EFS**₹029**trova

		LI OZDE
ATTORNEY OR PARTY WITHOUT ATTORNEY:	STATE BAR NO.: 206683	FOR COURT USE ONLY
NAME: Tanya E. Moore		
FIRM NAME: Moore Law Firm, P.C.		
STREET ADDRESS: 334 North Second Street		
CITY: San Jose	STATE: CA ZIP CODE: 951	12
TELEPHONE NO.: 408.298.2000	FAX NO.: 408.298.6046	on 8/12/2024 11:51 AM
E-MAIL ADDRESS: service@moorelawfirm,cor	n	Reviewed By: Z. Petrova
ATTORNEY FOR (name): Plaintiff, Safe Products	Case #19CV342125	
SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA, COU	NTY OF SANTA CLARA	
STREET ADDRESS: 191 North First Street		Envelope: 16239193
MAILING ADDRESS: 191 North First Street		
CITY AND ZIP CODE: San Jose CA 95113		
BRANCH NAME: Downtown Superior Cour	t	CASE NUMBER:
PLAINTIFF/PETITIONER: Safe Products for Californians, LLC		19CV342125
DEFENDANT/RESPONDENT: Amazon.com, Inc., et al.		JUDICIAL OFFICER:
OTHER:		Amber Rosen
PROPOSED O	DEPT:	
PROPOSED O	RDER (COVER SHEET)	16

NOTE: This cover sheet is to be used to electronically file and submit to the court a proposed order. The proposed order sent electronically to the court must be in PDF format and must be attached to this cover sheet. In addition, a version of the proposed order in an editable word-processing format must be sent to the court at the same time as this cover sheet and the attached proposed order in PDF format are filed.

1. Name of the party submitting the proposed order:

Plaintiff, Safe Products for Californians, LLC

2. Title of the proposed order:

[Proposed] Consent Judgment

- 3. The proceeding to which the proposed order relates is:
 - a. Description of proceeding: Motion for Approval of Settlement
 - b. Date and time: August 1, 2024 9:00 a.m.
 - c. Place: Department 16 191 North First Street San Jose CA 95113
- 4. The proposed order was served on the other parties in the case.

Tanya E. Moore	/s/ Tanya E. Moore
(TYPE OR PRINT NAME)	(SIGNATURE OF PARTY OR ATTORNEY)

Page 1 of 2

CASE NAME:	CASE NUMBER:
Safe Products for Californians, LLC v. Amazon.com, Inc., et al.	19CV342125

PROOF OF ELECTRONIC SERVICE PROPOSED ORDER

4	1		
1.	ran	m at least 18 years old and not a party to this action.	
	a.	My residence or business address is (specify): 334 North Second Street, San Jose CA 95112	
	b.	My electronic service address is (specify): service@moorelawfirm.com	
2.		lectronically served the <i>Proposed Order (Cover Sheet)</i> with a proposed order in PDF format attached, and a proposed order in editable word-processing format as follows:	
	a.	On (name of person served) (If the person served is an attorney, the party or parties represented should also be stated.): Gregory Doll, attorney for Amazon.com, Inc., gdoll@dollamir.com	
		To (electronic service address of person served): qdoll@dollamir.com On (date): July 31, 2024	
		Electronic service of the <i>Proposed Order (Cover Sheet)</i> with the attached proposed order in PDF format and service of the proposed order in an editable word-processing format on additional persons are described in an attachment.	
I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Date: August 12, 2024			
۱۸/۱	nitno	/s/ Whitney Law	
VVI	nuic	(TYPE OR PRINT NAME OF DECLARANT) (SIGNATURE OF DECLARANT)	

EFS-020 [Rev. February 1, 2017]

PROPOSED ORDER (COVER SHEET) (Electronic Filing)

Page 2 of 2

1 2 3 4	Tanya E. Moore, SBN 206683 MOORE LAW FIRM, P.C. 332 North Second Street San Jose, California 95112 Telephone (408) 298-2000 Facsimile (408) 298-6046 E-mail: service@moorelawfirm.com	Filed August 14, 2024 Clerk of the Court Superior Court of CA County of Santa Clara 19CV342125
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff Safe Products for Californians, LLC	By: zpetrova
6	Sale Froducts for Campornians, ELC	
7		
8	SUPERIOR COUR	Γ OF CALIFORNIA
9	COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA	
10		
11	SAFE PRODUCTS FOR CALIFORNIANS, LLC,) No. 19CV342125
12	Plaintiff,	PROPOSED CONSENT JUDGMENT
13	VS.	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq.)
14	AMAZON.COM, INC., et al.;	
15	AWAZON.COW, INC., et al.,	
16	Defendants.	
17		
18		
19	1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>	
20	1.1 Parties	
21	This Consent Judgment ("Consent Judg	gment") is entered into by and between plaintiff
22	Safe Products for Californians, LLC ("SPFC") and defendant DPL Trading, Inc. ("DPL	
23	Trading"). SPFC and DPL Trading are each referred to individually as a "Party" and collectively	
24	as the "Parties." Defendant Amazon.com, Inc., is an intended third-party beneficiary of this	
25	Consent Judgment.	
26	1.2 SPFC	
27	SPFC is a limited liability California company with its principal place of business within	
28	the State of California, County of Santa Clara,	who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to

contained in consumer and commercial products.

3

1.3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10 11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

28

toxic chemicals, and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating harmful substances

DPL Trading

For the purposes of this consent judgment, SPFC alleges that DPL Trading employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

1.4 **General Allegations**

SPFC alleges that the powdered dietary supplements that DPL Trading manufactures, imports, sells and/or distributes for sale in California cause exposure to lead and lead compounds (hereinafter referred to as "lead") and that DPL Trading does so without providing the health hazard warning that SPFC alleges is required by Proposition 65.

1.5 **Product Description**

The products that are covered by this Consent Judgment are identified as "Organic Moringa Leaf Powder," "Organic Spirulina," "Organic Sunflower Lecithin," "Organic Maca Powder," "Organic Barley Grass Powder," "Organic Turmeric Root Powder," and "Organic Ashwagandha Powder," that are manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by DPL Trading and/or its customers in the state of California, hereinafter the "Covered Products."

Notice of Violation 1.6

On or about October 19, 2018, SPFC served DPL Trading, and certain requisite public enforcement agencies, with a 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice"), alleging that DPL Trading violated Proposition 65 when it failed to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Covered Products expose users to lead. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notice.

1.7 Complaint

On January 18, 2019, SPFC commenced the instant action (the "Action") for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notice. On August 18, 2023, SPFC amended its Complaint to name DPL Trading in the Action.

1.8 No Admission

The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment pursuant to a full settlement of disputed claims between the Parties as alleged in the Action for the purpose of avoiding prolonged litigation. By execution of this Consent Judgment, DPL Trading does not admit any material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Action, and maintains that all of the products that it has sold or distributed for sale in California, including the Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, the same being specifically denied by DPL Trading. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right, remedy or defense that DPL Trading may have in this Action, or any other further legal proceedings unrelated to this Action. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect DPL Trading's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.9 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over DPL Trading as to the allegations contained in the Action, that venue is proper in the County of Santa Clara, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Settlement as a full and final binding resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Action based on the facts alleged therein and/or notice of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date that this Consent Judgment is signed by the Court.

2. <u>INJUNCTIVE RELIEF</u>

2.1 Product Removal

Commencing ninety (90) days after the Effective Date and continuing thereafter, DPL Trading shall only ship, distribute, sell or offer for sale in California, Reformulated Product pursuant to Section 2.2 or Product that is labeled with a clear and reasonable warning pursuant to Section 2.3. DPL Trading shall have no obligation to label Covered Products that were shipped prior to the Effective Date.

2.1.1 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the "Daily Lead Exposure Level" shall be measured in micrograms, and shall be calculated using the following formula: micrograms of lead per gram of product, multiplied by grams of product per serving of the product (using the largest serving size appearing on the product label), multiplied by servings of the product per day (using the largest number of recommended daily servings appearing on the product label), which equals micrograms of lead exposure per day. If the label contains no recommended daily servings, then the number of recommended daily servings of the product for purposes of the formula in this Section 2.1.1 shall be calculated as one serving per day.

2.2 Reformulated Covered Products

Reformulated Covered Products are Covered Products manufactured after the Effective date for which the "Daily Lead Exposure Level" is no greater than 0.5 micrograms of lead per day.

2.3 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

For any Covered Products manufactured after the Effective Date that do not qualify as Reformulated Covered Products and are directly sold or offered for sale in California by DPL Trading after the Effective Date, DPL Trading shall only sell or offer said non-reformulated Covered Products for sale in California when accompanied with one of the following warnings:

OPTION 1:

WARNING: Consuming this product can expose you to [chemicals including] lead which is [are] known to the State of California to cause [cancer and] birth defects and other reproductive harm. For more information go to: www.P65warnings.CA.gov/food"

OR:

OPTION 2:

WARNING: [Cancer and] Reproductive Harm – www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food"

In connection with providing a cancer warning for lead and lead compounds, DPL Trading shall use the phrase "cancer and" in the warning if DPL Trading has reason to believe that the "Daily Lead Exposure Level" is greater than 15 micrograms of lead as determined pursuant to the quality control methodology set forth in Section 2.1.2. DPL Trading also may include the reference to cancer if DPL Trading has reason to believe that another Proposition 65 chemical is present which may require a cancer warning. The words "chemicals including" may be deleted from the warning content if the warning is being provided for an exposure to a single chemical.

The warning provided pursuant to Section 2.3 shall be prominently affixed to or printed on the Covered Product's packaging or label with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. If the warning is provided on the label, it must be set off from other surrounding information and enclosed in a box. In addition, for any Covered Product sold over the internet where a California delivery address is indicated, the warning shall be provided either by including the warning on the product display page, by otherwise prominently displaying the warning to the purchaser during the checkout process prior to completing the purchase, or by any other means authorized under Section 25607.1 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations. An asterisk or other identifying method must be utilized to identify which products on the checkout page are subject to the warning. The Warning may be provided with a conspicuous hyperlink stating "WARNING" in all capital and bold letters so long as the hyperlink goes to a page directly to a page prominently displaying the Warning

without content that detracts from the Warning. If consumer information is provided in a foreign language with regard to any Product, the Warning must also be provided in that language. With respect to any downstream reseller customers of DPL Trading who are subject to Proposition 65, DPL Trading may give written notice, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25600.2(b), to the authorized agent for the downstream customer. Any third-party website that does not provide the required warning after receiving such notice is not released for future compliance. In the event that warnings requirements under Proposition 65 are modified after the Effective Date, DPL Trading reserves the right to amend the form and content of its warning label so long as it remains consistent with legal and regulatory requirements.

In the event DPL Trading provides the warning pursuant to OPTION 2, above, the entire warning must be in a type size no smaller than the largest size used for other consumer information on the product, and in no case shall the warning appear in a type size smaller than 6-point type. Further, for Option 2 Warning, a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline must be placed to the left of the text of the warning in a size no smaller than the height of the word "WARNING". If the sign, label, or shelf tag for the product is not printed using the color yellow, the symbol may be provided in black and white. For all warnings, the word "WARNING" shall be in all capital letters in bold print. Any additional statements in the warning shall comply with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25601(e).

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Payments Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b)(2)

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), DPL Trading shall pay civil penalties in the amount of \$4,000. The penalty payment shall be allocated according to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of the penalty amount paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty paid to SPFC. SPFC's counsel shall be responsible for remitting DPL Trading's penalty payment under this Consent Judgment to OEHHA. Within five business days of all Parties signing this Consent Judgment, DPL Trading shall issue a check payable to "Safe

Products for Californians, LLC" in the amount of \$1,000 and a check payable to OEHHA in the amount of \$3,000. These penalty payments shall be delivered to the address listed in Section 3.3 below.

3.2 Reimbursement of Attorneys' Fees and Costs

For all work performed as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to DPL Trading's attention and negotiating a settlement in the public interest through the mutual execution of this Consent Judgment and the Court's approval of the same, but exclusive of fees and costs on appeal, if any, DPL Trading shall reimburse SPFC and its counsel \$26,000. The Parties negotiated this resolution of the compensation due to SPFC and its counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5. DPL Trading's payment shall be delivered to the address in Section 3.3 in the form of a check payable to "Moore Law Firm, P.C." within five business days of all Parties signing this Consent Judgment. The reimbursement shall cover all fees and costs incurred by SPFC investigating, bringing this matter to DPL Trading's attention, litigating, and negotiating a settlement of the matter in the public interest.

3.3 Payment Procedures

The payments pursuant to Sections 3.1 and 3.2 shall be delivered to the following address:

Moore Law Firm, P.C. Attn: Proposition 65 (SPFC) 332 North Second Street San Jose, California 95112

If for any reason this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court within six months of the last date on which a party signed the Consent Judgment, SPFC shall meet and confer with DPL Trading about mutually agreeable steps the Parties can take to ensure entry of the Consent Judgment. If such steps cannot be agreed between the Parties, SPFC shall promptly return to DPL Trading any and all monies paid by DPL Trading herein under Sections 3.1 and 3.2 upon DPL Trading's written request, no later than 30 days after DPL Trading's demand.

4. <u>CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED</u>

4.1 SPFC's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims

This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between SPFC, acting on its own behalf and on behalf of the public interest, releases DPL Trading and its parents, subsidiaries, partners, joint venturers, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, shareholders, officers, employees, and attorneys and the predecessors, agents, suppliers, successors, or assigns of each of them expressly including Amazon.com, Inc. (the "Releasees"). SPFC, on behalf of itself and in the public interest, hereby fully releases and discharges the Releasees from any and all claims, actions, causes of action, suits, demands, liabilities, damages, penalties, fees, costs, and expenses asserted, or that could have been asserted from the handling, use, or consumption of the Covered Products, as to any alleged violation of Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations arising from the failure to provide Proposition 65 warnings on the Covered Products regarding lead up to and including the Effective Date. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to lead from Covered Products as set forth in the Notices of Violations.

4.2 SPFC's Individual Release of Claims

SPFC, in its own capacity only and on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees and *not* in its representative capacity, also provides a release to DPL Trading and the Releasees which shall have preclusive effect such that SPFC shall not be permitted to pursue and/or take any action with respect to any other statutory or common law claim to the fullest extent that any such claim was or could have been asserted by SPFC against DPL Trading and the Releasees, which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of SPFC of any nature, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to lead in Covered Products manufactured, imported, distributed or sold by DPL Trading and/or the Releasees, or the failure to provide a clear and reasonable warning of exposure as well as any other claim based in whole or in part on the facts alleged in

the Action and the Notice, based on actions committed before the Effective Date ("Chemical Exposure Claims").

. .

4.3 Waiver of Rights Under Section 1542 of the California Civil Code

SPFC, acting on its own behalf only with respect to the Individual Release, waives all rights to institute any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts, contracts, agreements, promises liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses and attorney's fees of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent now or in the future with respect to the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by DPL Trading and the Releasees who may use, maintain, distribute or sell the Covered Products, for the Proposition 65 Claims and the Chemical Exposure Claims (referred to collectively in this Sections as "Claims"). In furtherance of the foregoing, SPFC, acting on its own behalf only and acting in its individual capacity with respect to the Individual Release, waives any and all rights and benefits which SPFC now has, or in the future may have, conferred upon SPFC with respect to the Claims by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

4.4 DPL Trading's Release of SPFC

DPL Trading, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against SPFC and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by SPFC and its attorneys and other representatives in the course of investigating claims, seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter leading up to and including the effective date of this agreement.

5. ENTRY OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

The Parties hereby request that the Court promptly enter this Consent Judgment. Upon entry of this Consent Judgment, SPFC and DPL Trading waive their respective rights to a hearing or trial on the allegations of the Action and Notice.

5.1 COURT APPROVAL

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within six months after the last date executed by the Parties, unless the Parties mutually agree to extend that time period due to what they mutually agree are reasonably unforeseeable circumstances. SPFC and DPL Trading agree to support the entry of this agreement as a judgment, and to obtain the Court's approval of their settlement in a timely manner. The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required for judicial approval of this Consent Judgment, which motion SPFC shall draft and file and DPL Trading shall support, appearing at the hearing if so requested.

6. <u>SEVERABILITY</u>

If, subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any provision of this Consent Judgment is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Covered Products, then DPL Trading may provide SPFC with written notice of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment, with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Products are so affected. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be interpreted to relieve DPL Trading from its obligation to comply with any pertinent state or federal law or regulation.

12. <u>OTHER TERMS</u>

12.1 No Other Agreements

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter set forth in this Consent Judgment, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are deemed merged. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties except as expressly set forth in this Consent Judgment. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced in this Consent Judgment, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties. No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound or ordered by the Court. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall release, or in any way affect any rights that DPL Trading might have against any other party.

12.2 Construction

The Parties have participated in the preparation of this Consent Judgment and this Consent Judgment is the result of the joint efforts of the Parties. Each Party has had the opportunity to consult counsel with regard to the preparation of this Consent Judgment. This Consent Judgment was subject to revision and modification by the Parties and has been accepted and approved as to its final form by all Parties. Accordingly, any uncertainty or ambiguity existing in this Consent Judgment shall not be interpreted against any Party as a result of the manner of the preparation of this Consent Judgment. Each Party to this Consent Judgment agrees that any statute or rule of construction providing that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting Party should not be employed in the interpretation of this Consent Judgment and, in this regard the Parties hereby waive California Civil Code section 1654.

28 ||

ı		
1	//	
2	//	
3	//	
4	13. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>	
5	The undersigned are authorized to	execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their
6	respective Parties and have read, understood	d, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this
7	Consent Judgment.	
8	* '	
9	Dated: Apr 23, 2024	KRMoore (Apr 23, 2024 14:36 PDT)
10		Safe Products for Californians, LLC By: Randy Moore, Operating Manager
11		
12	Dated: 04/18/2024	DPL Trading, Inc.
13		By: Yang Sheng Pu
14	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
15	Da 8/14/2024 9:44:41 AM	Anh n
16	Dutcu	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22	[[*	