

ENDORSED



Jarrett S. Charo, Esq. (State Bar No. 224001)  
**JARRETT CHARO, APC**  
4079 Governor Dr., No. 1018  
San Diego, California 92122  
P: (619) 350-3334  
jcharo@charolaw.com

Joseph R. Manning, Jr., Esq. (State Bar No. 223381)  
**MANNING LAW, APC**  
26100 Towne Centre Drive  
Foothill Ranch, CA 92610  
Office: (949) 200-8755  
Fax: (866) 843-8308  
P65@manninglawoffice.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
RAMY KAUFLEDER EDEN

**SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
COUNTY OF COLUSA**

**RAMY KAUFLEDER EDEN**

**Plaintiff,**

**v.**

**NORTHGATE PETROLEUM COMPANY  
and DOES 1 through 50, inclusive,**

**Defendants.**

Case No.: CV24767

**[PROPOSED] ORDER ENTERING  
JUDGMENT**

Date: February 11, 2025

Time: 9:00 a.m.

Dept. 1

Judge: Hon. Brendan M. Farrell

Complaint Filed: July 30, 2024

After consideration of the papers submitted and arguments presented, this Court finds that the terms of the Proposed Stipulated Consent Judgment attached as Exhibit A hereto meet the criteria established by California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7.

**IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED** that the terms of the Proposed Stipulated Consent Judgment attached as Exhibit A hereto are approved and, pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6, judgment is hereby entered in accordance with such terms. By written request of the parties, the Court will retain jurisdiction pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6 to enforce the settlement.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: 2/11/25

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

# Exhibit A

Jarrett S. Charo, Esq. (SBN 224001)  
JARRETT CHARO, APC  
4079 Governor Dr., No. 1018  
San Diego, California 92122  
P: (619) 350-3334  
jcharo@charolaw.com

Joseph R. Manning, Jr., Esq. (State Bar No. 223381)  
MANNING LAW, APC  
26100 Towne Centre Drive  
Foothill Ranch, CA 92610  
(949) 200-8755 Phone  
(866) 843-8308 Fax  
GasVaporProp65@manninglawoffice.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
RAMY KAUFLEER EDEN

**SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
COUNTY OF COLUSA**

**RAMY KAUFLEER EDEN**

**Plaintiff,**

**v,**

**NORTHGATE PETROLEUM  
COMPANY; and DOES 1 through 50,  
inclusive,**

**Defendants.**

Case No.: CV24767

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED CONSENT  
JUDGMENT**

1 Plaintiff RAMY EDEN ("Plaintiff") and defendant NORTHGATE PETROLEUM  
2 COMPANY ("Defendant") hereby enter into this Stipulated Consent Judgment ("Consent Judgment")  
3 as follows:

4 WHEREAS: On or about November 2, 2023, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code  
5 section 25249.5, *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"), Plaintiff served the California Attorney General, the  
6 Colusa County District Attorney (collectively, "Public Prosecutors"), and Defendant with a 60-Day  
7 Notice of Violation regarding the service stations located at 570 E St., Williams, California ("Subject  
8 Location");

9 WHEREAS: The 60-Day Notice of Violation alleged that Defendant was required but failed  
10 to provide warnings with respect to Unleaded Gasoline at the Subject Location which sufficiently  
11 complied with the requirements of Proposition 65;

12 WHEREAS: No Public Prosecutor commenced an enforcement action concerning the  
13 allegations in the 60-Day Notice of Violation;

14 WHEREAS: On July 30, 2024, Plaintiff filed a civil complaint against Defendant in the above-  
15 entitled Court alleging violation of Proposition 65 with regard to Unleaded Gasoline at the Subject  
16 Location ("Complaint");

17 WHEREAS: Defendant denies Plaintiff's allegations in the 60-Day Notice of Violation and in  
18 the Complaint and denies that it has otherwise violated Proposition 65 or engaged in any wrongdoing  
19 whatsoever;

20 WHEREAS: Plaintiff and Defendant wish to resolve their differences without the delay,  
21 uncertainty, and expense of litigation;

22 NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED AND AGREED UPON AS BETWEEN PLAINTIFF  
23 ACTING IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST AND DEFENDANT AS FOLLOWS:

24 1. **JURISDICTION, VENUE, AND DEFENDANT'S DENIAL OF LIABILITY**

25 1.1 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, Plaintiff and Defendant (collectively, the  
26 "Parties") agree that: This Court has jurisdiction over the allegations contained within the Complaint;  
27 Venue of this matter is proper in the County of Colusa; and this Court has jurisdiction to enter this  
28 Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised

in the Complaint and/or the 60-Day Notice of Violation and through the date of this Judgment with respect to any violation of Proposition 65 arising out of an exposure to unleaded gasoline at the Subject Location ("Proposition 65 Claims").

1.2 The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of the Proposition 65 Claims for the purpose of avoiding prolonged and costly litigation and of resolving the issues raised therein both as to past and future conduct. By execution of this Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law. Defendant's compliance with the Consent Judgment shall not be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law. Defendant denies the material, factual, and legal allegations in the 60-Day Notice of Violation and the Complaint and expressly denies any wrongdoing whatsoever.

## 2. APPLICATION OF THIS CONSENT JUDGMENT AND EFFECTIVE DATE

2.1 The location covered by this Consent Judgment is the Subject Location. This Consent Judgment may apply to and benefit the Parties and their respective officers, directors, shareholders, employees, agents, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions, franchisees, licensees, customers, distributors, wholesalers, retailers, predecessors, successors, and assigns.

2.2 "Effective Date" shall mean, with respect to this Consent Judgment, the date on which the Court approves and enters the Consent Judgment.

## 3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

3.1 Clear and Reasonable Warning. As of the Effective Date, Defendant shall cause to be posted at the Subject Location a clear and reasonable exposure warning consistent with California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 as set forth in this section 3.1.

The warning shall consist of the following text:

**⚠ WARNING:** Breathing the air in this area or skin contact with petroleum products can expose you to chemicals including benzene, motor vehicle exhaust and carbon monoxide, which are known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. Do not stay in this area longer than necessary. For more information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/service-station](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/service-station)

The words "WARNING:" shall be in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a

colon. The warning symbol to the left of the words "WARNING:" shall be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a black outline. The symbol must be in a size no smaller than the height of the words "WARNING:".

The warning shall be posted on a sign at each gas pump at the Subject Location and the warning must be printed in no smaller than 22-point type and be enclosed in a box. If other signage at the Subject Location is provided for the public in a language other than English, the warning must be provided at that Subject Location in English and that other language.

3.2 Changes to Proposition 65. If, after the Effective Date, changes are enacted to Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations which require the use of additional or different information on any warning applicable to the Subject Location ("New Warnings"), the Parties agree that the New Warnings may be used in place of the warnings set forth in section 3.1.

#### 4. MONETARY RELIEF

4.1 Civil Penalty. Defendant shall pay a total of four thousand dollars (\$4,000.00) as a Civil Penalty in accordance with this Section. The Civil Penalty payment shall be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of the Civil Penalty remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25% of the Civil Penalty remitted to Eden. The Civil Penalty payments shall be delivered to the addresses identified in § 4.3, below.

4.2 Date for Payment of Civil Penalty. Within seven (7) days of the Effective Date, Defendant shall issue two separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment: (a) one check made payable to "OEHHA" in the amount of three thousand dollars (\$3,000.00); and (b) one check made payable to "Ramy Eden" in the amount of one thousand dollars (\$1,000.00).

#### 4.3 Payment Procedures.

(a) Issuance of Payments. Payments shall be delivered as follows:

- (i) The Civil Penalty payment owed to Eden shall be delivered to the address set forth in Eden's IRS Form W-9;
- (ii) The Civil Penalty payment owed to OEHHA shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at one of the

1 following addresses (depending on whether delivery is made via

2 United States Postal Service or a different courier):

3 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

4 Mike Gyurics  
5 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
6 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
7 P.O. Box 4010  
8 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

9 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

10 Mike Gyurics  
11 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
12 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
13 1001 I Street  
14 Sacramento, CA 95814

15 (b) Copy of Payment to OEHHHA. Defendant agrees to provide Eden's counsel  
16 with a copy of the check payable to OEHHHA, simultaneous with its penalty payments to  
17 Eden, which copy shall be delivered to the address provided in § 7.1(a), as proof of payment  
18 to OEHHHA.

19 (c) Tax Documentation. Within five (5) business days of the Parties fully  
20 executing this Consent Judgment, Eden shall provide IRS W-9 forms for each of the  
21 following payees:

- 22 (i) "Ramy Eden";
- 23 (ii) "Jarrett Charo APC" (EIN: 84-2408511); and
- 24 (iii) "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" (EIN: 68-  
25 0284486).

26 4.4 Attorney's Fees and Costs. Defendant shall pay a total of sixteen thousand dollars  
27 (\$16,000.00) to Plaintiff's counsel, Jarrett Charo APC, which is entitled to attorney's fees and costs  
28 incurred by it in this action for, including, without limitation, investigating potential violations,  
bringing this matter to Defendant's attention, prosecuting this action in court, and negotiating a  
settlement in the public interest. Within seven (7) days of the Effective Date, Defendant shall issue  
one check payable to "Jarrett Charo APC" in the amount of sixteen thousand dollars (\$16,000.00)  
and deliver it to the address identified in § 7.1(a), below.



1  
2 **5. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED**

3 5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between Plaintiff on  
4 behalf of himself and in the public interest, and Defendant and its respective officers, directors,  
5 members, shareholders, employees, attorneys, agents, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions,  
6 affiliates, suppliers, franchisees, licensees, and retailers, its parent and all subsidiaries and affiliates  
7 thereof, its employees, agents and assigns (collectively, the "Released Parties").

8 5.2 Plaintiff's Release of Released Parties. Plaintiff acting on his own behalf and in the  
9 public interest releases the Released Parties from all claims, actions, causes of actions, suits, demands,  
10 liability, damages, penalties, fees, costs, and expenses asserted or which could have been asserted  
11 based on the alleged failure to warn about exposures to unleaded gasoline under Proposition 65 at the  
12 Subject Location up through the Effective Date. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment  
13 constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to unleaded gasoline at the  
14 Subject Location.

15 5.3 Defendant's Release of Eden. Defendant, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents,  
16 representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Eden,  
17 his attorneys, and other representatives for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that  
18 could have been taken or made) by Eden and/or his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the  
19 course of investigating claims, bringing the 60-Day Notice of Violation, prosecution of this action, or  
20 otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against Defendant in this matter, or with respect to the  
21 Subject Location.

22 5.4 California Civil Code § 1542. It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties  
23 arising out of the facts alleged in this matter and relating to alleged violations of Proposition 65  
24 concerning the Subject Location will develop or be discovered. Eden on behalf of himself only, on  
25 one hand, and Defendant, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Consent Judgment is expressly  
26 intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date, including all rights of  
27 action therefor. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released may include unknown claims, and  
28 nevertheless waive California Civil Code § 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil

Code § 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR  
RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER  
FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY  
HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER  
SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

The Parties each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this  
specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542 which is a material inducement for this Agreement.

**6. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f) AND MOTION  
FOR COURT APPROVAL**

6.1 Eden agrees to comply with the reporting requirements referenced in California Health  
& Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a motion for approval of this Consent Judgment.  
Defendant agrees not to oppose such motion.

**7. NOTICES**

7.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided  
pursuant to this Consent Judgment to any Party shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent to  
that Party—via: (i) email; (ii) first-class registered or certified mail with return receipt requested; or  
(iii) overnight or two-day courier—at the following addresses:

(a). For Plaintiff:  
Jarrett S. Charo, Esq.  
Jarrett Charo APC  
4079 Governor Drive, No. 1018  
San Diego, CA 92122  
jcharo@charolaw.com

(b). For Defendant:  
Steve Caldwell  
Northgate Petroleum Company  
2549 Scott Avenue  
Chico, CA 95928  
scaldwell@ngpetro.com

7.2 Any Party, from time to time, may specify in writing to any other Party a change of  
address to which all notices and other communications from that other Party shall be sent.

**8. COURT APPROVAL**

8.1 This Consent Judgment shall not become effective until approved and entered by the

1 Court. If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force or effect, and shall  
2 not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any purpose.

3 **9. GOVERNING LAW**

4 9.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the law of the State of  
5 California.

6 **10. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

7 10.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties with  
8 respect to the entire subject matter herein, and any and all prior negotiations and understandings  
9 related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within it. No representations or terms of  
10 agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the  
11 other Party or the subject matter hereof.

12 **11. MODIFICATION**

13 11.1 No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment  
14 shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby and approved and ordered  
15 by the Court; or upon the Court granting a motion brought by any of the Parties.

16 **12. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

17 12.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement, enforce, or modify the  
18 Consent Judgment. Any alleged breach of the terms of this Consent Judgment shall be brought in this  
19 Court.

20 **13. COUNTERPARTS: SIGNATURES**

21 13.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, pdf signature,  
22 or Docusign signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken  
23 together, shall constitute one and the same document. Any photocopy of the executed Consent  
24 Judgment shall have the same force and effect as the original.

25 **14. AUTHORIZATION**

26 14.1 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by  
27 the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and has read, understood, and  
28 agrees to each of the terms and conditions contained herein.

15. **SEVERABILITY**

15.1 If, subsequent to Court approval of this Consent Judgment, any part or provision is declared by a Court to be invalid, void, or unenforceable, the remaining portions or provisions shall continue in full force and effect.

**STIPULATED AND AGREED TO:**

Dated: 11/6/2024

By:  Signed by: Ramy Eden  
Ramy Eden

Dated:

By:   
Bud Caldwell on behalf of Northgate Petroleum Company

**IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED.**

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_  
Judge of the Superior Court