EFS⊬0∂0haus

BAR NO.: 206683	FOR COURT USE ONLY
TATE: CA ZIP CODE: 95112	
X NO.: (408) 298-6046	on 5/28/2024 8:23 AM
	Reviewed By: M. Offhaus
ane II('	Case #19CV340967
	Envelope: 15453560
	CASE NUMBER:
nians, LLC	19CV340967
	JUDICIAL OFFICER:
	Frederick S. Chung
	DEPT:
ER SHEET)	10
	10
	X NO.: (408) 298-6046 ians, LLC

NOTE: This cover sheet is to be used to electronically file and submit to the court a proposed order. The proposed order sent electronically to the court must be in PDF format and must be attached to this cover sheet. In addition, a version of the proposed order in an editable word-processing format must be sent to the court at the same time as this cover sheet and the attached proposed order in PDF format are filed.

1. Name of the party submitting the proposed order:

Plaintiff, Safe Products for Californians, LLC

2. Title of the proposed order:

[Proposed] Consent Judgment

- 3. The proceeding to which the proposed order relates is:
 - a. Description of proceeding: Motion for Approval of Settlement
 - b. Date and time: May 28, 2024 9:00 a.m.
 - c. Place: Downtown Superior Court, Department 10
 191 North First Street
 San Jose, CA 95112
- 4. The proposed order was served on the other parties in the case.

Tanya E. Moore	/s/ Tanya E. Moore
(TYPE OR PRINT NAME)	(SIGNATURE OF PARTY OR ATTORNEY)

CASE NAME:	CASE NUMBER:
Safe Products for Californians, LLC v. Vital Amine, Inc., et al.	19CV340967

PROOF OF ELECTRONIC SERVICE PROPOSED ORDER

1.	I am at least 18 years old and not a party to this action.
	a. My residence or business address is (specify): 334 North Second Street, San Jose CA 95112
	b. My electronic service address is (specify): service@moorelawfirm.com
2.	I electronically served the <i>Proposed Order (Cover Sheet)</i> with a proposed order in PDF format attached, and a proposed order in an editable word-processing format as follows:
	a. On (name of person served) (If the person served is an attorney, the party or parties represented should also be stated.): William F. Tarantino, attorney for Defendant Vital Amine, Inc.
	b. To (electronic service address of person served): WTarantino@mofo.comc. On (date): May 28, 2024
	Electronic service of the <i>Proposed Order (Cover Sheet)</i> with the attached proposed order in PDF format and service of the proposed order in an editable word-processing format on additional persons are described in an attachment.
I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Date: May 28, 2024	
,	Whitney Law /s/ Whitney Law
	(TYPE OR PRINT NAME OF DECLARANT) (SIGNATURE OF DECLARANT)

EFS-020 [Rev. February 1, 2017]

PROPOSED ORDER (COVER SHEET) (Electronic Filing)

Page 2 of 2

Save this form

1 2 3 4 5 6 7	Tanya E. Moore, SBN 206683 MOORE LAW FIRM, P.C. 300 South First Street, Suite 342 San Jose, California 95113 Telephone (408) 298-2000 Facsimile (408) 298-6046 E-mail: service@moorelawfirm.com Attorney for Plaintiff Safe Products for Californians, LLC	Filed July 11, 2024 Clerk of the Court Superior Court of CA County of Santa Clara 19CV340967 By: raragon
8	SUPERIOR COUR	Γ OF CALIFORNIA
9	COUNTY OF S	SANTA CLARA
10		
11	SAFE PRODUCTS FOR CALIFORNIANS,) No. 19CV340967
12	LLC,))) [PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT
13	Plaintiff,)
14	VS.	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq.)
15	VITAL AMINE, INC. dba ORA ORGANIC;	
16	DOES 1 THROUGH 150, inclusive;))
17	Defendants.))
18))
19		
20		
21	1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>	
22	1.1 Parties	
23	This Consent Judgment ("Consent Judg	ment") is entered into by and between plaintiff
24	Safe Products for Californians, LLC ("SPFC") and defendant Vital Amine, Inc. dba Ora Organic	
25	("Vital Amine"). SPFC and Vital Amine are each referred to individually as a "Party" and	
26	collectively as the "Parties." Defendant Amazon.com, Inc. ("Amazon," and together with Vital	
27	Amine, collectively referred to as "Defendants	") is an intended third-party beneficiary of this
28	Consent Judgment.	

Page 1 19CV340967

[TROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT

sf-5780758

1.2 SPFC

SPFC is a limited liability California company with its principal place of business within the State of California, County of Santa Clara, who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals, and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating harmful substances contained in consumer and commercial products.

1.3 Vital Amine

Vital Amine employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code section 25249.5 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65").

1.4 General Allegations

SPFC alleges that powdered dietary supplements that Defendants manufacture, import, sell and/or distribute for sale in California cause exposure to lead and lead compounds (hereinafter referred to as "lead") and that they do so without providing the health hazard warning that SPFC alleges is required by Proposition 65.

1.5 Product Description

The products that are covered by this Consent Judgment are the dietary supplements identified on Exhibit A, which are manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Vital Amine and/or its customers in the state of California, hereinafter the "Products."

1.6 Notice of Violation

On or about May 8, 2018, SPFC served Defendants, and certain requisite public enforcement agencies, with a 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice"), alleging that Defendants violated Proposition 65 when they failed to warn their customers and consumers in California that the Products expose users to lead and lead compounds. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notice.

1.7 Complaint

On January 9, 2019, SPFC commenced the instant action against Defendants for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notice.

1.8 No Admission

Vital Amine denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint, and maintains that all of the products that it has sold or distributed for sale in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, the same being specifically denied by Vital Amine. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Vital Amine's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.9 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Vital Amine as to the allegations contained in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Santa Clara, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date that the Court grants the motion for approval of this Consent Judgment contemplated by Section 5.

2. <u>INJUNCTIVE RELIEF</u>

2.1 Product Reformulation

As of the Effective Date, Vital Amine shall be permanently enjoined from manufacturing for sale in the State of California, "Distributing into the State of California," or directly selling in the State of California, any Products which expose a person to a "Daily Lead Exposure Level" of more than 0.5 micrograms of lead per day ("Reformulated Product") unless it meets the warning requirements under section 2.2. Products manufactured prior to the Effective Date are not subject to this requirement.

2.1.1 As used in this Consent Judgment, the term "Distributing into the State of California" shall mean to directly ship a Product into California for sale in California or to sell a Product to a distributor Vital Amine knows or has reason to know will sell the Products in California.

2.1.2 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the "Daily Lead Exposure Level" shall be measured in micrograms, and shall be calculated using the following formula: micrograms of lead per gram of product, multiplied by grams of product per serving of the product (using the largest serving size appearing on the product label), multiplied by servings of the product per day (using the largest number of recommended daily servings appearing on the label), which equals micrograms of lead exposure per day. If the label contains no recommended daily servings, then the number of recommended daily shall be one. Naturally occurring lead, as defined in section 2.1.3, shall not be included in the Daily Lead Exposure Level.

2.1.3 The amount of lead deemed "naturally occurring" in each of the Supplement Products is the sum of the amounts of "naturally occurring" lead supplied by the quantity of each ingredient listed in Table 2.1.1 that is present in each Product. For each ingredient listed in Table 2.1.1, the amount of lead deemed "naturally occurring" is listed in Table 2.1.1 in micrograms of "naturally occurring" lead per gram of the ingredient contained in the Supplement Product.

Table 2.1.1
Ingredient Amount of lead (Pb) per gram of ingredient deemed naturally occurring

Calcium	0.8 micrograms Pb per 1000 milligrams of calcium
Ferrous fumarate	0.4 micrograms Pb per gram of ferrous fumarate
Zinc Oxide	8.0 micrograms Pb per gram of zinc oxide
Magnesium oxide	0.4 micrograms Pb per gram of magnesium oxide
Magnesium carbonate	0.332 micrograms Pb per gram of magnesium carbonate
Magnesium hydroxide	0.4 micrograms Pb per gram of magnesium hydroxide
Zinc gluconate	0.8 micrograms Pb per gram of zinc gluconate
Potassium chloride	1.1 micrograms Pb per gram of potassium chloride

To the extent any Product contains ingredients that are subject to the consent judgment and related releases in *As You Sow v. Trader Joe's Company*, San Francisco Superior Court Case No. CGC-15-548791, the lead content attributed to those Chocolate Product ingredients, as that term is defined in the consent judgment, and the related exemptions in that judgment shall be deemed naturally occurring and exclude from the Daily Lead Exposure Calculation.

2.2 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

For Products that are not Reformulated Products and are directly sold or offered for sale in California by Vital Amine, Vital Amine shall only sell or offer for sale in California Products accompanied with the following warning:

OPTION 1:

WARNING: Consuming this product can expose you to [chemicals including] lead, which is [are] known to the State of California to cause [cancer and] birth defects and other reproductive harm. For more information, go to: www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food

OR:

OPTION 2:

WARNING: [Cancer and] Reproductive Harm – www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food

Vital Amine shall use the phrase "cancer and" in the Warning if Vital Amine has reason to believe that the "Daily Lead Exposure Level" is greater than 15 micrograms of lead as determined pursuant to the quality control methodology set forth in Section 2.5 or if Vital Amine has reason to believe that another Proposition 65 chemical is present which may require a cancer warning. The words "chemicals including" may be deleted from the warning content if the warning is being provided for an exposure to lead only.

The warning provided pursuant to Section 2.4 shall be prominently affixed to or printed upon the container or label of each Product. If the Warning is provided on the label, it must be set off from other surrounding information and enclosed in a box. In addition, for any Product sold over the internet where a California delivery address is indicated, the Warning shall be provided either by including the Warning on the product display page, by otherwise prominently displaying the Warning to the purchaser during the checkout process prior to completing the

FROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT

purchase, or by any other means authorized under Section 25607.1 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. An asterisk or other identifying method must be utilized to identify which products on the checkout page are subject to the Warning.

In the event Vital Amine provides the Warning pursuant to OPTION 2, above, the entire Warning must be in a type size no smaller than the largest size used for other consumer information on the product, and in no case shall the Warning appear in a type size smaller than 6-point type. For all Warnings, the word "WARNING" shall be in all capital letters in bold print. No statements intended to or likely to have the effect of diminishing the impact of the Warning on the average lay person shall accompany the Warning. Further, no statements may accompany the Warning that state or imply that the source of the listed chemical has an impact on or results in a less harmful effect of the listed chemical.

Vital Amine must display the above Warning on the Products' packaging, labeling, website or instruction booklet and displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. Products manufactured prior to the Effective Date are not subject to the requirements of Section 2.3.

2.3 Testing and Quality Control Methods

- 2.3.1 Beginning within one year of the Effective Date, Vital Amine shall arrange for lead testing of the Products at least once a year for a minimum of two consecutive years by arranging for testing of three randomly selected samples of each of the Products, in the form intended for sale to the end-user, which Vital Amine intends to sell or is manufacturing for sale in California, directly selling to a consumer in California or "Distributing into the State of California." If tests conducted pursuant to this Section demonstrate that no Warning is required for a Product during each of the two consecutive years, then the testing requirements of this Section will no longer be required as to that Product.
- **2.3.2** All testing pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be performed using a laboratory method that complies with the performance and quality control factors appropriate for the method used, including limit of detection, qualification, accuracy, and precision that

meets the following criteria: Inductively Coupled Plasma-Mass Spectrometry ("ICP-MS") achieving a limit of qualification of less than or equal to 0.010 mg/kg.

- **2.3.3** All testing pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be performed by an independent third-party laboratory certified by the California Environmental Laboratory Accreditation Program or an independent third-party laboratory that is registered with the United States Food & Drug Administration.
- **2.3.4** Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall limit Vital Amine's ability to conduct, or require that others conduct, additional testing of the Products, including the raw materials used in their manufacture.
- **2.3.5** Within sixty (60) days of SPFC's written request, Vital Amine shall deliver lab reports obtained pursuant to Section 2.3 to SPFC. Vital Amine shall retain all test results and documentation for a period of three years from the date of each test.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Payments Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b)(2)

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), Vital Amine shall pay civil penalties in the amount of \$2,000. The penalty payment shall be allocated according to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of the penalty amount paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty paid to SPFC. SPFC's counsel shall be responsible for remitting Vital Amine's penalty payment under this Consent Judgment to OEHHA. By February 16, 2024, Vital Amine shall disburse \$2,000 to SPFC's counsel's trust account to be held in trust for this purpose pending Court approval of settlement. The funds shall be disbursed in the form of a check payable to "Moore Law Firm, P.C., Trust Account," in the amount of \$2,000. Within 30 days of the Effective Date, SPFC's counsel shall disburse \$1,500 of said funds in the form of a check, payable to OEHHA in the amount of \$1,500.

3.2 Reimbursement of Attorneys' Fees and Costs

For all work performed as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Defendants' attention and negotiating a settlement in the public interest through the mutual execution of this

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

said funds in the form of a check payable to "Moore Law Firm, P.C." which shall be delivered to the address in Section 3.3 within 30 days of the Effective Date. The reimbursement shall cover all fees and costs incurred by SPFC investigating, bringing this matter to Defendants' attention, litigating, and negotiating a settlement of the matter in the public interest.

3.3 **Payment Procedures**

The payments pursuant to Sections 3.1 and 3.2 shall be delivered to the following address:

> Moore Law Firm, P.C. Attn: Proposition 65 (SPFC) 300 South First Street, Suite 342 San Jose, California 95113

If for any reason this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court within one year of the date the Consent Judgment is executed by all Parties, or if the Court twice denies a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment, SPFC shall meet and confer with Vital Amine about mutually agreeable steps the Parties can take to ensure entry of the Consent Judgment. If such steps cannot be agreed between the Parties, SPFC shall promptly return to Vital Amine any and all monies disbursed by Vital Amine herein under Sections 3.1 and 3.2 upon Vital Amine's written request.

26 ///

27

28

4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

4.1 SPFC's Release of Proposition 65 Claims

SPFC, acting on its own behalf and in the public interest, releases Defendants and their parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, and attorneys and the predecessors, successors, or assigns of each of them ("Releasees") and each entity to whom Defendants directly or indirectly distribute or sell the Products including, but not limited to, their downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisers, cooperative members, licensors and licensees ("Downstream Releasees") for any violations of Proposition 65 up through the Effective Date based on exposure to lead from Covered Products manufactured, imported, distributed, or sold by Vital Amine as set forth in the Notices of Violations. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to lead from Covered Products as set forth in the Notices of Violations.

4.2 SPFC's Individual Release of Claims

SPFC, in its own capacity only and on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees and *not* in its representative capacity, also provides a release to Defendants, Releasees, and Downstream Releasees, which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of SPFC of any nature, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to lead in Products manufactured, imported, distributed or sold by Defendants before the Effective Date.

4.3 Vital Amine's Release of SPFC

Vital Amine, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against SPFC and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by SPFC and its attorneys and other representatives in the course of investigating claims, seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against

it in this matter, or with respect to the Products.

shall support, appearing at the hearing if so requested.

SEVERABILITY

provisions shall not be adversely affected.

GOVERNING LAW

5. **COURT APPROVAL**

3

4

5

6

7

8

9 10

11

7.

13

12

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

8. **NOTICE**

26

27

28

Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery, (ii) first-class registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to any Party by the

federal law or regulation.

PPOPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and

shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one

year after it has been fully executed by all Parties, unless the Parties mutually agree to extend

that time period due to what they mutually agree are reasonably unforeseeable circumstances.

SPFC and Vital Amine agree to support the entry of this agreement as a judgment, and to obtain

the Court's approval of their settlement in a timely manner. The Parties acknowledge that,

pursuant to California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required

for judicial approval of this Consent Judgment, which SPFC shall draft and file and Vital Amine

this Consent Judgment is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining

California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed,

preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the

Products, then Vital Amine may provide SPFC with written notice of any asserted change in the

law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment, with respect to,

and to the extent that, the Products are so affected. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be

interpreted to relieve Vital Amine from its obligation to comply with any pertinent state or

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent

If, subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any provision of

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of

Page 10 19CV340967

sf-5780758

	other at the following addresses:
2	To Vital Amine:

William F. Tarantino Attn: Proposition 65 (Vital Amine) 425 Market Street San Francisco, CA 94105 Moore Law Firm, P.C. Attn: Proposition 65 (SPFC) 300 South First Street, Suite 342 San Jose, California 95113

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

5

3

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other Party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

To SPFC:

9. COUNTERPARTS, FACSIMILE AND PDF SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (pdf) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original and, all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

10. COMPLIANCE WITH REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

SPFC and its counsel agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f).

11. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon; or (ii) upon a successful motion of any Party and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon.

12. <u>OTHER TERMS</u>

12.1 No Other Agreements

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter set forth in this Consent Judgment, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are deemed merged. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties except as expressly set forth in this Consent Judgment. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced in

Dated:

Safe Products for Californians, LLC By: Randy Moore, Operating Manager

Vital Amine, Inc. dba Ora Organic

By: William Smelko, Chief Executive Officer

PPOPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT

25

26

27

28

1	EXHIBIT A
2	Superfood Protein Supplement – Vanilla Chai
3	 Organic Superfood Acai Powder Easy Being Green – Organic Alkaline Greens Powder
4	Easy Being Green - Organic Arkannic Greens I owder
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

[TROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT

Page 13 19CV340967

[PROPOSED] ORDER AND JUDGMENT

Based upon the Parties' stipulation, and good cause appearing, this Consent Judgment is approved and Judgment is hereby entered according to its terms.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

June 17, 2024

Dated:



Hon. Frederick Chung

Judge of the Superior Court

[TROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT

19CV340967 Page 14