Superior Court of California County of Los Angeles 1 JAMES KAWAHITO (SBN 234851) 03/15/2023 KAWAHITO LAW GROUP APC David W. Slayton, Executive Officer / Clerk of Court 300 Corporate Pointe. Suite 340 S. Lugueno 3 Culver City, CA 90230 Deputy Telephone: (310) 746-5300 Facsimile: (310) 593-2520 4 Email: ikawahito@kawahitolaw.com 5 Attorneys for Plaintiff Pubic Health and Safety Advocates, LLC 6 7 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA 8 **COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES** 9 10 PUBLIC HEALTH AND SAFETY Case Number: 21STCV41274 ADVOCATES, LLC., a Limited Liability 11 Company, in the public interest, **IPROPOSEDI JUDGMENT PURSUANT** TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65 12 Plaintiff, SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT. v. 13 14 BEST BRANDS SALES COMPANY, LLC, Violation of Proposition 65, the Safe THE WALT DISNEY COMPANY, DISNEY **Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act** 15 ENTERPRISES INC., DISNEY CONSUMER of 1986 (Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 et PRODUCTS, INC., and DOES 1 through 50, seq.) 16 inclusive, March 15, 2023 Defendants. Date: 17 Time: 8:30 a.m. 18 Dept.: 32 Judge: Hon. Daniel S. Murphy 19 20 **RESERVATION ID: 923677551118** 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

IPROPOSEDLJUDGMENT

FILED

Plaintiff Public Health and Safety Advocates, LLC and defendant Best Brands Sales Company, LLC, having agreed through their respective counsel that Judgment be entered pursuant to the terms of their settlement agreement in the form of a stipulated judgment ("Consent judgment"), and following this Court's issuance of an order approving their Proposition 65 settlement and Consent Judgment, and for good cause being shown, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f)(4) and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6, judgment is hereby entered in accordance with the terms of the Consent Judgment attached hereto as Exhibit 1. By stipulation of the parties, the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the terms of the Consent Judgment under Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6. IT IS SO ORDERED. Sella, Dated: 03/15/2023 Daniel S. Murphy/Judge HONORABLE JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR **COURT**

[PROPOSED] JUDGMENT

EXHIBIT 1

1	JAMES KAWAHITO (SBN 234851)			
2	KAWAHITO LAW GROUP APC 300 Corporate Pointe Ste 340			
	Culver Ĉity, CA 90230			
3	Telephone: (310) 746-5300 Facsimile: (310) 593-2520 Email: jkawahito@kawahitolaw.com			
4				
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff Public Health And Safety Advocates, LLC			
6				
7	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA			
8	COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES			
9				
10	PUBLIC HEALTH AND SAFETY	Case Number: 21STCV41274		
11	ADVOCATES, LLC., a Limited Liability Company, in the public interest,	[PROPOSED] STIPULATED CONSENT JUDGMENT		
12	Plaintiff,			
13	v .	HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE § 25249.6		
14	BEST BRANDS SALES COMPANY, LLC, THE WALT DISNEY COMPANY, DISNEY			
15	ENTERPRISES INC., DISNEY CONSUMER			
16	PRODUCTS, INC., and DOES 1 through 50, inclusive,			
17	Defendants.			
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				

1. Introduction

1.1. Public Health and Safety Advocates and Best Brands Sales Company, LLC.

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff Public Health and Safety Advocates, LLC ("PHSA" or "Plaintiff"), and defendant Best Brands Sales Company, LLC ("Best Brands") with Best Brands and PHSA each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties."

1.2. Plaintiff

PHSA is a limited liability company duly organized and existing in the State of California, which seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances used in consumer products.

1.3. Defendant

Best Brands employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65").

1.4. General Allegations

PHSA alleges that Best Brands manufactured, sold, and/or distributed for sale in California, certain products described more specifically below containing benzene, a chemical listed by the State of California under Proposition 65, without providing a required Proposition 65 warning. Benzene shall be referred to hereinafter as the "Listed Chemical."

1.5. Product Description

Best Brands' products that are the subject of this Consent Judgment are the Star Wars Mandalorian Hand Sanitizers, which were sold and/or distributed for sale in California by Best Brands ("Covered Products").

1.6. Notice of Violation

On June 25, 2021 PHSA served Best Brands and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") alleging that Best Brands violated Proposition 65.

The Notice alleged that Best Brands failed to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Covered Products contain benzene.

1.7. Complaint

On November 9, 2021, Plaintiff, who was and is acting in the interest of the general public in California, filed a complaint ("Complaint") in the Superior Court in and for the County of Los Angeles against Best Brands, The Walt Disney Company, Disney Enterprises, Inc., Disney Consumer Products, Inc., and Does 1 through 50, alleging violations of Health & Safety Code §25249.6 based on the alleged exposures to benzene contained in the Covered Products.

1.8. No Admission

The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of all claims that were raised or that could have been raised in the Notice, arising out of the facts and/or conduct alleged therein. Best Brands denies the material, factual and legal allegations contained in PHSA's Notice and/or the Complaint, and maintains that all products, including but not limited to the Covered Products, that they have sold and distributed in California have been and are in compliance with all applicable laws, and are completely safe for their intended use. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Best Brands of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Best Brands of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Best Brands. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect Best Brands obligations, responsibilities, and duties hereunder.

1.9. Consent to Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that: 1) this Court has jurisdiction over Best Brands as to the allegations contained in the Complaint; 2) that venue is proper in the County of Los Angeles; and 3) that this Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment.

1.10. Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date on which the Court approves and signs an order approving this Consent Judgment.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1. Discontinuation of Covered Products

Best Brands no longer manufactures the Covered Product as they no longer have the license from Disney to do so.

If, in the future, Best Brands regains the license to manufacture and manufactures the Covered Products, Best Brands will comply with Proposition 65 by providing the warning set forth in Section 2.3.

To the extent the Attorney General's Office or OEHHA in the future adopts a standard for hand sanitizers with respect to the number of parts per million or parts per billion of benzene that they determine falls within the Safe Harbor provisions of Proposition 65, Best Brands shall be permitted to rely on such standard rather than provide the warnings set forth below.

As long as Best Brands complies and remains in compliance with the requirements of Section 2.1 – 2.5 for each of the Covered Products, the Parties agree that such Products shall be deemed to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to benzene, and that compliance with this Consent Judgment shall fully and completely satisfy Best Brands' obligations under Proposition 65 to provide warnings for such Covered Products with respect to the presence of benzene, regardless of when manufactured, distributed or sold.

Covered Products currently in the channels of distribution may continue to be sold through by Best Brands and Releasees. However, as of the Effective Date, Best Brands and the Releasees, as defined in Section 5.1, may not sell into California newly manufactured Covered Products do not contain the warnings set forth in Paragraphs 2.2 and 2.3. Notwithstanding anything else in this Consent Judgment, Covered Products that are manufactured prior to the Effective Date shall be subject to release of liability pursuant to this Consent Judgment, without regard to when such

Covered Products were, or are in the future, distributed or sold to customers and consumers. As a result, the obligation of Best Brands, or any Releasees if applicable, do not apply to those Covered Products manufactured prior to the Effective Date.

2.2. Warning

Covered Products introduced into California that Best Brands regains the license to manufacture in the future shall be accompanied by a warning as described in Section 2.3 below. This warning shall only be required as to Covered Products that Best Brands manufactures after the Effective Date. No Proposition 65 warning for benzene shall be required as to any Covered Products that are already in the stream of commerce as of the Effective Date.

2.3. Warning Language

Covered Products manufactured after the Effective Date for sale in California that do not comply with any standard set by OEHHA or the Attorney General for hand sanitizer shall contain a Proposition 65 warning affixed to the packaging, labeling, or directly on each Covered Product. The warning shall state either:

⚠ [California Proposition 65] WARNING: Use of this product can expose you to chemicals including benzene, which are known to the State of California to cause cancer, and birth defects and other reproductive harm. www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

⚠ [California Proposition 65] WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov..

The warning shall be prominently displayed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user is reasonably likely to understand the Covered Products the warning applies to, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion. In the event that the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment promulgates one or more regulations requiring or permitting warning text and/or methods of transmission different than

those set forth above applicable to the Covered Products and chemical, Best Brands shall be entitled to use, at its discretion, such other warning text and/or methods of transmission without being deemed in breach of this Consent Judgment, as long as such warning text and methods of transmission comply with OEHHA regulations.

2.4. Internet Sales

For any Covered Products sold by Best Brands through the internet, the relevant warnings shall comply with the requirements of 27 Cal. Code Regs. § 25602(b), effective August 30, 2018, or any subsequent or amended OEHHA regulations regarding internet warnings.

2.5. Warnings By Notice To Businesses Who Sell Or Receive The Covered Products

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, Best Brands may also satisfy the warning requirement by providing the required information in compliance with 27 Cal. Code Regs. §25600.2 to any business or retailer that is subject to Proposition 65, to which it sells or transfers the Covered Products.

3. MONETARY PAYMENTS

3.1. Payments Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b)

Best Brands shall pay a total civil penalty of \$20,000, to be apportioned in accordance with California Health & Safety Code §\$25249.12(c) & (d), with 75% of these funds remitted to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"") and the remaining 25% of the penalty remitted to PHSA. Best Brands shall issue two separate checks for the penalty payment: (a) one check made payable to the Kawahito Law Group in Trust for the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("in Trust for OEHHA") in the amount of \$15,000, representing 75% of the total civil penalty; and (b) one check to "Kawahito Law Group in Trust for PHSA" in the amount of \$5,000, representing 25% of the total civil penalty. Two separate 1099s shall be issued for the above payments: The first 1099 shall be issued to OEHHA, P.O. Box 4010, Sacramento, CA 95814 (EIN: 68-0284486). The second

1099 shall be issued to Kawahito Law Group APC, who shall furnish a W-9 at least five calendar days before payment is due.

The payments shall be delivered to PHSA's counsel at the following address within ten days of the Effective Date of this Consent Judgment:

James Kawahito, Esq. Kawahito Law Group APC 300 Corporate Pointe., Suite 340 Culver City, CA 90230

Payment may also be made by ACH or wire transfer. Instructions will be provided separately upon request.

4. REIMBURSEMENT OF ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS

The Parties acknowledge that PHSA and its counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving any fee reimbursement issue to be resolved after the material terms of the Consent Judgment had been settled. The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to PHSA and its counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure (CCP) § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution of this Consent Judgment. Best Brands shall reimburse PHSA and its counsel in the total amount of \$80,000 for all attorney's fees, investigative and consulting costs, and all other expenses of any kind incurred by PHSA as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to the attention of Defendants, negotiating this Consent Judgment, drafting the pleadings, and preparing the necessary briefing to obtain Court approval of the Consent Judgment. Best Brands shall make payment by check or by ACH or wire transfer within ten days of the Effective Date. The check shall be made payable to "Kawahito Law Group APC" and delivered to the address below. Wire or ACH Instructions will be provided separately upon request.

James Kawahito, Esq. Kawahito Law Group APC

3

5

6 7

8

9 10

12

13

11

14 15

16

17 18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

2627

28

300 Corporate Pointe., Suite 340 Culver City, CA 90230

To allow for the issuance of a timely payment pursuant to the above, PHSA shall provide Best Brands with a completed IRS Form W-9 for the Kawahito Law Group APC upon request.

5. RELEASE OF CLAIMS

5.1. Release.

This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between PHSA, on behalf of itself and the public interest, and its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees (the "Releasors"), on the one hand, and Best Brands, Disney Consumer Products, Inc., The Walt Disney Company, Disney Enterprises Inc., their respective parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities that are under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, licensors, licensees, and each entity to whom Best Brands directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Covered Products, including but not limited to downstream retailers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, marketplace hosts, franchisers, cooperative members, licensors, licensees, and the successors and assigns of any of them (together with Disney Consumer Products, Inc., The Walt Disney Company, ad Disney Enterprises Inc., "Releasees") of any violation of Proposition 65 that was or could have been asserted by PHSA against Best Brands, and/or any of the Releasees based on the alleged failure to warn about alleged Proposition 65 exposures to benzene caused by the Covered Products that were manufactured as of the Effective Date. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 by Best Brands and Releasees with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to benzene from Covered Products.

5.2 PHSA's Individual Release of Claims

PHSA acknowledges it is familiar' with section 1542 of California's Civil Code, which provides that:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR

HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, AND THAT IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

PHSA understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code section 1542 is that even if PHSA suffers future damages arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, Claims arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law regarding the Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by the Releasors through the Effective Date regarding the failure to warn about actual or alleged exposure to the Listed Chemical from the Covered Products, PHSA will not be able to make any claim for those damages, penalties or other relief against the Releasors. Furthermore, PHSA acknowledges that it intends these consequences for any such Claims arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law regarding the failure to warn about exposure to the Listed Chemical from the Covered Products as may exist as of the date of this release but which PHSA does not know exist, and which, if known, would materially affect their decision to enter into this Consent Judgment, regardless of whether their lack of knowledge is the result of ignorance, oversight, error, negligence, or any other cause.

5.3 Best Brands' Release of PHSA

Best Brands on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against PHSA, its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by PHSA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter with respect to the Covered Products.

6. COURT APPROVAL

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court.

7. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment, any provision of this Consent Judgment is deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected unless it materially alters the purpose of the Consent Judgment.

8. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Covered Products, then Best Brands may provide Plaintiff with written notice of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment, with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Products are so affected.

9. JOINT PREPARATION

The Parties have jointly participated in the preparation of this Consent Judgment and this Consent Judgment is the result of the joint efforts of the Parties. Accordingly, any uncertainty or ambiguity existing in this Consent Judgment shall not be interpreted against any Party as a result of the manner of the preparation of this Consent Judgment. Each Party to this Consent Judgment agrees that any statute or rule of construction providing that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting Party should not be employed in the interpretation of this Consent Judgment and, in this regard, the Parties hereby waive California Civil Code § 1654.

10. Entire Agreement

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein. No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the

PHSA and his attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(f).

14. Additional Post Execution Activities

The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7, a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of this Consent Judgment. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, PHSA shall be responsible for preparing the motion to approve the Consent Judgment. Best Brands and its respective counsel agrees to mutually employ their best efforts to support the entry of this agreement as a Consent Judgment and obtain approval of the Consent Judgment by the Court in a timely manner. For purposes of this paragraph, best efforts shall include at a minimum, cooperating in Plaintiff's drafting and filing of any papers in support of the required motion for judicial approval.

15. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only: (1) by written agreement of the parties and upon entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court thereon; or (2) upon a successful motion of any party and entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court. The Attorney General shall be served with notice of any proposed modification to this Consent Judgment at least fifteen days in advance of its consideration by the Court. To the extent either party alleges a breach of this Consent Judgment, written notice shall be provided to the party in alleged breach and the Parties shall thereafter meet and confer for at least 30 days to try to informally resolve the dispute before either Party files a motion to enforce.

16. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to stipulate to, enter into, and execute this Consent

Judgment on behalf of their respective parties, and have read, understood, and agree to all of the
terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

1	
2	
3	AGREED TO:
4	
5	Date: February 14, 2023 Date: February 14, 2023
6	Met
7	By: Public Health And Safety Advocates, LLC By: By: By: Best Brands Sales Company, LLC
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to Health & Safety
18	Code § 25249.7(f)(4) and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6, judgment is hereby entered.
19	
20	Dated:
21	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
- {	10

1	PROOF OF	SERVICE				
2 3	18 and not a party to this action; my current business address is 300 Corporate Pointe, Suite					
4	On February 21, 2023, I served the foregoing document(s) described as:					
5	[PROPOSED] JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT					
6	on the interested parties in this action as follows:					
7	x BY THE FOLLOWING MEANS:					
8	I placed an original enclosed in sealed en	velope(s) addressed as follows:				
10	Nancy Chung, Esq. Law Offices of David H. Schwartz One Post Street, Ste. 800	Jennifer Gross, Esq. Benjamin L. England & Associates, LLC 810 Landmark Drive, Suite 126				
11	San Francisco, CA 94104	Glen Burnie, MD 21061				
12	NChung@lodhs.com	jgross@englandlawgroup.com				
131415	Brett Taylor, Esq. Cozen O' Connor 601 S. Figueroa St., Ste. 3700 Los Angeles, CA 90017	Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting Attention: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Post Office Box 70550				
16	BTaylor@cozen.com	Oakland, California 94612-0550				
17	x BY THE FOLLOWING MEANS:					
18	BY MAIL I placed the envelope(s) with postage the mail, at Culver City, California.	ereon fully prepaid in the United States				
19 20	I am readily familiar with the firm's practice correspondence for mailing with the Uni	ctice of collection and processing				
21	deposits the collected correspondence wis same day, in the ordinary course of busin	ith the United States Postal Service that				
22	at Culver City, California. I placed the on the above date following ordinary bus	envelope(s) for collection and mailing				
23	x BY E-MAIL	Antess Praesices.				
24	x Due to the Covid-19 pandemic or	ur office is working remotely the majority of ysical mail per standard business practices. We				
25	will provide a physical copy, upo document listed above was electr	on request only. A true and correct copy of the conically served on the email addresses listed				
26	above.	C'A. C.N.				
27	Executed on February 21, 2023, at Culv	ver City, Camornia.				
28						

PROOF OF SERVICE

1 2	<u>x</u>	I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above is true and correct.
3	_x	I declare that I am employed in the office of a member of the bar of this court at whose direction the service was made.
4		whose direction the service was made.
5		
6		Sebastian Burnside
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		·
26		
27		
28		
		PROOF OF SERVICE
	11	I ROOF OF BERVICE

Court Reservation Receipt

Reservation

Reservation ID: 923677551118

Reservation Type:

Motion for Order (For Approval of Proposition 65

Settlement and Consent Judgment)

Number of Motions:

Status:

RESERVED

Case Title:

Case Number: 21STCV41274 PUBLIC HEALTH AND SAFETY ADVOCATES, LLC. vs BEST BRANDS SALES COMPANY, LLC, et al.

Filing Party:

Public Health and Safety Advocates, LLC. (Plaintiff)

Stanley Mosk Courthouse - Department 32

March 15th 2023, 8:30AM

Confirmation Code:

CR-WVIU6Y9E7DMGF72JL

Fees

Description	Fee	Qty	Amount
Reschedule Fee	20.00	1	20.00
Credit Card Percentage Fee (2.75%)	0.55	1	0.55
TOTAL	Yearning and the Market Service State of the Commission of the Com	AND STREET, ST	\$20.55

\$20.55

Payment

Amount:

\$20.55

Account Number: XXXX6592

Payment Date: 2023-02-17 Type: Visa

Authorization: 023523

∢ Back to Main

Print Page

 $\textbf{Copyright } \textbf{\textcircled{O}} \textbf{ Journal Technologies, USA. All rights reserved.}$