

28

WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer, and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information, go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Civil Penalty Payments

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), in settlement of all the claims referred to in the Notice and this Consent Judgment, Defendants shall pay \$2,000 in civil penalties. The civil penalty payment shall be allocated according to Health and Safety Code §25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the funds paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") by Brimer, and twenty-five percent (25%) of the funds remitted to Brimer. Defendants shall issue the payment in two checks for the following amounts made payable to: (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$1,500; and (b) "Russell Brimer, Client Trust Account" in the amount of \$500.

3.2 Reimbursement of Attorney's Fees and Costs

The parties acknowledge that Brimer and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving the issue to be resolved after the material terms of this Consent Judgment had been settled. Defendants agree to pay Brimer's counsel for an award of attorney fees, inclusive of all expenses and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Defendants' attention, litigating and negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement in the public interest, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, in an amount of \$20,000.00. Other than the payment required hereunder, each side is to bear its own attorneys' fees and costs.

Defendants shall issue the payment by check made payable to "The Chanler Group."

² At Defendants' sole discretion, any warning provided pursuant to section 2.2 of this Consent Judgment may include a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline or the symbol may be printed in black and white.

3.3 Payments

Defendants shall pay the civil penalty and attorney fees set forth in Sections 3.1 and 3.2 of this Consent Judgment within seven days of the Effective Date. In order to expedite the settlement of this claim, scanned copies that have been sent via email of the Motion to Approve the Consent Judgment that has been approved and entered by the Court will suffice as written notice for the purpose of determination of the Effective Date.

3.4 Payment Address

All payments required by this Consent Judgment shall be delivered to the following address:

The Chanler Group Attn: Proposition 65 Controller 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710

4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

4.1 Brimer's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims

This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Brimer, acting on his own behalf and in the public interest, and Defendants and their parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, and attorneys ("Releasees") and each entity to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell the Covered Products including, but not limited to, their downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisers, cooperative members, licensors and licensees ("Downstream Releasees") for any violations arising under Proposition 65 for unwarned exposures to lead from Covered Products sold by Defendants prior to the Effective Date. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with regard to the Covered Products.

4.2 Brimer's Individual Release of Claims

In addition to the foregoing, Brimer, in his individual capacity only and *not* in his representative capacity, also provides a release to Defendants, Releasees, and Downstream Releasees

which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar from any and all manners of actions, causes of action, claims, rights, suits, obligations, debts, contracts, agreements, promises, charges, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of Defendants of any nature whatsoever, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, in law or equity, fixed or contingent, now or in the future, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to lead in the Covered Products sold or distributed for sale by Defendants before the Effective Date.

With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph, the Parties hereby specifically waive any and all rights and benefits which they now have, or in the future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

4.3 Defendants' Release of Brimer

Defendants, on their own behalf, and on behalf of their past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waive any and all claims against Brimer and his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by Brimer's claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Covered Products.

5. COURT APPROVAL

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties.

6. **INTEGRATION**

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within its.

No representation or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

7. SEVERABILITY

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

If, subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

8. **GOVERNING LAW**

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California and apply within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Covered Products, then Defendants may provide written notice to Brimer of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further injunctive obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Products are so affected. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be interpreted to relieve Defendants from any obligation to comply with any pertinent state or federal toxics control laws.

9. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified mail, return receipt requested; (iii) validly addressed and sent email or (iv) a recognized overnight courier to the following addresses:

Defendants

Malcolm Weiss, Esq. and Vidya Venugopal Hunton & Williams LLP 550 South Hope Street **Suite 2000** Los Angeles, CA 90071 Mweiss@hunton.com VVenugopal@hunton.com

Brimer

Proposition 65 Coordinator or Warren Klein The Chanler Group 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565 Warren@chanler.com

26

27

28

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

10. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

11. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

Brimer agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, and those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this Section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, cooperating on the drafting and filing of the necessary moving papers, supporting the motion, and appearing at the hearing before the Court.

12. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court.

||| ||||

21 | ///

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22 ///

23 ///

24 | ///

⁴ | ///

25 | ///

///

26

27

1	13. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>	
2	The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and have read, understood,	
3	and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein	
4	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
5		
6	Date: 11/2/2016	Date: 11-4-2016.
7	Pro 1	Anoll VI
8	By: Russell Brimer	By: (1/1/000) Hebe Schecter, President
9		Kaltex North America, Inc.
10		AGREED TO:
11		Date: 11/2/16
12		Date.
13		By: Wilarl Jon
14		Richard Roman, CEO Revman International, Inc.
15		
16		
17		
18	10	
19		
20 21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28	CONS	ENT JUDGMENT
	II .	