

23

24

25

26

27

28



MAY 1 3 2019

JAMES M. KIM, Court Executive Officer MARIN COUNTY SUPERIOR COURT By: J. Berg, Deputy

## SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

#### **COUNTY OF MARIN**

#### UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION

Case No. CIV1801416

[PROPOSED] JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT

Date: May 10, 2019 Time: 1:30 p.m.

Dept.: I

Judge: Hon. Andrew E. Sweet

JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT

In the above entitled action, Plaintiff John Moore and Settling Defendants Balkamp Inc., Genuine Parts Company, and Ullman Devices Corporation, having agreed through their respective counsel that Judgment be entered pursuant to the terms of their settlement agreement in the form of a Consent Judgment, and following this Court's issuance of an Order approving their Proposition 65 Settlement and Consent Judgment, and for good cause being shown,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4) and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6, Judgment is hereby entered in accordance with the terms of the Consent Judgment attached hereto as Exhibit A. By stipulation of the parties, the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the terms of the settlement under Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: MAY 1 3 2019

ANDREW E. SWEET

JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

# EXHIBIT A

1 2 3 4 5	Laralei S. Paras, State Bar No. 203319 THE CHANLER GROUP 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565 Telephone: (510) 848-8880 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118 laralei@chanler.com Attorneys for Plaintiff	
6	JOHN MOORE	
7	Jeffrey J. Parker, State Bar No. 155377 SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER & HAMPTO 333 South Hope Street, 43rd Floor	N LLP
9	Los Angeles, CA 90071-1422 Telephone: (213) 620-1780 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118 JParker@sheppardmullin.com	
11	,	
12	Attorneys for Defendants GENUINE PARTS INC., BALKAMP INC. and ULLMAN DEVICES CORPORATION	
13	and OLLMAN DEVICES CORPORATION	
14		
15	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
16	COUNTY OF MARIN	
17	UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION	
18		
19	JOHN MOORE,	Case No. CIV1801416
20	Plaintiff,	CONSENT JUDGMENT
21	v.	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)
22	GENUINE PARTS COMPANY, et al.,	Code Civ. Floc. g 004.0)
23	Defendants.	
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff John Moore ("Moore") and defendants Balkamp Inc. ("Balkamp"), Genuine Parts Company ("Genuine Parts"), and Ullman Devices Corporation ("Ullman") with Balkamp, Genuine Parts and Ullman collectively referred to as "Defendants" and with Moore and Defendants each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties."

#### 1.2 Plaintiff

Moore is an individual residing in California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

#### 1.3 Defendants

Genuine Parts, Balkamp and Ullman each employ ten or more individuals and are each a "person in the course of doing business" for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

#### 1.4 General Allegations

Moore alleges that Defendants import, sell, or distribute for sale in California, tool pouches that contain lead without first providing the exposure warning required by Proposition 65. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 1.5 Product Description

The products covered by this Consent Judgment are tool pouches manufactured by or for Ullman and imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California by Genuine Parts and/or Balkamp that contain lead, including, but not limited to, the *Napa Service Tools Professional 1500 Series 4 Piece hook Set, 3121, UPC #6 64766 42126 6* ("Products").

#### 1.6 Notices of Violation

On February 14, 2018, Moore served Genuine Parts and Balkamp, and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") alleging that Genuine Parts and

Balkamp violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn their customers and consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to lead from the Products.

On October 24, 2018, Moore served Ullman, Genuine Parts and Balkamp, and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Supplemental Notice") alleging that Ullman, Genuine Parts and Balkamp violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn their customers and consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to lead from the Products. The Notice and Supplemental Notice are collectively referred to herein as the "Notices." No public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notices.

#### 1.7 Complaint

On April 27, 2018, Moore filed the instant action ("Complaint"), naming Genuine Parts and Balkamp as defendants for the alleged violations of Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 that are the subject of the Notice. Thereafter, Moore filed a First Amended Complaint ("Complaint") naming Ullman as a defendant for the alleged violations of Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 that are the subject of the Supplemental Notice.

#### 1.8 No Admission

Each of Ullman, Genuine Parts and Balkamp denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notices and Complaint, and maintains that all of the products it has sold and distributed for sale in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Ullman's, Genuine Parts' or Balkamp's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

#### 1.9 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Ullman, Genuine Parts and Balkamp as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Marin, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the

5

9

7

10 11 12

14

15

13

16 17 18

19 20

22

21

23 24

25

26 27

28

provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

#### 1.10 **Effective Date**

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" means the date on which the Court approves this Consent Judgment, including any unopposed tentative ruling granting approval of this Consent Judgment.

#### INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: PRODUCT REFORMULATION AND WARNINGS

#### Commitment to Reformulate or Warn 2.1

Commencing on the Effective Date and continuing thereafter, Ullman, Genuine Parts and Balkamp agree to only distribute, sell or offer for sale in California, Products that are either (a) Reformulated Products as defined by Section 2.2, below, or (b) Products that bear a clear and reasonable health hazard warning pursuant to Section 2.3 below, except as provided in Section 2.4, below.

#### 2.2 **Reformulation Standard**

"Reformulated Products" are Products that: (a) contain no more than 100 parts per million ("ppm") lead when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3050B and 6010B or equivalent methodologies utilized by federal or state agencies for the purpose of determining lead content in a solid substance; and (b) yield no more than 1.0 microgram ("ug") of lead when a wipe is applied to all surfaces according to NIOSH Test Method No. 9100.

#### 2.3 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

For any non-Reformulated Product manufactured by or for Ullman and/or purchased by Genuine Parts or Balkamp after the Effective Date that are sold or distributed for sale in California, Ullman, Genuine Parts and Balkamp agree to only sell or distribute such Products for sale in California with a clear and reasonable warning in accordance with this Section or Title 27 California Code of Regulations section 25602 and 25603. Ullman, Genuine Parts and Balkamp further agree that any warning used will be prominently placed in relation to the Products with such conspicuousness when compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it

2	
3	

likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, a warning satisfying the above criteria that is affixed directly to a Product or its accompanying labeling or packaging containing either of the following statements shall be deemed clear:

▲WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warning.ca.gov.

△ WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warning.ca.gov.

Where the label is not printed using the color yellow, the symbol may be printed in black and white.

#### 2.4 Covered Products in the Stream of Commerce

Any Products that have been distributed, shipped, or sold by Ullman to Genuine Parts,
Balkamp, or Downstream Releasees (as defined in Section 4.1) prior to the July 1, 2018, shall not be
subject to the requirements of Section 2.1, 2.2 or 2.3.

### 3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

#### 3.1 Civil Penalty Payments

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), and in settlement of all the claims referred to in the Notice, Complaint, and this Consent Judgment, Ullman, Genuine Parts or Balkamp shall pay \$5,000 in civil penalties. The civil penalty payment shall be allocated according to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the penalty paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining twenty-five percent (25%) of the penalty retained by Moore. Moore's counsel shall be responsible for delivering OEHHA's portion of any penalty payment(s) made under this Consent Judgment. The payment shall be by a check made payable to "John Moore, Client Trust Account" in the amount of \$1,250 and a check made payable to "OEHHA" in the amount of \$3,750 to be delivered to the address provided in Section 3.3, below.

#### 3.2 Reimbursement of Attorney's Fees and Costs

The parties acknowledge that Moore and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving the issue to be resolved after the material terms of this Consent Judgment had been settled. Shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized, the Parties negotiated the compensation due to Moore and his counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5 for all work performed through the mutual execution of this Consent Judgment, and court approval of the same, but exclusive of fees and costs on appeal, if any. Under these legal principles, Ullman, Genuine Parts or Balkamp shall pay \$35,000 for all fees and costs incurred by Moore investigating, bringing this matter to Ullman's, Genuine Parts' and Balkamp's attention, litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. The payment shall be delivered to the address in Section 3.4 in a check payable to "The Chanler Group."

### 3.3 Payment Timing; Payments Held in Trust

All payments due under this Consent Judgment shall be held in trust until such time as the Court approves the Parties' settlement. Within five business (5) days of the date that this Consent Judgment is fully executed by the Parties, all payments due under this agreement shall be delivered to Defendants' counsel and held in trust until the Effective Date. Defendants' counsel shall provide Moore's counsel with written confirmation upon its receipt of the settlement payments. Within five business days of the Effective Date, Defendants' counsel shall deliver the civil penalty and attorneys' fee reimbursement payments to Moore's counsel.

#### 3.4 Payment Address

All payments required by this Consent Judgment shall be delivered to:

The Chanler Group Attn: Proposition 65 Controller 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710

///

#### 4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

## 4.1 Moore's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims

Moore, acting on his own behalf and in the public interest, releases Ullman, Genuine Parts and Balkamp and their parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, and attorneys ("Releasees"), and each entity to whom either of them directly or indirectly distribute or sell the Products including, without limitation, their downstream customers, distributors, wholesalers, franchisees, and retailers ("Downstream Releasees") for any violation arising under Proposition 65 pertaining to the failure to warn about exposures to lead from Products sold or distributed for sale by Releasees prior to the Effective Date, as described in the Notice. The release in this Section 4.1 shall not extend upstream, and it shall remain limited to the Products. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to lead from Products sold or distributed for sale by Releasees or Downstream Releasees after the Effective Date.

#### 4.2 Moore's Individual Release of Claims

Moore, in his individual capacity only and *not* in any representative capacity, also provides a general release to Releasees and Downstream Releasees, which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action in law or in equity, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, fines, penalties, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of Moore of any nature, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures, or failure to warn of, to lead in Products sold or distributed for sale by Releasees or Downstream Releasees before the Effective Date. The release in this Section 4.2 shall not extend upstream, and it shall remain limited to the Products.

#### 4.3 Defendants' Release of Moore

Ullman, Genuine Parts and Balkamp, on their own behalf, and on behalf of their past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Moore, and his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by Moore, and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of

8 9

10

11 12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Products.

#### 4.4 Release of Known and Unknown Claims

It is possible that other Claims not known to Moore or Defendants arising out of the facts relating to the Claims released, discharged, and waived in Sections 4.1, 4.2 or 4.3 will subsequently be developed or be discovered. Moore and Defendants acknowledge that the Claims in this Consent Judgment include all known and unknown Claims within the scope of the claims released, discharged, and waived in Sections 4.1, 4.2 or 4.3 except as provided in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 hereinabove, and they each waive the provisions of California Civil Code § 1542 as to any unknown Claims that may have existed prior to and including the Effective Date, except as provided in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 hereinabove. California Civil Code § 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

Moore and Defendants acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

#### 5. **COURT APPROVAL**

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties, or by such additional time as the Parties may agree in writing.

#### 6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

#### 7. **GOVERNING LAW**

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California and apply within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally or as to the Products, then Genuine Parts may 7

1	provide written notice to Moore of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further		
2	injunctive obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the		
3	Products are so affected.		
4	8. <u>NOTICE</u>		
5	Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment		
6	shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified mail,		
7	return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to the following addresses:		
8	For Genuine Parts: For Moore:		
9 10 11	Paul D. Donahue, President Genuine Parts Company 2999 Wildwood Pkwy Atlanta, GA 30339  For Balkamp:  Proposition 65 Coordinator The Chanler Group 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565		
12 13 14 15	Balkamp, Inc. c/o Genuine Parts Company Attn. Corporate Counsel 2999 Wildwood Pkwy Atlanta, GA 30339		
16	For Ullman:		
17 18	Doug Spitler, President Ullman Devices Corporation 29 E. Madison, Suite 900 Chicago, IL 60602		
19	with a copy on behalf of Defendants to:		
20 21 22	Jeffrey Parker Sheppard, Mullin, Richter & Hampton LLP 333 S. Hope Street, 43rd Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071		
23 24	Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which all		
25	notices and other communications shall be sent.		
26	9. <u>COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES</u>		
27	This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile signature, each of		
28	which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and th		
	same document.		

#### 10. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

Moore agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement, which motion Moore shall draft and file. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, and those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this Section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval, responding to any objection that any third-party may file or lodge, and appearing at the hearing before the Court if so requested.

## 11. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.

#### 12. AUTHORIZATION

A CREED TO

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

ACDEED TO.

AGREED IU:	AGREED IO:	
Date: 1/25/2019	Date:	
By: JOHN MOORE	By:  Kathleen Eidbo, Assistant VP and Senior Counsel  GENUINE PARTS COMPANY	
AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:	
Date:	Date:	
By:  Doug Spitler, President  ULLI MAN DEVICES CORPORATION	By: Kathleen Eidbo, Counsel BALKAMP INC.	

#### 10. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

Moore agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement, which motion Moore shall draft and file. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, and those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this Section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval, responding to any objection that any third-party may file or lodge, and appearing at the hearing before the Court if so requested.

## 11. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.

#### 12. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
Date:	Date: 215/19
By:	By:  Kathleen Eidbo, Assistant VP and Senior Counsel GENUINE PARTS COMPANY
AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
Date:	Date: 215/19
By: Doug Spitler, President ULLMAN DEVICES CORPORATION	By: Kathleen Eidbo, Counsel BALKAMP INC.

#### 10. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

Moore agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement, which motion Moore shall draft and file. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, and those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this Section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval, responding to any objection that any third-party may file or lodge, and appearing at the hearing before the Court if so requested.

#### 11. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.

#### 12. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
Date:	Date:
By:  JOHN MOORE	By:  Kathleen Eidbo, Assistant VP and Senior Counsel  GENUINE PARTS COMPANY
AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
Date: 2/12/2019	Date:
By: Doug Spitler, President ULLMAN DEVICES CORPORATION	By: Kathleen Eidbo, Counsel BALKAMP INC.