- 1		9
1 2	Josh Voorhees, State Bar No. 241436 THE CHANLER GROUP 2560 Ninth Street	ENDORSED
3	Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565 Telephone: (510) 848-8880	2018 MAR 22 A 9: 27
4	Facsimile: (510) 848-8118 josh@chanler.com	CLERK OF THE COURT
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff	SUPERIOR COURT OF CA SUPERIOR COURT OF CA COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA BY R. JIMONOZ DEPUTY
6	PETER ENGLANDER	R. Jane
7		
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF TH	E STATE OF CALIFORNIA
9	COUNTY OF S	SANTA CLARA
10	UNLIMITED CIV	IL JURISDICTION
11	DESTED ENGLANDED	I G . N. 1507/015101
12	PETER ENGLANDER,	Case No. 17CV317191
13	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65
14	V.	SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT
15	GLOBAL AMICI, INC.; et al.,  Defendants.	Date: March 22, 2018
16	Defendants.	Time: 9:00 AM Dept.: 6
17		Judge: Hon. Theodore Zayner
18		
19		
20		
21	*	
22		
23		
24		
25		
26 27		
28		
40	i a	

JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT

Plaintiff Peter Englander and Defendant Global Amici, Inc. having agreed through their respective counsel that judgment be entered pursuant to the terms of their settlement agreement in the form of a consent judgment, and following this Court's issuance of an order approving their Proposition 65 settlement and Consent Judgment, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4) and California Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6, judgment is entered in accordance with the terms of the Consent Judgment attached hereto as Exhibit 1. By stipulation of the parties, the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the settlement pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6. IT IS SO ORDERED. THEODORE ZAYNER MAR 2 2 2018 Dated: JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT 

# EXHIBIT 1

1 2 3 4 5	Clifford A. Chanler, State Bar No. 135534 Josh Voorhees, State Bar No. 241436 THE CHANLER GROUP 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565 Telephone: (510) 848-8880 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118 clifford@chanler.com josh@chanler.com	
6	Attorneys for Plaintiff	
7	PETER ENGLANDER	
8		
9	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
10	COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA	
11	UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION	
12	*	
13	PETER ENGLANDER,	Case No. 17CV317191
14	Plaintiff,	IPROPOSED  CONSENT JUDGMENT
15	v.	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq., and Cal. Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)
		Call Code Civ. Free. § 554.69
16	GLOBAL AMICI, INC.; et al.,	
16 17	GLOBAL AMICI, INC.; et al.,  Defendant.	
17		
17 18		
17 18 19		
17 18 19 20		
17 18 19 20 21		
17 18 19 20 21 22		
17 18 19 20 21 22 23		
17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24		
17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25		

# 1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

#### 1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered by and between plaintiff Peter Englander ("Englander"), and Global Amici, Inc. ("Global Amici") with Englander and Global Amici each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties."

#### 1.2 Plaintiff

Englander is an individual residing in California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

#### 1.3 Defendant

Englander alleges that Global Amici employs ten or more individuals and is a "person in the course of doing business" for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

### 1.4 General Allegations

Englander alleges that Global Amici manufactures, sells, and distributes for sale in California glass jars with exterior designs containing lead, and that it does so without first providing the health hazard warning required by Proposition 65. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 1.5 Product Description

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Products" are defined as glass jars with exterior designs, including but not limited to the *Organized Kitchen Kitchenware Asst S/s Blk Lid Home Sm Herm Pres. UPC #9 23377 13384 3*, that are imported, manufactured, sold, or distributed for sale in California by Global Amici.

#### 1.6 Notice of Violation

On May 31, 2017, Englander served Global Amici, the California Attorney General, and all other requisite public enforcers with a 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice"). The Notice alleges that Global Amici violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn its customers and consumers in

California of the health risks associated with exposures to lead from the Products. No public enforcer has commenced or is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

# 1.7 Complaint

On October 11, Englander filed the instant action ("Complaint"), naming Global Amici as a defendant for the alleged violations that are the subject of the Notice.

#### 1.8 No Admission

Global Amici denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint, and maintains that all the products that it has imported, manufactured, sold, or distributed for sale in California, including the Products, have been and are in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Global Amici of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Global Amici of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, the same being denied by Global Amici. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Global Amici's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

#### 1.9 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that the Court has jurisdiction over Global Amici as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Santa Clara, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this

Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

#### 1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" means the date on which the Motion for Approval of the Consent Judgment is granted and entered by the Court.

# 2. <u>INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION OR WARNINGS</u>

# 2.1 Commitment to Reformulate Products or Provide Warnings

Commencing 30 days from the Effective Date and continuing thereafter, Global Amici shall only purchase for sale or manufacture for sale in California. (a) "Reformulated Products" as defined

3

4 5

> 6 7

8

9

10

11 12

13 14

15

16

17 18

19 20

21

22

23 24

25

26

27

28

111 111

by Section 2.2; or (b) Products sold with a clear and reasonable warning in California in accordance with Section 2.3.

#### 2.2 Reformulated Products Defined

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, Reformulated Products are defined as Products that: (a) contain lead in concentrations of no more than 90 parts per million ("ppm") in any exterior decorations analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") testing methodologies 3050B and 6010B; and (b) yield a result of no more than 1.0 micrograms of lead on any surface sampled and analyzed pursuant to the NIOSH 9100 testing protocol. In addition, Reformulated Products yield a result of "Non-detect" (defined as no more than 25 ppm lead content) in any decoration(s) located in the upper 20 centimeters of a Product, i.e., the "Lip-and-Rim" area of the vessel, or on any decoration(s) located on the interior surface of the Product (i.e., the beveragecontaining portion) when analyzed pursuant to EPA testing methodologies 3050B and 6010B. In addition to the testing methodologies provided above, the Parties may use equivalent methodologies utilized by state or federal agencies for the purpose of determining lead content in a solid substance to analyze a Product for the purpose of determining whether it qualifies as a Reformulated Product under this Consent Judgment.

#### 2.3 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

Commencing 30 days from the Effective Date and continuing thereafter, for any Products sold or distributed for sale in California by Global Amici that are not Reformulated Products, Global Amici will only offer such Products for sale with a clear and reasonable warning in accordance with this Section. Global Amici further agrees that any warning used will be prominently placed in relation to the Product with such conspicuousness when compared with other words, statements, designs, or devises as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, a clear and reasonable warning for the Products satisfying these criteria shall consist of a warning affixed 111

1 directly to a Product or its accompanying labeling or packaging sold in California that states: 2 A WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals 3 including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more 4 information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov. 5 or 6 ⚠ WARNING Reproductive Harm – www.P65Warnings.ca.gov. 7 8 At its option, Global Amici may use alternative methods of transmission specified by Title 27, Art. 6, 9 § 25602. 10 3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS 11 Civil Penalty Payment 12 Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), in settlement of all the claims referred 13 to in the Notice, Complaint, and this Consent Judgment, Global Amici shall pay a total of \$3,250 in 14 civil penalties. Global Amici's civil penalty payment shall be allocated according to Health and 15 Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the funds paid to the 16 California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and twenty-five percent 17 (25%) of the funds remitted to Englander. Global Amici shall provide its payment within ten (10) 18 business days of the Effective Date in two checks for the following amounts made payable to: (a) 19 "OEHHA" in the amount of \$2,437.50; and (b) "Peter Englander, Client Trust Account" in the 20 amount of \$812.50. Englander's counsel shall be responsible for delivering the penalty payment to 21 OEHHA. 22 3.2 Reimbursement of Attorney's Fees and Costs 23 The parties acknowledge that Englander and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute 24 without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed, thereby leaving the issue to 25 be resolved after the material terms of this Consent Judgment had been settled. Shortly after the 26 other settlement terms had been finalized, the Parties negotiated a reimbursement of the

attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5 for all work

compensation due to Englander and his counsel under general contract principles and the private

27

28

performed through the approval and entry of this Consent Judgment. Accordingly, Global Amici agrees to pay \$29,750 for all fees and costs incurred by Englander investigating, bringing this matter to Global Amici's attention, litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest, and obtaining court approval of the same. Global Amici's payment shall be delivered within ten (10)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

3.3 Payment Address

All payments under this Consent Judgment shall be delivered to:

business days of the Effective Date in a single check made payable to "The Chanler Group."

The Chanler Group Attn: Proposition 65 Controller 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710

# 4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

# 4.1 Englander's Release of Proposition 65 Claims

Englander, acting in the public interest and acting on his own behalf and on behalf of his past and current attorneys, agents, representatives, successors, and assigns, waives all rights to institute or participate in (directly or indirectly) any form of legal action, and releases and waives all actions. causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, fees (including, but not limited to, attorneys' fees, investigation fees, and expert fees), damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands (collectively, "Claims") against Global Amici, its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, shareholders, employees, attorneys, representatives, successors, and assigns, and each entity to whom Global Amici directly or indirectly distributes or sells Products, including, but not limited to, its downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisers, franchisees, cooperative members, licensors, licensees, Tuesday Morning, Inc., Tuesday Morning Corporation, and Tuesday Morning Partners, Ltd., and the manufacturers, importers, and suppliers of the Products (collectively, "Releasees"), with respect to any alleged violations arising under Proposition 65 for unwarned exposures to lead from the Products manufactured, imported. distributed, or sold by Global Amici prior to the Effective Date, as set forth in the Notice and Complaint. This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution as to the Claims referenced in this Section 4.1. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Global Amici constitutes

compliance with Proposition 65 by Releasees with respect to any exposures to lead in Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed for sale by Global Amici after the Effective Date.

# 4.2 Englander's Individual Release of Claims

Englander, in his individual capacity only and *not* in his representative capacity, also provides a release on behalf of himself, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assigns as to all Releasees, which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all Claims of any nature, character, or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to lead in Products imported, manufactured, distributed, or sold by Global Amici before the Effective Date. Englander further acknowledges that he is familiar with Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

Englander, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, in his individual and not representative capacity, expressly waives and relinquishes any and all rights and benefits which he may have under, or which may be conferred on him by the provisions of, Civil Code Section 1542, as well as under any other state or federal statute or common law principle of similar effect, to the fullest extent that he may lawfully waive such rights or benefits pertaining to the released matters.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, Englander on his own behalf and on behalf of his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, waives any and all rights that he may have to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, and releases all claims against Global Amici and Releasees, including, without limitation, all actions and causes of action, suits, liabilities, demands, claims, rights, judgments, duties, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, expenses, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees for claims arising under Proposition 65 or any other statute or the common law with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to lead in

. 5 

Products imported, manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale by Global Amici, before the Effective Date, as alleged in the Notice and Complaint.

# 4.3 Global Amici's Release of Englander

Global Amici, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Englander and his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by Englander and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Products.

# 5. <u>COURT APPROVAL</u>

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties, or by such additional time to which the Parties may agree in writing.

# 6. SEVERABILITY

If, after the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

# 7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. If Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then Global Amici may provide written notice to Englander of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further injunctive obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment, with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected.

*!!!* 

# 8. NOTICE

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier, to the following addresses:

#### For Global Amici:

Tanner Sloan, Chief Executive Officer Global Amici, Inc. 8400 Miramar Road, Suite 290 San Diego, CA 92126

# Copy to counsel:

Sarah Esmaili, Esq. Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP Three Embarcadero Center, Floor 10 San Francisco, CA 94111

#### For Englander:

Proposition 65 Coordinator The Chanler Group 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

# 9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE AND PDF SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

#### 10. POST-EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

Englander agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of this Consent Judgment, which Englander shall take the lead to draft and file, and Global Amici shall support, including appearing at the hearing if so required.

#### 11. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court.

12. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>	
The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment, and have read, understand,	
and agree to all the terms and conditions contained herein.	
AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
	10/00/-
Date: 12/29/17	Date: 12/27/17
By: DETERMENT ANDER	By: TANNER SLOAN, CEO
TITIK ENGLANDER	GLOBAL AMICTING.
5	
1 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
*	
	¥
a e	
*	
2	
	The undersigned are authorized to and agree to all the terms and conditions c AGREED TO:  Date: 12/29/17