# **60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION**

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)

Date:

May 4, 2007

To:

Philip I. Kent, Chief Executive Officer – Turner Broadcasting System, Inc.

Mark Lazarus, Chief Executive Officer - Turner Retail Company, a subsidiary of

Turner Broadcasting System, Inc.

California Attorney General's Office;

District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and

City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles

From:

Whitney R. Leeman, Ph.D.

#### I. INTRODUCTION

My name is Whitney R. Leeman. I hold a Doctor of Philosophy degree in Environmental Engineering. I am a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. I seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. This Notice is provided to the parties listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code §25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"). As noted above, notice is being provided to the violators, Turner Broadcasting System, Inc. and Turner Retail Company, a subsidiary of Turner Broadcasting System, Inc. (the "Violators"). The violations covered by this Notice consist of the product exposures, routes of exposures, and types of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the toxic chemical ("listed chemical") identified below, as follows:

Product Exposure:

See Section VI. Exhibit A

Listed Chemical:

Lead

Routes of Exposure:

Ingestion, Dermal

Types of Harm:

Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

## II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE)

The specific types of products that are causing consumer and occupational exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A in Section VI below. All products within the types covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the "products." The Violators' sales of these ceramic and glassware products have been occurring from at least May 4, 2006, to the present. As a result of the sales of these products, exposures to the listed chemical have been occurring without clear and reasonable warnings as required by Proposition 65. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical, resulting from contact with the products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the toxic chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products.

### A. CONSUMER PRODUCT EXPOSURE

California consumers, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the products, are exposed to the listed chemical. By way of example but not limitation, exposures occur when California citizens drink from the vessel, display, clean, pack, unpack, arrange, store or otherwise handle the products. These tasks cause consumers to be exposed directly and/or indirectly to the listed chemical through the routine touching of the parts or portions of the products containing readily available amounts of the listed chemical on the surface. Additionally, exposure can occur through the routine touching and ingesting of other materials (such as food items consumed while handling the products) that become contaminated with the listed chemical from the products. People likely to be exposed include both children and adults.

### B. OCCUPATIONAL EXPOSURE

Similarly, men and women in California use or otherwise handle the products as a part of their jobs and are, therefore, subject to occupational exposures to the listed chemical. Employees are exposed at any California business locations of the apparent manufacturer, distributor and retailer (and their agents, assigns and divisions) as well as all other California locations where the products, or the component parts thereof that include the listed chemical are, by way of example but not limitation, used as a drinking vessel, packed, unpacked, labeled, arranged, displayed, cleaned, stocked, stored, or otherwise handled. These tasks cause employee exposure directly and/or indirectly to the listed chemical through the routine touching of the parts or portions of the products containing readily available amounts of the listed chemical on the surface. Additionally, exposure can occur through the routine touching and ingesting of other materials that are contaminated with the listed chemical from the products as a result of these tasks. These products are also used by sole proprietors and other persons in settings not covered by the Occupational Safety Health Act ("OSH Act"). This Notice alleges the violation of Proposition 65 with respect to occupational exposure governed by the California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health. The State Plan incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions with regard to occupational exposures on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California. The approval also provides that an employer may use the means of compliance contained in the general hazard communication requirement to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement is subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the California Attorney General.

#### III. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to me at the following address:

Dr. Whitney R. Leeman c/o D. Joshua Voorhees Hirst & Chanler LLP 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710 Telephone: (510) 848-8880

#### IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's ("OEHHA") Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violators' reference, I have attached a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" which has been prepared by OEHHA.

#### V. ADDITIONAL NOTICE INFORMATION

THIS INFORMATION IS NOT REQUIRED TO BE PROVIDED UNDER CAL. CODE REGS., TITLE 22 §12903(b)(4).

Identified below are specific examples of products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California that are within the categories or types of offending products covered by this Notice. Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors and/or manufacturers of the examples within the categories or types of products are also provided below. I believe and allege that the sale of the offending products also has occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 "clear and reasonable warnings" at other locations and via other means including, but not limited to, transactions made over-the-counter, business-to-business, through the internet and/or via a catalog by the Violators.

Product*	Retailer(s)	Manufacturer(s)/Distributor(s)
CNN Building Porthole	Turner Broadcasting System, Inc.; Turner	
Mug, #10387	Retail Company, a subsidiary of Turner	
(#400000 137612)	Broadcasting System, Inc.	
	(http://www.costore.com/turnerstoreonline.com)	
CN – Multi Character	Turner Broadcasting System, Inc.; Turner	
Mug, #10376	Retail Company, a subsidiary of Turner	
(#400000 104720)	Broadcasting System, Inc.	
	(http://www.costore.com/turnerstoreonline.com)	

#### VI. EXHIBIT A

Product Category/Type	Such As*	Toxins
Glass Mugs with Colored Artwork or Designs (containing lead) on the Exterior	CNN Building Porthole Mug, #10387 (#400000 137612)	Lead
Ceramic Mugs with Colored Artwork or Designs (containing lead) on the Exterior	CN – Multi Character Mug, #10376 (#400000 104720)	Lead

\*These specifically identified examples of the types of products which are subject to this Notice are for the recipients' benefit to assist in their investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposure to the listed chemical from other items within the product categories/types listed in Exhibit A. It is important to note that these examples are not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product of the types listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A. Further, it is this citizen's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to continue to conduct in good faith an investigation into other specific products within the types or categories described above that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the notice recipients' custody or control) during the relevant period so as to ensure that the requisite toxic warnings are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

## PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is 2560 Ninth Street, Parker Plaza, Suite 214, Berkeley, CA 94710.

On May 4, 2007, I served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d);

PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY;

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS (SERVED ONLY ON THE ATTORNEY GENERAL)

on the Violators listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to each Violator and providing each envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Philip I. Kent, Chief Executive Officer Turner Broadcasting System, Inc. One CNN Center Atlanta, GA 30303 Mark Lazarus, Chief Executive Officer Turner Retail Company, a subsidiary of Turner Broadcasting System, Inc. One CNN Center Atlanta, GA 30303

as well as providing copies of the notice to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to each party listed below, and served as follows:

Via 2 <sup>nd</sup> Day Air Service by placing such envelope in a Federal Express Drop-Off Box:	The Attorney General of the State of California;
By placing each envelope in a United States Postal Service mailbox, first	The District Attorney for Each of the 58 counties in California; and
class postage prepaid:	The City Attorney for Los Angeles, San Diego, San Jose, San Francisco and Sacramento;

A list of addresses for each of these recipients is attached.

Executed on May 4, 2007, at Berkeley, California.

Patrick Rafanan

### CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

## I, D. Joshua Voorhees, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the *alleged* exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2) (i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.)

Datad: 5/

7 to 6

D. Joshua Voorhees

#### **SERVICE LIST**

The Honorable Tom Orloff Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

The Honorable William Richmond Alpine County District Attorney 270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248 Markleeville. CA 96120

The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642

The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Administration Building Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Jeffrey Tuttle Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas. CA 95249

The Honorable John R. Poyner Colusa County District Attorney 547 Market Street Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Robert J. Kochly Contra Costa County District Attorney 725 Court Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor, Rm. 402 Martinez, CA 94553

The Honorable Michael Riese Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable Gary Lacy El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

The Honorable Elizabeth Egan Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721

The Honorable Robert Holzapfel Glenn County District Attorney 540 West Sycamore Willows, CA 95988

The Honorable Paul Gallegos Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5<sup>th</sup> Street Eureka, CA 95501

The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 939 West Main Street El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Arthur Maillet Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526

The Honorable Edward R. Jagels Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield. CA 93301

The Honorable Ronald Calhoun Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

The Honorable Gerhard Luck Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 The Honorable Robert Burns Lassen County District Attorney 220 S. Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130

The Honorable Steve Cooley Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 West Temple Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Ernest LiCalsi Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

The Honorable Edward Berberian Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

The Honorable Robert Brown Mariposa County District Attorney 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

The Honorable Norman Vroman Mendocino County District Attorney 100 North State Street, G-10 Ukiah, CA 95482

The Honorable Gordon Spencer Merced County District Attorney 2222 M Street Merced, CA 95340

The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101

The Honorable George Booth Mono County District Attorney Old Court House, Main Street Bridgeport, CA 93517

The Honorable Dean Flippo Monterey County District Attorney 240 Church Street, #101 Salinas, CA 93901

The Honorable Gary Lieberstein Napa County District Attorney 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

The Honorable Michael Ferguson Nevada County District Attorney 201 Church Street, Suite 8 Nevada City, CA 95959

The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

The Honorable Bradford Fenocchio Placer County District Attorney 11562 B Avenue Auburn, CA 95603

The Honorable Jeff Cunan Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

The Honorable Grover Trask II Riverside County District Attorney 4075 Main Street Riverside, CA 92501

The Honorable Jan Scully Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 The Honorable John Sarsfield San Benito County District Attorney 419 4<sup>th</sup> Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95203

The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino County District Attorney 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415

The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis San Diego County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway Street, Suite 1320 San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Kamala Harris San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant Street, Room 325 San Francisco, CA 94103

The Honorable James Willett San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 E. Weber Avenue, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95201

The Honorable Gerald Shea San Luis Obispo County District Attorney 1050 Monterey Street, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

The Honorable James Fox San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

The Honorable Thomas Sneddon, Jr. Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara. CA 93101

The Honorable George Kennedy Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110

The Honorable Bob Lee Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

The Honorable Gerald Benito Shasta County District Attorney 1525 Court Street, Third Floor Redding, CA 96001

The Honorable Lawrence Allen Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square, Second Floor Downieville, CA 95936

The Honorable James Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney 311 4<sup>th</sup> Street Yreka, CA 96097

The Honorable David Paulson Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

The Honorable Carol Shipley Stanislaus County District Attorney 800 11<sup>th</sup> Street, Room 200 Modesto, CA 95353

The Honorable Carl Adams Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tehama County District Attorney PO BOX 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable Michael B. Harper Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

The Honorable Phillip Cline Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Mooney Boulevard, Suite 224 Visalia, CA 93291

The Honorable Donald Segerstrom, Jr Tuolumne County District Attorney 2 South Green Street Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009

The Honorable David C. Henderson Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695

The Honorable Patrick McGrath Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

The Honorable Rockard Delgadillo Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Michael Aguirre Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Samuel Jackson Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable Dennis J. Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco City Hall, Room 234 San Francisco, CA 94102

The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550