

LAW OFFICES OF  
**BUSHNELL, CAPLAN & FIELDING, LLP**

221 PINE STREET, SUITE 600

AT BATTERY

SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94104-2715

TELEPHONE (415) 217-3800

FAX (415) 217-3820

RODERICK P. BUSHNELL\*  
ALAN M. CAPLAN†  
DAVID H. FIELDING

OF COUNSEL  
PHILIP NEUMARK  
APRIL M. STRAUSS  
TERENCE F. YOUNG

\* BOARD CERTIFIED CIVIL TRIAL ADVOCATE

† ALSO MEMBER OF  
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA BAR

March 23, 2004

Mr. Glenn William Seymour  
President  
RENAISSANCE SPECIALTY FOODS, INC.  
310 South Maple Avenue  
South San Francisco, California 94080

Re: Notice of Violation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65), Section 25249.6 of the California Health and Safety Code, for Exposing Consumers to Lead in Vinegar Without Warning

Dear Mr Seymour:

This office represents the Environmental Law Foundation (“ELF”), a California non-profit organization dedicated to the preservation and enhancement of human health and the environment. ELF has a long-standing interest in reducing health hazards to the public posed by toxic chemicals.

This letter constitutes notice that the entity listed below has violated and continues to violate provisions of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code §§ 25249.5, *et seq.* Specifically, this entity has violated and continues to violate the warning requirement at § 25249.6 of the California Health and Safety Code, which provides, “No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual . . .”

Alleged Violator: Renaissance Specialty Foods, Inc.

Wine vinegar, including, but not limited to Balsamic Vinegar of Modena (12 year old), produced, distributed and/or sold by this entity contains lead, a chemical known to the state to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity. Since on or after February 1, 1999

Mr. Glenn William Seymour  
President  
Renaissance Specialty Foods, Inc.  
March 23, 2004  
Page 2

---

and continuing to the present time, this entity has exposed and continues to expose consumers within the State of California to high levels of lead, a toxic chemical contained in vinegar. The amount of lead contained in one serving of the vinegar at issue herein is more than .5 micrograms/liter per day or .5 ppb. Exposure has occurred by ingestion of the vinegar.

Because lead is a chemical listed in Proposition 65 as a reproductive toxin, pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 this entity was, and is, required to provide clear and reasonable warnings to purchasers of its vinegar before exposing the purchasers to lead contained in the vinegar. The warnings must state that the vinegar contains a chemical known by the State of California to cause reproductive toxicity. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d), ELF intends to bring suit in the public interest against each of the above-named entity sixty days hereafter to correct the violation occasioned by the failure to warn consumers of exposure to lead, unless the entity fully and completely remedies and ceases and desists from violating Proposition 65 within the sixty-day period.

Pursuant to 22 California Code of Regulations § 12903(b)(1), attached is a copy of "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65)," a summary of Proposition 65 prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment of the California Environmental Protection Agency. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)(1), attached is a Certificate of Merit pertaining to the allegations set forth in this Notice.

LAW OFFICES OF  
**BUSHNELL, CAPLAN & FIELDING, LLP**

Mr. Glenn William Seymour  
President  
Renaissance Specialty Foods, Inc.  
March 23, 2004  
Page 3

---

ELF is located at: 1736 Franklin Street, Ninth Floor, Oakland, California 94612, telephone: (510) 208-4555. ELF is represented in this matter by the law firms of Bushnell, Caplan & Fielding, LLP and Altshuler, Berzon, Nussbaum, Rubin & Demain. All communications concerning this matter should be direct to:

Alan M. Caplan, Esq.  
Bushnell, Caplan & Fielding, LLP  
221 Pine Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, California 94104-2715  
Telephone: (415) 217-3800  
Facsimile: (415) 217-3820

Very truly yours,

AMC: ams  
Enclosures

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**  
for Environmental Law Foundation's Notice of  
Proposition 65 Violation on Renaissance Specialty Foods, Inc.  
Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

I, Alan M. Caplan, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  2. I am an attorney for the Noticing party Environmental Law Foundation.
  3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
  4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 
1. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Date: 3/23/04 \_\_\_\_\_

**PROOF OF SERVICE**  
(Code of Civil Procedure §§ 1013a, 2015)

I am employed in the City and County of San Francisco, State of California. I am over the age of 18 and not a party to the within action. My business address is 221 Pine Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, California 94104.

On the below-stated date, I served the foregoing document entitled:

**NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF RENAISSANCE SPECIALTY FOODS, INC. OF THE  
SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986  
(PROPOSITION 65), SECTION 25249.6 OF THE CALIFORNIA HEALTH AND  
SAFETY CODE, FOR EXPOSING CONSUMERS TO LEAD IN VINEGAR  
WITHOUT WARNING**

on the other parties in this action by placing the true copies thereof enclosed in sealed envelopes addressed as stated below:

**Mr. Glenn William Seymour  
President  
RENAISSANCE SPECIALTY FOODS, INC.  
310 South Maple Avenue  
South San Francisco, California 94080**

and

**SERVICE LIST ATTACHED**

BY FIRST-CLASS MAIL: I am readily familiar with the firm's practice of collection and processing of correspondence for mailing. Under that practice, it is deposited with the U.S. Postal Service on that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at San Francisco, California, in the ordinary course of business. I am aware that on motion of the party served, service is presumed invalid if the postal cancellation date or the postage meter date is more than one day after date of deposit for mailing in affidavit.

BY OVERNIGHT COURIER SERVICE: I caused each envelope with postage fully prepaid to be sent by Federal Express.

BY FACSIMILE: I caused each document to be delivered by facsimile transmission to the offices of the addressee, Fax Number \_\_\_\_\_.

Executed on March 24, 2004 at San Francisco, California. I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California, that the above is true and correct.

The Honorable Thomas J. Orloff  
Alameda County District Attorney  
1225 Fallon Street, Room 900  
Oakland, CA 94612

The Honorable Alan Turner  
Alpine County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 248  
Markleeville, CA 96120

The Honorable Todd D. Riebe  
Amador County District Attorney  
708 Court Street, Ste. 202  
Jackson, CA 94542

The Honorable Michael Ramsey  
Butte County District Attorney  
25 County Center Drive  
Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Jeffrey Tuttle  
Calaveras County District Attorney  
891 Mtn Ranch Road  
San Andreas, CA 95249

The Honorable John Poyner  
Colusa County District Attorney  
547 Market Street  
Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Gary T. Yancy  
Contra Costa County District Atty.  
P.O. Box 670  
Martinez, CA 94553

The Honorable Robert J. Drossel  
Del Norte County District Attorney  
450 H Street  
Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable Gary L. Lacy  
El Dorado County District Attorney  
515 Main Street  
Placerville, CA 95667

The Honorable Edward W. Hunt  
Fresno County District Attorney  
2220 Tulare Street, Ste. 1000  
Fresno, CA 93721

The Honorable Robert Holzapfel  
Glenn County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 430  
Willows, CA 95988

The Honorable Terry R. Farmer  
Humboldt County District Attorney  
825 Fifth Street  
Eureka, CA 95501

The Honorable Gilbert Otero  
Imperial County District Attorney  
939 W. Main Street  
El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Philip McDowell  
Inyo County District Attorney  
P.O. Drawer D  
Independence, CA 93526

The Honorable Edward R. Jagels  
Kern County District Attorney  
1215 Truxtun Ave.  
Bakersfield, CA 93301

The Honorable Ron Calhoun  
Kings County District Attorney  
1400 W. Lacey Blvd.  
Hanford, CA 93230

The Honorable Gary Luck  
Lake County District Attorney  
255 N. Forbes Street  
Lakeport, CA 95453

The Honorable Robert Burns  
Lassen County District Attorney  
220 S. Lassen Street, Ste. 8  
Susanville, CA 96130

The Honorable Steve Cooley  
Los Angeles County District Atty.  
210 W. Temple Street, Ste. 18000  
Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

The Honorable Ernest Licalsi  
Madera County District Attorney  
209 W. Yosemite Ave.  
Madera, CA 93637

The Honorable Paula Freschi Kamena  
Marin County District Attorney  
3501 Civic Center Drive, Rm 130  
San Rafael, CA 94903

The Honorable Robert Brown  
Mariposa County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 730  
Mariposa, CA 95388

The Honorable Norman Vroman  
Mendocino County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 1000  
Ukiah, CA 95482

The Honorable Gordon Spencer  
Merced County District Attorney  
2222 M Street  
Merced, CA 95340

The Honorable Jordan Funk  
Modoc District Attorney  
204 South Court Street  
Alturas, CA 96101

The Honorable George Booth  
Mono County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 617  
Bridgeport, CA 93517

The Honorable Dean Flippo  
Monterey County District Attorney  
240 Church Street, Ste. 101  
Salinas, CA 93920

The Honorable Gary Lieberstein  
Napa County District Attorney  
931 Parkway Mall  
Napa, CA 94559

The Honorable Michael Ferguson  
Nevada County District Attorney  
201 Church Street, Ste. 8  
Nevada City, CA 95959

The Honorable Tony Rackauckas  
Orange County District Attorney  
401 Civic Center Drive  
Santa Ana, CA 92701

The Honorable Brad Fenocchio  
Placer County District Attorney  
11562 B Avenue  
Auburn, CA 95603

The Honorable James Reichle  
Plumas County District Attorney  
520 Main Street, Room 404  
Quincy, CA 95971

The Honorable Grover C. Trask II  
Riverside County District Attorney  
4075 Main Street  
Riverside, CA 92501

The Honorable Jan Scully  
Sacramento County District Attorney  
901 G Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable Harry J. Damkar  
San Benito County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 2461  
Hollister, CA 95024-2461

The Honorable Dennis L. Stout  
San Bernardino County District Atty  
316 N. Mountain View Avenue  
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004

The Honorable Paul Pfingst  
San Diego County District Attorney  
330 W. Broadway, Room 1300  
San Diego, CA 92112

The Honorable Kamala Harris  
San Francisco County District Attorney  
880 Bryant Street, Ste. 325  
San Francisco, CA 94103

The Honorable John D. Phillips  
San Joaquin County District Attorney  
222 E. Weber Street, Room 202  
Stockton, CA 95202

The Honorable Gerald T. Shea  
San Luis Obispo County District Attorney  
County Government Center, Room 450  
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

The Honorable James P. Fox  
San Mateo County District Attorney  
400 County Center, Third Floor  
Redwood City, CA 93101

The Honorable Thomas W. Sneddon Jr.  
Santa Barbara County District Attorney  
1105 Santa Barbara Street  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101

The Honorable George Kennedy  
Santa Clara County District Attorney  
70 W Hedding Street  
San Jose, CA 95110

The Honorable Ronald L. Ruiz  
Santa Cruz County District Attorney  
701 Ocean Street, Ste. 200  
Santa Cruz, CA 95060

The Honorable McGregor Scott  
Shasta County District Attorney  
1525 Court Street, Third Floor  
Redding, CA 96001

The Honorable Sharon O Sullivan  
Sierra County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 457  
Downieville, CA 95936

The Honorable Peter F. Knoll  
Siskiyou County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 986  
Yreka CA 96097

The Honorable David W. Paulson  
Solano County District Attorney  
600 Union Ave.  
Fairfield, CA 94533

The Honorable J. Michael Mullins  
Sonoma County District Attorney  
600 Administration Drive, Room 212  
Santa Rosa, CA 95403

The Honorable James C. Brazleton  
Stanislaus County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 442  
Modesto, CA 95353

The Honorable Carl V. Adams  
Sutter County District Attorney  
446 Second Street  
Yuba City, CA 95991

The Honorable Gregg Cohen  
Tehama County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 519  
Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable David L. Cross  
Trinity County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 310  
Weaverville, CA 96093

The Honorable Philip J. Cline  
Tulare County District Attorney  
221 S. Mooney Blvd., Ste. 224  
Visalia, CA 93291

The Honorable Donald I. Segerstrom  
Tuolumne County District Attorney  
Two S. Green Street  
Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Michael D. Bradbury  
Ventura County District Attorney  
800 S Victoria Ave  
Ventura, CA 93009

The Honorable David C. Henderson  
Yolo County District Attorney  
301 Second Street  
Woodland, CA 95695

The Honorable Patrick McGrath  
Yuba County District Attorney  
215 Fifth Street  
Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office  
200 N Main Street, Room 1800  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office  
Civic Center Plaza  
1200 Third Ave., Ste 1200  
San Diego, CA 92101

San Jose City Attorney's Office  
151 W Mission Street  
San Jose, CA 95110

San Francisco City Attorney's Office  
City Hall, Room 234  
San Francisco, CA 94102