



\*14108247\*

**FILED**  
ALAMEDA COUNTY

APR 07 2017

CLERK OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

By [Signature] Deputy

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

SUPERIOR COURT FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH, )

Plaintiff, )

v. )

SEE'S CANDY SHOPS, INC., et al., )

Defendants. )

Case No. RG-16-819342

~~PROPOSED~~ CONSENT  
JUDGMENT AS TO SEE'S CANDY  
SHOPS, INC.

1     **1.     INTRODUCTION**

2             1.1.     The Parties to this Consent Judgment are the Center for Environmental Health, a  
3     California non-profit corporation (“CEH”), and See’s Candy Shops, Inc. (“See’s Candy”). The  
4     Parties enter into this Consent Judgment to settle certain claims asserted by CEH against See’s  
5     Candy as set forth in the operative complaint (“Complaint”) in the above-captioned matter. This  
6     Consent Judgment covers lollypop candies sold by See’s Candy that have been or will be sold or  
7     offered for sale to California consumers, including but not limited to Little Pops hard candy treats  
8     and similar candies that do not have lollypop sticks and Lollypops (“Covered Products”).

9             1.2.     On February 18, 2016, CEH provided a 60-day Notice of Violation under  
10     Proposition 65 to See’s Candy, the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every  
11     county in California and the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than  
12     750,000, alleging that See’s Candy violated Proposition 65 by exposing persons to lead and lead  
13     compounds (“Lead”) contained in Covered Products without first providing a clear and  
14     reasonable Proposition 65 warning.

15            1.3.     See’s Candy is a corporation or other business entity that manufactures,  
16     distributes, sells or offers for sale Covered Products or has done so in the past.

17            1.4.     On June 13, 2016, CEH filed the Complaint in the above-captioned matter, which  
18     names See’s Candy as a defendant.

19            1.5.     For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, CEH and See’s Candy (the “Parties”)  
20     stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the  
21     Complaint and personal jurisdiction over See’s Candy as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that  
22     venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter and  
23     enforce this Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could  
24     have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein with respect to Covered  
25     Products manufactured, distributed, sold or offered for sale by See’s Candy.

26            1.6.     Nothing in this Consent Judgment is or shall be construed as an admission by the  
27     Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with  
28

1 the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact,  
2 conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall  
3 prejudice, waive or impair any right, remedy, argument or defense the Parties may have in any  
4 other pending or future legal proceedings. This Consent Judgment is the product of negotiation  
5 and compromise and is accepted by the Parties solely for purposes of settling, compromising and  
6 resolving issues disputed in this Action.

7 1.7. The "Effective Date" of this Consent Judgment shall be the date it is entered by the  
8 Court.

9 **2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

10 2.1. **Reformulation of Covered Products.** After the Effective Date, See's Candy shall  
11 not purchase, manufacture, or otherwise produce any Covered Product that will be offered for  
12 sale to California consumers that contains more than forty (40) parts per billion ("ppb") Lead by  
13 weight (the "Reformulation Level"), such concentration to be determined by use of a test  
14 performed by an accredited laboratory using equipment with a level of detection of at least ten  
15 (10) ppb such as inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (ICP-MS) (the "Test Protocol").  
16 In addition, after June 1, 2017, See's Candy shall not ship, sell or offer for sale any Covered  
17 Product that will be offered for sale to California consumers that exceeds the Reformulation  
18 Level, such concentration to be determined by the Test Protocol.

19 **3. ENFORCEMENT**

20 3.1. **General Enforcement Provisions.** CEH or See's Candy may, by motion or  
21 application for an order to show cause before this Court, enforce the terms and conditions  
22 contained in this Consent Judgment. Any action to enforce alleged violations of Section 2.1 by  
23 See's Candy shall be brought exclusively pursuant to this Section 3.

24 3.2. **Enforcement of Reformulation Commitment.**

25 3.2.1. Notice of Violation. In the event that CEH identifies a Covered Product  
26 manufactured, distributed, or sold by See's Candy for which CEH has laboratory test results  
27  
28

1 showing that See's Candy violated Section 2.1, CEH may issue a Notice of Violation pursuant to  
2 this Section.

3 3.2.2. Service of Notice of Violation and Supporting Documentation.

4 3.2.2.1. Subject to Section 3.2.1, the Notice of Violation shall be  
5 sent to the person(s) identified in Section 7.2 to receive notices for See's Candy, and must be  
6 served within sixty (60) days of the later of either the date the Covered Products at issue were  
7 purchased or otherwise acquired by CEH or the date that CEH learns that the Covered Products  
8 were manufactured or sold by See's Candy, provided that CEH may have up to an additional  
9 forty-five (45) days to provide See's Candy with the test data required by Section 3.2.2.2 below if  
10 it has not yet obtained such test data from its laboratory.

11 3.2.2.2. The Notice of Violation shall, at a minimum, set forth:  
12 (a) the date the alleged violation was observed; (b) the location at which the Covered Products  
13 were offered for sale; (c) a description of the Covered Products giving rise to the alleged  
14 violation; and (d) all test data obtained by CEH regarding the Covered Products and supporting  
15 documentation sufficient for validation of the test results, including any laboratory reports,  
16 quality assurance reports and quality control reports associated with testing of the Covered  
17 Products. Such Notice of Violation shall be based upon the Test Protocol. Wipe, swipe, swab  
18 and X-ray fluorescence testing are not sufficient to support a Notice of Violation. As an  
19 alternative, CEH may rely on testing conducted and published by the California Department of  
20 Public Health ("CDPH") to support a Notice of Violation, so long as CEH first obtains a full  
21 description of the Covered Product tested from CDPH and CEH makes a good faith attempt to  
22 obtain information from CDPH that would identify the product lot, such as a "best by" or "sell  
23 by" date, as well as the location at which the Covered Product was offered for sale, and the date  
24 the product was obtained by CDPH. CEH shall share any such information with See's Candy.  
25 Should CEH be unable to obtain any such information, See's Candy shall contact CDPH and  
26 request such information and shall share such information with CEH upon receipt from CDPH.

1                   3.2.3. Levels over 40 but no more than 45 parts per billion. If the level of lead  
2 alleged in the Notice of Violation is over 40 ppb but no more than 45 ppb, See's Candy shall refer  
3 the matter to an internal food quality officer to investigate the incident and prepare a report that  
4 shall be provided to CEH within 60 days of receipt of the Notice of Violation explaining the  
5 reason for the exceedance and detailing steps See's Candy has taken to ensure that the exceedance  
6 does not reoccur in the future. No additional monetary payment shall be due for a Notice of  
7 Violation alleging a lead level of no more than 45 ppb.

8                   3.2.4. Levels in excess of 45 parts per billion. If the level of lead alleged in the  
9 Notice of Violation is over 45 ppb, CEH and See's Candy shall meet and confer to attempt to  
10 resolve their dispute and remedy the violations during the thirty day period after service of the  
11 Notice of Violation. If no informal resolution of a Notice of Violation results during such time,  
12 CEH may file an enforcement motion or application pursuant to Section 3.1. In any such  
13 proceeding, CEH may seek whatever fines, costs, penalties, attorneys' fees or other remedies are  
14 provided by law for failure to comply with the Consent Judgment.

15                   3.2.5. Repeat Violations. If See's Candy has received four or more Notices of  
16 Violation alleging violations related to lead levels of 45 ppb or less, CEH may treat future  
17 violations alleging lead levels of 45 ppb or less under section 3.2.4.

#### 18 **4. PAYMENTS**

19                   4.1. **Payments by See's Candy.** Within five (5) days of the entry of this Consent  
20 Judgment, See's Candy shall pay the total sum of \$150,000 as a settlement payment, as further set  
21 forth in this Section 4.

22                   4.2. **Allocation of Payments.** The total settlement amount for See's Candy shall be  
23 paid in four (4) separate checks and delivered as set forth below. The funds paid by See's Candy  
24 shall be allocated as set forth below between the following categories and made payable as  
25 follows:

26                   4.2.1.           \$24,316 as a civil penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code §  
27 25249.7(b). The civil penalty payment shall be apportioned in accordance with Health & Safety

28

1 Code § 25249.12 (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental  
2 Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA")). Accordingly, the OEHHA portion of the civil penalty  
3 payment for \$18,237 shall be made payable to OEHHA and associated with taxpayer  
4 identification number 68-0284486. This payment shall be delivered as follows:

5 For United States Postal Service Delivery:  
6 Attn: Mike Gyurics  
7 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
8 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
9 P.O. Box 4010, MS #19B  
10 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

11 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:  
12 Attn: Mike Gyurics  
13 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
14 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
15 1001 I Street, MS #19B  
16 Sacramento, CA 95814

17 The CEH portion of the civil penalty payment for \$6,079 shall be made payable  
18 to the Center for Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-  
19 3251981. This payment shall be delivered to the Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street,  
20 San Francisco, CA 94117.

21 4.2.2. \$18,231 as an Additional Settlement Payment ("ASP") to CEH  
22 pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, §  
23 3204. CEH intends to restrict use of the ASP received from the Consent Judgment before the  
24 Court to the following purpose: the funds will be placed in CEH's Toxics in Food Fund and used  
25 to support CEH programs and activities that seek to educate the public about lead and other toxic  
26 chemicals in food, work with the food industry and agriculture interests to reduce exposure to  
27 lead and other toxic chemicals in food, and thereby reduce the public health impacts and risks of  
28 exposure to lead and other toxic chemicals in food sold in California. CEH shall obtain and  
maintain adequate records to document that ASPs are spent on these activities and CEH agrees to  
provide such documentation to the Attorney General within thirty days of any request from the  
Attorney General. The payment pursuant to this Section shall be made payable to the Center for  
Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-3251981. This

1 payment shall be delivered to the Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco,  
2 CA 94117.

3 4.2.3. \$107,453 as a reimbursement of a portion of CEH's reasonable  
4 attorneys' fees and costs. This amount shall be divided into two checks: (1) a check in the  
5 amount of \$96,918 shall be made payable to the Lexington Law Group and associated with  
6 taxpayer identification number 94-3317175; and (2) a check in the amount of \$10,535 shall be  
7 made payable to the Center for Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification  
8 number 94-3251981. These payments shall be delivered to the Lexington Law Group, 503  
9 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117.

## 10 **5. MODIFICATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT**

11 5.1. **Modification.** This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to time by  
12 express written agreement of the Parties, with the approval of the Court, or by an order of this  
13 Court upon motion and in accordance with law.

14 5.2. **Notice; Meet and Confer.** Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment  
15 shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with all affected Parties prior to filing a motion to  
16 modify the Consent Judgment.

## 17 **6. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE**

18 6.1. This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between CEH on  
19 behalf of itself and the public interest and See's Candy and See's Candy's parents, subsidiaries,  
20 affiliated entities that are under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, agents,  
21 shareholders, successors, assigns, and attorneys ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities to which  
22 See's Candy directly or indirectly distributes or sells Covered Products, including but not limited  
23 to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, licensors and licensees  
24 ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of any violation of Proposition 65 based on failure to warn  
25 about alleged exposure to Lead contained in Covered Products that were sold, distributed or  
26 offered for sale by See's Candy prior to the Effective Date.

1           6.2.       CEH, for itself, its agents, successors and assigns, releases, waives, and forever  
2 discharges any and all claims against See's Candy, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream  
3 Defendant Releasees arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or  
4 common law claims that have been or could have been asserted by CEH individually or in the  
5 public interest regarding the failure to warn about exposure to Lead arising in connection with  
6 Covered Products manufactured by See's Candy prior to the Effective Date.

7           6.3.       Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by See's Candy shall  
8 constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by See's Candy, its Defendant Releasees and its  
9 Downstream Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged failure to warn about Lead in  
10 Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by See's Candy after the Effective Date.

11       **7.       PROVISION OF NOTICE**

12           7.1.       When CEH is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the  
13 notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to:

14                       Eric S. Somers  
15                       Lexington Law Group  
16                       503 Divisadero Street  
17                       San Francisco, CA 94117  
18                       esomers@lexlawgroup.com

19           7.2.       When See's Candy is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment,  
20 the notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to:

21                       Meredith A. Jones-McKeown  
22                       Sheppard Mullin Richter & Hampton LLP  
23                       Four Embarcadero Center, 17th Floor  
24                       San Francisco, CA 94111  
25                       mjonesmckeown@sheppardmullin.com

26           7.3.       Any Party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by  
27 sending the other Party notice by first class and electronic mail.

28       **8.       COURT APPROVAL**

          8.1.       This Consent Judgment shall become effective as a contract upon the date  
signed by CEH and See's Candy, whichever is later, provided however, that CEH shall also



1 prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and See's Candy shall support  
2 approval of such Motion.

3 8.2. If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force  
4 or effect and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any  
5 purpose.

6 **9. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION**

7 9.1. The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of  
8 California.

9 **10. ATTORNEY'S FEES**

10 10.1. A Party who prevails in an action to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment  
11 shall be entitled to recover its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs related to such enforcement  
12 from the non-prevailing party. Nothing in this Section 10 shall preclude a party from seeking an  
13 award of sanctions pursuant to law.

14 **11. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

15 11.1. This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding  
16 of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions,  
17 negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein  
18 and therein. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties  
19 except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied,  
20 other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party  
21 hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise,  
22 shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically  
23 contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the  
24 Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein. No supplementation,  
25 modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in  
26 writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent  
27

1 Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof  
2 whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

3 **12. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

4 12.1. This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
5 Consent Judgment.

6 **13. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT**

7 13.1. Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized  
8 by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and  
9 execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and to legally bind that Party.

10 **14. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS**

11 14.1. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim  
12 against an entity that is not See's Candy on terms that are different than those contained in this  
13 Consent Judgment.

14 **15. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS**

15 15.1. The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by  
16 means of facsimile or portable document format (pdf), which taken together shall be deemed to  
17 constitute one document.

18

19 **IT IS SO STIPULATED:**

20 **CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH**

21

22



23

Charlie Pizarro  
Associate Director

24

25

26

27

28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**SEE'S CANDY SHOPS, INC.**

*Brad Kinstler*

Digitally signed by Brad Kinstler  
DN: cn=Brad Kinstler, o=See's Candy, ou=See's  
Candy, email=bkinstler@sees.com, c=US  
Date: 2017.01.23 10:06:25 -0800

Signature

Bradley D. Kinstler

Printed Name

President and CEO

Title

**IT IS SO ORDERED:**

Dated: April 7, 2017

*Winfred J. Smith*  
Judge of the Superior Court of California