

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Evan Smith (Bar No. SBN 242352)  
BRODSKY SMITH  
9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900  
Beverly Hills, CA 90212  
Tel: (877) 534-2590  
Fax: (310) 247-0160

*Attorneys for Plaintiff*  
Gabriel Espinoza

**FILED**  
Superior Court of California  
County of San Francisco  
MAY 25 2023  
CLERK OF THE COURT  
BY: *[Signature]*  
Deputy Clerk

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

GABRIEL ESPINOZA,  
Plaintiff,  
v.  
HEAD USA, INC.,  
Defendant.

Case No.: CGC-22-602662

**CONSENT JUDGMENT**

Judge: ~~Richard B. Ulmer~~ *Court's E.A. Karkow*  
Dept.: 302  
Hearing Date: May 19, 2023  
Hearing Time: 9:30 AM  
Complaint Filed: October 28, 2022

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**1. INTRODUCTION**

1.1 **The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Gabriel Espinoza acting on behalf of the public interest (hereinafter “Espinoza”) and Head USA, Inc. (“Head USA” or “Defendant”) with Espinoza and Defendant collectively referred to as the “Parties” and each of them as a “Party.” Espinoza is an individual residing in California that seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Head USA is alleged to be a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.

1.2 **Allegations and Representations.** Espinoza alleges that Defendant has exposed individuals to chromium (hexavalent compounds) (“chromium VI” or “(CrVI)”) from its sales of Head Renegade racquet gloves without providing a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to Proposition 65. CrVI is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and adverse developmental effects in both males and females.

1.3 **Notice of Violation/Complaint.** On or about June 24, 2021, Espinoza served Head USA, and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled “60-Day Notice of Violation” pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the “Notice”), alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that use of Head Renegade racquet gloves expose users in California to CrVI. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Notice. On October 28, 2022, Espinoza filed a complaint (the “Complaint”) in the matter.

1.4 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Notice filed in this matter, that venue is proper in the County of San Francisco, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter, and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all claims which were, or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein and/or in the Notice.

1           1.5 Defendant denies the material allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint  
2 and maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be  
3 construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor  
4 shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by  
5 Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically  
6 denied by Defendant. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations,  
7 responsibilities, and duties of Defendant under this Consent Judgment.

8           **2. DEFINITIONS**

9           2.1 **Covered Products.** The term “Covered Products” means gloves with leather  
10 components, including but not limited to Head Renegade racquet gloves, that are manufactured,  
11 distributed and/or offered for sale in California by Head USA.

12           2.2 **Effective Date.** The term “Effective Date” means the date Head USA’s counsel  
13 receives notice that this Consent Judgment is entered as a Judgment of the Court.

14           **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS**

15           3.1 **Clear and Reasonable Warning.** Commencing on the Effective Date, Defendant  
16 shall provide a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in this §§ 3.1 and 3.2 for all  
17 Covered Products that contain leather components that are tanned with chromium compounds that  
18 Defendant distributes or sells in California. The warning shall consist of either the **Warning** or  
19 **Alternative Warning** described in §§ 3.1(a) or (b), respectively:

20           (a) **Warning.** The “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

21           **⚠ WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including chromium  
22 (hexavalent compounds), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer  
23 and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to  
www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

24           (b) **Alternative Warning:** Head USA may, but is not required to, use the alternative  
25 short-form warning as set forth in this § 3.1(b) (“**Alternative Warning**”) as follows:

26           **⚠ WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

27           3.2 A **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** provided pursuant to § 3.1 must print the word  
28 “**WARNING:**” in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to

1 the left of the word “**WARNING:**” must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral  
2 triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Covered Product does not use  
3 the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller  
4 than the height of the word “**WARNING:**”. The **Warning** shall be affixed to or printed on the  
5 Covered Product’s packaging or labeling or provided for internet sales by including either the  
6 warning or a clearly marked hyperlink using the word “**WARNING**” on the product display page,  
7 or by otherwise prominently displaying the warning to the purchaser prior to completing the  
8 purchase. The **Warning** must be displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other  
9 words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary  
10 individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. If Head USA has actual knowledge  
11 Covered Products are being offered for sale via third-party websites to California consumers, Head  
12 USA shall provide such sellers with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of  
13 Regulations, Section 25600.2.

14       **3.3 Compliance with Warning Regulations.** Defendant shall be deemed to be in  
15 compliance with this Consent Judgment by either adhering to §§ 3.1 and 3.2 of this Consent  
16 Judgment or by complying with warning regulations approved or adopted by the State of  
17 California’s Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“**OEHHA**”), or by any other State  
18 of California agency authorized to issue regulations approving or adopting warnings as  
19 implementation of Proposition 65, or by statutes adopted by the California State Legislature or by  
20 the California voters applicable to the Covered Product and the exposures at issue after the Effective  
21 Date.

22       **3.4 Sell-Through Period.** Notwithstanding anything else in this Consent Judgment,  
23 Covered Products that are manufactured, packaged, or put into commerce within ninety (90) days  
24 of the Effective Date shall be subject to the release of liability pursuant to this Consent Judgment,  
25 without regard to when such Covered Products were, or are in the future, distributed or sold to  
26 customers, such that compliance with the warnings called for in the preceding paragraphs shall not  
27 be required for such products.  
28

1           **4. MONETARY TERMS**

2           4.1     **Civil Penalty.** Head USA shall pay \$4,000.00 as a Civil Penalty pursuant to Health  
3 and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California Health &  
4 Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25% of the  
5 Civil Penalty remitted to Espinoza, as provided by California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(d).

6                     4.1.1   Within thirty (30) days of the Effective Date, Head USA shall issue two  
7 separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$3,000.00; and  
8 to (b) "Gabriel Espinoza" in the amount of \$1,000.00. Payment owed to Espinoza pursuant to this  
9 Section shall be delivered to the following payment address:

10                   Evan J. Smith, Esquire  
11                   Brodsky Smith  
12                   Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510  
                      Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

13           Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly  
14 to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at one of the following address(es):

15                   For United States Postal Service Delivery:

16                   Mike Gyurics  
17                   Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
18                   Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
                      P.O. Box 4010  
                      Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

19                   For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

20                   Mike Gyurics  
21                   Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
22                   Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
                      1001 I Street  
                      Sacramento, CA 95814

23           A copy of the check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed to Brodsky Smith at the address set forth  
24 above as proof of payment to OEHHA.

25           4.2     **Attorneys' Fees.** Within thirty (30) days of the Effective Date, Head USA shall pay  
26 \$36,000.00 to Brodsky Smith ("Brodsky Smith") as complete reimbursement for Espinoza's  
27 attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Head USA's  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

attention, litigating and negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement in the public interest, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5.

**5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Espinoza acting on his own behalf, and on behalf of the public interest, and Head USA, and its parents, shareholders, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives, agents, attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their predecessors, successors and assigns (“Defendant Releasees”), and all entities from whom they directly or indirectly obtain (“Upstream Releasees”) and to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including but not limited to manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees, retailers, franchisees, and cooperative members (“Downstream Releasees”), of all claims for violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to CrVI from Covered Products as set forth in the Notice, with respect to any Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Head USA prior to the Effective Date. Defendant Releasees’ compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with regard to exposure to CrVI from use of the Covered Products.

5.2 In addition to the foregoing, Espinoza, on behalf of himself, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and *not* in his representative capacity, hereby releases Defendant Releasees, Upstream Releasees and Downstream Releasees from all claims that he has asserted or could have asserted against said Releasees arising out of Proposition 65. Espinoza acting on behalf of himself, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and *not* in his representative capacity further waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases Head USA, Defendant Releasees, Upstream Releasees and Downstream Releasees from any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts, contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses, and attorneys’ fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent, now or in the

1 future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 related to or arising from Covered  
2 Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Head USA, Defendant Releasees, Upstream  
3 Releasees or Downstream Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this  
4 paragraph, Espinoza hereby specifically waives any and all rights and benefits which he now has,  
5 or in the future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the California Civil  
6 Code, which provides as follows:

7  
8 A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE  
9 CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO  
10 EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE  
11 RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE  
12 MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE  
13 DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

14 5.3 Head USA waives any and all claims against Espinoza, his attorneys and other  
15 representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by Espinoza and his attorneys and  
16 other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking  
17 enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter, and/or with respect to Covered Products.

18 **6. INTEGRATION**

19 6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and  
20 any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been  
21 merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist  
22 or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hercof.

23 **7. GOVERNING LAW**

24 7.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of  
25 California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or  
26 is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to Covered Products, then  
27 Defendant shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and  
28 to the extent that, Covered Products are so affected.

**8. NOTICES**

8.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided  
pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-

1 class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any party  
2 by the other party at the following addresses:

3 For Defendant:

4 Paul S. Rosenlund  
5 Duane Morris LLP  
6 Spear Tower  
7 One Market Plaza, Suite 2200  
8 San Francisco, CA 94105-1127

8 And

9 For Espinoza:

10 Evan Smith  
11 Brodsky & Smith  
12 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900  
13 Beverly Hills, CA 90212

14 Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to  
15 which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

16 **9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

17 9.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of  
18 which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and  
19 the same document.

20 **10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT**  
21 **APPROVAL**

22 10.1 Espinoza agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health &  
23 Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment.  
24 Defendant agrees it shall support approval of such Motion.

25 10.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the  
26 Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case, the  
27 Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within 30  
28 days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.



1           10.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an  
2 appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent  
3 Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on  
4 its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

5 **11. MODIFICATION**

6           11.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties  
7 and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

8 **12. ATTORNEY'S FEES**

9           12.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent  
10 Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

11           12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions  
12 pursuant to law.

13 **13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

14           13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
15 Consent Judgment.

16 **14. AUTHORIZATION**

17           14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their  
18 respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this  
19 document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute  
20 the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as  
21 explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: 3/28/23

Date: 02-06-2023

By: GABRIEL ESPINOZA

By: Rose Mary Traynor  
HEAD USA, INC.

IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:

Dated: May 25 2023

[Signature]  
Judge of Superior Court  
CURTIS E.A. KARNOW