



As You Sow

Tel: (415) 391-3212

A Foundation Planting Seeds for Social Change

Fax: (415) 391-3245

A NON-PROFIT CORPORATION
311 California Street, Suite 510
San Francisco, California 94104
www.asyousow.org

December 23, 2003

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.

Dear Public Enforcement Agencies:

As You Sow ("AYS") is a non-profit foundation organized under California's Non-Profit Public Benefit Corporation Law. AYS is dedicated to, among other causes, the protection of the environment, the promotion of human health, the improvement of worker and consumer safety, and environmental education.

AYS has documented violations of California's Safe Drinking Water & Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), codified at Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* This letter serves to provide AYS' notification of these violations to the public enforcement agencies and to the violator. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, AYS intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

A summary of the statute and its implementing regulations, which was prepared by the lead agency designated under the statute, is enclosed with the copy of this notice served upon the violator. The specific details of the violations that are the subject of this notice are provided below.

Alleged violator. The name of the violator covered by this notice is **NATURE'S SUNSHINE PRODUCTS, INC.** ("Nature's Sunshine").

Chemicals. These violations involve exposures to lead and lead compounds from the products listed below. On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

Consumer products. The products that are the subject of this notice are herbs and herbal products, traditional patent medicines, bulk herbs, infusions, extracted powders, tea pills, traditional pills, patent formulas, bulk teas, liquid extracts and/or capsules that are imported, exported, manufactured, packaged, distributed, marketed and/or sold by Nature's Sunshine. The phrase "traditional patent medicines" above is used herein as defined by the California



Department of Health Services: "herbal and patent medicines consisting of single or multiple herbal ingredients, including botanical, mineral and animal products, formulated into tablets, pills, powders and liquids." The products that are the subject of this notice include but are not limited to the following:

<u>Product</u>	<u>Chemical</u>
Breathe EZ (Xuan Fei-Metal Reducing)	lead and lead compounds
Spleen Activator (Wen Zhong-Enhance Earth)	lead and lead compounds
LBS II	lead and lead compounds
Nature's Chi	lead and lead compounds
Ayurvedic Skin Detox	lead and lead compounds
Astragalus	lead and lead compounds
Dong Quai	lead and lead compounds
Siberian Ginseng	lead and lead compounds

Route of exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and use of these products as recommended by the manufacturer. Accordingly, the consumer exposures have occurred and continue to occur primarily through the ingestion exposure route, but also may occur through inhalation and/or and dermal contact.

Duration of violations. Each of these ongoing violations has occurred on every day since December 23, 1999, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided or until these known toxic chemicals are removed from the products.

Pursuant to Title 11, C.C.R. § 3100, a certificate of merit is attached hereto.

In keeping with its public interest mission and to expeditiously rectify these ongoing violations of California law, AYS is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter without engaging in costly and protracted litigation. Please direct all communications regarding this notice to AYS' counsel in this matter:

Andrew L. Packard, Esq.
Law Offices of Andrew L. Packard
294 Page Street
San Francisco, CA 94102
Tel. (415) 431-2970 Fax (415) 431-0410

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT
**(for As You Sow's Notice of Proposition 65 Violation
on NATURE'S SUNSHINE PRODUCTS, INC.)**

I, Andrew L. Packard, declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that **NATURE'S SUNSHINE PRODUCTS, INC.** has violated Health & Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is: 311 California Street, Suite 510, San Francisco, California 94104.

On December 23, 2003, I served the following documents:

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit
- "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary"

on the following party by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

Nature's Sunshine Products, Inc.
Daniel P. Howells, CEO
P.O. Box 19005
Provo, UT 84605-9005

On December 23, 2003, I served the following document(s):

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit, including Supporting Documentation Required by Title 11, C.C.R. § 3102

on the following party by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

Attn: Craig Thompson, Deputy Attorney General
California Department of Justice
P.O. Box 944255
Sacramento, CA 94244-2550

On December 23, 2003, I served the following document(s):

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit

on each of the parties on the service list attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the service list attached hereto, and depositing it at United States Postal Service mail box for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on December 23, 2003, at San Francisco, California.

PUBLIC ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES SERVICE LIST (updated 04/18/03)

THE HONORABLE THOMAS J ORLOFF
ALAMEDA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
1225 FALLON ST RM 900
OAKLAND CA 94612

THE HONORABLE WILLIAM RICHMOND
ALPINE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 248
MARKLEEVILLE CA 96120

THE HONORABLE TODD D RIEBE
AMADOR COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
708 COURT ST STE 202
JACKSON CA 95642

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL RAMSEY
BUTTE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
25 COUNTY CTR DR
OROVILLE CA 95965

THE HONORABLE JEFFREY TUTTLE
CALAVERAS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
891 MTN RANCH RD
SAN ANDREAS CA 95249

THE HONORABLE JOHN POYNER
COLUSA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
547 MARKET ST
COLUSA CA 95932

THE HONORABLE ROBERT KOCHLY
CONTRA COSTA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 670
MARTINEZ CA 94553

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL RIESE
DEL NORTE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
450 H ST
CRESCENT CITY CA 95531

THE HONORABLE GARY L LACY
EL DORADO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
515 MAIN ST
PLACERVILLE CA 95667

THE HONORABLE ELIZABETH EGAN
FRESNO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
2220 TULARE ST STE 1000
FRESNO CA 93721

THE HONORABLE ROBERT HOLZAPFEL
GLENN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 430
WILLOWS CA 95988

THE HONORABLE PAUL GALLEGOS
HUMBOLDT COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
825 FIFTH ST
EUREKA CA 95501

THE HONORABLE GILBERT OTERO
IMPERIAL COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
939 W MAIN ST
EL CENTRO CA 92243

THE HONORABLE ARTHUR MAILLET
INYO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO DRAWER D
INDEPENDENCE CA 93526

THE HONORABLE EDWARD R JAGELS
KERN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
1215 TRUXTUN AVE
BAKERSFIELD CA 93301

THE HONORABLE RON CALHOUN
KINGS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
1400 W LACEY BLVD
HANFORD CA 93230

THE HONORABLE GERHARD LUCK
LAKE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
255 N FORBES ST
LAKEPORT CA 95453

THE HONORABLE ROBERT BURNS
LASSEN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
220 S LASSEN ST STE 8
SUSANVILLE CA 96130

THE HONORABLE STEVE COOLEY
LA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
210 W TEMPLE ST STE 18000
LOS ANGELES CA 90012-3210

THE HONORABLE ERNEST LICALSI
MADERA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
209 W YOSEMITE AVE
MADERA CA 93637

THE HONORABLE PAULA FRESCHI KAMENA
MARIN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
3501 CIVIC CTR DR RM 130
SAN RAFAEL CA 94903

THE HONORABLE ROBERT BROWN
MARIPOSA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 748
MARIPOSA CA 95338

THE HONORABLE NORMAN VROMAN
MENDOCINO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 1000
UKIAH CA 95482

THE HONORABLE GORDON SPENCER
MERCED COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
2222 M ST
MERCED CA 95340

THE HONORABLE JORDAN FUNK
MODOC COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 1171
ALTURAS CA 96101

THE HONORABLE GEORGE BOOTH
MONO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 617
BRIDGEPORT CA 93517

THE HONORABLE DEAN FLIPPO
MONTEREY COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
240 CHURCH ST #101
SALINAS CA 93902

THE HONORABLE GARY LIEBERSTEIN
NAPA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
931 PARKWAY MALL
NAPA CA 94559

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL FERGUSON
NEVADA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
201 CHURCH ST STE 8
NEVADA CITY CA 95959

THE HONORABLE TONY RACKAUCKAS
ORANGE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
401 CIVIC CTR DR WEST
SANTA ANA CA 92701

THE HONORABLE BRAD FENOCCHIO
PLACER COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
11562 B AVE
AUBURN CA 95603

THE HONORABLE JEFF CUNAN
PLUMAS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
520 MAIN ST RM 404
QUINCY CA 95971

THE HONORABLE GROVER C TRASK II
RIVERSIDE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
4075 MAIN ST
RIVERSIDE CA 92501

THE HONORABLE JAN SCULLY
SACRAMENTO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
901 G ST
SACRAMENTO CA 95814

THE HONORABLE JOHN SANSFIELD
SAN BENITO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
419 FOURTH ST, FL 2
HOLLISTER CA 95023

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL RAMOS
SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
316 N MTN VIEW AVE
SAN BERNARDINO CA 92415-0004

THE HONORABLE BONNIE DUMANIS
SAN DIEGO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
330 W BROADWAY STE 1320
SAN DIEGO CA 92101

THE HONORABLE TERENCE HALLINAN
SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
880 BRYANT ST STE 325
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94103

THE HONORABLE JOHN D PHILLIPS
SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 990
STOCKTON CA 95201-0990

THE HONORABLE GERALD T SHEA
SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
COUNTY GOVERNMENT CTR RM 450
SAN LUIS OBISPO CA 93408

THE HONORABLE DAVID L CROSS
TRINITY COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 310
WEAVERVILLE CA 96093

THE HONORABLE JAMES P FOX
SAN MATEO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
400 COUNTY CTR FL 3
REDWOOD CITY CA 94063

THE HONORABLE PHILLIP J CLINE
TULARE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
221 S MOONEY BLVD # 224
VISALIA CA 93291

THE HONORABLE THOMAS W SNEDDON JR
SANTA BARBARA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
1105 SANTA BARBARA ST
SANTA BARBARA CA 93101

THE HONORABLE DONALD I SEGERSTROM
TUOLUMNE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
423 N WASHINGTON ST
SONORA CA 95370

THE HONORABLE GEORGE KENNEDY
SANTA CLARA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
70 W HEDDING ST
SAN JOSE CA 95110

THE HONORABLE GREG TOTTEN
VENTURA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
800 S VICTORIA AVE
VENTURA CA 93009

THE HONORABLE BOB LEE
SANTA CRUZ COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
701 OCEAN ST STE 200
SANTA CRUZ CA 95060

THE HONORABLE DAVID C HENDERSON
YOLO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
301 SECOND ST
WOODLAND CA 95695

THE HONORABLE MCGREGOR SCOTT
SHASTA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
1525 COURT ST FL 3
REDDING CA 96001

THE HONORABLE PATRICK MCGRATH
YUBA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
215 FIFTH ST
MARYSVILLE CA 95901

THE HONORABLE LAWRENCE ALLEN
SIERRA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 457
DOWNIEVILLE CA 95936

LOS ANGELES CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
200 N MAIN ST RM 1800
LOS ANGELES CA 90012

THE HONORABLE PETER F KNOLL
SISKIYOU COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 986
YREKA CA 96097

SAN DIEGO CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
CIVIC CENTER PLAZA
1200 THIRD AVE STE 1620
SAN DIEGO CA 92101

THE HONORABLE DAVID W PAULSON
SOLANO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
600 UNION AVE
FAIRFIELD CA 94533

SAN JOSE CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
151 W MISSION ST
SAN JOSE CA 95110

THE HONORABLE STEPHEN PASSALACQUA
SONOMA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
600 ADMINISTRATION DR RM 212-J
SANTA ROSA CA 95403

SAN FRANCISCO CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
CITY HALL, ROOM 234
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

THE HONORABLE JAMES C BRAZELTON
STANISLAUS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 442
MODESTO CA 95353

THE HONORABLE CARL V ADAMS
SUTTER COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
446 SECOND ST
YUBA CITY CA 95991

THE HONORABLE GREGG COHEN
TEHAMA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 519
RED BLUFF CA 96080