IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion for Court Approval and Entry of Consent Judgment is GRANTED. Pursuant to and in accordance with *Health & Safety Code* § 25249.7(t)(4), the Court makes the following findings with respect to the Consent Judgment between CALSAFE RESEARCH CENTER, INC and Defendant S&E GOURMET CUTS, INC. in the action *CalSafe Research Center, Inc. v. S&E Gourmet Cuts, Inc., et al., et al., et al.,* Case No. 23TRCV00100 (the "Consent Judgment"):

- 1. The Consent Judgment ensures compliance with the Proposition 65 warning requirement;
- 2. The attorneys' fee award in the Consent Judgment is reasonable under California law;
- 3. The civil penalty and additional settlement payment in lieu of civil penalty in the Consent Judgment are reasonable based on the criteria listed in *Health & Safety Code* § 25249.7(b)(2);
- 4. The additional settlement payment to Plaintiff pursuant to *Health & Safety Code* § 25249.7(b) and California *Code of Regulations*, *Title* 11, § 3204 to be used to support CRC's programs is reasonable; and
- 5. The amount sought for reimbursement of Plaintiff's costs for testing and bringing this action are reasonable.

In light of the findings set forth herein, the Consent Judgment is hereby APPROVED.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: 06/01/2023

Hon. Deldre Hill David K. Reinert Judge of the Superior Court.

Reschedule a Reservation

Reservation
Reservation ID: 691643426726
Reservation Type: Motion re: (To Approve)
Case Number: 23TRCV00100
Case Title: CALSAFE RESEARCH CENTER, INC., A CALIFORNIA NON-PROFIT CORPORATION vs S&E GOURMET CUTS, INC., A CALIFORNIA STOCK CORPORATION
Filing Party: CALSAFE RESEARCH CENTER, INC., a California non-profit corporation (Plaintiff)
Location: Torrance Courthouse - Department M
Date/Time: May 2nd 2023, 8:30AM
Status: CONFIRMED
Number of Motions: 1
Motions to Reschedule

Motion re: (To Approve)

Reschedule To:

Date: 05/16/2023 8:30 AM

Location: Torrance Courthouse - Department M

Fees			
Description	Fee	Qty	,
Reschedule Fee	20.00	1	Chat

Description		Fee	Qty	Amount
Credit Card Percentage Fee (2.75%)	(0.55	1	0.55
TOTAL				\$20.55
Payment				
Amount: \$20.55	Type: Visa			
Account Number: XXXX7564	Authorization: 023830			
Payment Date: 1969-12-31				
·	other Hearing View My Reservations			

Copyright © Journal Technologies, USA. All rights reserved.

1 2	Joseph R. Manning, Jr., Esq. (State Bar No. 223 MANNING LAW, APC 20062 S.W. Birch St., Suite 200	3381)
3	Newport Beach, CA 92660 (949) 200-8755 Phone (866) 843-8308 Fax P65@manninglawoffice.com	
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff CALSAFE RESEARCH CENTER, INC.,	
7		
8		
9		
10	SUPERIOR COURT OF	F THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
11	COUNTY	OF LOS ANGELES
12		
13	CALSAFE RESEARCH CENTER, INC., a	Case No.:
14	California non-profit corporation	[PROPOSED] STIPULATED CONSENT
15	Plaintiff,	JUDGMENT
16	V.	
17 18	S&E GOURMET CUTS, INC., a California stock corporation; and DOES 1 to 10,	
19	Defendants.	
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

Plaintiff CalSafe Research Center, Inc. ("Plaintiff"), and Defendant S & E Gourmet Cuts, Inc. ("Defendant") hereby enter into this Stipulated Consent Judgment ("Consent Judgment") as follows:

WHEREAS: On or about August 22, 2022, Plaintiff, through Plaintiff's counsel, served a 60 Day Notice to Defendant, Sprouts Farmers Market, LLC, the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every County in the State of California, and the City Attorneys for every City in the State of California with a population greater than 750,000 (collectively, "Public Prosecutor(s)") alleging that Defendant violated California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code § 25249.6, et seq., and its implementing regulations (collectively, "Proposition 65") alleging that and that Plaintiff intended to file an enforcement action in the public interest; and

WHEREAS: Plaintiff alleges that Defendant manufactured and/or distributed Country Archer Provisions, Plant-Based Jerky including but not limited to Teriyaki Jerky Spiced Bacon containing Lead, (collectively the "Covered Products") that were sold or distributed for sale in California and further alleges that those Covered Products expose consumers in the State of California to chemicals including Lead, which are listed by the State of California pursuant to California Health and Safety Code § 25249.8; and

WHEREAS: Plaintiff further alleges that persons in the State of California were exposed to Lead in Covered Products without being provided the Proposition 65 warning set out at California *Health and Safety Code* § 25249.6 and its implementing regulations ("Proposition 65 Warning");

WHEREAS: Defendant denies the allegations of the 60 Day Notice, and denies that it has violated Proposition 65 and expressly denies that it has engaged in any wrongdoing whatsoever,

WHEREAS: Plaintiff seeks to provide the public with Proposition 65 warnings and believes that this objective is achieved by the actions described in this Consent Judgment; and

WHEREAS: Plaintiff and Defendant wish to resolve their differences without the delay and expense of litigation.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED AND AGREED UPON AS BETWEEN PLAINTIFF

26 ACTING IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST AND DEFENDANT AS FOLLOWS:

2||1.1

19 1.4

- On August 22, 2022 Plaintiff served a 60-Day Notice upon Defendant, S & E Gourmet Cuts, Inc., and on Public Prosecutors. No Public Prosecutors commenced an enforcement action. No Public Prosecutor having commenced an enforcement action, Plaintiff proceeded to file its Complaint ("Complaint") against Defendant in the present action.
- 1.2 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the Parties agree that Defendant is a business entity that has employed ten or more persons at all times relevant to this action, and qualifies as a "person in the course of doing business" within the meaning of Proposition 65.
- 1.3 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, Plaintiff and Defendant (the "Parties") stipulate that:

 1) this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violation contained in the Complaint, and personal jurisdiction over Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint; 2) venue is proper in the County of Los Angeles; and 3) this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein with respect to the Covered Products, and of all claims which were or could have been raised by any person or entity based in whole or in part, directly or indirectly, on the facts alleged in the 60-Day Notice, in the present action, or arising therefrom or related thereto, with respect to Covered Products, including any Proposition 65 claim arising out of an exposure to Covered Products (collectively, "Proposition 65 Claims").
 - The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of the Proposition 65 Claims, for the purpose of avoiding prolonged and costly litigation and of resolving the issues raised therein both as to past and future conduct. By execution of this Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law, nor shall Defendant's compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law. Defendant denies the material, factual, and legal allegations in the 60-Day Notices and the Complaint and expressly denies any wrongdoing whatsoever.

the stream of commerce as of the Compliance Date. Said Covered Products are hereby deemed

26

27

28

to be exempt from a Proposition 65 warning with respect to Lead and/or expressly released under this Consent Judgment.

3.4 Warning Language

Where required to meet the criteria set forth in Section 3.3, Defendant shall provide one of the following warning statements ("Warning"), displayed in a reasonably conspicuous manner:

Option (1)

WARNING: Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals including Lead, which [is] are known to the State of California to cause [cancer and] birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Wamings.ca.gov/food

Option (2)

WARNING: [Cancer and] Reproductive Harm--

www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food

The Warning shall be provided through one of the following methods: (1) a product-specific warning provided on a posted sign, shelf tag, or shelf sign, for the consumer product at each point of display of the product; or (2) a product-specific warning provided via any electronic device or process that automatically provides the warning to the purchaser prior to or during the purchase of the consumer product, without requiring the purchaser to seek out the warning; or (3) a warning on the label that is securely affixed to or printed upon the label and complies with this Section 3.2. In addition, for any Covered Product sold over the internet by Defendant, the Warning shall appear prior to check-out on the primary product page, or as a pop-up when a California address is input into the shipping instructions, or on the checkout page when a California delivery address is indicated for any purchase of any Covered Product. The Warning may be provided with a conspicuous hyperlink stating "WARNING" in all capital and bold letters so long as the hyperlink goes directly to a page prominently displaying the Warning without content that detracts from the Warning. Given Defendant's lack of control over third-

applicable, the warnings set forth in this Section.

party websites, the online warning requirements expressed in this Section apply only to Covered

Products sold through Defendant's website. However, Defendant will instruct any third-party

website sellers to which it supplies the Cover Product to provide the Warnings, if applicable, as a

condition of selling the Covered Product. If subsequently enacted changes to Proposition 65 or

its implementing regulations require the use of additional or different information on any

warning specifically applicable to the Covered Products (the "New Safe Harbor Warning"), the

Parties agree that the New Safe Harbor warning may be utilized in place of or in addition to, as

12 13

9

10 4.1

11

14 15

16

17

18

19 20

4.2

22

21

23

24

25

26

27

28

Within 14 business days of the Defendant receiving notice that this Consent Judgment has been approved of and entered by the Court with signature, and after receiving taxpayer information from Plaintiff, Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$25,000.00 which includes \$2,500.00 in civil penalties and \$22,500.00 in payment of Plaintiff's costs and reasonable attorney's fees. The \$2,500.00 civil penalty shall be apportioned pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.12 (d), with 75%, or \$1,875.00, paid to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and 25%, or \$625.00, payable to Plaintiff. The Plaintiff's portion of the civil penalty shall be made payable to Manning Law APC, Client Trust and CalSafe Research Center, Inc. and associated with taxpayer identification number 84-4419173. This payment shall be delivered to Manning Law, APC, 20062 SW Birch St. Suite 200, Newport Beach, CA 92660.

The OEHHA portion of the civil penalty shall be made payable to OEHHA and associated with

taxpayer identification number 68-0284486. This payment shall be delivered as follows:

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Fiscal Operations Branch Chief

P.O. Box 4010, MS #19B

Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

Attn: Mike Gyurics

Attn: Mike Gyurics

Defendant agrees to provide Plaintiff's counsel with a copy of the check payable to OEHHA, simultaneous with its penalty payments to Plaintiff. Plaintiff and its counsel will provide completed IRS 1099, W-9, or other tax forms as required. Relevant information is set out below:

- CalSafe Research Center, Inc, associated with taxpayer identification number 84-4419173, CalSafe Research Center, Inc. 4533 MacArthur Blvd. Ste. 230, Newport Beach, CA 92660.
- Manning Law, APC, associated with taxpayer identification number 83-0502205,
 Manning Law, APC, 20062 SW Birch St. Suite 200, Newport Beach, CA 92660.
- The portion of the settlement attributable to attorney's fees and costs in the amount of \$22,500.00 shall be paid to Plaintiff's counsel, who are entitled to attorney's fees and costs incurred by it in this action, including but not limited to investigating potential violations, bringing this matter to Defendant's attention, as well as litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Defendant shall provide its payment to Plaintiff's counsel in one check, payable to the Manning Law, APC, and delivered to 20062 SW Birch St. Suite 200, Newport Beach, CA 92660, within fourteen (14) business days of the Effective Date.

5. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between Plaintiff on behalf of itself and in the public interest, and Defendant and its respective officers, directors, members, shareholders, employees, attorneys, agents, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions, affiliates, suppliers, franchisees, licensees, and retailers (including Sprouts Farmers Market, LLC), their parent and all subsidiaries and affiliates thereof, their respective employees, agents and assigns, as well as all other upstream and downstream entities in the distribution chain for any of the

13 4.3

5.1

5.4

Covered Products, and the predecessors, successors, and assigns of any of them (collectively, the "Released Parties").

- Plaintiff acting on its own behalf and in the public interest releases the Released Parties from all claims, actions, causes of actions, suits, demand, liability, damages, penalties, fees, costs, and expenses asserted or which could have been asserted from the handling or consumption of the Covered Products, as to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations up through the Compliance Date based on exposure to Lead from the Covered Products as set forth in the Notices of Violation, the Complaint and herein. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to Lead from the Covered Products. This release does not apply to third-party websites that do not provide the required Warnings.
- It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts contained in the 60-Day Notice, or alleged in the Complaint, relating to the Covered Products, will hereafter be discovered or developed. Plaintiff, on behalf of itself only, on the one hand, and Defendant, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Consent Judgment is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims through and including the Compliance Date, including all rights of action thereon. Plaintiff and Defendant acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 5.1 and 5.2 may include unknown claims, and nevertheless intend to release such claims, and in doing so waive California *Civil Code* § 1542 which reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

Plaintiff understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of California *Civil Code* § 1542 is that even if Plaintiff suffers future damages arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, the Covered Products,

	18	
1	10.5	No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a
2		waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver
3		constitute a continuing waiver.
4		11. <u>RETENTION OF JURISDICTION & ENFORCEMENT</u>
5	11.1	This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement, enforcer or modify the Consent
6		Judgment. Any alleged breach of the terms of this Consent Judgment must be brought in this
7		Court.
8	11.2	If Plaintiff alleges that any Covered Products fail to comply with this Consent Judgment, then
9		Plaintiff shall inform Defendant in a reasonably prompt manner of its test results and related
10		packaging information, including information sufficient to permit Defendant to identify the
11		Covered Products at issue. The Parties shall first attempt to resolve the matter prior to Plaintiff
12		taking any further legal action. No action or motion may be filed in the absence of such a good
13		faith attempt to resolve the dispute beforehand.
14	11.3	In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or preempted as to food products, or if lead is deemed
15		to be naturally occurring in the Covered Products and not requiring a warning through a law or
16		regulation, then Plaintiff shall have no further obligation pursuant to this Consent Judgment with
17		respect to, and to the extent that the Covered Products are so affected.
18		12. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS
19	12.1	Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude Plaintiff from resolving any claim against
20		another entity on terms that are different from those contained in this Consent Judgment.
21		13. <u>EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS</u>
22	13.1	This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts, each of which shall be deemed to be an
23		original, and all of which, taken together, shall constitute the same document. Execution of the
24		Consent Judgment by e-mail, facsimile, or other electronic means, shall constitute legal and
25		binding execution and delivery. Any photocopy of the executed Consent Judgment shall have the
26		same force and effect as the original.
27		14. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>
28		

1	14.1 The undersigned are authorized to stipulate to, enter into, and execute this Consent Judgment on
2	behalf of their respective parties, and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and
3	conditions of this Consent Judgment.
4	15. <u>SEVERABILITY</u>
5	15.1 If subsequent to Court approval of this Consent Judgment, any part or provision is declared by a
6	Court to be invalid, void, or unenforceable, the remaining portions of provisions shall continue in
7	full force and effect.
8	///
9	///
10	///
11	AGREED TO:
12	CalSafe Research Center, Inc.
13	Dated: January 30, 2023
14	$A_{\sim}/1$.
15	By:
16	
17	AGREED TO:
18	S & E Gourmet Cuts, Inc.
19	Dated: January 30, 2023
20	
21	By:
22	
23	IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to Health & Safety
24	Code § 25249.7(f)(4) and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6, judgment is hereby entered.
25	Dated:
26	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
27	
28	