1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Brodsky Smith (Bar No. SBN 242352) BRODSKY SMITH 9465 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 300 Beverly Hills, CA 90212 Tel: (877) 534-2590 Fax: (310) 247-0160  Attorneys for Plaintiff	Superior Court of California County of San Francisco  DEC - 4 2024  CLERK OF THE COURT  BY:  Deputy Clerk
9	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE	ESTATE OF CALIFORNIA
10	COUNTY OF SA	N FRANCISCO
11	EMA BELL,	Case No.: CGC-24-614422
12	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT
13	v. COLEWILLAIDAN, LLC, GEOMAR S.A.	Judge: Richard B. Ulmer
14 15	Defendants.	Dept.: 302 Hearing Date: October 31, 2024 Hearing Time: 9:30 AM
16		Complaint Filed: May 6, 2024
17	1. The state of th	<b>-</b> ! ⊙*:1
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24 25		
26		8
27		
28		

1.1 The Parties. This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Ema Bell acting on behalf of the public interest (hereinafter "Bell") on the one hand, and defendants Geomar, S.A. ("Geomar") and Colewillaidan, LLC ("Colewillaidan") (collectively, "Defendants" and each a "Defendant") on the other hand, with Bell and Defendants collectively referred to as the "Parties" and each of them as a "Party." Bell is an individual residing in California that seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Each Defendant is alleged to be a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.

- 1.2 Allegations and Representations. Bell alleges that Defendants have exposed individuals to lead and/or cadmium from their sales of (a) Clams, (b) Crabs, and (c) Mussels without providing clear and reasonable exposure warnings pursuant to Proposition 65. Lead and cadmium are listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.
- Notices of Violation/Action. On or about July 28, 2023, Bell served Colewillaidan and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the "July Notice"), alleging that Colewillaidan violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that consumption of "Cole's Clams" and "Cole's Crabs" expose consumers in California to lead. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the July Notice.

On or about May 6, 2024, Bell served Defendants and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the "First May Notice"), alleging that Defendants violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that consumption of Mussels, including but not limited to "Cole's Mussels," exposes consumers in California to lead and cadmium. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the First May Notice.

On or about May 6, 2024, Bell served Defendants and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the "Second May Notice"), alleging that Defendants violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that consumption of Clams, including but not limited to "Cole's Clams," exposes consumers in California to lead and cadmium. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Second May Notice.

On or about May 6, 2024, Bell served Defendants and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the "Third May Notice"), alleging that Defendants violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that consumption of Crabs, including but not limited to Cole's "Snow Crab," exposes consumers in California to lead. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Third May Notice.

The July Notice, the First May Notice, the Second May Notice, and the Third May Notice are collectively referred to herein as, the "Notices."

- 1.4 On May 6, 2024, Bell filed a complaint that brought claims pertaining to the July Notice (the "Complaint"). On September 6, 2024, Bell filed a first amended complaint alleging claims pertaining to the Notices (the "First Amended Complaint"). The Complaint and the First Amended Complaint are collectively referred to herein as, the "Action."
- 1.5 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Defendants as to the allegations contained in the Action filed in this matter, that venue is proper in the County of San Francisco, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter, and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Action based on the facts alleged therein and in the Notices.
- 1.6 Defendants deny the material allegations contained in the Notices and Action and maintain that they have not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Defendants of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor

shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Defendants of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Defendants. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Defendants under this Consent Judgment.

#### 2. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

- 2.1 Covered Products. The term "Covered Product(s)" mean all (a) Clams, (b) Crabs, and (c) Mussels that are manufactured, distributed, shipped into California and offered for sale in California by Defendants.
- 2.2 Effective Date. The term "Effective Date" means the date this Consent Judgment is entered as a Judgment of the Court.

## 3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION AND/OR WARNINGS

- Reformulation of Covered Products. Commencing within sixty (60) days after the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Covered Products that Defendants directly manufacture, import, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California shall either be: (a) reformulated Products pursuant to §§ 3.2 3.3, below; or (b) labeled with or accompanied by a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to §§ 3.4 3.5, below. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a "Reformulated Product" is a Covered Product that is in compliance with the standards set forth in §§ 3.2 3.3, below. The warning requirement set forth in §§ 3.4 3.5 shall not apply to any Reformulated Product and/or to any Product that entered the stream of commerce prior to, or within 60 days after the Effective Date. For the avoidance of doubt, Covered Products in the stream of commerce specifically include, but are not limited to, Covered Products in the process of manufacture.
- 3.2 Lead Reformulation Standard. "Reformulated Lead Products" shall mean Covered Products that expose a person to an exposure level of less than 0.5 micrograms of lead per serving size when analyzed pursuant to AOAC Official Method 2015.01. For the purpose of this Consent Judgment, the amount of lead a person is exposed to from a Covered Product shall be calculated using the following formula: micrograms of lead per gram of Covered Product,

multiplied by grams of Covered Product per serving size of the Covered Product (using the largest serving size appearing on the Covered Product label), multiplied by servings of the Covered Product per day (using the largest number of servings in a recommended dosage appearing on the label), which equates to micrograms of lead exposure per day. If the Covered Product label contains no recommended daily servings, then the number of recommended daily servings shall be one (1).

- 3.3 Cadmium Reformulation Standard. "Reformulated Cadmium Products" shall mean Covered Products that expose a person to an exposure level of less than 4.1 micrograms of cadmium per serving size when analyzed pursuant to AOAC Official Method 2015.01. For the purpose of this Consent Judgment, the amount of lead a person is exposed to from a Covered Product shall be calculated using the following formula: micrograms of cadmium per gram of Covered Product, multiplied by grams of Covered Product per serving size of the Covered Product (using the largest serving size appearing on the Covered Product label), multiplied by servings of the Covered Product per day (using the largest number of servings in a recommended dosage appearing on the label), which equates to micrograms of cadmium exposure per day. If the Covered Product label contains no recommended daily servings, then the number of recommended daily servings shall be one (1).
- Oate, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in this §§ 3.4 and 3.5 must be provided for all Covered Products that Defendants manufacturer, import, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California that is not a Reformulated Product. There shall be no obligation for Defendants to provide an exposure warning for Covered Products that entered the stream of commerce prior to, or within 60 days after the Effective Date. The warning shall consist of either the Warning or Alternative Warning described in §§ 3.4(a) (f):
- (a) Warning. If a Covered Product creates an exposure to lead only, the "Warning" shall consist of the statement:

[CALIFORNIA] WARNING: Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause [cancer and] birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to <a href="https://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food">www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food</a>.

Defendants shall use the phrase "cancer and" in the Warning only if the daily lead exposure level is greater than 15 micrograms of lead as determined pursuant to the test methodology identified in § 3.2.

(b) Warning. If a Covered Product creates an exposure to cadmium only, the "Warning" shall consist of the statement:

[CALIFORNIA] WARNING: Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals including cadmium, which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to <a href="https://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food.">www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food.</a>

(c) Warning. If a Covered Product creates an exposure to lead and cadmium, the "Warning" shall consist of the statement:

[CALIFORNIA] WARNING: Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals including lead and cadmium, which are known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to <a href="https://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food">www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food</a>.

Defendants shall use the phrase "cancer and" in the Warning only if the daily lead exposure level is greater than 15 micrograms of lead as determined pursuant to the test methodology identified in § 3.2 or if Defendants have reason to believe that another Proposition 65 listed chemical is present at a level requiring the cancer warning. As identified in the brackets, the Warning shall appropriately reflect whether there is lead, cadmium, or multiple chemicals in the Covered Product, but if there is a chemical present at a level that requires a cancer warning, the chemical requiring use of the phrase "cancer and" in the Warning shall always be identified.

(d) Alternative Warning: For each Covered Product Defendants may, but are not required to, use the alternative short-form warning as set forth in this § 3.4(d) ("Alternative Warning") as follows:

[CALIFORNIA] WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food

Any Warning provided pursuant to § 3.4 must print the word "[CALIFORNIA] WARNING:" in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The Warning, Alternative Warning shall be affixed to or printed on the Products' packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or automatic process, provided that the Warning or

Alternative Warning is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. If Defendants elect to warn with the Warning or Alternative Warning, the Warning or Alternative Warning may be contained in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Product and shall be at least the same size as those other safety warnings. Where the Warning or Alternative Warning is provided on the food product label, it must be set off from other surrounding information, and Defendants shall enclose the Warning or Alternative Warning in a black box and comply with the content requirements specified in Section 25607.2. If "consumer information," as that term is defined in Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.1(c) as it may be amended from time to time, is provided in a foreign language, Defendants shall provide the Warning, Alternative Warning, or Retail Seller Warning in the foreign language in accordance with applicable warning regulations adopted by the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA").

In addition to affixing the Warning or Alternative Warning to the Product's packaging or labeling, the Warning or Alternative Warning shall be posted on websites where Defendants offer Covered Products for sale to consumers in California. The requirements of this Section shall be satisfied if the Warning or Alternative Warning, or a clearly marked hyperlink using the word "WARNING," appears on the product display page, or by otherwise prominently displaying the warning to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. To comply with this Section, Defendants shall (a) post the Warning or Alternative Warning on their own website and, if they have the ability to do so, on the websites of third-party internet sellers Defendants authorize to sell Covered Products; and (b) if they do not have the ability to post the Warning or Alternative Warning on the websites of third-party internet sellers they authorize to sell Covered Products, provide such authorized third-party sellers with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.2. Authorized third-party internet sellers of the Product that have been provided with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section

25600.2 are not released in Section 5 of this Agreement if they fail to meet the warning requirements of this Section. Defendants shall not be responsible for posting the Warning or Alternative Warning on the websites of third-party internet sellers who are not authorized by Defendants to sell Covered Products or who are not authorized by Defendants' retail sellers to sell Covered Products supplied by Defendants, and such unauthorized third-party internet sellers are not released pursuant to Section 5 of this Agreement.

3.6 Compliance with Warning Regulations. The Parties agree that Defendants shall be deemed to be in compliance with this Settlement Agreement by either adhering to § 3 of this Settlement Agreement or by complying with warning regulations adopted by the State of California's OEHHA applicable to the Covered Products and the exposures at issue. If OEHHA adopts new warning regulations applicable to the Covered Products and exposures at issue, Defendants may choose to provide these warnings at their discretion.

#### 4. MONETARY TERMS

- 4.1 Civil Penalty. Defendants shall pay \$9,000.00 as a Civil Penalty pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25% of the Civil Penalty remitted to Bell, as provided by California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(d).
- 4.1.1 Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Defendants shall issue two separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$6,750.00; and to (b) "Ema Bell" in the amount of \$2,250.00. Payment owed to Bell pursuant to this Section shall be delivered to the following payment address:

Evan J. Smith, Esquire Brodsky Smith Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805 Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at one of the following address(es):

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics

Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment P.O. Box 4010 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

A copy of the check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed to Brodsky Smith at the address set forth above as proof of payment to OEHHA.

4.2 Attorneys' Fees. Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Defendants shall pay \$38,000.00 to Brodsky Smith as complete reimbursement for Bell's attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to the attention of Defendants, litigating and negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement in the public interest, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5.

#### 5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS

5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Bell acting on her own behalf, and on behalf of the public interest, and Defendants, and their parents, shareholders, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives, agents, attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their predecessors, successors and assigns ("Defendants Releasees"), and all entities from whom they obtain and to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including but not limited to manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees retailers, including but not limited to World Market Management Services, LLC, Trader Joe's Company, Amazon.com Services LLC; and Amazon.com, Inc., and each of these entities' parents, subsidiaries, and affiliates, franchisees, and cooperative members ("Downstream Releasees"), of all claims for violations of Proposition 65 that could be brought based on exposures to lead from Crabs and exposures to lead and/or cadmium from Clams and Mussels manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendants within 60 days after the Effective Date, as set forth in the Notices. It is the

27 28 intention of the Parties that this Consent Judgment shall have preclusive effect such that no other actions by private enforcers, whether purporting to act in his, her, or their interests or the public interest, shall be permitted to pursue and take any action with respect to any violation of Proposition 65 based on exposure to lead and/or cadmium from use of the Covered Products that was alleged in the Complaint, or that could have been brought pursuant to the Notices against Defendants and the Downstream Releasees ("Proposition 65 Claims"). Defendants' compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 by Defendants with regard to exposure to lead and/or cadmium from consumption of Clams and Mussels; and with regard to exposure to lead from consumption of Crabs.

5.2 In addition to the foregoing, Bell, on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and assignees, and not in her representative capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases Defendants, Defendants Releasees, and Downstream Releasees from any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts, contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses, and attorneys' fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent, now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 related to or arising from Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendants, Defendants Releasees or Downstream Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph, Bell hereby specifically waives any and all rights and benefits which she now has, or in the future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

Defendants waive any and all claims against Bell, her attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken, or statements made (or those that could have been

2	investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against them in this matter,	
3	and with respect to Covered Products.	
4	6. <u>INTEGRATION</u>	
5	6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and	
6	any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been	
7).	merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist	
8	or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.	
9	7. GOVERNING LAW	
10	7.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of	
11	California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or	
12	is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to Covered Products, then	
13	Defendants may move to modify this Consent Judgment to reflect such changes to the law, as set	
14	forth in Section 11.	
15	8. <u>NOTICES</u>	
16	8.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided	
17	pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-	
18	class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any party	
19	by the other party at the following addresses:	
20	For Defendants: For Bell:	
21	David Barnes Evan Smith	
22	Hogan Lovells US LLP Brodsky Smith 4 Embarcadero Center, Ste. 3500 9465 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 300	
23	San Francisco, CA 94111 Beverly Hills, CA 90212  Any party from time to time may enceify in writing to the other party a change of address to	
24	Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to	
25	which all notices and other communications shall be sent.	
26		

taken or made) by Bell and her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of

27

28

# 9. COUNTERPARTS: FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

9.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

# 10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT APPROVAL

- 10.1 Bell agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment. Defendants agrees they shall support approval of such Motion.
- 10.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case, the Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within 30 days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.
- 10.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

# 11. MODIFICATION

11.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

### 12. ATTORNEY'S FEES

- 12.1 This Consent Judgment may only be enforced by the Parties. A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.
- 12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions pursuant to law.

1	13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION.	
2	13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the	
-3	Consent Judgment.	
4	14. AUTHORIZATION	
5	14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their	
6	respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this	
7	document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute	
8	the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as	
9.	explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.	
10		
11	AGREED TO: AGREED TO:	
12	Date: See heart Act L. Date: September 9, 2024   12:44 PM PDT	
13	- Janier Dona oso	
14	EMA BELL GEOMAR, S.A.	
15		
16	×	
17	AGREED TO:	
18	September 9, 2024   12:44 PM PDT	
19	Datasimino por	
20	COLEWILLAIDAN, LLC	
21	COLEWILLAIDAN, LLC	
22	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:	
23		
24	Dated: /// z 9/24 UL1  Judge of Superior Court	
25	•	
26	RICHARD ULMER	
27		
28		
- 1	W	

# 1 13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION 2 13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the 3 Consent Judgment. 4 14. AUTHORIZATION 5 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their 6 respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this 7 document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute 8 the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as 9 explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs. **AGREED TO:** GEOMAR, S.A. Date: COLEWILLAIDAN, LLC IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED: Dated: Judge of Superior Court

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO: