

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

MIGUEL A. CUSTODIO, JR., STATE BAR NO. 248744
VINEET DUBEY, STATE BAR NO. 243208
CUSTODIO & DUBEY LLP
448 S. Hill St., Suite 612
Los Angeles, CA 90013
Telephone: (213) 785-2909
Facsimile: (213) 785-2899

CONFORMED COPY
ORIGINAL FILED
Superior Court Of California
County Of Los Angeles

RECEIVED
SEP 26 2018

DEC 04 2018

Sherril R. Carter, Executive Officer/Clerk
Martha Cervantes, Deputy

Attorneys for Plaintiff Ecological Alliance, LLC **FILING WINDOW**

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES
(Unlimited Jurisdiction)

ECOLOGICAL ALLIANCE, LLC, a California
limited liability company,

Plaintiff,

v.

NAVITOR, INC., a Minnesota corporation,

Defendant.

Case No.: *BC 709766.*

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED
CONSENT JUDGMENT**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Plaintiff Ecological Alliance, LLC ("Plaintiff"), and Defendant Navitor, Inc. ("Defendant") hereby enter into this Stipulated Consent Judgment ("Consent Judgment") as follows:

WHEREAS: On or about February 19, 2018, Plaintiff, through Plaintiff's counsel, served a 60 Day Notice to Defendant's parent company, Taylor Corporation, the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every County in the State of California, and the City Attorneys for every City in the State of California with a population greater than 750,000 (collectively, "Public Prosecutor(s)") alleging that Taylor Corporation violated California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code § 25249.6, et seq., and its implementing regulations (collectively, "Proposition 65") and that Plaintiff intended to file an enforcement action in the public interest; and

WHEREAS: Plaintiff alleges that Defendant manufactured and/or distributed art tapes (collectively the "Covered Products") that were sold or distributed for sale in California and further alleges that those Covered Products expose consumers in the State of California to chemicals including Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate [DEHP], which are listed by the State of California pursuant to California Health and Safety Code § 25249.8; and

WHEREAS: Plaintiff further alleges that persons in the State of California were exposed to DEHP in Covered Products without being provided the Proposition 65 warning set out at California Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 and its implementing regulations ("Proposition 65 Warning");

WHEREAS: Defendant denies the allegations of the 60 Day Notice, and denies that it has violated Proposition 65 and expressly denies that it has engaged in any wrongdoing whatsoever,

WHEREAS: Plaintiff seeks to provide the public with Proposition 65 warnings and believes that this objective is achieved by the actions described in this Consent Judgment; and

WHEREAS: Plaintiff and Defendant wish to resolve their differences without the delay and expense of litigation.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED AND AGREED UPON AS BETWEEN PLAINTIFF ACTING IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST AND DEFENDANT AS FOLLOWS:

1
2 INTRODUCTION

3 1.1. On February 19, 2018, Plaintiff served the 60-Day Notice upon Defendant's parent
4 company, Taylor Corporation, Staples The Office Superstore, LLC, and on Public
5 Prosecutors. No Public Prosecutors commenced an enforcement action. No Public
6 Prosecutor having commenced an enforcement action, Plaintiff proceeded to file its
7 Complaint against Defendant in the present action.

8 1.2. Defendant employs ten (10) or more persons.

9 1.3. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, Plaintiff and Defendant (the
10 "Parties") stipulate that: 1) this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violation
11 contained in the Complaint, and personal jurisdiction over Defendant as to the acts
12 alleged in the Complaint; 2) venue is proper in the County of Los Angeles; and 3) this
13 Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all
14 claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged
15 therein with respect to the Covered Products, and of all claims which were or could have
16 been raised by any person or entity based in whole or in part, directly or indirectly, on the
17 facts alleged in the 60-Day Notice, in the present action, or arising therefrom or related
18 thereto, with respect to Covered Products, including any Proposition 65 claim arising out
19 of an exposure to Covered Products (collectively, "Proposition 65 Claims").

20 1.4. The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of the
21 Proposition 65 Claims, for the purpose of avoiding prolonged and costly litigation and of
22 resolving the issues raised therein both as to past and future conduct. By execution of
23 this Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit
24 any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law, nor shall Defendant's compliance with
25 the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Defendant of any
26 fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law. Defendant denies the material, factual, and
27 legal allegations in the 60-Day Notice and the Complaint and expressly denies any
28 wrongdoing whatsoever.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1. "Effective Date" shall mean, with respect to this Consent Judgment, the later to occur of the following events: August 30, 2018, or the date the Consent Judgment has been approved and entered by the Court.

3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

3.1. For each Covered Product, Defendant agrees to undertake, or cause to be undertaken on its behalf, either (a) reformulation of the Covered Product to bring it within the Proposition 65 exemption identified in Section 3.2 below, or (b) provide a warning as prescribed in Sections 3.3-3.4 below. Compliance with this Section 3.1 will constitute compliance by Defendant with all requirements of Proposition 65 relating to DEHP exposure in the Covered Products:

3.2. Proposition 65 Exemption for the Covered Products

Subject to Section 3.5, any Covered Product that is sold, or offered for sale, to consumers in the State of California after the Effective Date shall be deemed to comply with Proposition 65, and be exempt from any Proposition 65 warning requirements with respect to DEHP, if no "Accessible Component Part" of such Covered Product contains more than 0.1 percent (1,000 parts per million) of DEHP. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Accessible Component Part" shall mean components of the Covered Products to which a person would be exposed to DEHP by direct contact during normal use of the Covered Product.

3.3. Warning Option

Subject to section 3.5, Covered Products that do not meet the warning exemption standard set forth in Section 3.2 above, shall be accompanied by a warning as described in Section 3.4 below. This warning requirement shall only be required as to Covered Products that are manufactured, distributed, marketed, sold or shipped for sale to consumers by Defendant in the State of California, after the Effective Date. No Proposition 65 warning shall be required as to any Covered Products that are already in the stream of commerce as

1
2 of the Effective Date, and all such Covered Products are hereby deemed to be exempt
3 from Proposition 65 with respect to DEHP

4 3.4. Warning Language

5 Where required to meet the criteria set forth in Section 3.3, Defendant shall provide one of
6 the following warning statements on or within the unit packaging of the Covered
7 Products, or affixed to the Covered Products, displayed in a reasonably conspicuous
8 manner:

- 9
- 10 (1) **[California Proposition 65] WARNING: This product**
11 **contains chemicals known to the state of California to**
12 **cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm.**
- 13 (2) **[California Proposition 65] WARNING: This product may**
14 **expose you to chemicals including DEHP known to the**
15 **State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other**
16 **reproductive harm. For more information go to**
17 **www.P65warnings.ca.gov**
- 18 (3) **WARNING: This product can expose you to DEHP, which is**
19 **known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or**
20 **other reproductive harm. For more info go to**
21 **www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.**
- 22 (4) **WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm -**
23 **www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.**

24 If Defendant elects to use the warning statements identified in either (3) or (4)
25 above, it may also include a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a
26 yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline. Where the sign, label or shelf
27 tag for the product is not printed using the color yellow, the symbol may be printed
28 in black and white. The symbol shall be placed to the left of the text of the
warning, in a size no smaller than the height of the word "WARNING".

1
2 3.5. 90-Day Grace Period

3 Although Defendant shall be deemed in compliance on the Effective Date, Defendant
4 shall have a ninety (90)-day grace period from the Effective Date to complete the
5 reformulation or warning steps provided in Sections 3.1 – 3.4.

6 4. MONETARY RELIEF

7 4.1. Within ten (10) business days of the date the Consent Judgment has been approved
8 and entered by the Court, Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$35,000 which includes
9 \$7,000 in civil penalties and \$28,000 in payment of Plaintiff's costs and reasonable
10 attorney's fees. The \$7,000 civil penalty shall be apportioned pursuant to Health and
11 Safety Code section 25249.12 (d), with 75%, or \$5,250, paid to the State of California's
12 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and 25%, or \$1,750, payable to
13 Plaintiff.

14 4.2. The payments specified in Section 4.1. shall be made by wire transfer to Plaintiff's
15 counsel Custodio & Dubey LLP as set forth below. Plaintiffs' counsel will remit the
16 portions due to the State of California Office of Environmental Health Hazard
17 Assessment and to Plaintiff.

18 Bank: Bank of America, N.A.

19 Routing Transit No.: 026009593

20 Account No.: 325054144600

21 Beneficiary: Custodio & Dubey LLP

22 5. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE

23 5.1. This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Plaintiff, on
24 behalf of itself, and acting in the public interest, and Defendant, and all of Defendant's
25 parent companies, as well as all of Defendant's officers, directors, members,
26 shareholders, employees, attorneys, agents, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions,
27 affiliates, suppliers, franchisees, licensees, and retailers, their parent and all subsidiaries,
28 and affiliates, thereof, their respective employees, agents and assigns, as well as all other
upstream and downstream entities in the distribution chain for any of the Covered

1
2 Products (including Staples The Office Superstore, LLC, including its parent companies,
3 subsidiaries, divisions, and affiliates), and the predecessors, successors, and assigns of
4 any of them (collectively, the "Released Parties"), for any alleged violation of
5 Proposition 65, and its implementing regulations, for failure to provide Proposition 65
6 warnings for the Covered Products with respect to DEHP, and fully resolves all claims
7 that have been brought, or which could have been brought in this action up to and
8 including the Effective Date. Plaintiff on behalf of itself, and in the public interest,
9 hereby discharges the Released Parties from any and all claims, actions, causes of action,
10 suits, demands, liabilities, damages, penalties, fees, costs and expenses asserted, or that
11 could have been asserted, with respect to any alleged violation of Proposition 65 arising
12 from the failure to provide Proposition 65 warnings about exposures to DEHP for any or
13 all of the Covered Products, through and including the Effective Date.

14 5.2. It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts
15 contained in the 60-Day Notice, or alleged in the Complaint, relating to the Covered
16 Products, will hereafter be discovered or developed. Plaintiff, on behalf of itself only, on
17 the one hand, and Defendant, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Consent Judgment
18 is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims through and including the
19 Effective Date, including all rights of action thereon. Plaintiff and Defendant
20 acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 5.1 and 5.2 may include unknown
21 claims, and nevertheless intend to release such claims, and in doing so waive California
22 Civil Code § 1542 which reads as follows:

23 A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE
24 CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER
25 FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF
26 KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS
27 OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

28 5.3. Plaintiff understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of
this waiver of California Civil Code § 1542 is that even if Plaintiff suffers future damages

1
2 arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, the
3 Covered Products, including but not limited to any exposure to, or failure to warn with
4 respect to exposure to, the Covered Products, Plaintiff will not be able to make any claim
5 for those damages against any of the Released Parties.

6 5.4. Compliance by Defendant with the terms of this Consent Judgment shall constitute
7 compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to DEHP in the Covered
8 Products as set forth in the 60 Day Notice and/or the Complaint.

9 **6. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(F)**

10 6.1. Plaintiff and its attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements
11 referenced in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

12 **7. PROVISION OF NOTICE**

13 7.1. When any Party is entitled to receive any notice or writing under this Consent
14 Judgment, the notice or writing shall be sent by first class certified mail with return
15 receipt requested, or by electronic mail, as follows:

16 To Defendant:
17 Guy Wilson, Esq.
18 Law Offices of Guy Wilson
19 509 Orchard Street
20 Santa Rosa, CA 95404
guywlaw@aol.com

21 To Plaintiff:
22 Vincet Dubey, Esq.
23 Custodio & Dubey LLP
24 448 S. Hill St., Ste 612
25 Los Angeles, CA 90013
dubey@cd-lawyers.com

26 7.2. Any party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by
27 sending the other Party notice that is transmitted in the manner set forth in section 7.1.

28 **8. COURT APPROVAL**

8.1. Upon execution of his Consent Judgment by all Parties, Plaintiff shall prepare and
file, at its sole cost and expense, a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment that

1
2 Defendant shall support. This Consent Judgment shall not become effective until
3 approved and entered by the Court. If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court,
4 it shall be of no force or effect, and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise
5 used in any proceeding for any purpose.

6 **9. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION**

7 9.1. The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of
8 California.

9 **10. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

10 10.1. This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding
11 of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior
12 discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are
13 hereby merged herein and therein.

14 10.2. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties
15 except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or
16 implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been
17 made by any Party hereto.

18 10.3. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or
19 otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements
20 specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or
21 to bind any of the Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated
22 herein.

23 10.4. No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent
24 Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby,
25 and approved and ordered by the Court.

26 10.5. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or
27 shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor
28 shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

11. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

AGREED TO:

Navitor, Inc.

Date: June 4, 2018

By: 

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4) and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6, judgment is hereby entered.

Dated: DEC 04 2018

DAVID S. CUNNINGHAM III
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT