Josh Voorhees, State Bar No. 241436 1 Troy C. Bailey, State Bar No. 277424 2 THE CHANLER GROUP 2560 Ninth Street 3 Parker Plaza, Suite 214 ALAMEDA COUNTY Berkeley, CÁ 94710 APR 1 0 2018 Telephone: (510) 848-8880 4 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118 5 Josh@chanler.com Troy@chanler.com Deputy 6 Attorneys for Plaintiff 7 PETER ENGLANDER 8 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA 9 COUNTY OF ALAMEDA 10 UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION 11 12 PETER ENGLANDER, Case No. RG17864662 13 [PROPOSED] JUDGMENT PURSUANT Plaintiff. 14 TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT v. 15 **JUDGMENT** TAPE HOLDING COMPANY, INC.; et al., 16 April 10, 2018 Date: Defendants. 17 Time: 3:45 p.m. Dept.: 24 18 Judge: Hon. Frank Roesch 19 Reservation No.: R-1936856 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4) and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6, Judgment is hereby entered in accordance with the terms of the Consent Judgment attached hereto as Exhibit A. By stipulation of the parties, the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the terms of the settlement under Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: 4/10/2018

JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

EXHIBIT A

1 2 3 4 5 6	Josh Voorhees, State Bar No. 241436 Troy C. Bailey, State Bar No. 277424 THE CHANLER GROUP 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710 Telephone: (510) 848-8880 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118 Josh@chanler.com Troy@chanler.com Attorneys for Plaintiff PETER ENGLANDER	
8	TETER ENGLANDER	•
9	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
	COUNTY OF ALAMEDA UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION	
10		
11		
12	DETER ENCY ANDER	V ==
- 1	PETER ENGLANDER,	Case No. RG17864662
14	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT
15	V.	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6)
16	TAPE HOLDING COMPANY, INC.; and DOES 1-150, inclusive,	
17	Defendants.	
18		
19		
	*	
- 11	*	
21	*	
21	*	
21 22 23	·	
21 22 23 24		
20 21 22 23 24 25		
21 22 23 24 25 26		
21 22 23 24		

[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO DEFENDANT TAPE HOLDING COMPANY, INC.

1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff Peter Englander ("Englander") and defendant Tape Holding Company, Inc. ("Tape"), with Englander and Tape each referred to individually as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties."

1.2 Plaintiff

Englander is a resident of the State of California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals, and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating harmful substances contained in consumer and commercial products.

1.3 Defendant

Tape employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

1.4 General Allegations

Englander alleges that Tape manufactures, imports, sells and/or distributes for sale in California, products containing di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate ("DEHP"), and that it does so without providing the health hazard warning that Englander alleges is required by Proposition 65.

1.5 Product Description

The products covered by this Consent Judgment are vinyl/PVC tapes containing DEHP including, but not limited to, *Identification Tape Green*, #333C-1/2, CG01-AE01, #434343 M10, UPC #0 00194 34343 3 that are manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California by Tape ("Products").

1.6 Notice of Violation

On March 30, 2017, Englander served Tape and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a Supplemental 60-Day Notice of Violation (the "Notice"), alleging that Tape violated Proposition 65 when it failed to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Products expose users to DEHP. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the allegations set forth in the Notice.

1.7 Complaint

On June 20, 2017, Englander commenced the instant action, naming Tape as one of the defendants for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notice.

1.8 No Admission

Tape denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint, and maintains that all of the products that it has sold or distributed for sale in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Tape of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Tape of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Tape's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.9 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Tape as to the allegations contained in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date that the Court grants the motion for approval of this Consent Judgment contemplated by Section 5, including any unopposed Tentative Ruling approving this Consent Judgment.

2. <u>INJUNCTIVE SETTLEMENT TERMS</u>

2.1 Reformulation Standards

"Reformulated Products" are defined as those Products containing DEHP in concentrations less than 0.1 percent (1,000 parts per million) when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or other methodology utilized by federal or state government agencies for the purpose of determining DEHP content in a solid substance.

2.2 Reformulation Commitment

As of three months from the Effective Date, all Products not already in Tape's inventory, that are manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in the State of California by Tape shall be Products that qualify as Reformulated Products as defined in Section 2.1, or shall carry appropriate health hazard warnings per section 2.3, below.

2.3 Product Warnings

Commencing three months from the Effective Date, Tape shall provide clear and reasonable warnings for all Products as set forth in subsections 2.3(a) and (b) for all Products that do not qualify as Reformulated Products. Each warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands to which *specific* Product the warning applies, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

(a) Retail Store Sales.

(i) Product Labeling. Tape shall affix a warning to the packaging, labeling, or directly on each Product provided for sale in retail outlets in California that states:

⚠ WARNING: This product can expose you to DEHP, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

Or:

⚠ WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

(b) Mail Order Catalog and Internet Sales. In the event that Tape sells Products via mail order catalog and/or the internet, to customers located in California, after the Effective Date, that are not Reformulated Products, Tape shall provide warnings for such Products sold via mail order catalog or the internet to California residents. Warnings given in the mail order catalog or on the internet shall identify the *specific* Product to which the warning applies as further specified in Sections 2.3(b)(i) and (ii).

(i) Mail Order Catalog Warning. Any warning provided in a mail order catalog shall be in the same type size or larger than the Product description text within the catalog. Either of the following warnings shall be provided on the same page and in the same location as the display and/or description of the Product:

⚠ WARNING: This product can expose you to DEHP, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

Or:

⚠ WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

Where it is impracticable to provide the warning on the same page and in the same location as the display and/or description of the Product, Tape may utilize a designated symbol to cross reference the applicable warning and shall define the term "designated symbol" with the following language on the inside of the front cover of the catalog or on the same page as any order form for the Product(s):

MARNING: Certain products identified with this symbol ▼ and offered for sale in this catalog can expose you to DEHP, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

The designated symbol must appear on the same page and in close proximity to the display and/or description of the Product. On each page where the designated symbol appears, Tape must provide a header or footer directing the consumer to the warning language and definition of the designated symbol.

(ii) Internet Website Warning. A warning shall be given in conjunction with the sale of the Products via the internet, which warning shall appear either: (a) on the same web page on which a Product is displayed; (b) on the same web page as the order form for a Product; (c) on the same page as the price for any Product; or (d) on one or more web pages displayed to a purchaser during the checkout process. Either of the following warning statements shall be used

6

7

8

9 10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25

26 27

28

and shall appear in any of the above instances adjacent to or immediately following the display, description, or price of the Product for which it is given in the same type size or larger than the Product description text:

MARNING: This product can expose you DEHP, which is known to the

State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to

www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

Or:

MARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm -

www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

Alternatively, where it is impracticable to provide the warning on the same page and in the same location as the display and/or description of the Product, Tape may utilize a designated symbol to cross reference the applicable warning with a "designated symbol" which may appear adjacent to or immediately following the display, description, or price of the Product for which a warning is being given, provided that the following warning statement also appears elsewhere on the same web page, as follows:

⚠ WARNING: Certain products identified with this symbol ▼ and offered

for sale in this website can expose you to DEHP, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information

go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

3. **ENFORCEMENT**

3.1 Notice of Breach

Englander may seek to enforce the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment and the requirements of Section 2 by issuing Tape a written Notice of Breach, prior to pursuing other remedies available at law. For each Product, the Notice of Breach shall include: (1) the date(s) of the alleged violation(s) or breach; (2) the location at which the Product was purchased; (3) a clear description of the Product, including images of the Product and any relevant packaging or labeling, together with the Product model number, UPC number or SKU; and (4) test data obtained by Englander regarding the Product allegedly in breach of this Consent Judgment, including, without

limitation, supporting documentation, laboratory reports, quality assurance and/or quality control reports associated with the testing of the Product. Any Product test data shall be based on the same, or comparable, testing methods specified in Section 2.

3.2 Meet and Confer; Opportunity to Cure

Englander and Tape agree to meet and confer for a period of not less than thirty (30) days from Tape's receipt of the Notice of Breach regarding Englander's allegations and potential informal resolutions of same, including the potential payment of reasonable additional civil penalties and or fees.

Tape will have an opportunity to cure the breach identified in the Notice of Breach within the meet and confer period, or within such a reasonable time as may be required to cure the breach, provided: (a) acts to cure the breach are commenced within 45 days; (b) Tape clearly communicates to Englander all actions taken to cure the breach; (c) Englander agrees with Tape's efforts to cure; and (d) the acts to cure the breach are thereafter diligently pursued to completion. If Tape fails to correct the breach, including the potential payment of reasonable additional civil penalties and or fees, to Englander's reasonable satisfaction and the Parties cannot resolve the dispute informally, Englander may pursue any remedies available to him under law to enforce the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

4. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

4.1 Payments Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b)(2)

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), and in settlement of all claims referred to in the Notice, Complaint, and this Consent Judgment, Tape agrees to pay a total of \$3,400.00 in civil penalties. Tape's civil penalty payments will be allocated according to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the penalty paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining twenty-five percent (25%) of the penalty payment retained by Plaintiff. Tape shall, within five (5) business days of the execution of this Consent Judgment, issue a check payable to its counsel's law firm in the amount of \$3,400.00, to be held in trust by its counsel. Counsel for Tape

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Reimbursement of Attorneys' Fees and Costs

shall provide The Chanler Group with written confirmation within three days of receipt that the funds have been deposited in a trust account. Within two business days of the Effective Date, Tape shall issue checks to "The Chanler Group" as follows: (1) to "Peter Englander, Client Trust Account" totaling \$850; and (2) to the "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" totaling \$2,550. Upon receipt, Englander and his counsel will then ensure payment to OEHHA. All penalty payments shall be delivered to the addresses listed in Section 4.3 below. 4.2

8 The Parties acknowledge that Englander and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute 9 without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving the issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. Shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized, Tape expressed a desire to resolve Englander's fees and costs. The Parties then negotiated a resolution of the compensation due to Englander and his counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5. For all work performed through the mutual execution of this agreement and the Court's approval of the same, but exclusive of fees and costs on appeal, if any, Tape shall reimburse Englander and his counsel \$28,000.00. Tape shall, within five (5) business days of the execution of this Consent Judgment, issue a check payable to its counsel's law firm in the amount of \$28,000.00, to be held in trust by its counsel. Counsel for Tape shall provide The Chanler Group with written confirmation within three days of receipt that the funds have been deposited in a trust account. Within two business days of the Effective Date, counsel shall issue a check to "The Chanler Group" in the amount of \$28,000.00, and shall deliver it to the address listed in Section 4.3 below. The reimbursement shall cover all fees and costs incurred by Englander investigating, bringing this matter to Tape' attention, litigating, and negotiating a settlement of the matter in the public interest.

4.3 Payment Address

All payments required by this Consent Judgment shall be delivered to the following address:

27 28

7

The Chanler Group Attn: Proposition 65 Controller 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710

5. <u>CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED</u>

5.1 Englander's Release of Proposition 65 Claims

Englander, acting on his own behalf and in the public interest, releases Tape and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, and attorneys ("Releasees") and each entity to whom Tape directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Products including, but not limited to, its downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisers, cooperative members, licensors and licensees, ("Downstream Releasees") for any violations arising under Proposition 65 for unwarned exposures to DEHP from the Products manufactured, imported, distributed or sold by Tape prior to three months after the Effective Date, as set forth in the Notice. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 by Tape with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to DEHP from Products manufactured, sold or distributed for sale by Tape after the Effective Date.

5.2 Englander's Individual Release of Claims

Englander, in his individual capacity only and *not* in his representative capacity, also provides a release to Tape, Releasees, and Downstream Releasees which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of Englander of any nature, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to DEHP in Products manufactured, imported, distributed or sold by Tape before three months after the Effective Date.

5.3 Tape's Release of Englander

Tape, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waive any and all claims against Englander and his

attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Englander and his attorneys and other representatives in the course of investigating claims, seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Products.

5.4 California Civil Code Section 1542

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Products will develop or be discovered. Englander and Tape acknowledge that this Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through three months after the Effective Date, including all rights of action therefor. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 5.1, 5.2 and 5.3 above may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code §1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code §1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

Englander and Tape each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code §1542.

6. <u>COURT APPROVAL</u>

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by all Parties. Englander and Tape agree to support the entry of this agreement as a judgment, and to obtain the Court's approval of their settlement in a timely manner. The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required for judicial approval of this Consent Judgment, which motion Englander shall draft and file and Tape shall support, appearing at the hearing if so requested. If any third-party objection to the motion is filed, Englander and Tape agree to work together to file a reply and appear at any hearing. This provision is a material component of the Consent Judgment and shall be treated as such in the event of a breach.

7. SEVERABILITY

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

If, subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any provision of this Consent Judgment is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

8. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then Tape may provide Englander with written notice of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment, with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be interpreted to relieve Tape from its obligation to comply with any pertinent state or federal law or regulation.

9. <u>NOTICE</u>

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery, (ii) first-class registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to any Party by the other at the following addresses:

To Tape:
Julie E. Schwartz, Esq.
Perkins Coie LLP
3150 Porter Drive
Palo Alto, CA 94304-1212

Attn: Proposition 65 Coordinator The Chanler Group 2560 Ninth Street

Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565

To Englander:

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other Party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

10. COUNTERPARTS, FACSIMILE AND PDF SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (pdf) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original and, all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

11. COMPLIANCE WITH REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

Englander and his counsel agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f).

10

12. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon; or (ii) upon a successful motion of any party and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon.

13. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agreed to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

AGREED TO:

PETER ENGL NDER

Dated: 2/2/2018

AGREED TO:

TAPE HOLDING COMPANY, INC.

(Print Name)
Its: President

Dated: 2/1/2018

SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

Case Number: RG17864662

Case name: Englander v. Tape Holding Company, Inc.

DECLARATION OF SERVICE BY MAIL

I certify that I am not a party to this cause and that a true and correct copy of the foregoing document **JUDGMENT** was mailed first class, postage prepaid, in a sealed envelope, addressed as shown at the bottom of this document, and that the mailing of the foregoing and execution of this certificate occurred at 1221 Oak Street, Oakland, California.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on April 11, 2018.

Executive Officer/Clerk of the Superior Court
By: <u>Suzanne Grewal</u>
Suzanne Grewal, Deputy Clerk

44

Troy Bailey
The Chanler Group
2560 9th St, Suite 214
Berkeley, CA 94710

Julie E. Schwartz Perkins Coie LLP 3150 Porter Drive Palo Alto, CA 94304