1	Laralei Paras, State Bar No. 203319 Seven Hills LLP	San Francisco County Superior Court
2	4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400 San Francisco, CA 94111	JUL 18 2023
3	Telephone: (415) 926-7247 laralei@sevenhillsllp.com	CLERK OF THE COURT BY: Deputy Clerk
4 5	Attorneys for Plaintiff CENTER FOR ADVANCED PUBLIC AWARI	•
6		
7	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
8	COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO	
9	UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION	
10 11	CENTER FOR ADVANCED PUBLIC AWARENESS,	Case No. CGC-23-605599
12	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO TERMS OF
13	V.	PROPOSITION 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT
14	MINERVA BEAUTY, INC.,	Date: July 18, 2023
15	Defendant.	Time: 9:30 a.m. Dept.: 302
16		Judge: Hon. Richard B. Ulmer, Jr.
17 18		Complaint Filed: April 3, 2023 Trial Date: None set.
19		
20		
21		
22		
23	;	
24		
25		
26	·	
27		
28		
	ILIDGMENT PLIRSHANT TO TERMS OF PRO	P. 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT

l l			
1	In the above-entitled action, Plaintiff Center for Advanced Public Awareness and		
2	Defendant Minerva Beauty, Inc., having agreed through their respective counsel that Judgment b		
3	entered pursuant to the terms of their settlement agreement in the form of a Consent Judgment,		
4	and following this Court's issuance of an Order approving this Proposition 65 settlement and		
5	Consent Judgment,		
6	IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to California		
7	Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4) and California Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6, Judgmen		
8	is entered in accordance with the terms of the Consent Judgment attached hereto as Exhibit A .		
9	By stipulation of the parties, the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the settlement under		
10	Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6.		
11			
12	IT IS SO ORDERED.		
13			
14	Dated: 7/18/23 UU JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT		
15			
16	FICHARD B. ULMER		
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27	^		
28			
	JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO TERMS OF PROPOSITION 65 SETTLEMENT AND CONSENT JUDGMENT		

- 1 -

EXHIBIT A

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Laralei Paras, State Bar No. 203319 SEVEN HILLS LLP 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400 San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone: (415) 926-7247 laralei@sevenhillsllp.com Attorneys for Plaintiff CENTER FOR ADVANCED PUBLIC AWARENESS Evan Dwin, State Bar No. 241027 Dwin Legal, APC 2121 Palomar Airport Road, Suite 160 Carlsbad, CA 92011		
9	Telephone: (760) 536-6471 edwin@dwinlegal.com		
10	Attorneys for Defendant MINERVA BEAUTY, INC.		
11			
12	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
13		SAN FRANCISCO	
14		CIVIL JURISDICTION	
15			
16	CENTER FOR ADVANCED PUBLIC	Case No. CGC-23-605599	
17	AWARENESS,	[PROPOSED]	
18	Plaintiff,	CONSENT JUDGMENT	
19	v.	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6)	
20	MINERVA BEAUTY, INC.,		
21	Defendant.		
22			
23			
24			
25			
26	·		
27			
28			

CONSENT JUDGMENT

1. INTRODUCTION

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff Center for Advanced Public Awareness ("CAPA") and defendant Minerva Beauty, Inc. ("Minerva"), with CAPA and Minerva each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively, as the "Parties," to resolve the allegations in the May 27, 2022 60-Day Notice of Violation in compliance with the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

1.1 The Parties

CAPA is a California-based non-profit organization alleging it proceeds in the public interest pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) to ensure that chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm are disclosed in or eliminated from consumer products sold in California. Minerva is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.11(b).

1.2 Consumer Product Description

CAPA alleges that Minerva manufactures, imports, sells, and distributes for sale in California seats with vinyl upholstery containing di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("DEHP"), including, but not limited to, *Child's Salon Styling Chair Booster Seat, SKU: 2232b*, without providing the health hazard warning that CAPA alleges is required by California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"). Seats with vinyl upholstery are referred to hereinafter as the "Products," with an individual seat with vinyl upholstery sometimes being referred to hereinafter as the "Product." DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

1.3 Notice of Violation

On August 24, 2022, CAPA served Minerva, the California Attorney General, and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice"), alleging Minerva violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn its customers and consumers in California that its Products can expose users to DEHP. No public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the allegations in the Notice.

1.4 Complaint

On April 3, 2023, CAPA commenced the instant action ("Complaint"), naming Minerva as a defendant for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notice.

1.5 No Admission

Minerva denies the factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint and maintains that all products it sold or distributed for sale in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall constitute or be construed as, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as, an admission by Minerva of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Minerva's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.6 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Minerva as to the allegations contained in the Complaint; that venue is proper in San Francisco County; and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment, pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6.

1.7 Execution Date

The term "Execution Date" means the date all parties have signed this Consent Judgment.

1.8 Effective Date

The term "Effective Date" means the date on which the Court approves this Consent Judgment and enters Judgment pursuant to its terms.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION AND INTERIM WARNINGS

2.1 Reformulation Commitment

Commencing on the Execution Date and continuing thereafter, all Products Minerva manufactures, orders, imports, or purchases for sale in or into California, which have not already shipped to California for sale, directly or through one or more third party retailers or e-commerce marketplaces, shall meet the Reformulation Standard for Reformulated Products, as defined by Section 2.2.

2.2 Reformulation Standard

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Reformulated Products" are defined as Products, which, if they contain di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("DEHP"), di-n-butyl phthalate ("DBP"), diisononyl phthalate ("DINP"), butyl benzyl phthalate ("BBP"), di-isodecyl phthalate ("DIDP") or di-n-hexyl phthalate ("DnHP"), contain any or all such chemicals each in a maximum concentration of less than 0.1 percent (1,000 parts per million (ppm)) in any accessible component (i.e., any component a consumer would handle during reasonably foreseeable use) when analyzed by a laboratory accredited by the State of California, a federal agency, or a nationally recognized accrediting organization. For purposes of compliance with this Reformulation Standard, testing samples shall be prepared and extracted using Consumer Product Safety Commission ("CPSC") methodology CPSC-CH-C1001.09.4 and analyzed using U.S. Environmental Protection Agency methodology 8270D, or other methodologies utilized by federal or state government agencies to determine phthalate content in a solid substance. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission that any product with a concentration of greater than 0.1% (1,000 ppm) of DEHP, DBP, DINP, BBP, DIDP or DnHP, or any other chemical, and analyzed using CPSC methodology CPSC-CH-C1001.09.4, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency methodology 8270D, or other methodologies utilized by federal or state government agencies to determine phthalate content in a solid substance, violates Proposition 65 and Minerva disputes and denies that 0.1% (1,000 ppm) constitutes the Maximum Allowable Dose Level for DEHP, DINP, BBD, DIDP or DnHP, or any other chemical, under Proposition 65.

2.3 Certification of Compliance with Reformulation Standard

On or before thirty (30) days after the Execution Date, an officer of Minerva shall provide Seven Hills LLP with a written attested declaration stating, as of the Execution Date, and continuing thereafter, any and all Products manufactured, ordered, imported, or purchased for sale, which have not already shipped to California prior to the Execution date, to (a) consumers in California directly including through its own website, affiliated websites or a third party website, and (b) customers with nationwide distribution and e-commerce platforms, are Reformulated Products as defined by Section 2.2. Along with its attested declaration, Minerva shall provide a recent test result performed

parameters set forth in Section 2.2 and are Reformulated Products. Failure to comply with this section shall render this agreement null and void.

2.4 Interim Clear and Reasonable Warnings

after the date of the Notice, showing the Products were tested and analyzed according to the

Commencing on or before the Effective Date, Minerva shall provide clear and reasonable warnings for all Products, that are not Reformulated Products, including Products already shipped to California prior as of the Execution Date but not yet sold, provided for sale to (a) customers in California and (b) customers with nationwide distribution and e-commerce platforms in accordance with this Section pursuant to Title 27, California Code of Regulations § 25600, et seq. Each warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use and shall be provided in a manner such that it is clearly associated with the specific Product to which the warning applies. Where a consumer product sign, label or shelf tag used to provide a warning includes consumer information in language(s) other than English, the warning or notice must also be provided in the other language(s) in addition to English.

(a) **DEHP Warning**. The Warning for DEHP in excess of the Reformulation Standard set forth in Section 2.2 shall consist of the following statement:

△WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP), which are known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/furniture.

A warning provided pursuant to this Section 2.4(a) must print the word "WARNING:" in all capital letters and in bold font. The warning symbol to the left of the word "WARNING:" must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a black outline, except if the labeling does not use the color yellow, then the symbol may be in black and white.

(b) Product Label Warnings

Minerva shall include the warning statement in Section 2.4(a) on the Product label affixed to the Products in the same manner as other consumer information or warning materials on the Products. The entire warning shall appear in a type size of at least 6-point type and no smaller than the largest

type size used for other consumer information on the Products. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Product label" means a display of written, printed or graphic material that is printed on or affixed to a Product or its immediate container or wrapper.

(c) Internet Warning

Minerva shall also provide the warning statement in Section 2.4(a) by prominently displaying, or requiring the warning to be prominently displayed on third party websites or by downstream retailers or distributors with e-commerce platforms, to the consumer during the purchase of any of the Products without requiring customers to seek out the warning. The warning or a clearly marked hyperlink to the warning using the word "WARNING" given in conjunction with the sale of the Products via the internet shall appear either: (i) on the same web page on which each Product is displayed; (ii) on the same web page as the virtual cart displaying each Product; (iii) on the same page as the price for each Product; or (iv) on one or more web pages displayed to a purchaser during the checkout process. The warning shall appear in any of the above instances adjacent to or immediately following the display, description or price of each Product for which it is given in the same type size or larger than other consumer information provided for each Product.

(d) Catalog Warning

If, after the Effective Date, Minerva prints new catalogs and sells Products, that are not Reformulated Products, via mail order through such catalogs to customers located in California, Minerva shall also provide the warning statement in Section 2.4(a) for each Product in the catalog in a manner that clearly associates the warning with the *specific* Product being purchased. Any warning provided in a mail order catalog shall be in the same type size or larger than other consumer information provided for the Product within the catalog and shall be provided on the same page and in the same location as the display and/or description of each Products.

(e) Receipt Notice

For each Products, sold or shipped to customers located in California, Minerva shall also provide, or require downstream retailers or distributes to provide, on the sales receipt and packing slip, the following notice statement:

NOTICE:

Some furniture products with vinyl upholstery in this shipment can expose you to chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer. Please check the product label for warning information. For more information go to: www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/furniture.

A notice statement provided pursuant to this Section must print the word "NOTICE:" in all capital letters and in bold font. The entire notice statement shall appear in a type size of at least 12-point type and no smaller than the largest type size used for other consumer information on the on the sales receipt and packing slip.

(f) Posted Notice Sign

Minerva shall inform, or require downstream retailers or distributes to inform, customers that, if the customer sells, uses or offers the product for sale or use in a business establishment in the State of California, a sign no smaller than 8 1/2 by 11 inches must be displayed at each public entrance and at each point of usage, and printed in no smaller than 28-point type which contains the following warning statement:

NOTICE:

Some furniture products with vinyl upholstery in this establishment can expose you to chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. Please check the product label for warning information. For more information go to: www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/furniture.

2.5 Customer Notification

No later than the Effective Date, Minerva shall send a letter, electronic or otherwise ("Notification Letter") to: (1) each customer in California to which it supplied Products between August 24, 2021 and August 24, 2022; and (2) any other customer that is a retailer or distributor that has any inventory of Products, which Minerva supplied between August 24, 2019 and August 24, 2022, for sale to consumers in California. The Notification Letter shall advise the recipient that each Product that is not a Reformulated Product, listed by SKU, must have a label attached to each Product expressly referring to the Product, which contains the warning statement in Section 2.4(a), before it is sold in the California market or to a customer in California, and shall further inform customers that, if the customer sells, uses or offers the Product for use in a business establishment such as a salon in the State of California, a sign no smaller than 8 1/2 by 11 inches must be displayed at each public

entrance and at each point of usage, and printed in no smaller than 28-point type which contains the warning statement in Section 2.4(f). If the customer is a business establishment, the Notification Letter shall include both a sheet of white background, adhesive stickers with the forgoing warning statement in Section 2.4(a) and the sign in Section 2.4(f), and require confirmation of receipt electronically or in writing from the authorized agent of the customer, unless the business has not designated an authorized agent, then the Notification Letter must be sent to the agent for service of process for the customer.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Civil Penalty

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b), Minerva agrees to pay a civil penalty of \$3,300 within five (5) business days of the Effective Date. Minerva's civil penalty payment will be allocated according to Health and Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the penalty paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining twenty-five percent (25%) retained by CAPA. Minerva shall issue its payment in two checks made payable to: (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$2,475; and (b) "Center for Advanced Public Awareness" in the amount of \$825. CAPA's counsel shall deliver to OEHHA and CAPA their respective portion of the penalty payment.

3.2 Reimbursement of Attorneys' Fees and Costs

CAPA and its counsel offered to resolve the allegations in the Notice and Complaint without reaching terms on the amount of reimbursement of attorneys' fees and costs. Shortly after the Parties finalized the other material settlement terms, they negotiated and reached an accord on the amount of reimbursement to be paid to CAPA's counsel, under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine, codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution and reporting of this Consent Judgment to the Office of the California Attorney General and entry of Judgment pursuant its terms, but exclusive of fees and costs on appeal, if any. Within five (5) days of the Effective Date, Minerva agrees to issue a check in the amount of \$27,000 and made payable to "Seven Hills LLP" for all fees and other costs incurred investigating, bringing this matter to Minerva's attention, litigating, negotiating a settlement

in the public interest, obtaining the Court's approval of its terms pursuant to Section 5, and reporting its terms to the Office of the California Attorney General pursuant to Section 9.

3.3 Payments

All payments payable and due under this Consent Judgment shall be delivered to CAPA's counsel at the following address:

Seven Hills LLP Attn: Laralei Paras 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400 San Francisco, CA 94111

4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

4.1 CAPA's Release of Proposition 65 Claims

This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between CAPA, acting on its own behalf and in the public interest, and Minerva, of any violation of Proposition 65 that was or could have been asserted by CAPA on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, against Minerva, its directors, officers, employees, attorneys, and each entity to whom Minerva directly or indirectly distributes or sells Products, including, but not limited to, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees (collectively, "Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 based on their failure to warn about alleged exposures to DEHP contained in the Products that were manufactured, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Minerva in California before the Effective Date, as alleged in the Notice.

4.2 CAPA's Individual Release of Claims

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, CAPA as an individual and not n its representative capacity, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives all of CAPA's rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims that CAPA may have, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses including, but not exclusively, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees arising under Proposition 65

with respect to DEHP, DBP, DINP, BBP, DIDP, and DnHP in the Products manufactured, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Minerva, before the Execution Date (collectively, "Claims"), against Minerva and Releasees.

The Parties understand and agree these Sections 4.1 and 4.2 releases shall neither extend upstream to any entities that sold, supplied, or manufactured the Products or any component parts thereof, or any distributors or suppliers who sold the Products or any component parts thereof to Minerva nor extend to Releasees who have been instructed by Minerva pursuant to Section 2.5 to provide a warning on Products that are not Reformulated Products and have failed to do so.

4.3 Minerva's Release of CAPA

Minerva, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against CAPA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by CAPA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter with respect to the Products.

5. COURT APPROVAL

Pursuant to California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4), CAPA shall file a noticed motion for judicial approval of this Consent Judgment. The Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, and those of their counsel, to support the entry of a judgment pursuant to the terms of this Consent Judgment, and to judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval, responding to any third-party objection, and appearing at the hearing before the Court if so requested.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any provision of this Consent Judgment is deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. **GOVERNING LAW**

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then Minerva may provide CAPA with written notice of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further injunctive obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment, with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be interpreted to relieve Minerva from its obligation to comply with any pertinent state or federal law or regulation.

8. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by electronic mail where applicable and either by: (i) first-class registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (ii) a recognized overnight courier to any Party by the other at the following addresses:

For Minerva: 14

For CAPA:

Laralei Paras, Partner

James Frank Rawl, III, CEO Minerva Beauty, Inc. 390 Jim Daws Road

Seven Hills LLP 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400

Monroe, GA 36055

San Francisco, CA 94111 Email: laralei@sevenhillsllp.com

With a copy to:

18

Evan Dwin

Dwin Legal, APC

2121 Palomar Airport Road, Suite 160

Carlsbad, CA 92011

Email: edwin@dwinlegal.com

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other Party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

9. COUNTERPARTS AND PDF SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by portable document format (pdf) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original and, all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

27

28

11

1

3 4

> 5 6

> 7 8

9

10 11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23 24

25

26

27 28

10. COMPLIANCE WITH REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

CAPA and its counsel agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

11. **ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein and therein. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto.

12. **MODIFICATION**

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon; or (ii) upon a successful motion of any party and the entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon.

AUTHORIZATION 13.

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agreed to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
Date: 6/28/2023	Date: 6/27/2023

By: James Frank Rawl, III, CEO da DeRose-Droubay, Executive Director Minerva Beauty, Inc. Center for Advanced Public Awareness