



21197854

1 Evan Smith (Bar No. SBN 242352)
2 BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC.
3 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900
4 Beverly Hills, CA 90212
5 Tel: (877) 534-2590
6 Fax: (310) 247-0160

7 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

FILED
ALAMEDA COUNTY

SEP 10 2019

CLERK OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

By *[Signature]* Deputy

8
9 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

10 COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

11 ANTHONY FERREIRO,

12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 FASHION ANGELS ENTERPRISES, INC.,

15 Defendant.

Case No.: RG19016449

CONSENT JUDGMENT

Judge: Paul D. Herbert

Dept.: 20

Hearing Date: August 15, 2019

Hearing Time: 3:00 PM

Reservation #: R - 2090338

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 **1.1 The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Anthony
3 Ferreiro acting on behalf of the public interest (hereinafter “Ferreiro”) and Fashion Angels
4 Enterprises, Inc. (“Fashion Angels” or “Defendant”) with Ferreiro and Defendant collectively
5 referred to as the “Parties” and each of them as a “Party.” Ferreiro is an individual residing in
6 California that seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human
7 health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Fashion
8 Angels is alleged to be a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal.
9 Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.

10 **1.2 Allegations and Representations.** Ferreiro alleges that Defendant has exposed
11 individuals to diisononyl phthalate (DINP) from its sales of Fashion Angels bath sponge
12 kits/cases/totes without providing a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to Proposition
13 65. DINP is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause
14 cancer.

15 **1.3 Notice of Violation/Complaint.** On or about January 11, 2019, Ferreiro served
16 Fashion Angels, and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled “60-Day Notice
17 of Violation” pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the “Notice”), alleging that
18 Defendant violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that use of Fashion
19 Angels bath sponge kits/cases/totes expose users in California to DINP. No public enforcer has
20 brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Notice. On April 25, 2019, Ferreiro
21 filed a complaint (the “Complaint”) in the matter.

22 **1.4** For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has
23 jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Complaint filed in this matter, that
24 venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter,
25 and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all
26 claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein
27 and/or in the Notice.
28

1 1.5 Defendant denies the material allegations contained in Ferreiro's Notice and
2 Complaint and maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment
3 shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of
4 law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission
5 by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being
6 specifically denied by Defendant. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the
7 obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Defendant under this Consent Judgment.

8 **2. DEFINITIONS**

9 2.1 **Covered Products.** The term "Covered Products" means Fashion Angels bath
10 sponge kits/cases/totes that are manufactured, distributed and/or offered for sale in California by
11 Fashion Angels

12 2.2 **Effective Date.** The term "Effective Date" means the date this Consent Judgment is
13 entered as a Judgment of the Court.

14 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS**

15 3.1 **Reformulation of Covered Products.** As of the date this Consent Judgment is
16 signed by both Parties, and continuing thereafter, Covered Products that Fashion Angels directly
17 manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California shall either: (a) be
18 Reformulated Products pursuant to § 3.2, below; or (b) be labeled with a clear and reasonable
19 exposure warning pursuant to §§ 3.3 and 3.4, below. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, a
20 "Reformulated Product" is a Covered Product that is in compliance with the standard set forth in §
21 3.2 below. The warning requirement set forth in §§ 3.3 and 3.4 shall not apply to any Reformulated
22 Product.

23 3.2 **Reformulation Standard.** "Reformulated Products" shall mean Covered Products
24 that contain concentrations less than or equal to 0.1% (1,000 parts per million (ppm) of DINP when
25 analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and
26 8270C or other methodology utilized by federal or state government agencies for the purpose of
27 determining the phthalate content in a solid substance.

1 3.3 **Clear and Reasonable Warning.** As of the date this Consent Judgment is signed
2 by both Parties, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in
3 this §§ 3.3 and 3.4 must be provided for all Covered Products that Defendant manufacturers,
4 imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California that is not a Reformulated Product. There
5 shall be no obligation for Defendant to reformulate or provide a warning for Covered Products that
6 enter the stream of commerce prior to the date this Consent Judgment is signed by both Parties.
7 The warning shall consist of either the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** described in §§ 3.3(a)
8 or (b), respectively:

9 (a) **Warning.** The “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

10 △ **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including diisononyl
11 phthalate (DINP), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer. For
12 more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

13 (b) **Alternative Warning:** Fashion Angels may, but is not required to, use the
14 alternative short-form warning as set forth in this § 3.3(b) (“**Alternative Warning**”) as follows:

15 △ **WARNING:** Cancer - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

16 3.4 A **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** provided pursuant to § 3.3 must print the word
17 “**WARNING:**” in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to
18 the left of the word “**WARNING:**” must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral
19 triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Covered Product does not use
20 the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller
21 than the height of the word “**WARNING:**”. The warning shall be affixed to or printed on the
22 Covered Product’s packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or
23 automatic process, providing that the warning is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared
24 with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an
25 ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. A warning may be contained
26 in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety
27 warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Covered Product and shall be at least the same size as
28 those other safety warnings.

1 If Fashion Angels sells Covered Products via an internet website to customers located in
2 California, the warning requirements of this section shall be satisfied if the foregoing warning
3 appears either: (a) on the same web page on which a Covered Product is displayed and/or described;
4 (b) on the same page as the price for the Covered Product; or (c) on one or more web pages
5 displayed to a purchaser prior to purchase during the checkout process. Alternatively, a symbol
6 consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow or white equilateral triangle may appear adjacent
7 to or immediately following the display, description, price, or checkout listing of the Covered
8 Product, if the warning statement appears elsewhere on the same web page in a manner that clearly
9 associates it with the product(s) to which the warning applies.

10 3.5 **Compliance with Warning Regulations.** Defendant shall be deemed to be in
11 compliance with this Consent Judgment by either adhering to §§ 3.3 and 3.4 of this Consent
12 Judgment or by complying with warning requirements adopted by the State of California's Office
13 of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") after the Effective Date.

14 4. **MONETARY TERMS**

15 4.1 **Civil Penalty.** Fashion Angels shall pay \$2,000.00 as a Civil Penalty pursuant to
16 Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California Health
17 & Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25% of
18 the Civil Penalty remitted to Ferreiro, as provided by California Health & Safety Code
19 § 25249.12(d).

20 4.1.1 Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Fashion Angels shall issue two
21 separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$1,500.00; and
22 to (b) "Brodsky & Smith, LLC in Trust for Ferreiro" in the amount of \$500.00. Payment owed to
23 Ferreiro pursuant to this Section shall be delivered to the following payment address:

24 Evan J. Smith, Esquire
25 Brodsky & Smith, LLC
26 Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

27 Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly
28 to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at one of the following address(es):

1 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

2 Mike Gyurics
3 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
4 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
5 P.O. Box 4010
6 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

7 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

8 Mike Gyurics
9 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
10 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
11 1001 I Street
12 Sacramento, CA 95814

13 A copy of the check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed to Brodsky & Smith, LLC at the address
14 set forth above as proof of payment to OEHHA.

15 4.2 **Attorneys' Fees.** Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Fashion Angels shall
16 pay \$19,000.00 to Brodsky & Smith, LLC ("Brodsky Smith") as complete reimbursement for
17 Ferreiro's attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to
18 Fashion Angels' attention, litigating and negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement
19 in the public interest, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5.

20 **5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

21 5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Ferreiro
22 acting on his own behalf, and on behalf of the public interest, and Fashion Angels, and its parents,
23 shareholders, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives, agents,
24 attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their
25 predecessors, successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities from whom they
26 obtain and to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including but
27 not limited to manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees
28 retailers, franchisees, and cooperative members, including but not limited to Hobby Lobby Stores,
Inc. ("Downstream Releasees"), of all claims for violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to
DINP from Covered Products as set forth in the Notice, with respect to any Covered Products
manufactured, distributed, or sold by Fashion Angels prior to the Effective Date. This Consent

1 Judgment shall have preclusive effect such that no other person or entity, whether purporting to act
2 in his, her, or its interests or the public interest shall be permitted to pursue and/or take any action
3 with respect to any violation of Proposition 65 that was alleged in the Complaint, or that could have
4 been brought pursuant to the Notice against Fashion Angels and/or the Downstream Releasees of
5 the Covered Products ("Proposition 65 Claims"). Compliance with the terms of this Consent
6 Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with regard to the Covered Products.

7 5.2 In addition to the foregoing, Ferreiro, on behalf of himself, his past and current
8 agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and not in his representative
9 capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of
10 legal action and releases Fashion Angels, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Releasees from
11 any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts,
12 contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses, and
13 attorneys' fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent,
14 now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 related to or arising
15 from Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Fashion Angels, Defendant Releasees
16 or Downstream Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph,
17 Ferreiro hereby specifically waives any and all rights and benefits which he now has, or in the
18 future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the California Civil Code, which
19 provides as follows:

20 A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE
21 CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO
22 EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE
23 RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE
24 MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE
25 DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

26 5.3 Fashion Angels waives any and all claims against Ferreiro, his attorneys and other
27 representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been
28 taken or made) by Ferreiro and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of
investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter,
and/or with respect to Covered Products.

1 **6. INTEGRATION**

2 6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and
3 any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been
4 merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist
5 or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

6 **7. GOVERNING LAW**

7 7.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of
8 California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or
9 is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to Covered Products, then
10 Defendant shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and
11 to the extent that, Covered Products are so affected.

12 **8. NOTICES**

13 8.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided
14 pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-
15 class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any party
16 by the other party at the following addresses:

17 For Defendant:

18 Michael J. Gleason
19 Hahn Loeser & Parks LLP
20 One America Plaza
21 600 West Broadway, Suite 1500
22 San Diego, CA 92101

23 And

24 For Ferreiro:

25 Evan Smith
26 Brodsky & Smith, LLC
27 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900
28 Beverly Hills, CA 90212

Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to
which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

1 **9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

2 9.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of
3 which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and
4 the same document.

5 **10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT**
6 **APPROVAL**

7 10.1 Ferreiro agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health &
8 Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment.
9 Defendant agrees it shall support approval of such Motion.

10 10.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the
11 Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case,
12 the Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within
13 30 days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.

14 10.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an
15 appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent
16 Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on
17 its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

18 **11. MODIFICATION**

19 11.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties
20 and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

21 **12. ATTORNEY'S FEES**

22 12.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent
23 Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

24 12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions
25 pursuant to law.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

14. AUTHORIZATION

14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: 6/27/19
By: Anthony Ferreira
ANTHONY FERREIRO

Date: 6/18/2019
By: Mak Hill
FASHION ANGELS ENTERPRISES,
INC.

IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:

Dated: 09/10/2019

Paul D. Haberl
Judge of Superior Court