

1 Evan J. Smith, Esquire (SBN 242352)  
2 BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC  
3 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900  
4 Beverly Hills, CA 90212  
5 Telephone: (877) 534-2590  
6 Facsimile: (310) 247-0160

7 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

ENDORSED  
FILED  
ALAMEDA COUNTY

DEC - 1 2017

CLERK OF THE SUPERIOR COURT  
By DIANNE HYATT Deputy

AUG 25 2017

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

ANTHONY FERREIRO,  
Plaintiff,

v.

WAXMAN CONSUMER PRODUCTS GROUP,  
INC.,  
Defendant.

Case No.: RG17860579

CONSENT JUDGMENT

Judge: Dennis Hayashi

Dept.: 303

Hearing Date: October 12, 2017

Hearing Time: 2:30 PM

Reservation #: R-1871770

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**1. INTRODUCTION**

1.1 **The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Anthony Ferreiro acting on behalf of the public interest (hereinafter "Ferreiro") and Waxman Consumer Products Group, Inc. ("Waxman" or "Defendant") with Ferreiro and Defendant collectively referred to as the "Parties" and each of them as a "Party." Ferreiro is an individual residing in California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Waxman is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.

1.2 **Allegations and Representations.** Ferreiro alleges that Defendant has exposed individuals to a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity from Plumb Craft Hose Adapters without providing clear and reasonable warnings under Proposition 65.

1.3 **Notices of Violation/Complaint.** On or about March 31, 2017, Ferreiro served Waxman and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the "Notice"), alleging that Defendant was in violation of Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that Plumb Craft Hose Adapters exposed users in California to a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Notice. On May 17, 2017, Ferreiro filed a complaint in the matter as captioned above (the "Complaint").

1.4 **Consent to Jurisdiction.** For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Complaint filed in this matter, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter, and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein and/or in the Notice.

1  
2 1.5 **No Admission.** Defendant denies the factual, legal, and material allegations  
3 contained in Ferreiro's Notice and Complaint and maintains that it has sold and distributed for sale  
4 in California, including the Products, which have been, and are, in compliance with all laws.  
5 Waxman specifically maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent  
6 Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or  
7 violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an  
8 admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such  
9 being specifically denied by Defendant. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise  
10 affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Defendant under this Consent Judgment.

11 **2. DEFINITIONS**

12 2.1 **Covered Products.** The term "Covered Products" means Plumb Craft Hose  
13 Adapters including but not limited to UPC No. 028905741026 that have been manufactured,  
14 distributed, sold, and/or offered for sale in California by Waxman, and that contain a chemical  
15 known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity.

16 2.2 **Effective Date.** The term "Effective Date" means the date this Consent Judgment is  
17 entered as a Judgment of the Court.

18 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS**

19 3.1 Commencing ninety (90) days after the Effective Date, Waxman shall not  
20 manufacture, import, distribute, sell or offer for sale in California any Covered Product unless the  
21 Covered Product is accompanied by the following warning, operative on August 30, 2018:  
22 "WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which are known to the  
23 State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more  
24 information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov)." Prior to August 30, 2018, Waxman also complies  
25 with its obligation in this Section if the Covered Product instead is accompanied by the following  
26 warning: "WARNING: This product contains chemicals known to the state of California to cause  
27 cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm."  
28

1           3.2     The warning provided pursuant to Section 3.1 shall be affixed to or printed on the  
2 Covered Product's packaging or labeling. The warning shall be prominently affixed to or printed  
3 on the packaging or labeling and displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other  
4 words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary  
5 individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. A warning may be contained in the same  
6 section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety warnings, if any,  
7 concerning the use of the product and shall be at least the same size as those other safety warnings.

8     **4.     MONETARY TERMS**

9           4.1     **Initial Civil Penalty.** Waxman shall pay a Initial Civil Penalty of \$1,000.00  
10 pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with  
11 California Health & Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to the State of  
12 California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and the remaining 25% of the  
13 penalty remitted to Ferreiro, as provided by California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(d).

14           4.1.1   Within ten (10) business days of the Effective Date, Waxman shall issue two  
15 separate checks for the civil penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$750.00; and (b)  
16 "Brodsky & Smith, LLC in Trust for Ferreiro" in the amount of \$250.00. Payment owed to Ferreiro  
17 pursuant to this Section shall be delivered to the following payment address:

18                     Evan J. Smith, Esquire  
19                     Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
20                     Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510  
                      Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

21     Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly to  
22 OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at one of the following address(es):

23           For United States Postal Service Delivery:

24                     Mike Gyurics  
25                     Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
26                     Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
                      P.O. Box 4010  
                      Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

27           For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:  
28

1 Mike Gyurics  
2 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
3 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
4 1001 I Street  
5 Sacramento, CA 95814

6 A copy of the check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed to Brodsky & Smith, LLC at the  
7 address set forth above as proof of payment to OEHHA.

8 4.2 **Final Civil Penalty.** Ninety (90) days after the Effective Date, Waxman shall make  
9 a Final Civil Penalty payment of \$1,000.00 on the same terms as set forth in § 4.1.1 pertaining to  
10 the Initial Civil Penalty. Pursuant to Title 11 California Code of Regulations, Section 3203(c),  
11 Ferreiro agrees that the Final Civil Penalty payment shall be waived in its entirety if, on or before  
12 the date the Final Civil Penalty payment is due, an officer of Waxman provides Ferreiro with a  
13 signed declaration certifying that all Products it ships for sale or distributes for sale in California as  
14 of the date of its certification have been marked with the warnings required by this Consent Decree  
15 (hereinafter "Labeled Product") and that Waxman will continue to offer only Labeled Products in  
16 California in the future. The option to provide a declaration certifying its complete early  
reformulation or labeling of the Products in lieu of making the Final Civil Penalty payment  
otherwise required by this Section is a material term, and time is of the essence.

17 4.3 **Attorney Fees.** Waxman shall pay \$14,000.00 to Brodsky & Smith, LLC ("Brodsky  
18 Smith") as complete reimbursement for Plaintiff Ferreiro's attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a  
19 result of investigating, bringing this matter to Waxman's attention, litigating and negotiating and  
20 obtaining judicial approval of a settlement in the public interest, pursuant to Code of Civil  
21 Procedure section 1021.5. Payment shall be made within ten (10) business days of the Effective  
22 Date and sent to the address for Brodsky & Smith set forth in section 4.1.1, above.

23 4.4 Waxman shall pay the civil penalty and attorney fees in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 within  
24 ten (10) days of the Effective Date.

25 **5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

26 5.1 **Ferreiro's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims.** This Consent Judgment is a  
27 full, final, and binding resolution between Ferreiro acting on his own behalf and in the public  
28

1 interest, and constitutes a full and binding release as to Waxman, and its parents, shareholders,  
2 divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their successors  
3 and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities from whom they obtain and to whom they  
4 directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including but not limited to Walmart.Com  
5 USA LLC, Walmart Stores, Inc., manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers,  
6 licensors, licensees retailers, franchisees, and cooperative members ("Downstream Defendant  
7 Releasees"), of all claims for violations of Proposition 65 with respect to any Covered Products  
8 manufactured, distributed, or sold by Waxman prior to the Effective Date. Compliance with the  
9 terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with regard to the  
10 Covered Products.

11       **5.2 Ferreiro's Individual Release of Claims.** Ferreiro, in his individual capacity only  
12 and not in his representative capacity, also provides a release to Waxman, Defendant Releasees,  
13 and Downstream Defendant Releasees. In addition to the foregoing, Ferreiro, on behalf of himself,  
14 his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and not in  
15 his representative capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or  
16 indirectly, any form of legal action and releases any Waxman, Defendant Releasees, and  
17 Downstream Defendant Releasees from any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims,  
18 demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts, contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages,  
19 charges, losses, costs, expenses, and attorneys' fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown,  
20 in law or equity, fixed or contingent, now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of  
21 Proposition 65 related to or arising from Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by  
22 Waxman or Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Defendant Releasees. With respect to the  
23 foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph, Ferreiro hereby specifically waives any and all  
24 rights and benefits which he now has, or in the future may have, conferred by virtue of the  
25 provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

26       A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR  
27 DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS FAVOR  
28 AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY  
HIM MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS SETTLEMENT WITH

1 THE DEBTOR.

2 5.3 By executing this Consent Judgment, Ferreiro understands and acknowledges that  
3 the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code Section 1542 is that even  
4 if Ferreiro suffers future damages arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly  
5 to, in whole or in part, the Covered Products, including but not limited to any exposure to, or failure  
6 to warn with respect to exposure to a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and  
7 reproductive toxicity from the Covered Products, Ferreiro will not be able to make any claim for  
8 those damages against Waxman, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Defendant Releasees, and  
9 the successors and assigns of any of them, who may manufacture, use, maintain, distribute, retail or  
10 sell the Covered Products. Furthermore, Ferreiro acknowledges that it intends these consequences  
11 for any such claims and any other claims which may exist as of the date of this release pertaining to  
12 the Covered Products listed in the Notice but which Ferreiro does not know exist, and which, if  
13 known, would materially affect its decision to enter into this Consent Judgment, regardless of  
14 whether its lack of knowledge is the result of ignorance, oversight, error, negligence, or any other  
15 cause.

16 5.4 **Waxman's Release of Claims Against Ferreiro.** Waxman waives any and all  
17 claims against Ferreiro, his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or  
18 statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Ferreiro and his attorneys and  
19 other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking  
20 enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter, and/or with respect to Covered Products.

21 6. INTEGRATION/ENTIRE AGREEMENT

22 6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and any  
23 and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged  
24 within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have  
25 been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.  
26  
27  
28

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7

7  
8

8  
9  
10  
11

12

13  
14  
15

16

17

18  
19  
20

21

22

23

23  
24  
25  
26



1 10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT  
2 APPROVAL

3 10.1 Ferreiro agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health &  
4 Safety Code §25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment  
5 and Defendant agrees it shall support approval of such Motion.

6 10.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the  
7 Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case, the  
8 Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within 30  
9 days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.

10 10.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an  
11 appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent  
12 Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on  
13 its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

14 11. MODIFICATION

15 11.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties  
16 and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

17 12. SEVERABILITY

18 12.1 If, subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment as a  
19 judgment, any provision is held to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall  
20 not be adversely affected.

21 13. ATTORNEY'S FEES

22 13.1 A party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent  
23 Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs unless  
24 the unsuccessful party has acted with substantial justification. For purposes of this Consent  
25 Judgment, the term substantial justification shall carry the same meaning as used in the Civil  
26 Discovery Act of 1986, Code of Civil Procedure Section 2016, et seq.  
27  
28

1 13.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions  
2 pursuant to law.

3 14. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

4 14.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
5 Consent Judgment.

6  
7 15. AUTHORIZATION

8 15.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their  
9 respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this  
10 document and certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute  
11 the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as  
12 explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

13  
14 **AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

15  
16 Date: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: JUNE 26, 2017

17 By: \_\_\_\_\_ By: Mark W. Jester  
18 ANTHONY FERREIRO WAXMAN CONSUMER PRODUCTS  
19 GROUP, INC.

20 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

21  
22 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_ Judge of Superior Court  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 13.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions  
2 pursuant to law.

3 **14. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

4 14.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
5 Consent Judgment.

6  
7 **15. AUTHORIZATION**

8 15.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their  
9 respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this  
10 document and certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute  
11 the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as  
12 explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

13  
14 **AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

15 Date: 8/25/17

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

16  
17 By: Anthony Ferreiro  
18 ANTHONY FERREIRO

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
WAXMAN CONSUMER PRODUCTS  
GROUP, INC.

19  
20 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

21  
22 Dated: 11/30/17

D-PA  
Judge of Superior Court