R. Aragon

FES-020

		L1 3-020
ATTORNEY OR PARTY WITHOUT ATTORNEY:	STATE BAR NO.: 206683	FOR COURT USE ONLY
NAME: Tanya E. Moore, Esq.		
FIRM NAME: Moore Law Firm, P.C.		
STREET ADDRESS: 300 South First Street, Sui		
CITY: San Jose	STATE: CA ZIP CODE: 95113	on 2/9/2022 3:56 PM
TELEPHONE NO.: (408) 298-2000	FAX NO.: (408) 298-6046	
E-MAIL ADDRESS: service@moorelawfirm.com		Reviewed By: R. Aragon Case #18CV332640 Envelope: 8256780
ATTORNEY FOR (name): Plaintiff, Safe Products for Californians, LLC		
SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF Santa Clara		
STREET ADDRESS: 191 North First Street		
MAILING ADDRESS: 191 North First Street		
CITY AND ZIP CODE: San Jose 95113		
BRANCH NAME: Downtown Superior Court		CASE NUMBER:
PLAINTIFF/PETITIONER: Safe Products for Californians, LLC		18CV332640
DEFENDANT/RESPONDENT: Amazon.com, Inc., et al.		JUDICIAL OFFICER: Honorable Drew Takaichi
OTHER:		
PROPOSED ORDER (COVER SHEET)		DEPT: 2

NOTE: This cover sheet is to be used to electronically file and submit to the court a proposed order. The proposed order sent electronically to the court must be in PDF format and must be attached to this cover sheet. In addition, a version of the proposed order in an editable word-processing format must be sent to the court at the same time as this cover sheet and the attached proposed order in PDF format are filed.

 Name of the party submitting the proposed order: Safe Products for Californians, LLC

2. Title of the proposed order:

[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT

- 3. The proceeding to which the proposed order relates is:
 - a. Description of proceeding: Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and Consent Judgment
 - b. Date and time: February 3, 2022 at 9:00 a.m.
 - c. Place: Department 2, Judge Takaichi, Downtown Superior Court, 191 North First Street, San Jose, CA 95113
- 4. The proposed order was served on the other parties in the case.

Tanya E. Moore, Esq. (TYPE OR PRINT NAME)

/s/ Tanya E. Moore

(SIGNATURE OF PARTY OR ATTORNEY)

Page 1 of 2

CASE NAME:	CASE NUMBER:
Safe Products for Californians, LLC v. Homegoods, Inc., et al.	18CV332640

PROOF OF ELECTRONIC SERVICE PROPOSED ORDER

1. I am at least 18 years old and not a party to this action.		
a. My residence or business address is (specify): Moore Law Firm, P.C., 300 South First Street, Suite 342, San Jose, CA 95113		
b. My electronic service address is (specify): isaac@moorelawfirm.com		
2. I electronically served the <i>Proposed Order (Cover Sheet)</i> with a proposed order in PDF format attached, and a proposed order in an editable word-processing format as follows:		
a. On (name of person served) (If the person served is an attorney, the party or parties represented should also be stated.): Michael Gleason, Esq. and Lindsay J. Mertens, Esq., Hahn Loeser & Parks LLP, 600 West Broadway, Suite 1500, San Diego, CA 92101, attorneys for Defendant, Lyfe Ventures LLC		
b. To (electronic service address of person served): mgleasont@hahnlaw.com; lmertens@hahnlaw.com		
c. On (date): February 8, 2022		
Electronic service of the <i>Proposed Order (Cover Sheet)</i> with the attached proposed order in PDF format and service of the proposed order in an editable word-processing format on additional persons are described in an attachment.		
I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Date: February 8, 2022		
Isaac Medrano /s/ Isaac Medrano		
(TYPE OR PRINT NAME OF DECLARANT) (SIGNATURE OF DECLARANT)		

		Filed February 16, 2022	
1	Tanya E. Moore, SBN 206683 Moore Law Firm, P.C.	Clerk of the Court Superior Court of CA	
2 3	300 South First Street, Suite 342 San Jose, California 95113 Telephone (408) 298-2000	County of Santa Clara 18CV332640	
4	Facsimile (408) 298-6046 E-mail: service@moorelawfirm.com	By: fmiller	
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff		
6	Safe Products for Californians, LLC		
7			
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA		
9	COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA		
10			
11	SAFE PRODUCTS FOR CALIFORNIANS, LLC,	No. 18CV332640	
12	Plaintiff,	AMENDED [PROPOSED] CONSENT	
13	VS.	JUDGMENT	
14	AMAZON.COM, INC., et al.;	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq.)	
15			
16	Defendants.		
17			
18			
19	1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>		
20	1.1 Parties		
21	This Consent Judgment ("Consent Judgment") is entered into by and between plaintiff		
22	Safe Products for Californians, LLC ("SPFC") and defendant Lyfe Ventures LLC ("Lyfe		
23	Ventures"). SPFC and Lyfe Ventures are each referred to individually as a "Party" and		
24	collectively as the "Parties." Defendant Amazon.com, Inc., is an intended third-party beneficiary		
25	of this Consent Judgment.		
26	1.2 SPFC		
27	SPFC is a limited liability California company with its principal place of business within		
28	the State of California, County of Santa Clara, who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to		
	AMENDED [PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT		

Page 1

11380709.1 11582080.1 toxic chemicals, and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating harmful substances contained in consumer and commercial products.

1.3 General Allegations

SPFC alleges that the powdered dietary supplements that Lyfe Ventures manufactures, imports, sells and/or distributes for sale in California cause exposure to lead and lead compounds (hereinafter referred to as "lead") and that Lyfe Ventures does so without providing the health hazard warning that SPFC alleges is required by Proposition 65.

1.4 Product Description

The products that are covered by this Consent Judgment are identified as "All in One – Daily Essentials Shake," ASIN B01JTEQMFO that are manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Lyfe Ventures and/or its customers in the state of California, hereinafter the "Covered Products."

1.5 Notice of Violation

On or about May 8, 2018, SPFC served Lyfe Ventures, and certain requisite public enforcement agencies, with a 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice"), alleging that Lyfe Ventures violated Proposition 65 when it failed to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Covered Products expose users to lead. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notice.

1.6 Complaint

On July 31, 2018, SPFC commenced the instant action (the "Action") for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notice. On September 3, 2019, SPFC amended its Complaint to name Lyfe Ventures in the Action.

1.7 No Admission

The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment pursuant to a full settlement of disputed claims between the Parties as alleged in the Action for the purpose of avoiding prolonged litigation. By execution of this Consent Judgment, Lyfe Ventures does not admit any material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Action, and maintains that all of the products that it has sold or distributed for sale in California, including the Covered Products,

9

10

14 15

13

16

17 18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27 28

have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, the same being specifically denied by Lyfe Ventures. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right, remedy or defense that Lyfe Ventures may have in any other further legal proceedings unrelated to this Action. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Lyfe Ventures's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

Jurisdiction 1.8

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Lyfe Ventures as to the allegations contained in the Action, that venue is proper in the County of Santa Clara, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions as a full and final binding resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Action based on the facts alleged therein and/or notice of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

1.9 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date that this Consent Judgment is adopted by the Court.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 Product Removal

Commencing one-hundred-eighty (180) days after the Effective Date and continuing thereafter, Lyfe Ventures shall only ship, distribute, sell or offer for sale in California, Reformulated Product pursuant to Section 2.2 or Product that is labeled with a clear and reasonable warning pursuant to Section 2.3. Lyfe Ventures shall have no obligation to label Covered Products that were shipped prior to the product removal deadline.

2.2 Reformulated Covered Products

Reformulated Covered Products are Covered Products manufactured after the Effective date for which the "Daily Lead Exposure Level" is no greater than 0.5 micrograms of lead per day.

2.2.1 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the "Daily Lead Exposure Level" shall be measured in micrograms, and shall be calculated using the following formula: micrograms of lead per gram of product, multiplied by grams of product per serving of the product (using the largest serving size appearing on the product label), multiplied by servings of the product per day (using the largest number of recommended daily servings appearing on the product label), which equals micrograms of lead exposure per day. If the label contains no recommended daily servings, then the number of recommended daily servings of the product for purposes of the formula in this Section 2.1.1 shall be calculated as one serving per day.

2.3 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

Commencing one-hundred-eighty (180) days after the Effective Date and continuing thereafter, for any Covered Products manufactured that do not qualify as Reformulated Covered Products and are directly sold or offered for sale in California by Lyfe Ventures after the Effective Date, Lyfe Ventures shall only sell or offer said non-reformulated Covered Products for sale in California when accompanied with one of the following warnings:

OPTION 1:

WARNING: Consuming this product can expose you to [chemicals including] lead which is [are] known to the State of California to cause [cancer and] birth defects and other reproductive harm. For more information go to: www.P65warnings.CA.gov/food"

OR:

OPTION 2:

WARNING: [Cancer and] Reproductive Harm – www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food"

In connection with providing a cancer warning for lead and lead compounds, Lyfe Ventures shall use the phrase "cancer and" in the warning if Lyfe Ventures has reason to believe that the "Daily Lead Exposure Level" is greater than 15 micrograms of lead. Lyfe Ventures also

9

13 14

12

15 16

17 18

19

20 21

22

23

24

25

26 27

28

may include the reference to cancer if Lyfe Ventures has reason to believe that another Proposition 65 chemical is present which may require a cancer warning. The words "chemicals including" may be deleted from the warning content if the warning is being provided for an exposure to a single chemical.

The warning provided pursuant to Section 2.3 shall be prominently affixed to or printed on the Covered Product's packaging or label with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. If the warning is provided on the label, it must be set off from other surrounding information and enclosed in a box. In addition, for any Covered Product sold over the internet where a California delivery address is indicated, the warning shall be provided either by including the warning on the product display page, by otherwise prominently displaying the warning to the purchaser during the checkout process prior to completing the purchase, or by any other means authorized under Section 25607.1 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. An asterisk or other identifying method must be utilized to identify which products on the checkout page are subject to the warning.

In the event Lyfe Ventures provides the warning pursuant to OPTION 2, above, the entire warning must be in a type size no smaller than the largest size used for other consumer information on the product, and in no case shall the warning appear in a type size smaller than 6-point type. For all warnings, the word "WARNING" shall be in all capital letters in bold print. Any additional statements in the warning shall comply with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25601(e).

MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS 3.

Payments Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b)(2) 3.1

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), Lyfe Ventures shall pay civil penalties in the amount of \$500.00. The penalty payment shall be allocated according to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of the penalty amount paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty paid to SPFC. SPFC's counsel shall be responsible for remitting Lyfe

Ventures's penalty payment under this Consent Judgment to OEHHA. Within five business days of all Parties signing this Consent Judgment, Lyfe Ventures shall issue a check payable to "Safe Products for Californians, LLC" in the amount of \$125.00, and a check payable to OEHHA in the amount of \$375.00. These penalty payments shall be delivered to the address listed in Section 3.3 below.

3.2 Reimbursement of Attorneys' Fees and Costs

For all work performed as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Lyfe Ventures's attention and negotiating a settlement in the public interest through the mutual execution of this Consent Judgment and the Court's approval of the same, but exclusive of fees and costs on appeal, if any, Lyfe Ventures shall reimburse SPFC and its counsel \$ 18,933.18. The Parties negotiated this resolution of the compensation due to SPFC and its counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5. Lyfe Ventures's payment shall delivered to the address in Section 3.3 in the form of a check payable to "Moore Law Firm, P.C." within five business days of all Parties signing this Consent Judgment. The reimbursement shall cover all fees and costs incurred by SPFC investigating, bringing this matter to Lyfe Ventures's attention, litigating, and negotiating a settlement of the matter in the public interest.

3.3 Payment Procedures

The payments pursuant to Sections 3.1 and 3.2 shall be delivered to the following address:

Moore Law Firm, P.C. Attn: Proposition 65 (SPFC) 300 South First Street, Suite 342 San Jose, California 95113

If for any reason this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court within one year of the date the Consent Judgment is executed by all Parties, SPFC shall meet and confer with Lyfe Ventures about mutually agreeable steps the Parties can take to ensure entry of the Consent Judgment. If such steps cannot be agreed between the Parties, SPFC shall promptly return to

Lyfe Ventures any and all monies paid by Lyfe Ventures herein under Sections 3.1 and 3.2 upon Lyfe Ventures's written request.

4. <u>CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED</u>

4.1 SPFC's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims

This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between SPFC, acting on its own behalf and on behalf of the public interest, releases Lyfe Ventures and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, shareholders, officers, employees, and attorneys and the predecessors, agents, suppliers, successors, or assigns of each of them, and each entity to whom Lyfe Ventures directly or indirectly distributes or sells Covered Products, including but not limited to, Amazon.com, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, importers, and licensees (the "Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 up through the Effective Date based on exposure to lead from Covered Products manufactured, imported, distributed or sold by Lyfe Ventures as set forth in the Notices of Violations. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to lead from Covered Products as set forth in the Notices of Violations.

4.2 SPFC's Individual Release of Claims

SPFC, in its own capacity only and on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees and *not* in its representative capacity, also provides a release to Lyfe Ventures and the Releasees which shall have preclusive effect such that SPFC shall not be permitted to pursue and/or take any action with respect to any other statutory or common law claim to the fullest extent that any such claim was or could have been asserted by SPFC against Lyfe Ventures and the Releasees, which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of SPFC of any nature, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to lead in Covered Products manufactured, imported, distributed or sold by Lyfe Ventures and/or the Releasees, or the failure to provide a clear and reasonable

warning of exposure as well as any other claim based in whole or in part on the facts alleged in the Action and the Notice, based on actions committed before the Effective Date ("Chemical Exposure Claims").

4.3 Waiver of Rights Under Section 1542 of the California Civil Code

SPFC, acting on its own behalf only, waives all rights to institute any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts, contracts, agreements, promises liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses and attorney's fees of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent now or in the future with respect to the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Lyfe Ventures and the Releasees who may use, maintain, distribute or sell the Covered Products, for the Proposition 65 Claims and the Chemical Exposure Claims (referred to collectively in this Sections as "Claims"). In furtherance of the foregoing, SPFC, acting on its own behalf and in its individual capacity, waives any and all rights and benefits which SPFC now has, or in the future may have, conferred upon SPFC with respect to the Claims by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

4.3 Lyfe Ventures's Release of SPFC

Lyfe Ventures, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against SPFC and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by SPFC and its attorneys and other representatives in the course of investigating claims, seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter.

5. ENTRY OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

The Parties hereby request that the Court promptly enter this Consent Judgment. Upon entry of this Consent Judgment, SPFC and Lyfe Ventures waive their respective rights to a hearing or trial on the allegations of the Action and Notice.

5.1 COURT APPROVAL

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by all Parties, unless the Parties mutually agree to extend that time period due to what they mutually agree are reasonably unforeseeable circumstances. SPFC and Lyfe Ventures agree to support the entry of this agreement as a judgment, and to obtain the Court's approval of their settlement in a timely manner. The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required for judicial approval of this Consent Judgment, which motion SPFC shall draft and file and Lyfe Ventures shall support, appearing at the hearing if so requested.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any provision of this Consent Judgment is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Covered Products, then Lyfe Ventures may provide SPFC with written notice of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment, with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Products are so affected. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be interpreted to relieve Lyfe Ventures from its obligation to comply with any pertinent state or federal law or regulation.

8. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery, (ii) first-class registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to any Party by the other at the following addresses:

To Lyfe Ventures: To SPFC:

Michael Gleason

Hahn Loeser & Parks LLP

One America Plaza

600 West Broadway, Suite 1500

San Diego, CA 92101

Moore Law Firm, P.C.

Attn: Proposition 65 (SPFC)

300 South First Street, Suite 342

San Jose, California 95113

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other Party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

9. COUNTERPARTS, FACSIMILE AND PDF SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (pdf) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original and, all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

10. COMPLIANCE WITH REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

SPFC and its counsel agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f).

11. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon; or (ii) upon a successful motion of any Party and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon.

12. OTHER TERMS

12.1 No Other Agreements

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter set forth in this Consent Judgment, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are deemed merged. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the

Parties except as expressly set forth in this Consent Judgment. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced in this Consent Judgment, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties. No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall release, or in any way affect any rights that Lyfe Ventures might have against any other party.

12.2 Construction

The Parties have participated in the preparation of this Consent Judgment and this Consent Judgment is the result of the joint efforts of the Parties. Each Party has had the opportunity to consult counsel with regard to the preparation of this Consent Judgment. This Consent Judgment was subject to revision and modification by the Parties and has been accepted and approved as to its final form by all Parties. Accordingly, any uncertainty or ambiguity existing in this Consent Judgment shall not be interpreted against any Party as a result of the manner of the preparation of this Consent Judgment. Each Party to this Consent Judgment agrees that any statute or rule of construction providing that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting Party should not be employed in the interpretation of this Consent Judgment and, in this regard the Parties hereby waive California Civil Code section 1654.

[Signatures are on the following page; the remainder of this page is intentionally left blank.]

24 |

28 II

13. **AUTHORIZATION** The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment. Dated: __Jan 19, 2022 Safe Products for Californians, LLC By: Randy Moore, Operating Manager Dated:_ By: Signed: 2/9/2022 08:36 PM IT IS SO ORDERED. Dated: February 9, 2022 JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

AMENDED [PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT