1 2 3 4 5 6 7	Laralei Schmohl Paras, State Bar No. 203319 Rebecca M. Jackson, State Bar No. 221583 Seven Hills LLP 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400 San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone: (415) 926-7247 laralei@sevenhillsllp.com Attorneys for Plaintiff KEEP AMERICA SAFE AND BEAUTIFUL SUPERIOR COURT OF THE	Superior Court of California County of San Francisco OCT 2 D 2021 CLERK OF THE COURT BY: Deputy Clerk E STATE OF CALIFORNIA
8	COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO	
9	UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION	
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	KEEP AMERICA SAFE AND BEAUTIFUL, Plaintiff, v. MFAC, LLC and DOES 1-30, inclusive, Defendants.	Case No. CGC-21-593483 [PROPOSED] JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT Date: October 15, 2021 Time: 9:30 Dept.: 302 Dept.: 302 RICHARD ULMER Judge: Hon. Ethan P. Schulman Complaint Filed: July 23, 2021 Trial Date: None set.
26 27		
28		

JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO TERMS OF PROP. 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT

1	In the above-entitled action, Plaintiff Keep America Safe and Beautiful and Defendant		
2	MFAC, LLC, having agreed through their respective counsel that Judgment be entered pursuant		
3	to the terms of their settlement agreement in the form of a Consent Judgment, and following this		
4	Court's issuance of an Order approving this Proposition 65 settlement and Consent Judgment,		
5	IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to California		
6	Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4) and California Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6, Judgment		
7	is entered in accordance with the terms of the Consent Judgment attached hereto as Exhibit A.		
8	By stipulation of the parties, the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the settlement under		
9	Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6.		
10			
11	IT IS SO ORDERED.		
12			
13	Dated: 10 1421. JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT		
14	RICHARD ULMER		
15			
16	·		
17			
18			
19			
20			
21	- ···		
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			

DocuSign Envelope ID: 52F44340-4D7F-4751-A030-28D1BF7A87E4

i. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff Keep America Safe and Beautiful ("KASB") and defendant MFAC, LLC ("MFAC"), with KASB and MFAC each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively, as the "Parties," to resolve the allegations in the February 18, 2021 60-Day Notice of Violation and the May 13, 2021 Supplemental Notice KASB issued to MFAC in compliance with the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

1.1 The Parties

KASB is a California-based non-profit organization proceeding in the public interest pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) to ensure that chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm are disclosed in or eliminated from consumer products sold in California. MFAC is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.11(b).

1.2 Consumer Product Description

KASB alleges that MFAC manufactures, imports, sells and distributes for sale in California vinyl/PVC jump rope cords containing di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("DEHP") including, but not limited to, *Perform Better First Place Speed Jump Rope, Item Model No. 1139*, and handle grips containing di-n-butyl ("DBP") including, but not limited to, *Perform Better Contour Rubber Cable Handle (2 Pack, Item Model No. 5309*, without providing the health hazard warning that KASB alleges is required by Proposition 65. Vinyl/PVC jump rope cords are referred to hereinafter as the "Jump Ropes." Handle grips are referred to hereinafter as the "Handle Grips." Jump Ropes and Handle Grips are collectively referred to herein as the "Products." DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer. DEHP and DBP are listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as chemicals known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

1.3 Notices of Violation

On February 18, 2021, KASB served MFAC, Amazon.com, Inc., the California Attorney General, and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation

.

.9

("Notice"), alleging MFAC and Amazon.com, Inc. violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn their customers and consumers in California that Jump Ropes can expose users to DEHP. On May 13, 2021, KASB served MFAC, Amazon.com, Inc., the California Attorney General, and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a Supplemental 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Supplemental Notice"), alleging MFAC and Amazon.com, Inc. violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn their customers and consumers in California that Handle Grips can expose users to DBP. The Notice and Supplemental Notice are collectively referred to hereinafter as the "Notices." No public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the allegations set forth in the Notices. The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment for the purpose of resolving KASB's claims asserted in the Notices and to avoid prolonged and costly litigation.

1.4 Complaint

On July 23, 2021, KASB commenced the instant action ("Complaint"), naming MFAC, LLC as a defendant for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notices.

1.5 No Admission

MFAC denies the factual and legal allegations contained in the Notices and Complaint and maintains that all products it has sold or distributed for sale in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as, an admission by MFAC of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect MFAC's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.6 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over MFAC as to the allegations contained in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of San Francisco, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6.

ر 2

1.7 Effective Date

The term "Effective Date" shall mean the date on which the Court approves this Consent Judgment and enters judgment pursuant to its terms.

2. <u>INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: PRODUCT REFORMULATION OR WARNINGS</u>

2.1 Reformulation Commitment

Commencing on the Effective Date and continuing thereafter, each Product MFAC manufactures, imports, sells, ships, or distributes for sale in or into California, directly or through one or more third party retailers or e-commerce marketplaces whom MFAC knows or has reason to know offer the Products for sale in California, shall meet the Reformulation Standard for Reformulated Products, as defined by Section 2.2, or be accompanied by a clear and reasonable warning pursuant to Section 2.3. No warnings shall be required for Products meeting the Reformulation Standards set forth in Section 2.2 below.

2.2 Reformulation Standard

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "DEHP Free Products" are defined as Products which, if they contain DEHP, contain no more than 0.1 percent (1,000 parts per million) DEHP when analyzed by an "Accredited Lab," defined as a laboratory accredited by the State of California, a federal agency, or a nationally recognized accrediting organization. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "DBP Free Products" are defined as Products which, if they contain DBP, contain no more than 0.1 percent (1,000 parts per million) DBP when analyzed by an Accredited Lab. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Reformulated Products" are defined as Products which, if they contain DEHP, DBP, diisononyl phthalate ("DINP"), di-isodecyl phthalate ("DIDP"), butyl benzyl phthalate ("BBP"), or di-n-hexyl phthalate ("DnHP"), contain any or all such chemicals each in a maximum concentration of less than 0.1 percent (1,000 parts per million) when analyzed by an Accredited Lab. For purposes of compliance with this reformulation standard, testing samples shall be prepared and extracted using Consumer Product Safety Commission ("CPSC") methodology CPSC-CH-C1001.09.3 and analyzed using U.S. Environmental Protection Agency methodology 8270D, or other methodologies utilized by federal or state government agencies to determine phthalate content in a solid substance.

2.3 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

3

2

4

5

7

O

8

10

11

12

13

1415

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

2627

28

For Products requiring a warning under this Consent Judgment, MFAC shall provide clear and reasonable warnings for such Products in accordance with this Section pursuant to Title 27 California Code of Regulations § 25600, et seq., as such regulations may be amended from time to time. Each warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use and shall be provided in a manner such that it is clearly associated with the specific Product to which the warning applies.

- (a) Warning. The Warning shall consist of the following statement:
 - 1. For Jump Ropes:
 - ⚠ WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP), which are known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
 - 2. For Handle Grips:
 - ⚠ WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including dinn-butyl phthalate (DBP), which are known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
 - 3. For Products:
 - ▲ WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP), which are known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
- (b) Short-Form Warning. As an alternative to the warnings set forth in subsection 2.3(a), MFAC may, but is not required to, use the following short-form warning ("Short-Form Warning"), and subject to the additional requirements in Sections 2.4 and 2.5, as follows:
 - A WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
- (c) Foreign Language Requirement. Where a consumer product sign, label or shelf tag used to provide a warning includes consumer information, as that term is defined in Title 27 California

9:

Code of Regulations § 25600.1(c) ("Consumer Information"), in languages other than English, the warning must also be provided in those languages in addition to English.

2.4 Product Warnings

For Products requiring a warning under this Consent Judgment, MFAC shall affix a warning to the Product label or otherwise directly on each such Products provided for sale directly to customers in California, or indirectly through customers with retail outlets in California and/or e-commerce websites which MFAC knows or has reason to know offer the Products for sale into California. For the purpose of this Consent Judgment, "Product label" means a display of written, printed or graphic material that is printed on or affixed to a Product or its immediate container or wrapper. A warning provided pursuant to section 2.3(a) or (b) must print the word "WARNING:" in all capital letters and in bold font. The warning symbol to the left of the word "WARNING:" must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a black outline, except that if the labeling does not use the color yellow, then the symbol may be in black and white. For the short form warning, the entire warning shall appear in a type size of at least 6-point type and no smaller than the largest type size used for other Consumer Information on the product label.

2.5 Internet Warnings

For Products requiring a warning under this Consent Judgment, if MFAC sells Products via the internet directly to customers located in California, or indirectly through customers with e-commerce websites which MFAC knows or has reason to know offer the Products to customers located in California, MFAC shall provide warnings for each Product both on the Product label in accordance with Sections 2.3 and 2.4, and for its own website or third-party websites through which it sells Products and also is capable of directly providing warnings, by including either the warning or a clearly marked hyperlink using the word "WARNING" on the product display page, or by otherwise prominently displaying the warning to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase and without requiring the purchaser to search for the warning in the general content of the website. If MFAC sells Products directly to customers with e-commerce websites which MFAC knows or has reason to know offer the Products to customers located in California, MFAC shall inform those customers in writing of their obligation to provide online warnings consistent with Title 27 California Code of Regulations

§ 25600.2(b) in conjunction with Products sold to customers located in California. The internet warning may use the Short-Form Warning content described in Section 2.3(b) if the warning provided on the Product label also uses the Short-Form Warning content.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Initial Civil Penalty

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b), MFAC agrees to pay a civil penalty of \$2,000 within five (5) business days of the Effective Date. MFAC's civil penalty payment will be allocated according to Health and Safety Code § 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the penalty paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining twenty-five percent (25%) retained by KASB. MFAC shall issue its payment in two checks made payable to: (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$1,500 and (b) "Keep America Safe & Beautiful" in the amount of \$500. KASB's counsel shall deliver to OEHHA and KASB their respective portion of the penalty payment.

3.2 Second Waivable Civil Penalty

MFAC shall pay a second civil penalty of \$2,500. However, the second civil penalty shall be waived in its entirety, if, within thirty-five (35) days of the Effective Date, an officer of MFAC certifies, as of the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, (a) any and all Jump Ropes manufactured or imported by MFAC for sale to consumers in California directly including through its own website, affiliated websites or a third party website (through which MFAC drop ships Jump Ropes directly to consumers), to consumers located in California, and to customers whom MFAC knows or has reason to know offer the Jump Ropes online to California customers, are DEHP Free Products as defined by Section 2.2, and (b) any and all Handle Grips manufactured or imported by MFAC for sale to consumers in California directly including through its own website, affiliated websites or a third party website (through which MFAC drop ships Handle Grips directly to consumers), to consumers located in California, and to customers whom MFAC knows or has reason to know offer the Handle Grips online to California customers, are DBP Free Products as defined by Section 2.2. Unless the second civil penalty is waived, on the thirty-fifth (35th) day after the

3

4

Effective Date, MFAC shall issue a check made payable to "OEHHA" in the amount of \$1,875 and a check made payable to "Keep America Safe & Beautiful" in the amount of \$625.

3.1 Third Waivable Civil Penalty

5.

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17 18

19

20

21

22

23

24.

25

26

27

28

MFAC shall pay a third civil penalty of \$2,000. However, the third civil penalty shall be waived in its entirety, if, within thirty-five (35) days of the Effective Date, an officer of MFAC certifies, as of the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, any and all Products manufactured or imported by MFAC for sale to consumers in California directly including through its own website. affiliated websites or a third party website (through which MFAC drop ships Products directly to consumers), to consumers located in California, and to customers whom MFAC knows or has reason to know offer the Products for sale in California, are Reformulated Products as defined by Section 2.2. Unless the second civil penalty is waived, on the thirty-fifth (35th) day after the Effective Date, MFAC shall issue a check made payable to "OEHHA" in the amount of \$1,500 and a check made payable to "Keep America Safe & Beautiful" in the amount of \$500.

3.2 Reimbursement of Attorneys' Fees and Costs

KASB and its counsel offered to resolve the allegations in the Notices and Complaint without reaching terms on the amount of reimbursement of their attorneys' fees and costs. Shortly after the Parties finalized the other material settlement terms, they negotiated and reached an accord on the amount of reimbursement to be paid to KASB's counsel, under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine, codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution and reporting of this Consent Judgment to the Office of the California Attorney General and to move the Court for approval of and entry of Judgment pursuant to its terms, but exclusive of fees and costs on appeal, if any. Within five (5) business days of the Effective Date, MFAC agrees to issue a check in the amount of \$31,500 payable to "Seven Hills LLP" for all fees and costs incurred investigating, bringing this matter to MFAC's attention. litigating, negotiating a settlement in the public interest, complying with the Office of the California Attorney General's reporting requirements, and obtaining the Court's approval of its terms pursuant to Section 5.

3.3 Delivery Address

2

All payments required by this Consent Judgment shall be delivered to the following address:

This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution of the claims that were or could

3

Seven Hills LLP Attn: Laralei Paras 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400

4

San Francisco, CA 94111

5

6

4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

7

4.1 KASB's Release of Proposition 65 Claims

9.

8

have been asserted by KASB arising out of the allegations in the Notices and in the Complaint.

KASB, acting on its own behalf and in the public interest, and on behalf of its past and current

10 11

agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees ("Releasors") releases MFAC, its past

12

and present parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers,

13 14 employees, attorneys, and each entity to whom MFAC directly or indirectly distributes or sells.

Products including Amazon.com, Inc., its downstream distributors, wholesalers, marketplace hosts,

15

customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees, and the successors and assigns

16

of any of them ("Releasees"), based on the alleged failure to provide a clear and reasonable warning

17.

about alleged exposures to DEHP contained in Jump Ropes and DBP contained in Handle grips that

18

were manufactured, processed, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California before the

19

Effective Date, as set forth in the Notices and Complaint. The Parties further agree that compliance

20

with Section 2 of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to alleged exposures to DEHP in Jump Ropes and DBP in Handle Grips.

21 22

4.2 KASB's Individual Release of Claims

23

release to MFAC and Releasees which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as

KASB, in its individual capacity only and *not* in his representative capacity, also provides a

24

a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses,

25 26

claims, liabilities and demands of KASB of any nature, character or kind, whether known or

27

unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual failure to provide a clear and

28

reasonable warning about exposures to DEHP, DIDP, DBP, DINP, BBP, and DnHP, in Products

3 4

5

7 8

9

10 11

12 13

14

15 16

17

18 19

20

21

22 23

24

25

26

27

28

manufactured, processed, distributed or sold to consumers in California before the Effective Date. Nothing in these Section 4 releases shall affect KASB's right to commence or prosecute an action under Proposition 65 against a Releasee that does not involve MFAC's Products:

4.3 MFAC's Release of KASB

MFAC, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against KASB and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by KASB and its attorneys and other representatives in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter with respect to the Products.

5. **COURT APPROVAL**

Pursuant to California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4), KASB shall file a noticed motion for judicial approval of this Consent Judgment. The Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, and those of their counsel, to support entry of a judgment pursuant to the terms of this Consent Judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in the form of this Consent Judgment in a timely manner. For purposes of this section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval, responding to any third-party objection, and appearing at the hearing before the Court if so requested.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any provision of this Consent Judgment is deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. **GOVERNING LAW**

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then MFAC may provide KASB with written notice of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further injunctive obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment, with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected. If OEHHA amends any of the Proposition 65 warning regulations (beginning at

1.	Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600), MFAC may, at its sole discretion,		
2	implement the applicable provisions of such amended regulations for the Products without being		
3	deemed in violation of this Consent Judgment. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be		
4	interpreted to relieve MFAC from its obligation to comply with any pertinent state or federal law or		
5	regulation.		
6	8. NOTICE		
7	Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment		
8	shall be in writing and, in addition to being sent to the email addresses sent forth below, sent by:		
9	(i) first-class registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (ii) a recognized overnight		
10	courier to any Party by the other at the following addresses:		
11	For MFAC: For KASB:		
12	Ann G. Grimaldi Laralei Paras		
13	Grimaldi Law Offices 75 Broadway Street, Suite 202 Seven Hills LLP 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400		
14	San Francisco, CA 94111 San Francisco, CA 94111 ann.grimaldi@grimaldilawoffices.com laralei@sevenhillsllp.com		
15	Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other Party a change of address to which		
16	all notices and other communications shall be sent.		
17	9. <u>COUNTERPARTS, FACSIMILE AND PDF SIGNATURES</u>		
18	This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by portable document format		
19	(pdf) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original and, all of which, when taken together,		
20	shall constitute one and the same document.		
21	10. COMPLIANCE WITH REPORTING REQUIREMENTS		
22	KASB and its counsel agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in		
23	California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).		
24	11. <u>ENTIRE AGREEMENT</u>		
25	This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the		
26	Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions,		
27	negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein and		
28	therein. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties except as		
	4		

expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto.

12. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon; or (ii) upon a successful motion of any party and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon.

13. **AUTHORIZATION**

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agreed to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: 8/10/2021	
By:	Brobert andersen
Ngoc-Bich Hoang Vo, CEO	Röbert Affidersen, Manager
Keep America Safe and Beautiful	MFAC, LLC